

TARLOPUB00795
13/06/2017

TARLO
pp 00795-00840

PUBLIC
HEARING

COPYRIGHT

INDEPENDENT COMMISSION AGAINST CORRUPTION

THE HONOURABLE REGINALD BLANCH AM QC

PUBLIC HEARING

OPERATION TARLO

Reference: Operation E15/1982

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

AT SYDNEY

ON TUESDAY 13 JUNE, 2017

AT 10.00AM

Any person who publishes any part of this transcript in any way and to any person contrary to a Commission direction against publication commits an offence against section 112(2) of the Independent Commission Against Corruption Act 1988.

This transcript has been prepared in accordance with conventions used in the Supreme Court.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, Mr Chhabra.

MR CHHABRA: Good morning, Commissioner. Commissioner, I seek leave for Ms Jasmina Ceic, my instructing solicitor, to appear in this jurisdiction. For the record C-e-i-c.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, I grant leave, then, Mr Chhabra. Thank you.

10 MR CHHABRA: And secondly I'd also seek leave for her to have access to the material in the restricted portal.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, I grant access.

MR CHHABRA: May it please.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you. Mr Rajalingam.

MR RAJALINGAM: Thank you, Commissioner. Ms Sharobeem - - -

20 THE COMMISSIONER: Before you - - -

MR RAJALINGAM: Yes.

THE COMMISSIONER: Ms Sharobeem, you're still on the same affirmation to tell the truth.

MS SHAROBEEM: Yes, Commissioner.

30 THE COMMISSIONER: And the orders that I've made continue.

<EMAN SHAROBEEM, on former affirmation [10.07am]

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you. Yes.

40 MR RAJALINGAM: Thank you, Commissioner. On the last occasion, Ms Sharobeem, I was asking you questions initially about you commencing work at the Immigrant Women's Health Service. Do you remember that?
---Yes.

Yeah. O.K. I'm going to show you a document, volume 14, page 21. I forgot to show you your letter of employment from Immigrant Women's Health Service, so I'll show you that document. Do you agree that that is a letter you received from the Immigrant Women's Health Service in December 2003 prior to starting work at the service as a coordinator?---Yes.

Ms Sharobeem, on the last occasion do you remember that I was asking you – Ms Sharobeem, I'm done with that document.---Sorry.

Are you happy that's the letter of employment you received?---Yes, it's under my name, yes.

Yeah. All right. That document can be closed. On the last occasion I asked you some questions about reimbursements to your account and also transfers to your account for facilitator fees. Do you understand that?---Yes.

10

I'm going to ask you some more questions about those two topics, but before I get there I want to ask you about your Classic Club holiday membership. Do you understand that?---(No Audible Reply)

You need to say yes or no.---Sorry. Um - - -

Do you understand that I'm going to ask you some questions about your Classic Club holiday membership?---Please ask me.

20 Okay. Do you agree that you gave evidence about that topic on the last occasion in May of this year?---Yes, you asked me before.

I'm going to take you to a part of your evidence in May of last year.---Sure.

You said this at page 730 of the transcript. You said that you purchased the holiday membership for the organisation. That's at the top of the page. ---Yes.

30 The second half of the page you went into an explanation. I want to read that to you. You said, "I was in Queensland for a conference and I met this company who actually offered me and proposed the idea of buying holidays cheap for women when they knew where I work. And that's why I bought it and I offered it to a couple of women but the circumstances didn't allow." Now, when you say the circumstances didn't allow, what did you mean by that?---It didn't happen.

What didn't happen?---The actual trip for them. It didn't happen.

40 You said, "At the end of the year I buy something for the organisation similar to the massage chair."---Yes.

You said, "So at that year I bought actually the holiday package and it was used once and it was used by me just to experience what happened and I paid for it but the idea is to buy a week of holiday for a woman and her children worth \$400 only or something and that's the whole thing and that's actually owing to Immigrant Women's Health not me."---That was - - -

Do you agree that you said that on the last occasion?---Yeah.

You also said on the last occasion at page 730, line 41, you said this, “I offered it to a couple of women after that. One of them from, now I remember from the breast cancer group and she actually took it and I believe she travelled if my memory collection”, I think it should read recollection, “is right I believe she travelled but it was similar to what the Breast Cancer Council did I did which is offering women a holiday at the end of the year”.---Then I - - -

10 Are you now suggesting that no one travelled on the Classic Club membership from the Immigrant Women's Health Service?---Sometimes when I speak it's, it's just – it doesn't make sense when it – even when I hear it back so I just would like to correct this that when I bought it, it was for the service as – to get the service into this, you know, giving women something at the end of the year and that's what we tried to do as health information service, but at the same time circumstances didn't allow this to happen. That's what I remember.

20 What circumstances did not allow it to happen?---Which circumstances at that time. I can't remember exactly. I can't remember why it didn't happen.

What are you talking about, what circumstances are you talking about, Ms Sharobeem?---What I mean by that is it didn't take place that women travel.

Why didn't it take place?---Definitely something didn't allow that to happen or there wasn't – the operation of sending women to this destination did not flourish for some reasons. That's what I'm trying to explain.

30 What reasons, Ms Sharobeem? It's not making sense what you're saying. ---I'm trying to make sense but - - -

Well, try a little harder.--- - - - I can't remember.

What circumstances are you saying did not allow you to offer the service to clients of the Immigrant Women's Health Service?---I can't really remember what circumstances happened at that time.

40 That's - - -?---That's the only thing I can say.

Ms Sharobeem, that's because what you're suggesting to this Commission about purchasing the membership for members of Immigrant Women's Health Service is a lie isn't it?---No.

Ms Sharobeem, did you purchase the membership for yourself and family? ---When I purchased this I even shared that with the salesman about my work and what I wanted or intended to do. Yes, I used it for my family but I

didn't say that it was for me at all. All what I remember and my recollection of the purchase is that - - -

Well, just setting aside the purchase.---Sure.

On the last occasion in May you said that you only used it once. Is that incorrect?---To my recollection it's – I'm not trying to lie I'm just trying to remember but I can't remember more than once.

- 10 There's a big difference isn't there between you purchasing a club membership for yourself and personal benefit and purchasing it for the Immigrant Women's Health Service isn't there?---That's right, but I also remember right now - - -

Well, that's the answer to the question. When you purchased it in April, 2012 I think?---2000 and - - -

12 was it?---I believe - - -

- 20 When you originally purchased the club membership was it for you and your family?---No, it wasn't mainly for that, but I also remember that I was saying to different people around the organisation and beneficiaries of the organisation that we do have this membership if any would like, anyone would like to take advantage of it. The membership itself it doesn't give people travel for free. People have to pay for their travel. It's just because it allows variety of travel. That's the meaning of the membership.

Are you sure about that?---To my best recollection, sir. My memory is not that sharp, seriously. I have been through a lot.

- 30 You said on the last occasion that you used the membership once.---To my best recollection.

Well, what's your recollection now, is it changed?---Maybe if you remind me but all what I remember is I used it once.

Was it ever used by a client of the Immigrant Women's Health Service?---Not to my recollection at this stage. Maybe.

- 40 If you say it was purchased for the Immigrant Women's Health Service, why wasn't it used for the Immigrant Women's Health Service?---I just would like to remind you of one thing, sir.

Why wasn't it used for the Immigrant Women's Health Service? That is the question. Answer it.---And that's the answer.

What is the answer?---I would like to remind you, sir, that I was the only full-time worker doing all and everything in an organisation, including speaking up against all the form of violation against women.

That's got nothing to do with the question I'm asking you.---It got, it got a lot to do - - -

10 I'm asking you why you did not extend the membership to Immigrant Women's Health Service clients. Why not?---It got a lot to do with the size of things required from me as a human being. Please remember that you are working certain hours and getting certain pay. I, I was underpaid and overworked. So if any wrongdoing happened, including not offering or not proceeding, it's not because it's my intention. It's because I was overstretched. And I was also doing a lot of volunteer work. It's, I don't want you to feel that I did this deliberately.

20 Are you suggesting that because you were overworked that those were the circumstances that led to this service, the membership, not being extended to the IWHS clients?---Many, many of the mistakes because I was overstretched.

So because you were overworked, you're saying that you then used the membership for your personal benefit, are you?---No, no. The membership was there and as a worker of the organisation I can use it as well. I am also a client of the organisation in some other events.

No, you are not, Ms Sharobeem.---I'm sorry. That was wrong.

30 You are the chief executive officer - - -?---I would like to withdraw that. - - - of the Immigrant Women's Health Service, do you agree with that? ---No, I don't.

40 You don't agree?---I don't. I have to set the record straight right now, sir. Every time I am called a CEO of the organisation, this is actually wrong. I might have the title of a CEO but I never had any benefit as a CEO. The CEO as a title was given to me just because of the number of things and the number of position I was elevated to, just as a prestige. But I was never, ever being treated as one. So every time I am in the media or here (not transcribable) CEO, this is a big title and big responsibility. I was doing everything and anything in the organisation. I wasn't paid as a CEO. I didn't have entitled as a CEO. It was something because of the threaten we were receiving from the Health Department and other funding body that the funding is going to be cut to small organisation. The organisation was trying to elevate its position so that we have that.

THE COMMISSIONER: I'm not sure what you're telling me or what question is being answered, so could we – yes?---I'm sorry. I went again into blabbing because of the stress. Sorry. I'll try to focus again.

MR RAJALINGAM: Ms Sharobeem, I am going to take you to your call or your log history with Classic Club membership. Is that funny, is it?---No, I'm looking at my, my lawyer and they try to say to me try to be calm, and I'm trying, so I'm looking at them in this way.

10 Well, be calm. Answer the question.---Yes.

I'm going to take you to some entries for your log with Classic Club membership, holiday membership.---Sure. Sure.

Page 51, volume 5 of the statements. Volume 5 statements, page 51. Ms Sharobeem, when did you realise that you couldn't extend the service to IWHS clients?---Sorry. I can't understand.

20 When did you come to the view that circumstances would not allow you to extend the club membership, Classic Club holiday membership, to IWHS clients?---That never happened. I never said that. I, I didn't say that. I, I realise that I can't extend it. I can't understand the question. Maybe if you can - - -

Was your evidence that circumstances, there were circumstances that did not allow you to extend the Classic Club membership to IWHS clients? ---No, let me rephrase that. I'm talking about the - - -

30 Just before we rephrase it, is that what you said in your evidence?---No, that's not what I meant.

Ms Sharobeem, what do you mean?---What I meant is at that particular incident - - -

What, what, sorry, what incident are you talking about?
--- - - - circumstances did not allow for this particular client to travel.
That's all what I give as explanation. But maybe my language (not transcribable).

40 Okay. So when you said circumstances, you were referring to a particular client, were you?---I was referring to those women, why didn't they travel.

So you said a particular client in your last answer.---Yeah.

Now you're talking about a number of different people, are you?---No, no. I'm talking about the same person.

Who is the person that you're talking about?---I can't even remember. Really.

Do you know what they look like?---I saw thousands of people. I can't really describe.

So what are the circumstances, Ms Sharobeem, that you're talking about? ---The circumstances happened for that particular client not to travel.

10 What are the circumstances?---I can't remember. I can't remember.

That's because you are telling a lie, aren't you, to this Commission?---No. No, I don't.

Let me take you to these entries. Page 51. On 26 April, do you agree that you purchased, you finally purchased 40,000 club membership points? ---No, that was given to us as, as a present.

20 Who gave it to you?---The, the club itself. They give it to us as a present, to the organisation as a present.

Which club?---The Classic Club or the Classic Holiday. That's, that's what I'm referring to.

Ms Sharobeem, you purchased these 40,000 points on your credit card, didn't you?---To my recollection it was given as part of the package. That's not to be purchased. That's like something to top up the package, to my recollection.

30 Sorry, what package are you talking about?---When the purchase happened, the 40,000 points is, was part of the package. That's what I'm referring to.

Who purchased the package? Who purchased the Classic Club holiday membership package?---I did the purchase.

Okay. So we're talking about you and nobody else, is that correct?---I, I made the payment, yes.

40 Did you make the payment using a personal credit card?---As far as I remember.

Okay. Well, I'll show you that receipt for your credit card purchase. Volume 1, page 272. Just go to the top right-hand corner. That is a credit card receipt, isn't it? Do you agree with that?---Yes, it is.

Do you know whose credit card receipt it is?---I never remember numbers.

It's yours, Ms Sharobeem.---Okay.

And the Commission has done an investigation of any amount closely resembling \$8,990 coming out of any of your personal accounts, and that's the only one that's there.---All right.

All right? Do you agree that the receipt relates to \$8,990?---Yes.

That is your Classic Club holiday membership purchase. Do you accept that from me?---Yes.

10

You made that purchase, didn't you?---I'm, I, yeah. I just said.

So it's absolute nonsense to suggest that the Classic Club holiday membership business gave it to the Immigrant Women's Health Service as a present, isn't it?---It's not a present. It's a purchase - - -

Weren't you suggesting before that it was given to the organisation? --- - - - made at the end of the financial year for the organisation to use and enjoy, and any members of the organisation also to use.

20

So you agree that you purchased the Classic Club membership, don't you? ---Yeah, I was the manager and everybody in the organisation - - -

Okay, just forget about you being a manager.---Yeah.

Just forget about everyone else in the organisation. I just want you to think about your credit card and purchasing the membership.---Yeah.

30

Did you do it?---Of course. The credit card, my personal credit card, was the credit card the organisation used in every other occasion during the years.

Where did you make the payment for the Classic Club holiday membership?---Where?

Where?---Over there.

Where?---In Brisbane.

40

Was it at the service, at the Classic Club holiday membership shop?---Yes.

So it was you that purchased it?---Yes, sir.

It had nothing to do with the organisation, didn't it?---No, sir. When I bought it, it was for the organisation to enjoy as well.

You bought it on your personal credit card, didn't you?---Similar to all the tables and all the other things, I bought by my credit card for the organisation.

Can you go back a page to page 270, 269 rather.---The organisation had a credit card maximum of \$2,000 only.

Just have a look at these transfers, Ms Sharobeem.---Sure.

10 269. Ms Sharobeem, is that a transfer to your account in the amount of \$2,000 on 4 May, 2012?---Yes.

Do you agree that that's about a month after you purchased the Classic Club holiday membership?---All right.

Do you agree that it's a month after you purchased your Classic Club holiday membership?---This is May. When was the purchase made? If it's April then it's a month.

20 Yes.---I didn't even look at the date.

Okay. So you agree that you purchased Classic Club in April, 2012 don't you?---Yes.

Yes. And this is a transfer from May, 2012 isn't it?---Yes.

It's a transfer for \$2,000 isn't it?---Yes, I can see that.

30 Do you remember what the Classic Club holiday membership receipt was for?---8,900.

Do you want to see it again?---It was 8,900.

Go to page 271. Do you have a notebook and a pen there with you?---Yeah, I do.

Write the figure down. So go to page 271 and just the top right-hand corner. So with your pen and notebook can you write down the figure on the receipt.---Sure.

40

If you just go up. Do you see that, that's 18 April, 2012 isn't it?---Yes.

So write the date down and write the amount down for \$8,990.---Sure.

Have you got 18 April, 2012 on your note?---I note, I wrote that.

You understand that now?---I wrote it down.

Okay. Let's go to page 269. So this is not even a month later, this is half a month later. On 4 May there's a transfer for \$2,000 to your account. Do you agree with that, yes or no?---Yes, I can see that.

Do you agree that it's a transfer to your account for \$2,000 on 4 May, 2012? Put your glasses on if you can't see it.---I can see that.

10 Do you agree that it's a transfer to your account on 4 May, 2012 for \$2,000 from the Immigrant Women's Health Service to your account?---I can see the transaction.

Do you agree with it?---I, I can see it.

Do you agree that on 4 May, 2012 \$2,000 was transferred from the Immigrant Women's Health fund to your account?---Yes, I can see that.

Do you agree, yes or no?---I agree with the document, yes.

20 The next page.---I'm sorry, I'm not sure of the words agree and all the terminologies but I just respond to what I can see.

Do you agree that on page 270 there's a transfer to your account from the Immigrant Women's Health Service for \$5,000?---On 4 May?

Yes.---Yes, 5,000.

The next page. That's a transfer from Immigrant Women's Health Service to your account for \$1,990 isn't it?---On 6 May.

30 Do you want to add the three totals up, and what do you get, Ms Sharobeem?---8,999.

8,990 isn't it?---90, yes.

Yeah. Isn't that the same amount on the receipt that you submitted for reimbursement?---Yes, it's the calculation of it, yes.

40 That is the only debit in all of your accounts across the board for \$8,990, Ms Sharobeem.---All right.

You made that transfer half a month later didn't you – you made those three transfers rather half a month after you made the purchase of Classic Club Holiday?---I don't think I made them. Most likely the bookkeeper made them.

We're going back to that, are we?

THE COMMISSIONER: Did you intend that you would be reimbursed for the money that you had spent on the club membership?---I believe because I bought it, I made the purchase for the organisation as far as I remember.

So you needed to be reimbursed by the organisation?---As far as I remember, yes.

Yes. Okay.

10 MR RAJALINGAM: Ms Sharobeem, you said in your evidence on the last occasion that the receipt at page 271, if we could go back to that, 272, yeah, you said that the \$8,990 receipt was for work done by a handyman, on the last occasion. Do you remember that?---You showed me that, yes.

Yeah. That wasn't correct, was it?---I can't remember at all. I tried all my best to remember.

20 You told this Commission that the receipt for \$8,990 was for a handyman who performed work at the Bankstown Community Hall. Do you remember saying that to the Commission?---You, you showed me the note and I read it with you and I tried to, to remember even how much or who the handyman, I tried even on my own during this past month, I couldn't remember more than that from 2012.

The note was incorrect, wasn't it?---I, I can't say that now.

Well, have a look at it now, 272. That was the receipt for 8,990 that you submitted for reimbursement?---Yes.

30 And that's the note that you provided with the receipt?---Yes.

That is incorrect, isn't it, suggesting that the 8,990 related to a handyman? ---I can't really respond with or agree or disagree with you, I can't really remember. All what I remember is when we started the group in Bankstown we needed to do some work and I remember talking to people and handyman and the department and we got the work done.

THE COMMISSIONER: Is that note in your handwriting?---Yes, this is my handwriting.

40

So you wrote that note - - -?---Yes.

- - - to explain why the \$8,990 needed to be reimbursed?---And also I remember that we did the work and we got reimbursed from the department.

Yes?---When I refer her to the department it's different department, different project for the elder group, not the Health Department.

MR RAJALINGAM: How much money do you say was spent on the handyman at Bankstown?---I can't really remember that. I tried all my best. I tried to look into my notes. I couldn't remember more.

THE COMMISSIONER: But it appears that this note that you've written here is not correct?---No, it is actually correct, sir. I did the work, I can't remember how much. Many people actually worked on that project - - -

10 No, stop. The note here is asking for reimbursement for \$8,990 on the basis that it was work spent for a handyman at Bankstown. That's not correct, is it?---The work was done.

20 No, is that note not correct?---Yes, yes, the note is correct, the work is done, and we did the work over there. That's all what I remember. That's all what I recollect from my memory. The number, why it's 8,990, why it's the same number is what I can't remember really, what, what happened over there, how much we did. We're talking about frail aged so we really needed to do more work in the premises to be able to accommodate this group and many of them were on wheelchair as well, so I can't really remember why the number is the same, truly I can't.

MR RAJALINGAM: Ms Sharobeem, in the middle of April you purchased \$9,000 worth of membership points on your personal credit card. Would you accept that?---Yes.

30 13 days later you're presenting a receipt to the bookkeeper for the exact same amount and you're suggesting in a note at the same time that it related to work done at the Bankstown Community Hall. Do you accept that that's what you've done?---Yes, but that's, there is no relation between them.

Just, just stop. Just stop. No, no, no. Stop.---When you put them together - - -

I understand. That's the point, yes.---When you put them together - - -

Ms Sharobeem - - -?--- - - - you, you appear as you're trying to say they are linked. They are not linked.

40 You must have known that the receipt that is now cut and presented to the bookkeeper for \$8,990, you must have known that that receipt related to the purchase of membership points you had made about two weeks before. ---But if that, I'm just trying to think aloud here. If that's the case I wouldn't go to different people in the organisation and say we have this holiday package and people can travel with it, isn't it?

It's a lie, isn't it, Ms Sharobeem? It's a lie to the bookkeeper and it's a lie to the Commission.---No, sir, it's neither a lie to the bookkeeper, neither a lie to the Commission. No, it's not.

Take you to page 52 of volume 5. 50. Ms Sharobeem, in January of 2013 you called Classic Club Holiday and you made inquiries about a holiday at the Pacific Palms. Do you remember doing that?---Yes. Remember? No, I'm reading.

3 January, 2013 at 5.27pm, you called Classic Club holiday membership. ---Okay.

10 It's the Classic Holidays Club. Do you agree that in January 2013 you called them about a booking?---Okay.

And that was a booking in relation to you, wasn't it?---To, yeah, to, well, I'm just trying to read. Yeah, okay.

Go to 3 January, 2013 at 5.38. It says there essentially that a booking had been made at Pacific Palms from 2 February to 9 February, 2013. My question to you is do you recall staying there between those dates?---I'm trying to remember.

20

The message above is the confirmation of your booking, Ms Sharobeem. ---Okay.

So do you agree that in January or February 2013 you used the Classic Holiday Club membership for your personal benefit?---All right.

Go to page 49. Do you see an entry for 4 December, 2013. Email in, second column. Reference to your name, Eman Sharobeem, with your contact number.---Ah hmm.

30

Do you agree with that?---Yeah.

And what are you asking about in your email inquiry, Ms Sharobeem? Do you remember?---No.

It says you're inquiring about a property on Mantra on Salt Beach for four people.---Mmm.

40 Do you know who you were making travel arrangements for?---No, no. I made several inquiries but I can't remember. Which one is that?

RECORDING INTERRUPTED

[10.39am]

RECORDING RESUMED

[10.41am]

THE WITNESS: When you buy this, it doesn't give you free or points, no, it doesn't. Every time you found on the website cheap holiday, you can pay for it and use it. That's all what it does or gives you. So you look at, they call it hot deals or cheap holidays. That's all it means.

MR RAJALINGAM: All right, Ms Sharobeem. Just we'll stop with the telephone calls. I'll take you to a statement from the resolution officer of the Classic Holiday Club at paragraph 5, page 38 of volume 5. The Commission has a statement from the Classic Holiday Club, Ms Sharobeem, so what you're saying about the points, we'll go to the statement, okay.
10 ---Sure. I'm just stating what I understand.

You read paragraph 5 to yourself.

RECORDING INTERRUPTED [10.42am]

SHORT ADJOURNMENT [10.45am]
20

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, Mr Rajalingam.

MR RAJALINGAM: Thank you, Commissioner. Ms Sharobeem, I asked you to read paragraph 5 of the Classic Holiday Club resolution officer's statement. Can I show that to you again. It's page 38 of volume 5, statement brief. Did you have a chance to read all that, Ms Sharobeem?
---I'm towards the end. Yes, I read it.

30 Do you agree that to obtain the benefits of the holiday you had to purchase membership points from Classic Holiday Club?---Yes, I understand that.

Can I take you then to page 49. I think I was asking you some questions about Mantra on Salt Beach. I'll just go over that again. 4 December, 2013 do you agree that you made an inquiry for four people to travel to Mantra on Salt Beach, to travel and stay at Mantra on Salt Beach?---(No Audible Reply)

40 See it says travel as four adults?---Yeah, I can see that.

Do you agree that that inquiry related to a holiday for four people?---Yes.

Do you agree that it related to a holiday at Salt Beach, four people?---It's mentioned here, yes.

Do you agree going on a holiday to Salt Beach – do you agree – do you recall going on a holiday to Salt Beach?---Do I agree on what?

Do you recall going on a holiday to Salt Beach?---No.

Can I take you to 8 January, 2014 at the top of the page. That was the Surfers Paradise holiday that I took you to and you said that you and your partner Haiman I think went on that trip. Do you agree with that?---Sorry, come again please.

10 Do you agree that you and your partner Haiman Hammo went on a trip to Surfers Paradise between 27 January to 1 February, 2014?---Yes.

And did you do that on the Classic Holiday Club membership points?---We paid for it, yes.

Did you do that through Classic Holiday Club?---We used some of the points and we paid for the rest of the holiday.

When you say you paid - - -?---It was the whole thing.

20 - - - for the rest of the holiday isn't it the case that you would pay Classic Holiday Club extra money to obtain more points to go on the holiday?---Not to obtain more points but to pay for the accommodation - - -

Who would you pay?--- - - - as the whole deal.

Who did you pay?---The club.

That's what I mean. So you've - - -?---Yeah.

30 You paid more money to the club for more points didn't you essentially? ---Not to my understanding.

Okay. All right.---My understanding is it's advertised as a hot, hot deal and we pay for it. That's what I understand. It has points but then you pay for the rest or something.

Can I take you to the next page 48. Do you agree there that a quote is provided to you in January of 2014 in relation to three different hotels and you ring some later – some days later, do you see that?---Yes, I can see that.

40 And you thank the person Max for their advice regarding the points, do you accept that?---I can see that.

Would – Ms Sharobeem - - -?---I'm thanking him regarding the advice about the points.

Yes. Can I ask you a question?---Sure.

Did your sons ever go with you on your holidays using Classic Club Holiday membership points?---Not that I remember.

How many times do you recall going on holidays with the Classic Holiday Club, through Classic Holiday Club, rather?---I remember once.

It was more than that, wasn't it, Ms Sharobeem?---I do remember once right now.

10 Wasn't it more than once?---No, I do remember once, I just remember once.

Did your son, Richard, come with you on holidays through Classic Holiday Club?---Ah, not that I remember.

On the last occasion you said this about you using, your use of the membership, Ms Sharobeem. You said, "It was used once and it was used by me just to experience what happened and I paid for it, but the idea is to buy a week of holiday for a woman and her children worth \$400."---Or so

20

You said that at page 830. Do you agree with that?---Yeah.

You said, "I didn't get the experience for it that much but I bought it for the organisation so women once a year or if we do a raffle ticket or something can get a week with their holiday with their kids." Do you agree you said that?---That's the idea, yes.

30 You agree that no clients from the Immigrant Women's Health Service ever used the Classic Holiday Club membership, don't you?---To my recollection I can't even recall but I, I can't recall yes or no.

You gave evidence, yeah, you gave evidence this morning that circumstances came up that you're not aware of that meant that no clients would use the service. Didn't you say that?---Not to that form as you framed it, but I was referring to a case where my memory actually is not helping much than remembering I offered this and the woman at that particular time was a breast cancer client and she had already her children with, so I can't remember why - - -

40 Did she, did she go on the holiday?---I can't remember why it didn't happen, if it didn't happen, I can't really remember.
Can you even remember if it happened at all?---Oh, yeah, I remember her sitting with me and talking to her, I remember all that, but I can't remember what happened after that, I can't. I was doing all that by my own so it's, the pressure on me was too much at that time.

I'll take you to page 48, the top of that page, 28 January, 2014, at 9.16am. Do you agree that you're referring to your son, Richard, in that message?

---Where would I look, can you please point?

The top message. Are you referring to your son assisting you with credit card payment for the holiday that you were going on?---(No Audible Reply)

Isn't that right?---Um - - -

10 You're nodding your head?---Ah, I'm just – sorry, I'm just trying to remember, I'm trying to remember based on what you show me. That's the same holiday, yes, maybe - - -

Do you agree that your son was involved in that holiday at least?---He went before us, used some days before we arrived, it's the same week.

Go to page 47?---Yeah, the, so I'm remembering right.

20 Do you see your email at the middle of that page, on 12 March, 2014? And you're inquiring about a property, Mantra Aqua, for four adults?---Where should I look again, sorry?

The middle of the page, 12 March, 2014.---Yes.

Who was that booking for, the four people that are referred to there?---Can't really remember.

Well, go to 14 March. There's another email that you send. And you say it is for "the four of us". Aren't you referring to you and your family?---(No Audible Reply)

30 Aren't you referring to you and your family?---I can't recall this at all. I'm trying.

Page 46. Can I take you to the fourth entry from the bottom, and that relates to a promotion. It says that you purchased one VIP pass. Do you see that? ---Mmm. Yes.

Do you remember purchasing a VIP pass?---Yes.

40 Do you know how much it was for?---No.

Ms Sharobeem, the Commission has done an investigation into the Classic Holiday Club, as you know, and the following receipt was provided to the Commission from the Classic Holiday Club. And I'll take you to volume 5, page 71. Ms Sharobeem, that receipt or the invoice is dated 26 October, 2016. Do you see that?---The '16?

At the top. At the top.---Yeah, yeah.

Now, that's got nothing to do with the actual transaction. That's simply the date on which the inquiry was made by Classic Holiday Club for the Commission. Do you understand that?---I can read that.

Do you see that the date on which the VIP pass was purchased - - -?---Yes.

- - - on the left-hand side is 26 March, 2014?---Yes.

Do you see it's for an amount of 489?---Yes.

10

Can you write those two things down? 26 March, 2014 and 489? And also can you write the receipt number down? 1-8-6-9-1-7-2. Do you agree with that, that's the receipt number?---Yes.

Have you written those three things down?---Yes.

Can you show me?---Sorry?

20

What you've written on your notepad.---I don't want my notes to be on a public record. This is my notes.

Yeah, well, can you, for your own record, can you write down the things that I'm asking you about? Because you're getting confused by my questions, Ms Sharobeem.---But, sir, you just asked me to write them.

Yes.---And I did.

30

Okay. Can I have a look?---I don't want you to. I want, I don't want this to be on camera.

Well, Commissioner - - -?---Why, why should I do that?

- - - in my submission, last time an exercise was undertaken that this witness, she made notes on a completely unrelated document and was unhelpful. I haven't raised that with the witness yet but I'm asking the witness to show me notes of what she's making in the witness box.

THE COMMISSIONER: I don't think it's necessary, Mr Rajalingam.

40

MR RAJALINGAM: Yeah, sure.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you. Just proceed.

MR RAJALINGAM: Do you understand that there's a date of 26 March, 2014?---What understand? I wrote it down here.

Yeah. And that was the day on which this pass was purchased for \$489?---I can see that and I wrote it down.

I'm going to take you to a reimbursement made to your account. It's volume 2, page 267. Do you agree it's a transfer on 31 March, 2014 to your account for an amount of \$489?---I can read that.

Do you agree that it is a transfer from the IWHS account to your account for \$489?---I can see that.

10 Do you agree that it has a description on it repay?---I can see that.

Do you agree that this transfer was made some five days after you purchased your VIP pass?---I can see that.

Do you agree with it?---I can see it.

Well, I told you that the VIP pass was purchased on 26 March wasn't it?---I wrote that down.

20 Yeah. And the transfer was on 31 March wasn't it?---Yes.

So five days later would you agree there was a transfer for an identical amount?---Yes.

Can you turn the page please to page 268. Did you submit this receipt in support of a reimbursement to your account from IWHS funds?---(No Audible Reply)

30 THE COMMISSIONER: Is that your handwriting on the document, paid to be reimbursed?---It's very similar to my handwriting, paid to be reimbursed.

So did you write that?---I can't remember writing it down but I can't really relate to this document because I can't remember buying office furniture from Queensland. I, I don't think I did.

That's because it's being suggested that you made that up.---Office furniture from Queensland? No, I didn't.

40 MR RAJALINGAM: Ms Sharobeem, do you see that it has the same receipt number from the Classic Holiday Club trust?---And payment method viewpoint online.

Everything is identical apart from the top part of that document and the addressee?---The amount is the same 489.

THE COMMISSIONER: The receipt number?---Receipt number 1-8-6-9-1-7-2. It's the receipt number I have here - - -

Yes.--- - - - for the VIP.

Yes. So it's suggesting - - -?---But I - - -

- - - that you forged it?---No, no, no, no, no, no. Okay, just a moment. I did not buy furniture from Queensland.

10 That's not the point. The point is, the other question that has been put suggested that you've deliberately misled the accountant to get reimbursed for something that you paid for for personal use.---The yes or no answer is definitely no and even when I looked at this document it was very foreign to me. I can't recall at all seeing office furniture purchased from Queensland. That's why when I looked at it I was wondering what's this document about until I was told to look at the receipt number. This is a document I did not make or create or even saw before. The 489 is a VIP pass.

20 Yes.---I even can't remember purchasing this pass yet alone that if it's done for a personal purpose then it's also on my desk during this dark year of 2014 when everything was taken and fabrication was made and I said that to the Commission before. I did not see – this is the first time I am seeking this document.

So are you suggesting that somebody else fabricated it so that the \$489 could be credited to your account, paid back to you?---Absolutely. I mean it's \$489. Why would I do such a thing?

30 Because it's being suggested that you used the accounts of the organisation for your own purposes and for your own lifestyle. But are you saying to me that you feel that somebody has fabricated all of this to frame you?---I saw that before, sir, and I pointed that out before about the 12 chairs for Inada, which - - -

Yes, all right. I understand.---Yeah. I'm sorry.

I'm just trying to understand what you're saying.---Yes.

So you're saying that somebody has fabricated this?---Absolutely.

All right.---And I didn't see this before.

40 Thank you.---This is the first time I'm sighting this.

Yes, no, I understand. Thank you.

MR RAJALINGAM: I'm going to hand you the Classic Holiday Club Trust document in hard copy, Ms Sharobeem, to make this very simple for you. Do you agree, Ms Sharobeem, that the only different, the differences – Ms Sharobeem, you need to listen to my question for us to get anywhere with this.---I am. I am. I'm just trying to see this.

Listen to my – just, just wait. Just, just hold that document. Don't look at it. Look at me.---Sure. I'm, I'm sorry. This is just getting another new level of shocks, I'm sorry.

Yeah, well, you heard my opening address.---Just, just give me a minute - -
-

Okay.--- - - - to recall what is this. Sorry.

10

Yes. Okay. I'm going to ask you a question.---Yes.

Before you, the hard copy document is a Classic Holiday Club Trust invoice or receipt, isn't it?---In my hand, yes.

The hard copy is a Classic Holiday Club Trust receipt, isn't it?---Yes, it is.

What's in front of you on the computer screen is a receipt from Office Furniture and Equipment.---Yes.

20

Would you agree with that?---Yes.

Do you agree that the differences between the hard copy Classic Holiday Club Trust receipt you have and the one on the screen are as follows? Firstly, the title is different?---Yes.

Do you agree that the receipt on the screen does not contain the phone and fax details?---Yes.

30

But the same ABN number - - -?---That's right.

- - - as the Classic Holiday Club Trust receipt, right?---That's right.

You agree with that?---That's right.

All right. They're both addressed to you, aren't they?---No, no.

Yes, isn't that right?---No, this is addressed to my home.

40

Yes, doesn't it have your name on it? The one on the screen has your name?---Yes, yes, of course. I am the holder of the account.

Yeah. And the one in your hand, the hard copy, has your name on it too, doesn't it?---That's right.

All right. The one for Classic Holiday Club Trust in your hand is addressed to you at your home address, isn't it?---That's right.

The one on the screen is the IWHS PO box, isn't it?---That's right.

Both receipts have the same number, don't you agree?---Yes, yes.

They have the same account ID, don't you agree?---Yes.

10 There's a different date on the Classic Holiday Club receipt because it was provided much later to us, the Commission. Do you agree that the only other change there is the contents of what is being paid for in the description? Isn't it the case that you have - - -?---(not transcribable)

- - - deleted "VIP passport" from the Classic Holiday Club Trust and put in there "chairs and desk, including shipping"?---I disagree with what you said right now.

You have - - -?---You, you're saying to me that you deleted, you, you are saying to me that you deleted and you want me to say that I deleted? You want me to admit something I didn't do?

20 I am suggesting that you falsified the document on screen.---You're trapping me in the words. This is too much.

THE COMMISSIONER: Just calm, just calm, just calm - - -?---One minute, this is too much.

Just calm down. Just calm down.---Just one minute. This is too much to see. All right. Just one second, one second, one second.

30 But you can see that this document has been fabricated?---Yes, I can see that now.

Yes, all right. Thank you. That's all.---But, but he's saying, "That's you." He's trying to put the you in the middle and I am a very simple person to be trapped in this way.

Well, he's suggesting to you that, for your answer, that you are the person who fabricated it.---Of course not.

40 Okay. Thank you.

MR RAJALINGAM: Ms Sharobeem, do you agree that you were the person that had possession at least of the Classic Holiday Club Trust receipt at some point in 2014? You must have had it.---This is came to my home.

Yes. And so you agree you had it?---This is came to my home and all my letters always goes to my bag and to my desk.

Just stop there, that's all right, just stop there?---That's the truth.

The next question is, on the screen to you agree that the office furniture and equipment receipt has the same ABN number - - -?---Which is very silly.

- - - as the Classic Club Holiday Trust receipt?---Yes, of course, it's here.

So the person who had the Classic Holiday Club receipt would have known the ABN number, wouldn't they?---It's written.

10 Yeah. And it's also there on the office, office furniture and equipment receipt, isn't it?---Yes, it's here.

But that clearly can't be the same business, can it?---Sorry, what do you mean?

Well, two businesses can't have the same ABN number, can they, Ms Sharobeem?---They've been registered for the business.

20 Yes?---And the business is the Classic Holiday, not office furniture and equipment.

Did you have the Classic Holiday Club Trust receipt in your hand in March 2014?---I can't remember.

It was sent to your address, wasn't it, Ms Sharobeem?---Yes.

You'd made a purchase for \$489 on 26 March, 2014, for VIP pass, hadn't you?---Of course.

30 You knew that, didn't you?---Knew what?

You knew that you'd made a purchase from Classic Holiday Club, didn't you?---Four years ago?

In March 2014 when you received - - -?---Four years ago, three years ago? Yes, well, you just showed me that I made this purchase. Fine. Yes. Okay. But this is a very foreign document to me.

40 It's not foreign, Ms Sharobeem, that's your handwriting on that receipt, isn't it, in front of you on the screen at page 268?---Well, definitely that appeared to be reimbursed if this is my handwriting and - - -

That is your handwriting, yes?--- - - - it was made on the paper, not on this, because this belongs to the organisation. Why this is different from anything?

You wrote on that office furniture and equipment receipt, "Paid, to be reimbursed" and you knew - - -?---No.

You just said you did?---No, no, I didn't say that. No, I didn't say that. All what I said is this might be my handwriting, most likely it's my handwriting, but I didn't write it on officer furniture and equipment, no, I didn't.

Well, it's there, isn't it, Ms Sharobeem?---This is a copy.

10 Is it, is it magic that it somehow appeared on this document?---Why, well
- - -

Is it?---No, no, no, but it's very simple that I wrote this on this and this was fabricated after. This is very simple to fabricate, very simple. This is computer.

How would you fabricate it, Ms Sharobeem?---How do I?

20 How would you fabricate it then, tell me?---I don't have the skills to do that,
sir.

Well, why did you say it would be easy to fabricate?---This is a document created from a computer. This doesn't have any logo in it, isn't it, so anyone can write this. This, I'm not – this is not magic, this is just no logo.

30 It was submitted in support of a reimbursement to your account. Do you agree with that?---No, I don't, I don't know how this was created and when and how and, and why. Sir, if, in my mind, the Classic Holiday owed to the organisation and I bought something, I had the opportunity to submit it to be reimbursed. Why would I fabricate this? This is argument number 1.
Argument number 2 is, no, no, sorry, I withdraw this. Sorry, I'm just mixed up right now, but for sure, for sure this was on my desk and it was paid to me and this was made up. Right now my mind is just telling me that this is no other translation to this except that. I can see any other interpretation to this except that. Am I making sense? I'm sorry.

40 Ms Sharobeem, in January of 2013 did you agree for Mr Haiman Hammo to become an authorised person on the Classic Holiday Club membership account, yes or no?---Yes. I wasn't able to manage this so if we need to make any, any inquiry I ask him to do that and that's also when I learn that I – no one can do the search except me because I'm the only authorised person. I didn't have time to do anything more than what I was doing.

Commissioner, I'll be another five minutes on this topic. Page 46 of volume 5. Do you agree, just before getting to that document, Ms Sharobeem, that Mr Haiman Hammo, your partner, was organising a trip to Queenstown in late 2014 for you and your family?---Yes. Yes.

And he was doing that through the Classic Holiday Club membership account wasn't he?---Yes, if I recall.

And it had nothing to do with the Immigrant Women's Health Service. Is that right?---No. We were trying to find cheap accommodation for us.

Pardon me, Commissioner. Commissioner, is that a suitable time for break?

10 THE COMMISSIONER: Yes. We'll take the morning tea adjournment.

SHORT ADJOURNMENT

[11.35am]

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, Mr Rajalingam.

20 MR RAJALINGAM: Thank you, Commissioner. Ms Sharobeem, before the break you gave some evidence about the office furniture and equipment receipt that I showed you. Do you agree with that?---Yes.

And you said something about it could easily be fabricated.---It looked like a Word document.

Do you remember that?---It looked like a Word document.

30 Yeah. I'll show you – the Commission has gone to the effort of finding the original invoice with what appears to be your original ink handwriting on it and I'm going to ask you to look at that document then the investigator is going to turn on the computer and show you the document you were looking at before. Will you accept, Ms Sharobeem, that the document in your hand is the same, firstly, the same receipt as what's appearing on the screen? ---Yes, it is.

The document in your hand in your hand, in your left hand has your handwriting on it doesn't it?---Yes, it appears as my handwriting.

And it looks like it's original ink doesn't it?---I'm not really sure. I'm - - -

40 You can verify - - -?---I'm not - - -

- - - can you not that that receipt in your hand is dated 26 March, 2014 the same day you made the purchase for the VIP points, do you agree with that?---I agree with what I see.

Commissioner, I understand I'm not in a position to tender that document but it can be marked. It is the same as what appears at volume 2, page 268 but the original copy of that.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes. It can be marked for identification.

#MFI 1 – ORIGINAL RECEIPT FROM OFFICE FURNITURE AND EQUIPMENT WITH HAND WRITTEN NOTES DATED 26 MARCH 2014

10 MR RAJALINGAM: Thank you, Commissioner. Ms Sharobeem, on the last occasion I took you to a number of retailers for which credit card receipts have been submitted in support of reimbursements to your account. A number of those retailers were Harvey Norman, Bing Lee, Eye Concept. Do you remember me taking you to those receipts?---Yeah, I do.

All right. I've been through the transcript and the brief and there's a couple more receipts that I need to take you to. The first is at volume 1, page 79. It's a Harvey Norman receipt. Do you see that document?---(No Audible Reply)

20 Do you see it, Ms Sharobeem?---I see a document. I didn't look at the details yet.

Do you see that the – yes, I just need the MFI returned. Thank you. Do you see that the receipt on the left-hand side is a credit card receipt for the amount of \$379?---Yes, I can see that.

30 If you turn back a page – keep going back to the transfer – do you see that transfer to your account from IWHS funds for \$3,307.20 on 9 July, 2010? ---Yes, I can see that.

So the receipt I showed you from Harvey Norman was submitted in support of that reimbursement. If you go back to the receipt on page 79, are you able to say, Ms Sharobeem, what that receipt related to? Without looking at the right-hand side, can you say just by looking at the credit card receipt what it related to?---The information under the word "customer" is a bit fade so I don't know. It's not clear.

40 It's for a computer, which is what was submitted, the invoice on the right-hand side. Do you see that?---The right-hand side um, the right-hand side is 499.

It says, "Dell Work Centre?"---Yeah, yeah.

The invoice was addressed to you at your [REDACTED] address?---Yeah.

But it's been redacted. So I'm saying that to you?---It's been oh, you took

It's been redacted?---Yeah, you hide the address, yeah.

What was this purchase in relation to?---Ah, this is a purchase from which year ah, 2010?

Yes, the credit card receipt is for 2010?---Ah, it's Dell Work Centre. Well, it's, Dell is a computer brand so - - -

10 Yes. Was it delivered to your [REDACTED] address?---Delivered?

Was it delivered?---Um, no, I can't remember.

Did you pick it up?---I can't remember at all.

See in the middle of that document it says, "pick up schedule 19 June, 2010?"---Work Centre. Sorry, come again?

20 See in the middle of that document it says, "pick up schedule 19 June, 2010?"---Pick up schedule? Yeah, pick up or delivery, yes, yeah.

Do you know if this went to your [REDACTED] address or if it went to the Immigrant Women's Health Service?---No, I can't remember, but Harvey Norman have a system, they register your details and whenever you make any purchase it goes to the same details in the invoice, they don't change, and you can, you can investigate that yourself.

30 All right. I've shown you that receipt and invoice for the sake of completeness, but do you see that on this occasion what was submitted for reimbursement was the credit card receipt and also the invoice from Harvey Norman. Would you accept that?---If that's what you found in the organisation.

40 If you add, if you include this relatively small purchase for \$380 with the other Harvey Norman receipts that you submitted for reimbursement, the total from Harvey Norman is \$17,089.94. Do you understand what I'm saying? So just turning that document off, the total of receipts that you submitted between July 2010 and May 2015, so July 2010 and May 2015, the total of receipts from Harvey Norman that you submitted in support of reimbursements to your account was \$17,089.94. Do you understand what I've said to you?---Over five years?

Over five years.---All right.

It is suggested to you that you submitted those receipts dishonestly in support of reimbursements to your account from IWHS for your personal benefit. What do you say about that?---No, I didn't.

What do you say about that?---No, I did not.

There were \$18,000 approximately worth of reimbursements to your account. Are you suggesting that all of them were work-related?---I can't really respond yes and no. I don't know.

Did you - - -?---Every individual one is different and I explained to the Commission before that many of my personal invoice were reimbursed my mistake to me and we already said that clear in the previous time. So I can't really respond yes or no.

10

You said on the last occasion that the – do you remember the Charleston lounge suite that was purchased at Harvey Norman?---I already responded to that.

And it was – do you remember what colour it was?---I already responded to that.

What colour was the Charleston lounge suite?---I can't remember.

20

It was a beige lounge.---I already responded to that.

Do you recall saying that it was a beige lounge?---I already responded to that.

Well, do you recall saying it was a beige lounge?---I already responded to this point.

And what was your answer?---You have it on record.

30

Ms Sharobeem, was a beige Charleston lounge sent to Cabramatta?---No. Blue.

Ms Sharobeem, on the last occasion you said that the blue couch went to Fairfield and that the beige couch went to Cabramatta. Page 713, line 29. I asked you, well, you bought two sets of lounges, right? You said the beige one went to Cabramatta, the blue one went to Fairfield “in particular in the child care room when we had the,” and that should be under AAP or maybe MPP, “when we had the mother breastfeeding area.” Do you agree that you said that to the Commission in May this year?---You were asking me different questions at that time, so I can't remember was that - - -

40

No, I was asking you about the Neptune and the Charleston lounges that you purchased from Harvey Norman.---I remember I corrected the record about the lounges, sir.

Well - - -?---I remember I did that before the break. I remember I did that. And it's on record. I just don't want to keep saying things which I can't remember.

Ms Sharobeem, at page 714 of the transcript I asked you again, at line 14, "And you could remember that the beige couch went to Cabramatta?" and you said, "I remember organising them. I remember seeing them in their place. I remember the staff saying okay about it or not. I remember when they were old that they were recycled and took them home to my new address after some years." That's what you said to the Commission. Do you remember that?---And I remember I talked about it after that as well. In record you will find it.

10

That was false, wasn't it?---No.

That was a lie, wasn't it?---No.

Where did the Charleston lounge go?---You will have it on record.

You just said today that it went to the Fairfield centre. Are you lying about - - -?---No, I didn't.

20

You said the beige couch - - -?---What did I say today about the lounges? I - - -

You said the beige - - -?---I didn't say anything about the lounges.

Well, Ms Sharobeem, that's what I heard. Your lawyer hasn't gotten up to object. That's what you said. You said the beige couch went to Fairfield. In May you said the beige couch went to Cabramatta. Let me show you the receipt and the invoice for the Charleston lounge. Page - - -?---Did we talk about the lounges today? I can't remember. I'm sorry.

30

Volume 4. Volume 4, page 152. Do you see that, that invoice, Ms Sharobeem? Do you see the pick-up and delivery address at [REDACTED] at the bottom? You probably won't.---I can see.

No, well, you're looking at a redacted version. I wonder if the witness can be shown page 152 of volume 4 of the allegation brief. 152.---Thank you. Do I need to keep it? I'm sorry.

40

That's the invoice, Ms Sharobeem, that Harvey Norman have provided to the Commission. Do you see that the invoice is addressed to you at your [REDACTED] address in the top left-hand corner, do you agree with that?---Yes.

And do you agree that the pick-up and delivery address at the bottom is [REDACTED] Yes.

Do you also agree that in the middle of – you’ll see on the screen here, it’s not even redacted, you go to the middle just under where it says, “Ivory,” and “Customer responsibilities,” it says there, do you agree with this?
---Yes.

Look at the document. “To make sure the goods will fit, to be home on delivery day or extra fees apply.” Do you agree that that’s contained on the invoice?---It’s written on the invoice.

10 Would you accept that the Charleston lounge, which is here described as ivory in colour, was delivered to your [REDACTED] address?---Sir, I remember before the holiday that I already said that the ivory was delivered to my address and the blue one was delivered and I sent it to Cabramatta.

THE COMMISSIONER: So your answer is - - -?---I answered this already. This is why I’m confused, why we’re going back to it. I already, that was made on record.

20 Ah hmm. So you accept that the ivory or beige lounge was delivered to your address?---Was made to my address, but the blue one was made to my address and I sent it to Cabramatta.

Okay.

MR RAJALINGAM: Are you suggesting that the Charleston lounge was sent to Cabramatta sometime later after it was purchased?---Not sometimes later, it’s, I um, I can’t remember how, how long after, I can’t remember.

30 Pardon me. Ms Sharobeem, it’s incredible what you’re saying because you’re saying that the Charleston lounge was first delivered to your house, then it ended up at the Immigrant Women’s Health Service. Ms Sharobeem, it was found at your house in [REDACTED] when the Commission did a search there?---They did the search in 2017.

Yeah?---The purchase was made many years before and when recycle happened I got it, when we did the recycle I got it, like the others. One of our fridges was sent actually to NESH Guildford office, if you will go and search there you will find it there.

40 You know Ms Sharobeem that Ms Chan said that the Cabramatta centre never received a new lounge. You know that, don’t you?---You know that everyone will sit on this chair will try to save themselves and they’re not going to look at any other one. Everyone will try to save themselves.

May you answer the question, please?---So I can’t really say people lied or not, but these people took these items. Even when you ask Marie if she took anything and Marie said strongly no - - -

I'm not asking you about Marie, Ms Sharobeem?--- - - - well, go and check her home, the holiday house, you will find the lounge if she didn't get rid of it.

My suggestion to you is that your evidence about the Charlestown lounge being - - -?---And it was, it was taken - - -

- - - delivered - - -?--- - - - by her own son from the service, so - no - it was taken by her own husband from the service.

10

My suggestion to you, Ms Sharobeem is that your evidence on the last occasion about the Charleston lounge, the ivory Charlestown lounge being delivered to Cabramatta was a lie, wasn't it?---No, I don't lie.

20

I'm going to move on. For Bing Lee on the last occasion I missed another receipt and I'm going to take you to it. Volume 1, 181, page 181. Volume 1, reimbursement allegation, page 181. Is that a Bing Lee receipt, Ms Sharobeem, for \$795 submitted in support of a reimbursement to your account on 23 September, 2011? And I'll ask you to go back a couple of pages to confirm the transfer. That's the transfer to your account, Ms Sharobeem, 23 September, 2011. Do you agree with that?---It's my account.

From IWHS to your account?---It's from, yeah, from the service to my account.

If we go to page 181, that's a receipt that you submitted in support of reimbursements to you. Would you agree?---Um - - -

30

Part of it.---That's year 2011, yeah.

Yeah. And that's your writing at the top right-hand corner with the six and the squiggle and the circle around it?---No, that's not.

Are you sure about that?---Sorry, which one you're pointing at?

The circle, the figure with the circle around it. That's your handwriting isn't it?---Six. It's very similar to my handwriting.

40

In total, Ms Sharobeem, there was \$7,785 worth of receipts submitted in support of reimbursements to your account between September, 2011 and January, 2015 from Bing Lee. Do you understand that?---That's your calculation.

Do you understand the allegation?---That's your calculation.

What's your response to it though, that you dishonestly submitted receipts from Bing Lee to be reimbursed a total of \$7,785?---I, I of course disagree. I don't know what you're referring to.

You were being dishonest when you were - - -?---Over five years.

My suggestion is that you were being dishonest when you were submitting these receipts from Bing Lee because they related to personal expenses.

---No, sir. I'm not dishonest at all.

10

You were being dishonest with the auditor weren't you when he was asking you questions about the expenses. Would you agree with that?---Disagree fully.

Would you agree that you gave him false representations about what certain expenses were?---Disagree fully.

I'm going to take you to reimbursement, allegation brief, volume 3, page 74. Pardon me, Commissioner. Do you see the receipt I'm taking you to, Ms Sharobeem, it is the \$4,000 receipt in the top middle of the screen. Can you see that?---Bing Lee Casula?

20

Yeah.---I can see it.

Would you accept that there's no way to tell what that receipt relates to from looking at it?---There are other documents submitted of course.

No, no. Well, this is what was submitted in support of the reimbursement. It was a piece of paper, namely a credit card receipt, and that was it.---I don't think so. This is a big amount. Definitely there were some paper documented with it or - - -

30

Ms Sharobeem.--- - - - mentioned with it.

Ms Sharobeem.---Yeah.

Your evidence just before the morning tea break was that you accepted you submitted a credit card receipt for \$8,990 and you told the bookkeeper that it related to a handyman when it clearly didn't.---I didn't say that.

40

So you were submitting - - -?---I didn't say what you're saying.

- - - receipts for large amounts weren't you without any supporting documentation?---No. Not, not, not 4,000. The - - -

Well, that's clearly incorrect because we've got all the reimbursements here and we've looked through them and there's nothing more than credit card receipts for the vast bulk of them, Ms Sharobeem.---I don't think it's true.

So just by looking at this one, can you say - - -?---I don't think it's true. I don't think it's true. I, I think in my own mind - - -

Well, that's for you, Ms Sharobeem. Would you agree that by looking at this - - -?--- - - - Bing Lee is an organisation or a store where they have other document – sorry, electronics and definitely if there is – at least the warranty is supported by that because there was a big fight with all the warranty so people can follow up equipment we buy.

10

So you say do you, Ms Sharobeem, that when you submitted these reimbursements you knew what they were for?---It's Bing Lee. It's electronics.

Do you say that when you submitted that reimbursement, the receipt for reimbursement, this one on the screen, that you knew what it was for? ---Right now asking me this question the reply is this is Bing Lee and it's electronic store. The warranty of this equipment purchased definitely it's kept in the organisation and given to the administration to follow up.

20

So if you had the warranty then at the time you submitted this receipt for reimbursement you would know what it was for wouldn't you?---Of course. At that time, yes.

We'll go to page, volume 5, page 35. Do you remember Mr Boyd, the auditor, gave you a number of schedules of reimbursements and asked you to comment on what they were?---I remember he did that.

Sorry?---I remember he did that.

30

And he gave you a schedule of reimbursements, a document didn't he? ---Yes, more than once.

Yeah. And next to certain expenses you wrote down or typed in what those expenses were for didn't you?---To my best recollection so we can get this audit done and finish with it.

Did the Immigrant Women's Health Service ever have a multi-room screening system at the service?---A multi-room screening service?

40

System. Multi-room screening system.---System. Yes, we did.

What brand was it?---I can't remember the brand.

How much did it cost?---Quite a large sum.

Where was it?---In different rooms.

How did it work, Ms Sharobeem? How did it work?---But the main screen was in my room.

How did it work? How did it work?---In my office. It actually goes with the cameras so we can see each room.

So you've got a camera in each room, is that what you're saying?---Yes. More in big rooms. More than one camera.

10 And how many different units were there that operated this multi-screening system?---I can't remember how many units it was. It was installed by professionals, so I didn't - - -

So it recorded as well, did it?---Sometimes. But he was trying to set up the recording and I wasn't really clever in working the recording.

Who? Who was trying?---The person who installed it for us.

20 So it's not a projector? It's like a security system, is that what you're saying?---We also had a projector. We - - -

What brand was that?---I can't remember the brand.

You can't remember the brand of the projector?---No, I'm, I'm very bad with brands and things like that.

What about the multi-screening system?---What about it?

30 What brand was that?---I can't remember brands, I'm sorry. But I remember that the guy came and put the screen on my desk and another one for the reception, I believe, because we discovered that items have been banish and also there was no monitoring for the rooms, and for occupational health and safety we had to put this system in place.

So who else knew that there was this system in place?---The administrators and - - -

40 So Ms Abboud and Ms El-Baf would know about the multi-screening - - -?
---Sir, who?

Ms Abboud and Ms El-Baf would know about the multi-screening system?
---Yes, of course.

Who else?---They were actually monitoring the guy who put it for us.

Who else knew about this?---I can't remember.

All right.---I don't know.

So they would be well aware if it was installed, wouldn't they?---Who?

Ms Abboud and Ms El-Baf.---Yeah, yeah. They were following the guy who did the installation.

10 I'll show you volume 5, page 35. So the receipt relates to a 636-litre side-by-side Samsung fridge, Ms Sharobeem, which Harvey – Bing Lee, rather, it's delivered to your address, Ms Sharobeem.---Because it's my personal purchase.

The fridge, the 636-litre fridge, went to [REDACTED] didn't it?---Of course it has to go because it's my personal purchase and I never ask for reimbursement for my personal purchase. This is my personal purchase. You showed me that before and I said that before.

And we go back to the receipt - - -?---I'm not going to be shocked again with this.

20 - - - at volume 3, page 74. That receipt actually relates to the 636-litre fridge, Ms Sharobeem.---What? Sorry.

The receipt that I showed you, which you identified was a receipt for a multi-screening – well, actually, withdraw that. The receipt I showed you for \$4,000 relates to the 636-litre fridge. Did you submit that in support of that reimbursement?---No way. No.

30 Well, it's there, Ms Sharobeem. Do you agree that the Post-in note next to that receipt has “office outreach establishment” written on it?---Yes, it's my handwriting.

And that's your handwriting, isn't it?---Yes. But that's a Post-it note. You can put it anywhere you like.

I'll take you to page 57.---Where is the reference to that?

Volume 3.---And this is not my handwriting. The number written there is not my handwriting.

40 That's volume 3, page 57 of the allegation brief. Do you see the receipt for \$1,287?---Can you please point to it?

On the – well, there are three of them at the bottom. And you recall I took you to those receipts which were submitted in support of reimbursements? There are two declined receipts that were submitted. On - - -?---No, not submitted. I disagree with your word submitted. I did not submit it.

You were paid an amount equivalent to the total of receipts submitted in support of this reimbursement?---The bookkeeper deposit this amount in my account without my permission.

The receipt in the bottom right-hand corner is one for \$1,287 on 8 June, 2014. Would you agree with that?---Can you please point to it? Can you kindly point to it?

The bottom right-hand corner?---Yes, yes, I can see it now.

10

When you were asked by the auditor you said that that receipt was for a camera for the Fairfield office. Is that true or not true?---We purchased the camera which I didn't get a chance to return it back because I didn't do a handover until now. I can't remember this is for the camera or not, this is not my handwriting.

If you didn't know it related to a camera why did you tell the auditor that it did?---At that time two years ago or three years ago maybe I remember that because I have more document, but what you, what you show me now, I can't really say yes or no.

20

You agree that you gave him incorrect information about the \$4,000 receipt for your 636-litre fridge, don't you?---No, I don't.

This particular receipt, Ms Sharobeem, for 1,297, relates to a TV and a DVD player. Did they go to your home?---No, of course, if they are bought for the service they are at the service, if they are old we recycle, as I said before.

30

Then why did you say to the auditor that it was a camera, it was for a camera for the Fairfield office?---So maybe we bought a camera at that time.

You said, Ms Sharobeem, that this particular receipt related to the camera, but it didn't?---I can't understand your question.

Do you agree that the responses you gave to the auditor, some of them at least, were incorrect in relation to the expenses that were being raised? ---No, I disagree. I reported back to him on this document, sent it back to management, to my best recollection while I was injured and I did my best to write everything in details.

40

All right. We'll go to volume 5, page 35. Pardon my back, Commissioner. Volume 23, page 108. Volume 23, allegation brief, page 107. Ms Sharobeem, do you agree that that's the document you provided to the auditor?---Hmm, no. No, I didn't provide that. I can't remember providing that.

Well, the auditor said that it was provided by you and it's also attached to the forensic investigators' report as provided by the auditor to the forensic investigators?---Um, no, I didn't. Maybe it's a document created by them but I didn't provide that. Maybe it's in different form but I can't remember this at all.

Do you agree that you gave evidence a little earlier that you noted down explanation for expenses on a reimbursement schedule provided by the auditor, Mr Boyd? Did you say that?---Yes, I did.

10

Does that look like the document?---No, it's not the document I provided, no.

Do you agree that that document was provided to the auditor?---This one? No, I didn't see this before, I'm just seeing it for the first time. I don't know what's this or who create it.

THE COMMISSIONER: When you were providing the details to the auditor did you write some of the things out?---He provided a schedule.

20

Yes.---A spreadsheet and I give wording explanation.

But did you write it out with a pen?---No, on the computer.

On the computer.---And send it to him open so he can – actually I didn't send it to him. At certain point when I was critically injured I asked the management committee to stop referring me to him directly so I was sending my document to the management committee and they would send it to him.

30

MR RAJALINGAM: Ms Sharobeem, I'm going to take you to the entries for Bonnyrigg Garden Centre on that document. Can you see them there on the screen, the first one 28 June, 2014. Do you see that?---Yes, I - - -

\$191.30?---Yes, I do.

And that says gardening project STEPS to Employment doesn't it?---It's written next to it.

40 Do you see the next entry for Bonnyrigg Garden Centre on 12 July, 2014, do you see that, and it has the same thing written next to the amount, gardening project STEPS to Employment?---12 July. Yes, I see that.

Do you see the next one on 13 December, 2014 for \$260.50?---Yes, I can see that.

And does it say gardening STEPS to Employment?---Gardening. Yes, I can see that.

Yeah. 23 December, 2014 another one from Bonnyrigg Garden Centre \$1,779.15.---Yes, I can see that.

Again does it say gardening project STEPS to Employment?---I can see that.

10 14 March, 2015 does it say Bonnyrigg Garden Centre 1,904.95 and the explanation there is gardening project STEPS to Employment?---I can see that.

Do you recall telling the auditor that the receipts from Bonnyrigg Garden Centre all related to the gardening project that STEPS to Employment was running?---I can't say that it's all. I remember that I said I made personal purchase from the gardening centre and also we were running the project and I said also that big amount is not relating to the organisation and I believe I repaid it back because they paid it to me by mistakes.

20 Where in this document have you – where in this document does it suggest that the Bonnyrigg Garden Centre expenses were personal expenses?---It is not here because I didn't create this document. It is actually submitted to the management.

Well, is your evidence then that at least what you've been taken to – those expenses that you have been taken to related to IWHS?---Sorry, come again. At least what?

30 I'll withdraw the question. I'll ask it again. Are you saying that the expenses on that document related to the STEPS to Employment program? ---No, not all of them, no, and I already said that before and I didn't write that and I already paid the amount which they made – they said that they paid it by mistake and I paid it back.

40 Going to take you to volume 5, page 364. Volume 5 of the allegation brief. Volume 3. Apologies. Volume 3, page 89. Can we just – we'll do volume 3, page 89. Top left-hand corner, Ms Sharobeem. That's – do you accept that that's a receipt submitted in support of a reimbursement to your account? You'll have to go back for the transfer. That's the transfer to your account, Ms Sharobeem, on 27 January, 2015. Would you agree with that? ---It is my account.

And it's for \$4,568. Do you agree with that?---Yes.

Go back to page 89. What does that receipt relate to, Ms Sharobeem? ---Which one?

The one from Bonnyrigg Garden Centre.---Relating to what? Sorry, your question is - - -

You submitted it for reimbursement. What do you think it related to?---I don't think I - - -

It says STEPS to Employment.---I don't think I submitted anything. I left them on my desk and the bookkeeper took them. STEPS to Employment is my handwriting. The number under, it's not my handwriting. That's all what I can say.

10 What gardening projects were being conducted by the STEPS to Employment program?---We were doing a gardening project with, a small project.

Can I just stop you there. When you say "we", who was we?---Any "we" is referring to Immigrant Women's Health women and staff.

But in terms of individuals, who was with you when you were doing the gardening projects for the STEPS to Employment program?---One of the people I recall now is a woman called Berri. She was - - -
20

Berri Gailani?---Yeah, she was working on that.

Do you remember anyone else working with you on these gardening projects?---Not, not right now, not right now, not at the moment, I can't remember names. As far as I remember I say.

I'll take you to volume 3, page 96. I've showed you a small receipt for \$191.30, this is a relatively large receipt for \$1,779.15 from Bonnyrigg Garden Centre, that's included in a bundle of receipts submitted in support of reimbursements to your account, Ms Sharobeem. What does this receipt relate to?---This should not be submitted, this is not submitted, this is my personal and it was reimbursed and the organisation already admitted paying by mistake.
30

What was it for?---This is my personal item, sir, it was wrongly reimbursed to me.

What was it for?---It's my personal item, it's my personal gardening item, gardening item for my personal use. It was wrongly paid to me by the organisation and I repaid it.
40

But, Ms Sharobeem, do you agree that you told, you told the auditor in relation to this particular invoice that it related to STEPS to Employment, didn't you?---No, I can't recall saying that. As I said, I was sick and I was trying to finish all the question he bombarded us with.

You were reimbursed to the extent of about \$1,800 for this receipt. You know that it related to large troughs, didn't they?---Large what?

Troughs. Shall I – it's Sansevieria troughs, three of them - - -?---It's - - -

- - - that went to your [REDACTED] home?---But I just said it's my personal item, I don't know what you're referring to, sir.

Do you agree that it was for large pots you purchased?---It's my personal item. I can't remember what it was, but it was my personal and they admit wrongly paying it to me and I admit pay it back.

10

How did you come to the conclusion that it was wrongly paid to you? ---Because I can't remember paying – sorry, come again with the question? I'm answering something - - -

How did you come to the conclusion that the receipt had been wrongly paid to you?---First of all I did not submit this. Second of all, when I was told that this was paid to me I said that was wrong, this is personal, so I paid it back.

20

That's not what the auditor said, Ms Sharobeem. If I take you to volume 23, page 107?---I'm not responsible about he says if it's lies or truth but mostly lies.

THE COMMISSIONER: I'm sorry, are you saying that the auditor's evidence was mostly lies?---One of the things he said, sir, I remember very well he's saying that he noticed a problem between me and the former manager, Mira Mitrovic, which is an absolute lie. I have evidence of the good wonderful relation we had and I don't know why he fabricated that, but truth will come. I don't know.

30

Are you saying he fabricated other things?---Yes, sir.

Okay. Thank you.

MR RAJALINGAM: Have a look at the screen. 23 December, 2014. \$1,779.15. Do you see that?---Sorry, come again, which one?

23 December, 2014, Bonnyrigg Garden Centre. Do you see the entry? ---Yes.

40

You identified it to the auditor as a STEPS to Employment program expense, didn't you?---No.

I'm going to take you to another receipt, page, volume 5, page 364. Let's go through this one slowly, Ms Sharobeem. The date is for 14 March, 2015. Do you agree with that?---Yes.

Who is Sam?---It's a name I use when in places like that people can't pronounce Eman so I – instead of announcing my name I just put Sam as an abbreviation.

So Sam relates to you, does it?---Yeah, yeah, and I use it even in the coffee places.

And that's your address on that invoice, isn't it?---Yeah. It's a personal purchase, yeah.

10

Yeah, what's it for, it's for a grey fountain, isn't it?---Yeah, yeah.

And you identified that to the auditor as a work-related expense didn't you? ---No.

And that was a lie, wasn't it, when you said that to the auditor?---I just said to you no. What lie? I just said no. I didn't identify it as a personal. It's a fountain, sir. Immigrant Women's Health Service is a very micro service. It doesn't have fountains.

20

Between April, 2013 and March of 2015, Ms Sharobeem, receipts from the Bonnyrigg Garden Centre were submitted in support of reimbursements to your account totalling \$5,428.30. Do you understand that?---Between - - -

April.---Can you mention the period again.

April, 2013 and March, 2015 you were reimbursed \$5,428.30 from IWHS funds for receipts that were submitted from Bonnyrigg Garden Centre. Do you understand that?---What you're saying is not fully true.

30

Well, that's the - - -?---That's what I understand.

That's the financial information we have, Ms Sharobeem.---And my reply to that - - -

Between those two dates that amount was reimbursed to you.---And my reply to that is majority of the receipts were taken from my desk, reimbursed to me. The management committee ask - - -

40

Taken by who?---By the bookkeeper or Nevine Ghaly.

The bookkeeper took them and reimbursed them to your account did they? ---That was the trend at the organisation at the time where I was - - -

Are you suggesting the trend - - -?--- - - - mixed between - - -

- - - of the organisation was to transfer - - -?--- - - - being sick and also being busy.

MR CHHABRA: I object, Commissioner.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, yes. I think we need to step back a bit. Yes. What's your answer to the - - -?---I was saying that during this period for more than one year all my invoices were left – all receipts, sorry, were left on the desk taken by the bookkeeper or Nevine Ghaly at that time when I was preparing her to be the manager under me directly. During that time all receipts, including personal receipts, were taken and reimbursed to me. As soon as I was told by the management committee or the auditor, the reimbursement was repaid to the organisation and also the organisation and I clearly wrote down to the management that why the bookkeeper reimbursed me of my personal items. That was clearly indicated.

How much did you reimburse?---Every cent they say to me reimburse.

How much was it, do you remember?---Around 70 or 80,000.

Now, didn't you notice all that money going into your account when you shouldn't have been getting it, 70 or \$80,000 worth of money?---I had – I might sound very silly or naïve or other people might call me liar but this is the exact truth. I never looked at my account because I had – the word never is very big. Let me just rephrase it because I was told to be careful with my words. I rarely looked at my account, rarely. Means that I was using for the organisation and personal my credit card and I had a system of the credit card to be paid in full at the time so I wouldn't accumulate interest. That's why I was always asking the bookkeeper to pay me as soon as possible. Now, during that time I was ill physically and ill psychologically for many, many different reasons and I didn't often look so I didn't notice how much I was getting. Also I have three investment which I worked hard to gain over the years to secure my pension because I wasn't entitled to anything else and I don't have long years of service in Australia so with the income coming from the investment with my income and with also the board sitting it was overwhelming for me as a person, single woman to carry on and look after all this so I didn't particularly notice everything. No, I didn't.

MR RAJALINGAM: Ms Sharobeem, I'm going to take you to another receipt. Volume 2, page 295. Do you see that? It's a receipt for \$1,029.35. Do you agree with that?---Yes.

On 5 April, 2014?---Yeah, I can see that.

Can you see it? Volume 5, page 365. Volume 5, page 365. The receipt that I just showed you, Ms Sharobeem, relates to this invoice from Bonnyrigg Garden Centre. Ms Sharobeem, whenever you went to Bonnyrigg Garden Centre, while that's coming up, whenever you went to Bonnyrigg Garden Centre, did you use the name Sam?---Not every time.

When did you use the name Sam?---It depends. If they couldn't pronounce my name, I would say, "Just write Sam."

All right. Well, this one also has the name Sam on it.---Yeah.

And take it from me that it's your [REDACTED] address that's been redacted. Do you agree that the invoice relates to 5 April, 2014?---Yeah.

10 And your phone number is also there on that invoice.---Okay.

So you are Sam, aren't you?---Yeah. I, I just mentioned that.

Would you agree that this relates to the receipt that I just showed you for 5 April, 2014?---The same amount.

Same amount. Same day as well, isn't it, Ms Sharobeem?---Yeah, okay.

20 Go back to volume 2, page 295.---Can you just hold on one second, please?

Sure.---I just need to read what's in this. Yes, all right.

So when you submitted that receipt – or did you submit that receipt from Bonnyrigg Garden Centre, for \$1,029.35, for reimbursement to your account?---Yeah, those items were bought for the service.

They were?---Yeah.

30 And how did they relate to the service, Ms Sharobeem?---Those pots were all put around the service. That's why I wanted to read what's actually in that invoice. Those pots were for the service, all of them. All of them.

Why was it delivered to [REDACTED] then?---No, it's not delivered to [REDACTED]. That's my address registered there in my card, so it goes there. It's not delivered. I picked them up. It's not delivery.

40 Just, just go back to – go back to volume 5, page 365. You took them from Bonnyrigg Garden Centre, is that what you're saying?---Yeah, these items I remember having it around the service.

It says two pots at \$256 approximately. Two plants at 195. And it says, "Goods taken. Two men delivery. Eight bags of organic potting mix." And the only address on that invoice is your [REDACTED] address, Ms Sharobeem.---Maybe the soil was delivered to my home. But all the pots I remember having it around the service or the other explanation I can give is maybe it was delivered there to put the soil there and then deliver it back to the service. That's all what I can recall.

You were moving soil from [REDACTED] to Fairfield, were you?---It's the same local area.

[REDACTED] Yeah.

To Fairfield?---Yeah, yeah. It's the same.

10 How long does it take you to get from [REDACTED] to Fairfield?---Less than 10 minutes. It's the same local area. I, I live in the south-west. That's where I work as well. Used to.

Ms Sharobeem, if these items were going to the Immigrant Women's Health Service, why didn't you just have them delivered to the centre?---I'm just here not even saying truth or fact, but I'm just giving explanation - - -

20 Ms - - -?--- - - - as far as I remember, that to prepare the pots I don't have anyone at the service to do that except Marie. And at that time I was married, so most likely my husband helped me. That's just an explanation I'm just coming up with. But we, we bought those pots for the service.

Ms Sharobeem, between April 2013 and March 2015, receipts from Bonnyrigg Garden Centre of \$5,428.30 were submitted in support of reimbursements to your account. Did you dishonestly submit those receipts to be reimbursed for your personal items?---No, sir. I already answered and replied what happened in that matter.

30 In relation to receipts submitted from Myer, I'm going to take you to those now. The evidence is that between August 2009 and June 2015, receipts from Myer were submitted to the extent of \$15,422.47. Have you got those dates and amounts?---Roughly between '09 and '15 and it's 15.

August 2009 and June 2015?---Mmm.

\$15,422.47. What is your response to the allegation that you submitted receipts from Myer dishonestly to be reimbursed that amount to your account?---No, sir.

40 The Commission also has evidence that between February 2012 and June 2015, receipts from David Jones were submitted in support of reimbursements to your account totalling \$3,440.89. What's your response to the allegation that you dishonestly submitted those receipts in order to be paid for those personal items?---No, sir.

Do you say that you were purchasing items for the Immigrant Women's Health Service from David Jones?---Some items were purchased.

Like what?---But also I already made clear to the Commission that my personal receipts were left on my desk and were wrongly reimbursed to me and it was reimbursed back to the service.

You accept that the David Jones receipts are for the most part relating to personal expenses?---I remember buying on sale Christmas decoration for the service, I remember buying on sale some items for the kitchen projects, but that's all about the service and I am not a shopper of David Jones anyway.

10

You know that it's expensive to shop at David Jones, don't you?---No, it's not.

Well, it wouldn't have been the most appropriate place for you to be shopping for a charity, would it?---Any item for sale I go for it because that's my, my idea, that if it's on sale it's cheap, so we, we get the items after the proper price.

20

And what did you purchase, apart from the Christmas decorations, what did you purchase from David Jones that related to Immigrant Women's Health Service?---I remember very well kitchen pots and appliances were on sale as well, if I recall.

And how much money would you spend at David Jones on the Immigrant Women's Health Service?---I can't answer that, very hard.

Why not?---Very hard. It's, we're talking about years of service and I'm talking about - - -

30

It's only, it's only \$3,500?---That doesn't matter, it's replying to you has to be an honest reply and I can't really just give you a random number.

All right. Ms Sharobeem, the Commission – it's 1 o'clock.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, we'll adjourn till 2.00.

LUNCHEON ADJOURNMENT

[1.04pm]

40