

TARLOPUB00664  
12/05/2017

TARLO  
pp 00664-00719

PUBLIC  
HEARING

COPYRIGHT

INDEPENDENT COMMISSION AGAINST CORRUPTION

THE HONOURABLE REGINALD BLANCH AM QC

PUBLIC HEARING

OPERATION TARLO

Reference: Operation E15/1982

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

AT SYDNEY

ON FRIDAY 12 MAY, 2017

AT 10.00AM

Any person who publishes any part of this transcript in any way and to any person contrary to a Commission direction against publication commits an offence against section 112(2) of the Independent Commission Against Corruption Act 1988.

This transcript has been prepared in accordance with conventions used in the Supreme Court.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, you're still under the same affirmation to tell the truth, Ms Sharobeem.---Yes.

Yes, Mr Rajalingam.

10 MR RAJALINGAM: Thank you, Commissioner. Ms Sharobeem, yesterday you gave some evidence about the purchase of a Mercedes. Do you remember that?---Yes.

I'm going to ask you some more questions about that just to clarify I think some of your answers that you gave for me. I didn't understand what you were saying so I considered that overnight. Can I first take you to what your partner said, Mr Hammo, in November last year. Do you agree that he gave, firstly, he gave evidence at this inquiry, you know that?---Yes.

20 He gave evidence about the purchase of a Mercedes. Do you know that? ---Yes.

For my friend's benefit, transcript page 97. I'm not sure he has – for the Commission's benefit it's at page 96/97. Mr Hammo, Ms Sharobeem, said that he purchased a B class Mercedes 300B in December, 2014. Is that right?---Yes.

He said it was registered in his name. Is that right?---Yes.

30 He said that the purchase of the Mercedes came out of the blue. Is that right?---Out of the blue, yes.

It wasn't planned.---Yeah, yeah, it wasn't planned.

I think you were also trying to say that yesterday as well but you were rushing through your answer. Do you remember saying that there was no plannings?---Yes, yeah. Yeah, when you say to me that you went to buy it and I said no, we didn't plan.

40 But you accept that he has told this Commission that notwithstanding that it wasn't planned he purchased the Mercedes and he registered it in his name. Do you understand?---That's right.

He also said in November last year that when he purchased the Mercedes you were looking for a car for the centre. He wasn't sure which centre. ---That's right.

He also said in his evidence that Richard was helping you for the centre car.---That's right.

To purchase the centre car.---That's right.

I think you also said that yesterday.---Yes, that's right.

You've said that there was no one at NESH.---That's right.

And that you wanted some help.---Yes.

10 He helped you.---Yes.

And you purchased a car for NESH.---At that time, well, we went together, the three of us.

You purchased the NESH car from Peter Warren. Correct?---That's right.

I want to talk about that car. Was that car a Honda City sedan?---Yes, I was reminded of the make, yeah.

20 MR CHHABRA: Apologies for the interruption, Commissioner.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, Mr Chhabra?

MR CHHABRA: Perhaps it may be required for leave to be granted for Ms Sharobeem's legal representatives to have access to that transcript.

THE COMMISSIONER: There's no problem with that, I take it?

30 MR RAJALINGAM: There's no problem, issue with Mr Chhabra being provided with Mr Hammo's compulsory examination from November last year.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes. Thank you. Yes, you have access, Mr Chhabra.

40 **VARIATION OF A SUPPRESSION ORDER: COMMISSIONER  
VARIES THE SUPPRESSION ORDER OVER EVIDENCE GIVEN  
BY HAIMAN HAMMO AT A COMPULSORY EXAMINATION  
HELD ON 21 NOVEMBER 2016 AUTHORISING MR CHHABRA &  
MR WASSEF TO HAVE ACCESS TO THE FULL TRANSCRIPT**

MR CHHABRA: May it please - - -

MR RAJALINGAM: I might even assist him to take him to the right reference.

When did you first – how many times did you go to Peter Warren Automotive, the dealership, how many times did you go, Ms Sharobeem?  
---I think two times from memory.

On the first time, on the first occasion that you went to Peter Warren - - -?  
---Yes.

- - - was a deposit paid for the Honda City sedan?---Yes.

10 Had you been to Peter Warren prior to the deposit being paid - - -?---No.

- - - for the Honda City?---No.

So is it your clear understanding that you paid for the deposit for the Honda City sedan at Peter Warren Automotive without having attended there before?---That's right.

20 You went with Richard, didn't you?---I went with my husband and my son to help me. I don't have enough understanding of cars from a technical point of view.

Mr Hammo also said this in his evidence, and I was asking him questions about the Mercedes, how that came about. He said this, transcript 98, I think it's a different reference for my friend, but he said this, "We passed by the car. I was looking." I asked him, "Who is we?" And he said, "Me, Eman ah, and ah, Richard." That's correct, isn't it?---Yes, it is.

30 He then said, "Yeah. And ah, it's a used car, it's not a, it's a display car and yeah, she suggested that 'cause I was thinking of buying," he said that you said, "'You deserve to buy, you know, a car,' 'cause I had a very old car."  
---That's right.

So did you say to Mr Hammo that he deserved a new car?---Yes, yes.

He then said that he sat down and talked to a dealer about the price?  
---That's right.

The price was 35?---Yeah.

40 And he agreed to pay a deposit of \$2,000. Did that happen on the same day you paid a deposit for the NESH Honda City sedan?---Yes.

Prior to attending Peter Warren Automotive, had you done any planning in relation to buying a vehicle?---For who?

For the NESH service or the IWHS service?---Every second year we do this process of updating, not buying, we update what we have so we keep the value for the organisation.

Prior – I understand what you're saying?---Sure.

Before the deposit was paid on that day, on 29 December I think it was - - -?  
---Yeah.

- - - and we'll check that?---Yeah.

10 I'll make sure to check it. But before that date paying the deposit - - -?  
---Yeah.

Did you make any arrangements for the purchase of a motor vehicle?  
---What kind of arrangement I would make?

Well - - -?---Like what?

Did you - - -?---Search online? Yes, I did.

20 You did search online?---Yes. Every time I would look at prices and when  
the sale is going to start so we catch a good opportunity for the organisation.

Okay. Had you created bank cheques by that stage?---No.

Because you say the deposits were only paid on 29 December, don't you?  
---On the day we went there.

On the first day?---Yeah.

30 Okay. All right. I think I was a bit confused yesterday after. Now I  
understand. The first day you went to the dealership - - -?---Yeah.

- - - two deposits were paid.---One personal, one work.

Yes. I understand. I understand that.---Yeah.

One was for a work-related vehicle, the Honda.---Yeah.

40 And the other was for a Mercedes, which was genuinely going to be Mr  
Hammo's vehicle, correct?---We didn't think at that time it's going to be  
registered under whose name.

Yeah.---But it's Haiman's right to have it under his name.

But you agreed moments ago, didn't you, that you said to him, "You deserve  
a car"?---Yeah, of course. Any good woman would say that to her husband.

At the inquiry, sorry, the compulsory examination last year, Mr Hammo  
said, he sat down, he talked about the price. He then paid a deposit of

\$2,000. I then asked him how the remainder of the Mercedes was going to be paid and this is what he said, "I had \$15,000 in the bank. So there was a transfer of 15,000. Eman said that she would pay an amount which I would pay her back." He said in response to my question how much was she going to pay, he thought you were going to pay about 17. "I can't remember the exact amount," is what he said. He then also said - - -?---Yes.

- - - he repaid you \$9,000. Does that all make sense?---I believe, I believe so, yes.

10

I asked him about picking up the car. Do you know how many days after you paid the deposit did you pick up the car?---No, not precisely, but we went together and picked it up.

When did you pick up the Honda City vehicle?---I didn't go and pick it up. Richard did.

20

Do you know if Richard went on the same day you picked up the Mercedes?---I don't think so. The Honda had other problems. It wasn't really up to the specification of OH&S when he was going to receive it, so they did upgrade, so I can't really remember the time.

All right. We'll just go back to 29 December.---Mmm.

That's the day you paid the deposits. You paid a deposit for the NESH vehicle, the Honda.---Yes.

And Mr Hammo paid the deposit for the Mercedes.---That's right.

30

Prior to him paying the deposit for the Mercedes, was it your evidence yesterday that you were also looking for a IWHS car as well?---Actually, yes, and the dealership can witness that. When I walk in I said I want two cars.

No, no. I'm just trying to understand.---Oh, sure.

So when you went in, you were looking for two cars for the services - - -?  
---Yes.

40

- - - NESH and IWHS?---That's right.

Right?---Yeah.

And then at some stage during your shopping at the centre, at the dealership - - -?---Yeah.

- - - there was an impromptu, spontaneous decision to look for a personal car for Hammo, right?---Not as you describe it, no.

Okay. Can you – you describe it.---As I said yesterday, after we walked from one place to the other, we saw this one and were laughing about it. We never dreamed of having a Mercedes or never rode one. So we had a look at it and we knew that it's second-hand or test drive or something. And then we, the thing evolved. So there wasn't any intention, as I said.

But on 29 December, then, you looked at three cars, is what you're saying?  
---That's right. Well, eventually.

10

Now, I think yesterday you referred to the potential IWHS cars having an issue with the child thing.---That's right. The safety.

And I wasn't sure what you meant by that. What did you mean by that?---I didn't find the right car where I can buy for Immigrant Women's Health, because we transport children so I really wanted a high car with safety features in it. So I didn't find what I want.

Did you – just leaving Peter Warren for a moment.---Right.

20

Did you ultimately purchase an IWHS car - - -?---Yes.

- - - in January that month?---Yes. When I found the right one.

And have I got this right? Was that a Land Rover Discovery or something?  
---That's right.

Okay. That was from Peter Trivett?---That's Parramatta, yeah.

30

Parramatta Peter Trivett?---Yeah. And I also bargained badly.

Yeah. I'm not worried about that for the moment.---I am.

Okay. Going back to 29 December there were three cars then that had been looked at.---Yes.

The Honda City, you've looked at that and you paid a deposit.---Ah hmm.

40

The Mercedes, you looked at that and Mr Hammo paid a deposit. That was his personal thing, right?---He did.

Then there was another car wasn't there that you looked at?---We were looking for, yes.

But did you find a car?---I was about to buy but it didn't work - - -

Do you know – do you remember what it was?---Um - - -

Just the make.---It should be - - -

It's not entirely important but do you remember what the make was?---It should be either Honda or – because we used to have a Honda before so it was either Honda or Ford. Not to my recollection. I'm not good at that anyway.

Did you or Richard have any discussion with the dealer about purchasing that other car for IWHS?---Yes, yes.

10

Was a purchase price fixed for that car?---I remember the difference was around the 1,800 – the 18,000 because I always tried not to exceed the 20,000 or tried to stick with that range, the 20 range.

Okay.---If – that's again from memory.

My question to you was do you recall how much that car was worth?---No.

20

Do you recall any negotiation with the dealer in relation to the price of that car?---Yes. I spent at least four hours over there negotiating and - - -

Was a deposit placed in relation to that vehicle?---Paid, no, but we talk to the last finer details at that time and again it's my attitude to keep bargaining until the end so I, I'm, I consumed myself in every event.

Mr Hammo said in relation to the Mercedes that a deposit was paid, that he then made a transfer and you had agreed to pay the remainder.---Yeah, I would say so. I would agree with what he said, yes.

30

So is this right then. 29 December a deposit is paid.---Ah hmm.

At some stage after that he made a transfer.---Ah hmm.

And then at some stage after that you've picked up the car and on your evidence you mistakenly gave him the – Peter Warren the \$18,000 cheque. Is that what you said yesterday?---I believe that's what happened. I believe that's what happened.

40

Prior – if that's the case - - -?---Ah hmm.

- - - prior to paying the deposit - - -?---Ah hmm.

- - - you would not have known – prior to paying the deposit for the Mercedes - - -?---Ah hmm.

Withdraw that. Prior to paying the deposit for the Honda - - -?---Ah hmm.

- - - you would not have known the balance remaining. Correct?---Of, of the Honda?

Yes.---Well, definitely the dealer gave me the balance in writing or something.

No, no, no. Before paying the deposit, before 29 December - - -?---Yeah.

10 - - - you would not have known the amount you would have to pay as the remainder. Correct?---Of course.

Are you agreeing with me?---I'm trying to make sense of the question.

Before 29 December - - -?---The 29<sup>th</sup> we went to the dealer.

Before 29 December - - -?---Right.

20 - - - you would not have been able to figure out the remainder, the remaining amount to be paid to Peter Warren Automotive. Correct?---Yeah, if I didn't know about the car.

Yes. And if you hadn't paid a deposit you wouldn't have known what the remainder was would you?---Yeah, it makes sense.

At the same time you would not have known the remainder on the IWHS car would you prior to 29 December?---I believe so.

30 So you're agreeing with me that you wouldn't have known what the remaining, remainder was?---I'm, I, I would agree with the logic of things you put together but I don't have recollection of dates even so I can't fully agree with the date of the 29<sup>th</sup>.

What I'm going to show you is first of all the contract with Peter Warren Automotive.---Mmm.

40 So page, volume 21, page 114. All right. Is that the – does that look like, Ms Sharobeem, the contract for the sale of the Honda City vehicle? Do you see on the top right-hand corner it has “deal date 29 December, 2014”? And it describes the car?---Yeah.

Now, do you see there, there was a trade-in of a Ford, an old Ford, a 2007 Ford?---Yes.

All right.---That's what I'm saying, that we trade in the old one.

Yeah. So I accept what you're saying about the Ford, the trade-in.---Yes.

That appears on this document, doesn't it?---Well, yeah.

Yeah. And you turn the page. And indeed the trade-in vehicle is listed there on the second page. Now, I'll take you to page 121. That's the – 121. That's the receipt from Peter Warren Automotive for the Honda City sedan deposit.---Deposit. How much?

It was a 500 deposit. Do you agree with that?---Thanks for the reminder. I didn't get this money back. I paid it from my credit card - - -

10 Yeah. I understand.--- - - - and didn't get it back.

No, no, no. That's, don't worry about that.---It is important.

I'm just taking you to the date. Yes, yes.---It's my money and I didn't get it back.

Let's work out the dates, Ms Sharobeem, and then we'll - - -?---Sure.

- - - work out the money.---I'm sorry.

20

Okay.---It's just a reminder.

So page 121. Do you agree, then, the deposit was paid on 29 December?  
---That's right.

All right. I'll take you to the next page. That's the deposit for the Mercedes.---Okay.

30 And that, of course, was also paid, it seems like, on 29 December, 2014. Do you agree with that?---Yes, it's here.

And there's the credit card receipt for it. I understand your partner paid that deposit. Is that right?---I believe so.

Now I'll show you page 279. Is that the contract for the Mercedes?---It does look it. Definitely.

There wasn't a trade-in with this vehicle, was there?---No.

40 Go to page 281. Sorry, no, no. Yeah, 281. Do you see there the price? Bottom left, "total purchase amount \$35,000". Do you see that?---Yes.

Now I'll take you back to page 280. That is the remainder to be paid on the Mercedes, would you agree with that? 33,000 after you take the \$2,000 deposit out.---Yes.

It also says, doesn't it, that there was a bank cheque presented for \$18,000, correct?---I need to see that.

Just there next to the bank cheque box.---Yes. Yes. Yes.

And a direct deposit received on 30 December, right, of 15,000?---Yes.

And as I understand your evidence, you mistakenly handed over the \$18,000 cheque - - -?---That's right.

10 - - - on the, must be 31 December, right, the day you pick it up?---Ah, I can agree with mistakenly depositing that cheque but I can't remember the date. I just want to be precise.

Yes. But this is the receipt for the money - - -?---Yeah, okay.

- - - Ms Sharobeem. Did you have both bank – I want to take you back to 29 December, Ms Sharobeem?---Mmm.

20 On 29 December did you have both IWHS bank cheques with you, the 29<sup>th</sup>?  
---No, no, no.

You didn't?---No.

Had you even drawn them?---No, I don't think so, on the 29<sup>th</sup>? No.

The day you paid the deposit - - -?---No.

- - - for the Mercedes?---No, no.

30 Are you sure about that?---No, not sure.

Well, you just said no to my answer and now you're saying you're not sure?  
---I'm just making sense, how can I have a cheque in my hand if I don't know how much I'm paying?

That's my question to you, Ms Sharobeem?---Yeah, so I, when you say you're not sure you've giving me the doubt in my mind but it doesn't make logic.

40 Did you then draw the cheque after 29 December when the deposit was paid?---I believe so.

Did you turn both IWHS cheques, the \$18,000 cheque and the other cheque for 18,600 or whatever it was, on the same day into a bank cheque?---No, it was two different occasions I believe. I remember going to the bank twice.

Now, you're telling me that you converted both bank cheques, sorry, both service cheques between 29 December and obviously the day on which you picked up the vehicle, right?---Ah, yeah.

When did you first – firstly, when did you decide that you weren't going to go ahead with the car that had the child thing problem?---When did – sorry, come again with the question.

You know how you said you weren't going to go ahead with the IWHS car at Peter Warren?---Yeah, yeah, when I was there, yeah.

10 When did you first decide that you weren't going to go ahead with that car?  
---A few days after.

Well, the deposit's paid for the NESH vehicle on the 29<sup>th</sup>?---Yeah, because (not transcribable).

No deposit's paid for the IWHS vehicle that might have been a Honda as well?---Or Ford. No, no, no, we didn't pay for it.

You didn't pay for it?---I kept thinking about it for some days, I remember.

20 When did you change your mind about the car?---It was Christmas holiday so I can't really precisely remember, but as soon as we found - - -

There are three – Ms Sharobeem, I think there are three days for you to think about, the 29<sup>th</sup>, 30<sup>th</sup> and 31<sup>st</sup> of December, 2014?---Yeah.

When over those three days – if you're saying to this Commission that you changed these cheques to bank cheques between the date of the deposit, the first time you went to the dealership - - -?---Yeah.

30 - - - and the day you picked up the vehicle for NESH, when across those three days did you change these bank cheques, change these cheques to bank cheques?---It's – even if I don't remember it is all documented in papers and I always put it in the folder.

But what's your recollection of it, Ms Sharobeem?---No, I can't, I don't have any recollection with my status.

40 Well, you'll read, if you - - -?---But it's, every time I made a bank cheque and every time I draw a cheque I always take a picture, sorry, a copy, and leave it in the folder for the bookkeeper.

I'm - - -?---So it's there, if you're asking me the details I'm sorry, I can't remember.

I'm going to show you - - -?---But everything gets photocopied.

Pardon me.

Do you see the cheque, Ms Sharobeem, for 18,000?---Yes.

It's dated on 28 December, 2014.---Right.

Do you understand that?---Yes, it's here.

That cheque was written or created, converted at the bank one day prior to even putting a deposit on the NESH vehicle. Would you agree with that?  
---Yes.

10

You weren't even going ahead – you hadn't even chosen a vehicle for the Immigrant Women's Health Service at that point, had you, on 28 December, 2014?---No, we did. No, we did, definitely. So why would I draw this?

Well, Ms Sharobeem, you just told this Commission the first time you went there was on 29 December, when you paid the deposit, didn't you? You agreed with that.---No, I didn't.

20

You didn't agree with that?---You said, no, no.

Well, I'm pretty sure you did.---No, I didn't.

You said the first time you went there was when you paid the deposit. I'm pretty sure you said that, Ms Sharobeem.---Yes, but you picked the date, not me. So I agreed that I - - -

Don't worry about the date. Don't worry about the date. I'm asking you – no, no, no.---Well, your statement included the 28<sup>th</sup>.

30

Well, your, your - - -?---That's why I'm rejecting that.

Okay. Turn, turn the screen off. That's confusing you. My question to you earlier was - - -?---Yeah.

- - - was the first time you went to the dealership the day you paid the deposit for the NESH vehicle? Your answer was yes.---That's to my recollection, yes.

40

None of it adds up, does it, Ms Sharobeem?---To be honest, now the 28<sup>th</sup> there is, a cheque was made for that amount on the 28<sup>th</sup>, so definitely there was some arrangement prior to that.

Did you ever draw a bank cheque in your own name to pay for Mr Hammo's vehicle?---Absolutely never, not. Absolutely never. Never.

So did you always intend on using the cheque you had made on 28 December, 2014 - - -?---The two organisations.

- - - to pay for Mr Hammo's Mercedes?---What? How?

Did you plan, on 28 December, 2014, when you converted the cheque, the IWHS cheque, into a bank cheque to pay for a vehicle for Mr Hammo?---Sir

- - -

Ms Sharobeem, I've asked you a question.---No, that's an accusation, sir. It's not a question.

10 No, I asked you a question, Ms Sharobeem.---That's a very strong allegation.

I asked you if you planned on 28 December to purchase a car for Mr Hammo.---I was told to be straightforward when I'm shocked, as much as I can. With this statement you're making, sir, my reply straightforward is, no, never. And can I just add that in any person's life, mistakes could happen. But there's no way a person in their own even sick or ill brain would go and pay for a Mercedes for a charity. And even if I did that or paid that, where would be the vehicle so people would see what we paid for it? So it doesn't  
20 really make sense that you come with a statement and tell me that I took the organisation's money to pay for Mercedes, let alone it's for my husband. Mercedes for a charity?

How did you pay for Mr Hammo's vehicle?---I spent all my career in NGOs.

Ms Sharobeem, how did you pay for the Mercedes, then?---In my own recollection, I made the bank cheque but definitely it was from the wrong account, and there are two other mistakes or three that I made the wrong  
30 collection because of who I was and how busy I was. Yes, it was a mistake. And by the way, straightaway, as soon as I was reminded of that cheque, immediately, and it was hours before travelling to Israel, I actually wrote an SMS between me and the auditor, and I said to him, "What cheque? What are you talking about?" And as soon as he told me, straightaway the money was paid. And he say to me - - -

Let's talk about that.--- - - - "Do not pay it now."

Well, Ms Sharobeem - - -?---"Wait until you come back."  
40

Let's talk - - -?---And I said, "No, I will pay it now. When a mistake is discovered, it's better corrected." So, no, no, sir. Do not try to change a mistake to a crime. Please don't.

Let's - - -?---Because a mistake is clearly a mistake. And I'm human.

Ms Sharobeem, I've heard your answer in relation to the question. I'm going to ask you some questions about your response to the auditor. Okay?---Yes.

Maybe I'll show you the emails first and you can make sure you understand what you said previously about this particular topic.---Okay.

Volume 21, page – wait. Do you agree, Ms Sharobeem, the email – you've seen this email, haven't you? This is not a surprise to you, is it?---No, you show it to me yesterday.

Yeah. Okay. Well, all right.---And I didn't read it fully.

10

I want you to read - - -.---And by the way, sorry.

- - - the paragraph starting MYOB.---You showed me – my, my sincere apology. You showed me yesterday this and I didn't read up to the end but I now picked that he wrote there were 12 chairs purchased by IWHS for 6,900. No, I didn't buy 12 chairs for 6,900, 6,900.

You bought a massage chair for \$6,990, Ms Sharobeem.---Yes, yes, not 12 chairs.

20

At this point in time of the inquiry I'm taking you to the - - -.---I'm sorry.

- - - part about the \$18,000 cheque.---I'm just correcting the record - - -

Thank you.--- - - - because you said that I saw this - - -

And we've got a lot of - - -.--- - - - and I didn't comment on that.

- - - information to get through. Let's go on to the car.---Sure.

30

Can you read the part that starts "MYOB indicates the payment".---MYOB.

That's Mr - - -.---Yeah.

That's Mr Boyd raising the issue with you isn't it?---I'm just reading the top now to see my reply.

Yeah, that's, that's your response on the same day but in the evening isn't it?---Yes.

40

All right.---Hold on. Sorry. I'm just reconfirming that, yeah, my, my recollection is right.

Firstly, why did you think at that point that there was a double payment done in this situation, what does that mean?---Yes.

What does that mean? You wrote it. You know what it means. Tell me what it means.---Yes. Sorry, come again. What's the question? I was reading the details.

That's all right. I apologise. The second paragraph of your email it stars "The car we had in mind".---Ah hmm.

Go down to the last sentence.---Ah hmm.

10 "I will contact the dealer - - ----Ah hmm.

- - - and ask if there is double payment done in this situation and will check with the bank as well".---Ah hmm.

20 What did you mean by double payment?---That was – I was – as indicated in the first sentence I was running mad with my thoughts what happened exactly and I kept calling him when I read this when I was – when I went back to the office and when I read it I was a bit confused and didn't know what's actually happened and how this happened. It was a bit late so I kept  
30 calling him to get some conversation going so maybe he can advise me. He finally picked the phone and he said to me don't worry about it and what have you and I said no, no, no, I will call the dealer, and I wrote back to him those words and to my recollection I kept trying to open the account for IWHS to see what happened and all what I remember is I have only a few hours before I travel so I really need to fix this if there is a mistake happen. I kept calling him several times in the way home and it was very late, around maybe 7.00 or 8.00. He didn't reply or pick at all so I started to message him, SMS's and I told him Nathan, there is a mistake definitely  
40 happen. I will pay for it from my account and then I will sort it out with the dealer. That's exactly, and the SMS is available for you to see it.

What do you mean by double payment done, what does that mean?---That's the terminology I found in my head at that time so there's - - -

What do you mean by that, Ms Sharobeem, what do you mean by it?---What I meant with my limited English is maybe there is some mistakes with the payment. That's all what I thought of. I'm not a dictionary. What I thought of I wrote.

40 Did you mean that you had made two payments to Peter Warren - - -?  
---That's when my – to my recollection that's what I thought at that time. Honestly, sir, that's the exact truth.

How did you think you had made two payments to Peter Warren?---I thought I paid for – sorry, what? Did I make - - -

It says here double payment done. I will – and ask if there is double payment done.---What I meant maybe is double withdrawn for the same car or something else. I mean - - -

Withdrawal from your account?---From my account, no. From the organisation account - - -

I'll take you to page - - -.--- - - - for the same car.

10 I don't understand.---I was confused.

I don't understand what you're saying.---Me neither.

Page 233.---You're just trying to add anything on me.

Ms Sharobeem, I am not. I'm showing you emails that you have written yourself?---I am not God, I am not perfect, but I didn't steal money.

20 Okay?---I didn't take anything don't belong to me.

Can I – can I ask you to look at page 233?---I wouldn't take the organisation money and pay for a Mercedes. I'm not stupid.

It's going to - - -?---I am not stupid.

Ms Sharobeem, I'm not saying you are stupid?---I am not an idiot.

30 I'm asking you to look at page 233?---Why don't you differentiate between a mistake and truth?

THE COMMISSIONER: Ms Sharobeem, Ms Sharobeem, could you please calm down?---I'm trying, sir.

No, you're not trying, now just - - -?---Sorry, I'll try.

Thank you.

MR RAJALINGAM: Ms Sharobeem, page 233?---I'm sorry.

40 Mr Boyd follows you up the following day on this same issue. He says to you, as I am not clear, he says, "I am still not clear as to why the 18,000 was transferred from NESH to IWHS in the first instance. I may need you to clarify this more clearly when you return." Now, firstly do you agree that that email was sent at 6.48am?---It's written here, 6.48.

Yeah. Now, your reply to his email was at 11.20pm, wasn't it?---When I had a chance, definitely, yeah.

Well, have a look. Don't think about your recollection, just look at the email. Do you agree that it's at 11.20pm, 3 September?---Um - - -

Do you agree that it's at 11.20pm?---What's written down here is right but you can go and check my computer, it always had a problem with the hours on the emails, always, and you can check other emails as well.

10 Now, you had plenty of time to think about - - -?---But either way I can't remember when I replied back because it's actually sent from my phone.

Have a look at that email, your response to Mr Boyd?---It is sent from my phone.

THE COMMISSIONER: Did your phone, did your phone have a problem with the times?---No.

So the time is accurate then?---The time is accurate here, it's sent from my phone.

20 Yes, thank you?---But the computer had a problem with the time.

Yeah, well, don't worry about that, this came from your phone, so that's the accurate time?---Yeah.

MR RAJALINGAM: So did you have - - -?---At night.

30 Just have a read of the email, Ms Sharobeem?---We were buying two cars. Yes, yes. That's the, exactly what I'm saying and the recollection of what I'm saying.

But your last paragraph, "I never check my own bank account and didn't notice that the withdrawing of the amount, but for sure will sort this out personally."?---Yes.

What does that mean?---(No Audible Reply)

Had you withdrawn money out of your account as well?---In my own understanding I did, so that's what's written down here.

40 And is that what you mean by potential double payment, a payment made by you and a payment accidentally made with the cheque?---At that time maybe that's what I thought.

Is that what you're saying to Mr Boyd?---Maybe that's what's written and, and thought at that time after a long day of working.

Ms Sharobeem, do you see these eight folders here?---Yeah.

They're all your bank statements?---Yeah.

Do you accept that?---If you say so.

And I have spent about three hours looking through all of your bank statements looking for an \$18,000 withdrawal?---Well?

There is no such withdrawal?---Okay, at that time, maybe, yeah.

10 Would you agree with that?---With what you're saying, yeah.

I've also been told by the investigator that the spreadsheet created after summarising all of your bank statements - - -?---Yeah.

- - - that there is no approximately even \$18,000 amount coming out of your accounts at around about that time?---Fine. Okay.

20 So there was no double payment, was there?---Well, that doesn't mean that I'm lying, it just means that I didn't check my bank account as it said.

You're also blaming the bookkeeper in that email, aren't you?---Blaming, no. Stating the fact, yes.

Pardon me, what are you saying?---Stating the fact. So the fact here is most likely things got overwhelming and it's wrongly spelling with the bookkeeper and her - - -

30 How do you – can I ask you something?--- - - - focus was distracted with administration duties. I'm only guessing.

Now, on your evidence you took a cheque to the bank, didn't you?---(No Audible Reply)

You took an IWHS cheque to the bank, didn't you?---Ah, yes, yes.

Yeah?---Yes.

You converted it for a bank cheque, didn't you?---That's right.

40 You then presented it to the dealership accidentally, on your version, correct?---Yes.

What part of that was the bookkeeper involved in?---I don't know what I was referring here to it.

Absolutely nothing.---No, no, no. You're here trying to confuse the points and confuse the witness as well. So kindly - - -

I'll listen to your answer.--- - - - focus on what the matter at hand. The point here mentioned about the administrator or Neth definitely doesn't relate to this series of talk. We definitely had other phone conversations and we were talking about the books at that time, because I am the one appointed him to do the audit. So it's, it's not my intention to confuse him more than what I was confused at that time.

Are you suggesting that this email - - -?---He knew that Neth was overwhelmed.

10

- - - is relating to something more than just the car?---It might have. Yes, we had many issues.

It may have? Okay.---Yeah. We had many issues.

Well, the subject is "Re: IWHS car", isn't it?---That's what he wrote, yeah.

20

And the email before that, the day before that, was in relation to the car, wasn't it?---It could be. We always had emails. If you will go back, you will have many emails between us and many phone calls and many messages.

I understand. I'm going to take you back to what your evidence is about this car. You say you accidentally, mistakenly presented an \$18,000 cheque to the dealership from IWHS.---That's the truth. That's the truth.

30

Did you know at some stage after that you had made a mistake?---No. I travelled straightaway. I, no, no. When, sorry, what's, one second. That was December, no, we got the break and then we came back. No, it just slipped my mind fully to – no, no, it didn't slip my mind. I'm sorry, I need to rephrase that. It's just the business of the day continued and we kept going with what we want to do.

You purchased – you said earlier in your evidence that you also purchased a car for IWHS, didn't you?---I believe that happened after, yes.

Yes. It happened in January, one month later, didn't it?---Yeah, if you say so. I can't remember.

40

You tell me. You were driving a Land Rover Discovery, Ms Sharobeem. You know when you bought it. When was it?---You don't need to mock me.

Well, when did you buy it?---I can't remember.

Unbelievable.---You have the details more than me. Why don't you tell me the date and I will confirm?

When you spent IWHS funds on another vehicle, did it occur to you that you may have mistakenly issued the \$18,000 cheque or passed that cheque over to the Mercedes, for the Mercedes vehicle?---One month after, sir. Do you expect me to remember while running the business of the two organisations, not only one?

Can I take you to volume 21, page 285. So on 8 January, about a week after this, there's a transfer of 18,000 authorised by you from NESH to IWHS, isn't there?---No.

10

There isn't? What does this document say, then, Ms Sharobeem.---No, no. No. The document here, and it's stated in different occasion also by other people, confirmed and authorised and whatever here. It doesn't really represent the truth. The truth of the matter is the two tokens comes from the bank under the names of whoever is a signatory. And there are more than two people, but it usually comes under Audrey and myself because she was the chair and I was the current chair.

20

Who are you blaming for this transfer?---No-one. I'm just stating the fact.

So was it you? Did you make this transfer?---Never. I don't have access to – no, the word is not right. Let me rephrase it because I'm talking from frustration. I did not open the Commonwealth Bank for NESH. That was the job of Nevine Ghaly and Neth, the bookkeeper, and the auditor with them. I only kept on my desk the two tokens, sorry, one token. And then one stage of our life, when, like, a year before we started, Neth actually got the two tokens and kept them in a plastic folder in her cabinet in our room at IWHS. So, no, I did not log in or do any transaction. This is the work of the bookkeeper or whoever, as I said. I'm just trying to be precise.

30

Who was the bookkeeper for NESH - - ?---Me.

- - - at this time?---Me.

And who else are you blaming, Nevine?---I am not blaming. I am stating the facts, sir.

How do you know these facts?---Because they used to work with me in the same premises and they have keys to the organisation and all these keys.

40

Ms Sharobeem, Neth wasn't working on 8 January.---Well - - -

So who is it?---I just said to you yesterday, sir, that the time sheet you saw for anyone in the organisation does not represent the actual time they worked.

So these people were working for free were they for you?---Including me, yeah. We were working extra hours, all of them.

Ms Sharobeem, none of these witnesses that have come to this inquiry have said that they were working for free if they were being paid. Ms Abboud never worked for free. Ms El-Baf never worked for free.---Did you direct the question to any of them saying did you work extra hours and you didn't get paid? Please do and you will hear the answer.

10 Well, some of them did say they may have spent another hour there but they didn't turn up on another day did they?---Well, I don't know. They had the keys and no, I don't have access to Commonwealth and by the way, I don't know how to access it. I've been trying to explain to you that I don't access it. I didn't know how. When we received the token from Commonwealth Bank they explained to us what to do and Audrey can witness to that. But they all know that none of us as management access it. We were management, management committee. Management committee do not access the bank account. It's the work of the staff. What else I would say to you. You want the truth and I'm telling you exactly to the letter.

20 Ms Sharobeem, I'll move on.---Unless you want me to say a lie to get it out and over because I am tired and exhausted. I can, I cannot do that and putting blame on myself for something I didn't do, sir, just to make the process easier for everybody.

THE COMMISSIONER: Ms Sharobeem, I think you've answered the question.---You're having me here day after day.

MR RAJALINGAM: Ms Sharobeem, please.---I'm tired.

30 I'm going to show you the IWHS credit card bank statement – credit card statements and I'm going to take a pink highlighter, Ms Sharobeem, and I'm going to highlight everything that you say that is a personal expense on your – on the IWHS credit card. All right?---Sure. Go ahead.

40 Volume 2 bank statements, St George Visa business card issued to Mrs E. Sharobeem, Immigrant Women's Health Service between 27 December, 2012 to 28 January, 2013. So what I'm going to do, Ms Sharobeem, I'm going to try and get into 2013 and take you to 2014. All right. Do you see the first page, 604, folder 2. Now, there's more – there are more documents supporting these transactions, Ms Sharobeem, so I'm going to ask you to take this exercise seriously, okay. So look at the screen and you tell me what's a personal expense.---Visa card of Immigrant Women's Health Service.

Not that page. That's – do you agree that this is the statement - - -?---Of St George.

- - - December, 2012 to 28 January, 2013, top right?---Yeah. Yeah, I see the date.

Okay. Next page, Foxtel. Is that personal or work?---It is work paid for me to follow up the media as public officer.

Where did you have the Foxtel set?---At home.

What about AAMI, what's that for?---I – it could be the organisation car, I'm not sure.

10 Okay. The Foxtel again, same explanation? Don't repeat this, you can – you've told me about the Foxtel?---Yeah.

If there's any difference in the transaction you explain it - - -?---Yeah.

- - - but otherwise same explanation? Foxtel?---I, yeah, yeah, same.

Okay. Next page, that's a statement for January 2013 and February 2013. Agreed?---Yes, it's date in there.

20 Next page, Lite n' Easy, personal or work-related?---The, there was certain time where we used to get for the Middle Eastern senior groups Lite n' Easy because we're trying different cooks so that might be there at that time, but then - - -

Are you sure about that?---Um, let me finish this. And then later on in another time, I can't remember when I personally used Lite n' Easy so I can't remember which one.

30 So I'm going to pink it because it might be personal, might it?---It might be. I, really I just state the fact.

Next page, February 2013 and March 2013. Do you agree with that, that's the statement?---Yeah.

We're talking about the IWHS credit card, nothing else. I'm going to – all of these - - -?---It's St George.

Yeah, yeah. And you agree it's IWHS credit card, don't you?---It is.

40 All right. Page 609, again Foxtel. Same explanation?---Yes.

Anything else on that you think is personal, you think is personal?  
---Ah, ah, I don't think so.

That's all right?---I don't know.

611, or sorry, 610?---Oh.

That's a statement for March 2013 to April 2013, isn't it?---Yes.

Next page, 611?---Lily Room.

The Lily Room, that's personal, surely?---Lily Room, that's personal.

Okay. Action Motorcycles?---No, that's personal.

10 Yeah, yeah, Action Motorcycle, what about that?---That's personal.

Yeah, that's for Richard, isn't it?---I don't know which one but that's personal.

Do you ride a motorcycle?---It's a woman's organisation, we don't have motorcycles.

So that's personal isn't it?---Exactly.

20 Foxtel? Personal?---Yeah. No, no, no. Foxtel is - - -

Same explanation?---So don't say it's personal.

You were following up the media?---Don't say it's personal.

You were following up the media. I'll write that down. All right. Next page, statements for April to May 2013. Agreed?---Yeah.

30 All right. Page 613, there's nothing much on that page. What do you say about the Thai restaurant?---Definitely it's something relating to work. I don't go out to eat.

All right. So I'll just circle it. Are you sure about that?---Yeah, I'm sure.

It might have been a personal meal, could have been, couldn't it?---No, I don't eat, and \$28?

Is that a lot or a little?---No, it's a lot, of course it is.

40 Page 614, May 2013 to June 2013, again we're looking at the IWHS credit card, and what is personal on this page 615, you tell me?---There is a repeat of Lite n' Easy here.

Yeah, I'm going to pink that because you're not sure, are you?---So it might be work or might be me, I'm not sure.

You were using Lite n' Easy's services, weren't you?---I can't remember which stage. I remember that I used it but I can't remember which stage.

What about By Dezign?---By Dezign, it's a place where we bought something for work from it, but I can't remember what.

You can't remember, so I'm going to circle it and I'll chase it up for you?  
---All right.

Foxtel, same explanation, correct?---It's work, yeah.

Next page, 616?---Lily Room is personal.

10

Yeah, it's \$1,000 on the IWHS card, isn't it?---It's personal.

It's \$1,000 isn't it?---It's personal, why it's there?

Yeah. The Lite n' Easy, that's problematic, isn't it?---Ah, it's 24<sup>th</sup>, the same day, so it might be one personal and one work because it doesn't make sense that we pay twice.

20

So it's clear what happened on 24 June, isn't it? You went to Lily Room Cosmetics and you had two meals from Lite n' Easy and you didn't pay for either of that, any of those transactions with your own money, did you?---What do you mean I didn't pay from my own?

Well, you didn't pay for Lily Room Cosmetics using your money, did you, on 24 June?---Definitely. It's a mistake, sir.

30

No, but the question is did you actually pay with your own money?---The organisation credit card was using, was used mistakenly. No-one would do such a stupid mistake. It's definitely human error. Definitely.

Well, I think your lawyer has corrected me.---What?

It was 21 June is the Lily Room Cosmetics transaction, and 24 June you had your Lite n' Easy.---Okay.

Page 617, June to July 2013. And, Ms Sharobeem, you must know I've only taken you to a small portion of the statements that I've looked at.---Yeah.

40

Have a look at what's on that page. What's personal?---I can't see anything personal.

The Foxtel management. Same issue.---It's not same issue. We already stated the fact that it's part of my package as a public officer.

Did you have any authorisation from the board or the management committee to have Foxtel services at home?---I spoke about it in one of the meetings just to follow up the media, but I can't remember if it's documented or not. I didn't write the minutes anyway.

Page 619. July 2013 to August 2013. The next page there's nothing there.  
Page 621. August to September 2013. Would you agree?---Yes. It's written there.

Page 622. What's personal on this?---I don't think there is anything personal.

10 But I'm going to highlight the Foxtel because we're going to talk about that a bit more later.---Okay.

Page 623. That's September 2013 to October 2013. Foxtel again. Agreed? It's there. The Foxtel, some transaction. Agreed?---It just came to the screen after you talked.

Oh, okay. Sorry.---That's why I didn't say anything when you talked.

Is it on the screen, the Foxtel transaction?---Now I can see it.

20 October 2013 to November 2013. Page 625. 625. 626. Mooda Hair, Liverpool. What's that about?---I'm reading one by one to identify the (not transcribable), so please give me a chance. I don't think Mooda Hair is personal. I don't do my hair in Liverpool, never did. Definitely there was something bought for that \$30 for the organisation. I never did my hair in Liverpool.

That's all right. It's only – that's only \$30.---No, it's money. It's not only \$30. It's - - -

30 There are bigger transactions we've got to get to, so let's keep going.---It doesn't matter. You ask me for the truth and I'm giving you the details.

And there's another Foxtel one there, isn't there? Sorry, Ms Sharobeem, are you answering a question or am I asking you a question?---I'm waiting for you to talk.

Oh. You didn't have 628? Sorry. Apologies. There's nothing. Is there anything on that screen you think is personal?---No.

40 These AAMI instalment transactions keep coming up. Do you know what they were for?---We had our insurance with AAMI, so I don't know.

Which insurance?---We had the cars.

Which car?---Organisation car.

Which one?---At that time, whatever it was. Because every second year we upgrade the car to keep the value.

Page 629. Transactions to December 2013 to January 2014. Page 630. Again, the Foxtel. Do you agree with that? There's Foxtel there? I don't think there's anything else on that page, is there?---No, nothing.

The ticket, the Jetstar ticket. What was that about? Do you know?  
---Definitely it's flying for a conference or something.

10 Page 631. January 2014 to February 2014. Page 632. And again there's Foxtel transactions, isn't there?---It's a direct debit

Yeah.---That's why it appears regularly.

It's automatic payment, isn't it?---Yeah, that's different word for it, direct debit or automatic payment. It's the same, in my own understanding anyway.

This is a credit card, though, isn't it?---That's the organisation credit card.

20 Yeah. Page 633 from February 2014 to March 2014, then 634 for the transactions. Again do you agree Foxtel appears?---Yeah.

And is there anything else on that page?---No.

Page 635. March 2014 to April 2014. Page 636 of the transactions. Are you happy with that?---Yeah.

30 Page 638. April 2014 to May 2014. Page 639 for the transactions. And then page 640 there's another Foxtel transaction there.---Yeah.

The next page. Agree with that?---Yeah.

Leather goods.---Yeah.

For the service or for yourself?---Oh, no, I - - -

Mmm?---I don't remember but definitely we bought something for \$40 from that place.

40 Do you know if - - -?---I don't think it's personal. I don't think so.

All right. Page 641. May 2014 to June 2014. Page 642. What do you see there?---Everything is work including the Canberra purchase. I bought a couple of items there for the office. I do remember that because I carried them.

What about Bing Lee Casula?---Let me see that again, Bing Lee.

It's \$569.---Yeah, that's work definitely.

What was it do you know?---Could be the update of the stove at that time.

All right. I'm going to note that down, update at store.---It could be. I'm not sure.

What did you buy do you think?---No, I can't remember really but if you have anything to confirm.

10

I'll come back to it.---Yeah.

And the Foxtel Management is there as well. Agreed?---Foxtel there, yeah. Yeah, yeah, last time.

All right. Page 643, June 2014 to July 2014. Optus Billing. I know we've seen these before but do you know what the Optus Billing covered?---Phone or Internet.

20

And there's the Foxtel Management transaction at the end. Do you agree? ---Ah hmm.

July 2014 to August 2014, page 645, page 646 for the transactions.---Yeah, the old work and the Fairfax is similar to Foxtel.

Ms Sharobeem, from August 2014 to September 2014, page 648. What do you say about S+S Hair.Beauty?---That's my personal but I also said that I bought from them some items for work but that is personal, the \$30 is personal.

30

In this period of time, Ms - - -?---But that's St George used.

This is the IWHS credit card, right?---Yeah.

Ms Sharobeem, you should also know that the Commission has a number of receipts from S+S Hair.Beauty that you submitted for reimbursement over the 2013/2014 years.---No, I didn't submit any.

40

Okay. Well, I'm going to take you to them at some point later but - - -? ---Sure.

- - - do you agree that that one appears on your IWHS credit card?---It does. That's personal.

Do you remember what colour the IWHS credit card was?---Red.

And your personal credit card?---It was black.

There's a pretty big difference isn't there between the red and the black card?---Yeah, yeah, the colours, yeah, but I remember mine - - -

Okay.--- - - - wasn't black. You're talking now. Now it's black.

Page 649, another transaction for Foxtel Management. Do you agree?  
---Yeah.

10 All right. Page 650, September to October 2014. Page 651, anything stand out?---No.

Page 652, that's October to November 2014, there's another Foxtel transaction. There's two. Correct?---Yeah, different month.

Page 2645, November to December 2014. Turn the page to 2646. We might come back to that, Commissioner. Ms Sharobeem, where were you living in late 2009.---In Wetherill Park.

20 Was there only one address in Wetherill Park you were living?---One address?

Was there only one address? I don't want to say the address. There was only one, wasn't there?---Yeah.

And can you describe those premises, that house or unit?---It was a townhouse.

Yeah? How many bedrooms?---Three.

30 When did you move out of that house?---2012.

2012?---Mmm.

I'm going to take you to some much older transactions.---Mmm.

40 Volume 1, page 1. Reimbursement brief, volume 1, page 1. I'll just – I'm going to take you through just a selected number of transactions between 2009 and 2013. Do you agree that that's a transfer to your account in the name Eman Sharobeem on 28 August, 2009 for \$2,581.56?---Yeah.

Is it your initial that you see on the page?---Yeah, as usual.

Page 2. You see that there's a cut receipt there for groceries? Do you accept that?---Yeah.

And also a credit card receipt.---It's got on the top. Sorry, where it's cut?

Well, it's cut on the top. Right through the middle of the - - -?---Yeah, so they kept this.

Yeah.---Yeah.

All right. The receipt for \$501.95 - - -?---Yeah.

- - - was a receipt for a Westfields gift card.---Yes.

10 How does that relate to the Immigrant Women's Health Service?---The name of the person appeared at the top.

Yeah.---She did our – the form, all the format of our annual report. And she said, no, I don't expect any payment, because she used to work for Health at that time. And I said, well, how about a gift card? And we issued the gift card for her.

20 Did you run that by the board?---At that time, yes, I believe we did that. And it's very common to get gift cards also for women in, like, to give them something at the end.

I understand. Volume 1, page 8. That's a transfer on 4 September, 2009 for \$2,000. Do you agree?---Yeah, that's what I paid.

Made from your account, isn't it?---Mmm.

And your initials on the transfer receipt.---Ah hmm.

30 Page 9, is that another transfer on 11 September for \$3,522.30?---Ah hmm.

Page 10, there are a number of receipts that were submitted in relation to this transfer, but I'm going to take you to one?---Okay.

Page 10, do you recognise that document?---Ah, when is that, two thousand, yeah, yeah, yeah, I realise that.

What do you realise?---I'm just trying to realise what's that.

40 Well, whose address is [REDACTED]  
---This is Charlie previous.

Your son, Charlie's address, isn't it?---Yeah.

And your son, Charlie, received a sofa, didn't he - - -?---Yes.

- - - on that day?---Yes.

That is not in relation to the service, is it?---No.

I'll take you to page 14. You see the receipt for 1,600?---1,600? Yes.

Do you know what that's for?---Ah, no, but it's written on the top AAPP report.

So what do you think it's for?---I don't know, that abbreviation doesn't say much.

10 Do you agree that the person making the transfer to your account would also not have known what that amount was for?---Definitely there was an explanation given at that time. It's 2013.

Well, I have your MYER one account in front of me - - -?---Mmm.

- - - from 26 June, 2009?---Mmm.

And I can tell you that on 7 August, 2009, there was a Myer, an LCD TV purchased?---So that would be for it?

20

Sorry?---That would be for it, for the - - -

Was that for the service or for your home?---No, it's not for my home, I didn't buy for my home from MYER.

But how is the bookkeeper going to figure out that that was a TV?  
---Definitely I give her the receipt.

30 Did you?---Well, how then would we know that it's for that? You're just telling me. I can't really answer or relate to this.

What does AAPP mean?---That's the abbreviation we used to use for Arabic and Assyrian parenting project and - - -

It says "AAPP report?"---Definitely to be, maybe that's an abbreviation, I give it to her, maybe at that time to say charge this amount against AAPP, AAPP, and definitely we're doing a lot of parenting so it makes sense that the TV was bought for them. We used to have couple of TVs.

40 Where did you put it, where did you put the TV?---Sorry, come again?

Where did you put the TV after you purchased it?---In the childcare room, that's where it's always there.

Okay. So what was that allocated in MYOB as?---We actually had two of them.

Huh?---Sorry, we had two TVs, not only one.

In the same room?---No, no, we had two TVs.

How big was the TV in the childcare room?---It's always big because it's a big room so - - -

How big was it?---I wouldn't know, I don't know, big, big TV, it's for children to sit on the floor and watch, and we had another one in Cabramatta as well. That's normal in a childcare area.

10

So what was this allocated in MYOB as if you wrote AAPP report for the receipt?---No, I don't know the report but I'm sure that there were things like that purchased under the project, so we were allowed from the project money to buy items for the project, used by the project.

Do you agree it's a cut receipt?---No, I, I don't know if it's cut or teared or unstapled, I don't know.

20

Well, you can tell it's a MYER one gift, sorry, a MYER one, it comes from MYER one because it refers to MYER one?---Oh, I saw the MYER now.

But it doesn't have on it what was purchased?---Well, sir, I don't know, I don't deal with these papers, it's the work of other people reviewing what I do. This is not my work, you're showing me receipts which I did not put it anywhere in the financial system, I didn't have access to the financial cabinet. I don't do it, I don't file it, I don't, I don't do it this way, I don't staple it, I don't punch it, that's not my work.

30

So all you did was you bought the TV? And the receipt, where did the receipt go?---I usually – the practice is I either leave it on my desk or it's left, if it's organised and I know what I'm paying for, in the tray. And hardly put in the tray. I actually put on the tray only maybe sometimes time sheets, sorry, invoices. But it's always, always left on my desk. I was the only full-time person. Always.

So are you saying the bookkeeper would go to your desk and collect all the receipts, all the invoices and sort them out?---The practice in the organisation was like that.

40

Are you saying that the bookkeeper would then go through all of your receipts, all your personal receipts, and cut through them? Is that what you're saying?---In early days, in early days I didn't put a lot of personal receipts on the desk in the '04, '05. I was more organised and I was more knowing my staff. But as soon as the campaign against child bride and FGM started, I lost it. I was called by different people to talk every day in different schools and areas. So I lost it. Management wasn't really what I'm doing every day.

Ms Sharobeem, these transactions were conducted, would you agree, when Ms Chen was working, Selina Chen?---It depends on the time.

It's 2009. I'm taking you back to 2009.---Yeah, yeah.

All right. And I showed you receipts yesterday that were – sorry, transfers that were made – I showed you transfers yesterday that were made in 2013 and 2014 during Neth's time, didn't I?---Yeah.

10 You're suggesting that both of these bookkeepers cut your credit card receipts, are you?---And maybe from before.

Both of these bookkeepers - - -?---Cutting my credit card only. No, maybe it's a habit for them to do that in other area in the organisation as well.

You're suggesting that both of these bookkeepers had this unusual habit of cutting credit card receipts and transferring money to your account? Is that your evidence?---Transferring money to my account? That's not an attitude they would do. But the simple fact about the accounting here is I spent,  
20 bring invoices. Bookkeeper manager invoices. Auditor review invoices, review transaction, review everything. Tell us at the end of the year if we did anything wrong, and we fix it. That is the practice.

THE COMMISSIONER: Ms Sharobeem, I don't know that you're addressing the issue which is raised. You can see from these exhibits that at the earlier time there seem to have been a practice of cutting the tops of the receipts which had the effect of removing any identification of either where they were bought or what was purchased and then later - - ----Don't know.

30 - - - when there was another bookkeeper there was the same practice.---It could be the same practice that they follow. I didn't have any access to the financial system to know what's there or how they do their job at all. I didn't, I didn't follow.

So you're saying that both the bookkeepers may have done precisely the same thing?---It might be the same act that they saw when I handed the job for them and they saw how the job is done before and they followed. It might. I'm not trying to say that's their attitude. But also I can't see that this is cut. I'm not sure if this is cut or this is – as I said before what I was  
40 doing and Nathan Boyd discussed with me was the unstapling of the two pieces.

No, you've explained that before or you've - - ----Yeah. But cutting, I'm not sure if this has been cut or not.

MR RAJALINGAM: All right. I'll take you to page 16, volume 1.---But I didn't see them.

We'll just go to the next one. That's a transfer on 9 October, 2009 for \$3,950.67 made to your Eman Sharobeem account isn't it?---Yeah.

Your initial appears on the receipt, transfer receipt?---Yeah.

Page 17. Do you see what's at the bottom right-hand corner of the screen?  
---Yeah.

10 What is it? Just think about it really carefully, Ms Sharobeem.---AAPP - - -

No, no, look at the receipt. Look what's there.---Yeah.

Look what it's for.---Which one you want me to look at?

That one, the one the mouse is hovering over.---Oh, sorry. Here, this one.  
Yeah.

What's it for?---It's some resource we bought at that time for the AAPP.

20 What date?---From Myer.

What date?---Date is – date. Here, sorry. Thanks for pointing out. 7/8/09.

It's the same receipt isn't it, it's the other half, Ms Sharobeem.---For what?

Oh.---The other half for what?

Got to page 14.---Other half for what, sorry?

30 The other half of the receipt I just showed you. You were asking where it was cut, what happened to it. You submitted it twice for reimbursement didn't you?---Of course not.

It's the same receipt, Ms Sharobeem.---Of course not.

Let's have a look at your MYER one account then.---If the same receipt - - -

Volume 4, page 238.---Oh, boy.

40 Don't be – this happens quite a bit.---So I would submit a receipt twice?

That is what I'm suggesting to you, Ms Sharobeem. Don't be mistaken about it.---And I refuse and reject your suggestion.

238, volume 4.

THE COMMISSIONER: Mr Rajalingam, I see it's sort of past time.

MR RAJALINGAM: Yes. Yes, yes. Sorry.

THE COMMISSIONER: We probably all need a rest. We'll adjourn for morning tea.

**SHORT ADJOURNMENT**

**[11.36am]**

10 THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, Mr Rajalingam.

MR RAJALINGAM: Thank you, Commissioner. Sorry, Commissioner, there's just so much paper here.

I apologise, Ms Sharobeem and Commissioner, for the delay. Ms Sharobeem, I was showing you a receipt for 1,600. Do you remember that?  
---Yes.

20 Do you agree that they are the same receipt but cut? If I can take you to pages 14 and 16, do you agree that they are the same receipt?---Yes, you said that before, yeah.

Do you agree?---You said they are the same receipt.

Do you agree?---I agree they are the same receipt, they are two halves, yeah, okay.

Do you recall cutting those receipts?---Absolutely never.

30 Do you recall cutting those receipts and then submitting them for reimbursements?---I absolutely never cut, never submit, I just leave it there to be handed by the people who is doing the finance and responsible about it.

At that time the person doing the bookkeeping was Ms Selina Chen, wasn't it?---We always had a bookkeeper, I can't remember which one, it would be Selina.

40 Can I ask you this about Ms, is it Chen or Chan? Chen, isn't it?---I can't remember.

Do you recall her giving evidence at the inquiry?---Yes, I saw her here.

Do you recall that she said she worked at the IWHS about seven or eight years ago?---I don't recall but of course you have the record.

Do you agree that she was there in about 2009?---Yeah, if, if the record is saying so.

Ms Chen said she worked a long time ago at the Immigrant Women's Health Service. She couldn't recall the exact time, Ms Sharobeem, but would you accept that in 2009 she was there?---She was our bookkeeper and Neth our, and NESH our bookkeeper as well.

Okay?---She was the bookkeeper of both.

10 In any event, when she worked at IWHS as a bookkeeper, you were the boss, weren't you?---I've been the manager since '04.

And Ms Chen worked prior to Neth, correct?---Ah, yes.

You gave her, that is Selina Chen, the password to do St George online banking, didn't you?---The password is always on my desk.

20 And when Ms Chen was there as a bookkeeper it was only you and her that had the password, correct?---No, the auditor also had access to the password and the password is kept in a piece of paper on my desk all the time since I was there.

Was there anyone else doing bookkeeping work when Ms Chen was there? ---Ah, the auditor in some stage ah - - -

Was there another bookkeeper at the service when Ms Chen was employed? ---Ah, there was a person by the name of Linda.

30 Linda came after Ms Chen, didn't she?---Ah, yeah, well, you have the record, I can't remember really.

Does that sound familiar to you?---Linda?

Linda Yab?---Linda, she was Chinese, from Chinese background as well, yeah, what's the question, sorry?

Look, do you know if Linda Yab was the next bookkeeper after Ms Chen? ---After, after Selina? No, I can't really recall if it's after or before, but definitely you have records of their name.

40 And when you, you provided receipts to Ms Chen by just simply leaving them in the tray, didn't you?---No, I leave them on my desk, that's the attitude.

And what, you expected her to go through your desk and figure out what was personal and what was work-related, is that your evidence?---Every bookkeeper worked with IWHS had the same instruction, here is the detail, I'm not responsible about the finance, you get the receipts from my desk, you sort it out, you look at what's to be paid and what's not and let me

know. There is auditor at the end of the financial year, you give them the details and they observe and look at our finance. I - - -

Ms Sharobeem, you accept that what you're saying is completely at odds with what Ms Chen said?---I accept what, I accept what?

You accept that what you're saying now about Ms Chen's role - - -?---Yeah.

10 - - - is completely at odds with what she said to this inquiry?---How would I know what she said to the inquiry?

Weren't you here in the room next door listening?---I was, but you want me to accept that what I said is contradicting her? This is just what I say to every bookkeeper, how, how - - -

[REDACTED]

■

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

■

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

■

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

But Selina,  
when she was employed, she was fully capable of running - - -

She was - - -?---Fully capable of being a very good bookkeeper.

Yes, thank you.

30

MR RAJALINGAM: Do you know if Ms Chen has ever received any training at bookkeeping?---I believe so.

You say that she was a good bookkeeper?---She was doing the work good. I mean, I didn't get any complaint from, about her from the previous or former auditor. That's why I'm saying she do good bookkeeping.

So you - - -?---That's the only evidence.

40

Why else do you say that she's a good bookkeeper, Ms Sharobeem?  
---Because I was referring to the language, sorry. I was referring to the claim you said she didn't have a good English, so I'm just responding back.

No, you said she's a good bookkeeper, didn't you?---I didn't mean she was.

I know you didn't mean that. Is that what you're saying?---We're not playing the language game. You know my mental status. You know that I

am getting very deteriorated and tired. So please don't try to pick on my language.

Was she a good bookkeeper or a bad bookkeeper?---I withdraw this statement and I say she had good English. That's all I meant. She had good English.

THE COMMISSIONER: Okay,---I'm responding to your word about English.

10

MR RAJALINGAM: You never asked her to sort out work and personal related expenses, did you?---That's my attitude with every bookkeeper. I don't change my attitude since day one. That's what they are employed to do, to follow up the finance of the organisation.

Page 1, sorry, volume 1, page 20. Do you agree that that's a transfer on 6 November, 2009 for \$3,812.56 to your account?---Yes.

You agree your initial appears on the transfer receipt?---Yes.

20

Page 21. Did you submit here another credit card receipt from Myer Parramatta?---I don't submit anything, as I said before.

Do you know what the receipt at the bottom right-hand corner for \$1,988 was for?---It's definitely items marked down from Myer for the purpose of the AAPP, and there is the word outreach which sometimes we use for projects not IWHS.

30 So in August of 2009, you purchased one TV for the service, the receipt I showed you earlier for 1,600, correct?---Yes. That's, you said that.

And you put that in the childcare centre didn't you?---We - - -

That's what you said didn't you, you put it in the childcare centre for the kids?---If it's what I said okay, all right.

Is that what happened to the TV you purchased on 7 August, 2009?---You just said that. All right.

40 No, no, are you agreeing with it?---I can't remember what happened in '09 so I'm agreeing with what you're showing me. You want me to lie?

No, no,---I'm just saying based on your question.

Ms Sharobeem, I'm saying to you that before the break you told the inquiry - - -.---And I agreed with you.

No, no, listen to the question.---Okay.

You're cutting across me now.---Sure.

I'm trying not to cut across you.---Okay.

Okay. But you told the inquiry before the break that the TV that was purchased on 7 August, 2009 - - -.---Yeah.

- - - was put into the childcare centre didn't you?---Yes.

10

You were sitting in the witness box and you were describing how big it was and you said it went into the childcare centre.---I said I can't remember the size. I'm not good with metres and sizes.

Okay. I'm asking where you put the TV not the size now.---That's where we put the TV.

In the childcare centre?---We usually have one in Cabramatta and one in Fairfield and I had one in my room, in my office for certain time.

20

Do you agree that this is another TV that has been purchased, bottom right-hand corner, for 1,988?---It could be, yes.

Well, it says there LCD plasma doesn't it?---Yes, yes, I can read that.

Ms Sharobeem, I'm looking at your MYER one account.---Yes.

And it's a 50-inch plasma TV.---All right.

30

Where did you put that 50-inch plasma TV?---It might be in Cabramatta centre.

It's in the Cabramatta centre is it in 2009?---We had one in Fairfield, one in Cabramatta so we might of recycled Parramatta one – sorry, Fairfield one to Cabramatta one and also we had the policy in the organisation that if anything is over two years because of the depreciation that we update it and it's available for staff or clients to take home if they like or the rubbish bin. So it might be here, it might be in staff houses. They take it home. It might be in my home. It might be in Cabramatta. So if it's old, older than two years it's recycled.

40

Did you – was that ever approved by the board, recycling items that were purchased for the IWHS?---That's from the beginning of my employment, yes.

You thought from 2004 that after two years you could pretty much take anything from the office did you?---No, that's not true.

So what's your evidence? No, let's be clear about it. You're saying after two years - - -?---I am replying and you cut my reply for a purpose.

10 Okay. You, you, you tell me.---My reply is clearly no, it is not that I take. It is the policy that if it's old and it's going to be thrown away we either recycle it for the client or the staff or it's to the rubbish bin or actually we give it to donation and by the way, this is not my practice. This is the practice known around the NGO sector. This is not Immigrant Women's Health only. This is the NGO sector in Australia. We do that, all of us. We recycle what we have or either the staff take it.

And in about 2009, Ms Sharobeem, were there outreach services being conducted by the Immigrant Women's Health Service?---The outreach word is just for the MYOB because we didn't have coding at that time and we were just starting the project so most likely the word outreach just to direct the bookkeeper of how to find the – or write the, the expenses against the MYOB.

20 AAPP, what does that mean again?---The Arabic Assyrian Parenting Project.

That was the notation on the receipt for the \$1,600 invoice as well wasn't it?---I believe so. I believe so. Sorry, 12 what? Sorry, come again.

AAPP outreach was the same notation on the 1,600 invoice wasn't it?---The AAPP is for the Arabic and Assyrian Parenting Project.

30 Go to page 14 of the brief. Page 14 says AAPP report. Page 17, the other half of the \$1,600 invoice says AAPP resource. Now, what's the difference between the two first of all?---It's just for MYOB purpose but it's all to be put under AAPP and then - - -

Same thing?---Right. When we do the reporting, excuse me, financial reporting, we look at under each project what's the money spent for, so you have to have like itemisation for MYOB, that's why you have another word next to the project name so - - -

40 What else would happen in financial reporting, itemisation, what else? ---Well, it depends on what's going to come out, I'm going to explain it to you, sir.

Okay, explain it?---I don't know what's - - -

You don't know about financial reporting, do you?---What, what's the question really? Sorry, let me - - -

How do you allocate a payment in MYOB?---I don't know MYOB.

You don't know. I'll ask you the next question, Ms Sharobeem. I'll take you to page 27?---I seriously didn't know what you meant by that and I didn't answer full answer, so I ask for this either to be explained or that my answer is not to be recognised as anything at all because I don't know what I'm answering to anything.

Well, explain, what do you want to explain?---I don't know the question. What, what are you asking me?

10 Do you know - - ?---You're saying I don't know about financial system. I don't.

Do you know – okay. Well, that's, that's your answer?---Sorry, yeah.

Page 27, do you agree it's a transfer on 15 January, 2010 for \$3,041.06 made to your account, Eman Sharobeem?---Yeah, it's written here.

Go to page 30. You see the credit card receipt for \$184.60?---Yes.

20 Do you accept it's a cut receipt?---No, I don't know if it's cut or not. What I see her doesn't really indicate that it's cut or not.

Well, we'll go back to page 14 of this folder and I'm going to show you a document, Ms Sharobeem, in hard copy. That's that \$1,600 receipt again. Okay?---Sorry, what?

Do you see the \$1,600 receipt?---Yes, I can.

30 Go to page 17. Is that the same receipt but the other half of it?---If it's the same coding and everything, yes, it is. I'm not sure.

Ms Sharobeem, I'm going to give you these receipts - - ?---Okay.

- - - and you can have a look for yourself to satisfy yourself?---Sure.

Are these the two cut receipts that I've shown you?---Ah, yes.

Do you recall cutting that receipt?---Never.

40 Do you recall making the purchase for a \$1,600 TV?---No, no, no, no. See, that's what I mean, that's what I exactly mean. De-staple them but no cutting, no. That's where I take the pin from here, no cutting.

But it's cut in the middle, isn't it, Ms Sharobeem, can you see that?---It is cut in the – yeah, somehow.

Did you cut it?---No, of course not.

I tender that original receipt.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, Exhibit 36.

**#EXHIBIT 36 - PHOTO OF MYER RECEIPT DATED 7 AUGUST  
2009 CUT IN HALF**

10 MR RAJALINGAM: I understand a photograph will be taken of that which can be tendered.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you.

MR RAJALINGAM: We might do that later.

THE COMMISSIONER: Okay.

20 MR RAJALINGAM: You can hand that back now, Ms Sharobeem. I'll take you back to page 27. Page 30, and you can have a look at the \$184.60 receipt. That, do you agree you can't tell what time it is for, the receipt? ---If you didn't see it and point it out to me I wouldn't be able, it's maybe 4.14 or – there's a 4.14 on the side.

Where are you suggesting there's a 4.14?---Actually, it's 4.11.

That's the expiry date of the credit card, isn't it?---Oh, expiry date, sorry. So there's – I can't read anything else.

30 Ms Sharobeem, this transaction appears in your bank account statement on 27 December, 2009, some two weeks before the reimbursement.---Okay.

Would you accept that?---If you saw it.

I'm saying it to you.---Sure.

Just accept it for the sake of the questions.---All right. Okay.

40 Do you know what the amount is for, looking at the receipt?---No, but definitely it would belong or relate to AAPP if it's written here.

Well, it relates to a meal you had at Criniti's restaurant in Parramatta on 27 December, 2009.---So definitely it was the celebration with the facilitators. That's why it's written under there. And I don't go to Parramatta unless I have the staff with me.

But those details cannot be seen on the receipt, can they?---That's why there is maybe they wrote AAPP or it has explanation over there, or maybe

because the staff were there already. And maybe there is another document with it. I'm not sure.

I'll take you to page 36. Is that a transfer to your account on 29 January, 2010 for \$1,026?---It appears like that.

Your initials on the receipt?---Yeah.

10 Page 37 is a credit card receipt for \$189.90.---Which one should I look?  
\$189.90 is the - - -?---Yes.

Do you see that?---Yeah.

That is for – it's a credit card receipt again, isn't it?---Yeah, it's written card.

And you agree you can't tell where it's from?---It might be the organisation card. I'm not sure.

20 The actual transaction came from Sambello Menswear in Fairfield.  
---Menswear?

Why is it, then, that it is noted as "Cabra"?---Yes.

It's Sambello Menswear, Fairfield.---Sambello Menswear, Fairfield. And it has "Cabra" on it?

30 Yes.---I only bought menswear for the organisation during the life of AAPP and also a couple of times during the multicultural parenting project, as presents for the parents. I'm not sure.

What sort of clothing did you buy as gifts? How many - - -?---No, from clothing shops I remember buying belts, I remember buying wallets as presents for the parents after the end of the program. But nothing much more than that.

Okay. Well, think about it carefully. What else did you buy?---And that happened maybe three to four times.

40 Belts, wallets. What else did you buy?---I remember also I bought small perfumes. The amount would be between \$20 to \$30. I bought – that's when it comes to men's. I bought training - - -

What about the belts and wallets? How much would they cost?---I usually, with these gifts for the parents, each one of them wouldn't exceed \$30. That's also from the project. And the other things I bought is shaving cream, the things at Target or Big W, which is, like, in boxes, like trimming kit it was for \$30 as, around Christmas. Things like that.

So small items under about 50 bucks?---Under 50 bucks each, yeah.

Well, this is a transfer receipt for \$190, isn't it? Sambello's Menswear?  
---Yes, well, maybe I bought more than one. That's what I'm saying. I, I did, I don't buy for one parent. I buy for a group. And I did that over the life of the two projects maybe four to six times, to my recollection. And those are the items I bought for those groups. No, there is another one where we had a big event. I bought, I bought those items as well. We didn't  
10 buy anything else except, like, items like that. But I bought more than six items at that time. It was a big event and we had a raffle door prize.

Why were you buying presents for parents?---It's not presents, we were encouraging at that time parents to attend, specially men, because the responsibility of parenting always left to women, so we try to encourage men to attend by advertising that come and bring your child, you'll be with your wife, we will talk about parenting and as a promotion and we are allowed from the project money to do promotion, so under the promotion we can do that to encourage parent to attend. It's like food, when we buy  
20 food to encourage people to attend. Under promotion you can do anything, really. And it's not presents, it's just encouragement, token of appreciation.

How many presents to do recall giving people on one occasion? So you're saying you gave more than one gift on one occasion?---Yes. Each occasion, as I explained yesterday, for this - - -

Well, no, can we be precise about it?---Sure.

Let's be precise?---Okay.  
30

When did you start giving gifts to people?---Gifts to people? We're talking here about the Arabic Assyrian project and the multicultural - - -

Only that program?---You referring to these purchases from Fairfield?

I'm asking you about - - -?---Right.

No, no, turn the computer off, there's nothing in front of you?  
---No, nothing except you.  
40

I'm asking you a question?---Sure.

From what point at your time at the IWHS did you start purchasing encouragement items for people?---Encouragement items, I never got encouragement items but we call it small gifts to support people.

Sorry, you just said small gifts to support people, didn't you?  
---I'm trying to - - -

Did you say that?---No, no, no, no.

You didn't say that?---No, no.

Okay?---Can I get a chance - - -

So, well, what do you want to say?--- - - - to say one thing - - -

- 10 Because I'm going to write it down?--- - - - at a time without cutting me?  
Can you please ask him to give me a chance to say what's on my mind and clarify it?

Commissioner, I will allow the witness to finish.

THE WITNESS: I'm just trying to find the right word for it and you're not giving me a chance.

- 20 MR RAJALINGAM: I am not asking you another question until you can answer this one?---Okay. It's not buying gifts or it's not an encouragement, basically it's to promote the activities among members of the community, sometimes we buy small gifts and the gifts could be distributed during bingo games or during raffle ticket prizes or during big events when we give away presents to men, women and children. I hope I made myself clear. That's in a nutshell.

Did you mention the word presents in your answer?---Maybe. I, I can't remember. I did? I don't know.

- 30 You don't know what your answer just then was, do you?---I just said what's in my mind exactly about those events.

Can you answer this question yes or no?---Yes.

Did you give presents to people when you were working at the Immigrant Women's Health Service?---Yes, presents and gifts, if that would explain it.

- 40 What's the difference between a present and a gift?---Ah, the terminology is used by different people in different way. The Middle Eastern group, they will call it gifts, the Spanish group will call it present, so I'm just trying to summarise what happened in all the services and give you an answer. Different workers will say we need presents for this group and different others will say where is the gifts for this groups, so I'm, I'm, I don't know where are you taking this question to and I'm reluctant to say anything, maybe he's trapping me so I don't know. I don't know.

Ms Sharobeem, are you suggesting I'm trapping you?---You have been for the last week.

Ms Sharobeem, I am showing you receipts that have been submitted in support of reimbursements to your account. Do you understand that?  
---But your question is just – I don't know where you're taking the question to so I'm not sure what I'm answering.

THE COMMISSIONER: Just stop and we'll go back to a question and answer.

10 MR RAJALINGAM: I'll take you to page 71 of the brief. Do you agree it's a transfer on 9 July, 2010 for \$3,307.20 to your account?---Yes, I can see it and I don't know the writing in the middle.

Is it your initial on the transfer receipt?---Yeah, that's scribble, yeah.

I'll take you to page 75. What is – the top left-hand corner is that a receipt from Roger David?---Yes.

Is that a men's clothing store?---Yes, it is.

20

Do you agree it's only a credit card receipt?---Yes.

Do you agree you cannot tell what was purchased?---Definitely for the groups for those ones. I don't think you will have many of those across the years.

I'll take you to page 104.---Maybe 10 maximum. Sorry, where?

30 Is that a transfer for 3 December, 2010 for \$1,074.61 made to your account Eman – sorry. That's a transfer on December, 2010 for \$1,074.61 to your account isn't it?---I can see that.

Your initial is on the transfer receipt isn't it?---Yes.

Page 103. The reference to MPP9, do you know what that's a reference to?  
---Where are we.

MPP9.---Yeah.

40 What's that?---MPP is multicultural parenting project and 9 don't know the reference to it.

Page 104, is that a credit card receipt there for – it's \$265 on 17 November, 2010.---Yeah.

Do you know what it's for?---From Westfield. Definitely - - -

Yeah. Do you know what you purchased for the service?---Definitely there was another paper with it or something to say.

So what's it for?---Well, this receipt doesn't tell but definitely there is another paper to say, there's document attached to it.

I've worked it out and it's for Leah's Waxworks in Parramatta.---What?

10 Leah's Waxworks. Is that somewhere you went?---Leah's Wax?

Waxworks.---Waxworks.

Leah's Waxworks.---Leah's Wax?

Leah's Wax, you know, a beauty salon.---So definitely we bought something from there.

20 Was it waxing that you got done on 17 November, 2010?---No. I don't do waxing. No.

I'll take you - - .---There's definitely things we bought from there.

At Leah's Waxworks for the service?---Well, I don't know what they selling there so maybe we bought candles, maybe we bought other stuff like creams for women or something, maybe. We're a health service so I'm assuming. It doesn't ring a bell. I'm just assuming with you while we go. Maybe I'll refresh my memory a bit more if I see something else and it will reflect in my memory.

30 Page 111. Do you agree it's a transfer to your account on 17 December, 2010 \$3,999?---Yeah.

So this transfer, Ms Sharobeem, is only two weeks after the last transfer to your account.---All right.

You're receiving a lot of money aren't you?---Receiving - - -

40 Yeah.--- - - - is not the right expression. Spending and receiving would be much better.

I'll take you – do you agree that that's a transfer for 17 December, 2010 for \$3,999?---Yes, I can see that.

I'll take you to page 112. This was submitted in support of this reimbursement. Do you know what it's for, the receipt?---No. Nature, Natural Room? Let me just dig my memory a bit. It's a warehouse, so definitely we bought a product from there.

Don't you recognise this type of receipt? You know what this is, Ms Sharobeem, don't you?---I, why do you have to mock me in your attitude? That doesn't help anyone.

Well, do you know what it is?---I'm trying to read it equally to you.

All right.---But if you know it, why do you have to mock me? Just tell me what you see and I will accept what you're saying.

10 THE COMMISSIONER: Do you know what it is?---I'm trying, sir. From what I read on the top, no, but I'm trying to read what's underneath.

MR RAJALINGAM: It's for the purchase of a Neptune lounge suite, Ms Sharobeem.---Okay.

Do you remember purchasing a Neptune lounge suite?---Oh, I look for lounge. Sorry, I got lounge now, yes.

20 Do you remember purchasing a Neptune lounge suite?---From Harvey Norman I purchased three lounges from the stock floor, from the floor stock, sorry.

And they were the Neptune lounge, wasn't it?---I, well, I can't really remember.

Was it three, R plus R plus R. Do you see the reference to that in the receipt? Three R plus R plus R. Next to Neptune LOU.---I see that, yes.

30 See that? Okay. Does that refresh in your memory - - -?---Yeah, I, I don't know Natural is, what's Natural reference in reference to? Like, that's the brand or the name or what? We found it on the stock and that's why it's cheap. That's why we got it.

You also that day purchased a Charleston lounge suite, didn't you? Remember the Charleston?---I remember buying two in one go because it was floor stock.

40 But they weren't two sofas. They were two sets of sofas, weren't they? ---Two sets, yes.

Big ones, weren't they?---No, not big ones.

How much was in each set?---Each set. One is a lounge and - - -

So it was a two-seater. You know what I'm asking you, right?---Sorry?

Do you know what I'm asking you?---How big is - - -

Was it a two-seater, three-seater and a one-seater? What was it?---Okay. I'll wait until you finish because I think I'm interrupting you.

10 No, no. You can answer now. What was the Neptune lounge suite?---The lounge suites I bought from Harvey Norman for the organisation. At that stage, at that day there were two of them. One of them is a, like, sofa. Not sofa, the word is – two chairs and a sofa. Not sofa bed, I mean sofa. And other one is two chairs and sofa as well. One was placed in Parramatta. Sorry, in Fairfield. One in Cabramatta, one in Fairfield. And then recycled after that.

Hold on. Wait, sorry, sorry. Can I write that down? The Neptune lounge, you said, was two-seater and a seater and a seater?---Oh, sure, yeah.

So the Neptune was two seats, one seat and one seat? Is that what you said?---There's two sets.

20 The Neptune.---I don't know the name. I'm saying on that day I bought two lounges. Each one was a sofa and two chairs.

Okay. And in relation to one set, just one set - - -?---Yeah.

- - - where did the chairs go?---The chairs and the sofa went to Fairfield office.

And were they the same set that went to the Fairfield office?---What do you mean the same set?

30 Well, you bought two sets of lounges, right?---The beige one went to Cabramatta. The blue one went to Fairfield, in particular in the child care room when we had the – and that should be under AAPP or maybe MPP – when we had the mother breastfeeding area.

All right. I'll take you - - -?---And we were using the area also for groups.

I'll take you to volume 4, page 145. Before you put that up, who delivered the sofa to the service?---I believe I did. I arrange the delivery. I believe I did.

40 By who?---A company, I think. I mean, I can't really recall.

You can't recall? Was it Harvey Norman?---It was Harvey Norman.

Yeah. The receipt was from Harvey Norman, wasn't it?---Yeah, yeah, I saw that.

So did you organise a delivery with Harvey Norman?---I can't remember. Sometimes if they are expensive I don't organise delivery with them.

So if it's expensive with them you won't organise delivery. Is that what your evidence is?---That's from memory, not that's my evidence or not.

Dig deep, Ms Sharobeem. There were two lounges you purchased?---Yeah.

How were they delivered?---Can't remember.

10 You said you could remember in relation to the blue couch that it went to Fairfield?---Yeah.

And you could remember that the - - -?---Yeah.

- - - beige couch went to Cabramatta?---I remember organising them, I remember seeing them in their place, I remember the staff saying okay about it or not, I remember when they were old that they were recycled and I took them home to my new address after some years.

20 I'll show you volume 4, page 145?---Okay.

And I wonder if you could be shown page 112 from the hard copy of the brief, volume 1, page 112, which is the receipt you looked at. So volume 4, page 145. So keep the folder in front of you, Ms Sharobeem, and I'll show you what Harvey Norman sent the Commission?---Sorry.

Do you see that?---Sorry? Oh, do I see that? Yes, I can see that.

30 Do you understand that what's been cut and submitted for reimbursement is everything in that document from where it says "product", underneath the redaction, to just above where it says, "pick up/delivery address." Would you agree that that is the case?---No, you're hiding the delivery address, isn't it?

I'll give you the un-redacted – I haven't asked you about what the delivery address is, I'm just asking you if - - -?---Right.

- - - the cut receipt that was submitted for reimbursement - - -?---Mmm. Isn't it that what's submitted?

40 Sorry?---Or isn't it that what you found in the folder or – I didn't get the question. What are you, what are you asking me really, to verify this document or to verify the address?

Look at the folder in front of you?---Okay.

Is that page 112?---Yes.

Is that a cut receipt?---The receipt in front of me is not complete.

That's right?---Yes.

It's not complete?---I can't see any further details, even the ANZ.

Is the complete version on page 145 of volume 4, if we can show that again  
- - -?---That's what you found there, okay.

10 Well, that's the complete version of the invoice - - -?---Okay.

- - - from Harvey Norman. That's what they sent the Commission, Ms Sharobeem. Do you understand that?---So that wasn't in the file?

Ms Sharobeem, what I showed you at page 112 was part of an invoice submitted in support of a reimbursement. Do you understand that?  
---So this what you're seeing me on the screen wasn't in the file?

What file are you talking about, Ms Sharobeem?---In the financial file.

20 THE COMMISSIONER: I think the answer is no. This, I think what we're hearing is that this document from Harvey Norman was obtained from Harvey Norman?---Right.

Not from the file?---From not from the file, okay.

And what was in the file was only part of it, the copy that was in the file was only part of it. I think that's what's being put to you?

30 MR RAJALINGAM: Yes, thank you, Commissioner.

THE WITNESS: So where is the part you found in the file? Is that the only thing, the credit receipt?

MR RAJALINGAM: So page 112 - - -?---Yeah.

- - - of the folder in front of you, the folder – just turn the screen off. Page 112 - - -?---Mmm.

40 - - - is the invoice - - -?---Mmm.

- - - that was submitted for reimbursement. Do you understand that?  
---I don't think so. I don't think so.

Oh, you're not being serious with that answer, are you?---I don't think so.

THE COMMISSIONER: I think what you're being asked is, can you see that that document there that you're looking at is part of that other document?---Yes.

You can see that?---Yes.

Okay?---They are linked together.

Yes, thank you.

10 MR RAJALINGAM: If the witness could be shown page 145 of volume 4 of the allegation brief. No, the actual hard copy, sorry. Volume 4, page 145. So I'm going to show you the unredacted version of the invoice provided by Harvey Norman.---Okay. So that wasn't in the organisation. Yes.

Do you see that what you're looking at is what appears on the screen but the unredacted version of it?---I can see that.

20 And do you agree that on the invoice that Harvey Norman have provided the Commission that the delivery address is the address at Wetherill Park?---It's written down here that.

And that sofa was delivered to that address wasn't it?---Sir, those two sofas came to my house after not before and I'm sorry, but my signature is here as well so I'm not sure about that. Give me one second just to remember or trying to recollect. And this is also nearly \$4,000. And my place in Wetherill Park was very, very small. It wouldn't take that.

Let's leave – let's - - -.---No.

30 I'll give you the lunchbreak to think about that. Let me take you to one more - - -.---No, no, no.

Okay. Ms Sharobeem, don't think about that yet. I'll take you to one more reimbursement, okay, and we'll have lunch. How's that?---(No Audible Reply)

Are you happy with that?---No, no, no, no. I just need to look at this. Sorry, I'm not, I'm not even following what you're saying.

40 Would you mind – what I'm saying to you, Ms Sharobeem, is take your time over lunch and think about it.---I don't have a place to have lounges.

Okay.---And they came to me after.

Just - - -.---Anyway.

Don't respond now. I'll ask you this question again I promise - - -.---Sure, sure.

- - - after lunch.---Go ahead.

Okay. I'll take you volume 1, page 127. All right. Ms Sharobeem, do you agree that that's a transfer to your account Eman Sharobeem on 14 January, 2011 in the amount of \$2,999?---Yes.

Your initial is on the transfer receipt isn't it?---Ah hmm.

10 I'll take you a couple of pages forward. Yeah, that, stop there. What is all this about, what is this document about, Ms Sharobeem, page 128?---Let me read and understand. Okay.

So in support of the transfer did you submit the receipt here for a Charleston lounge valued at \$3,000?---That's what I'm saying.

What - - -?---So my recollection is right. I'm confused now.

20 Well - - -?---So what – so maybe there wasn't any, anything with it so I put a statement with it. I'm trying to dig my memory to remember. Attach receipt for the amount.

You're suggesting at the top aren't you that it's - - -?---Office and furniture supplies for Cabramatta.

- - - for Cabramatta aren't you?---In 2010.

Yeah.---Okay.

30 It's a Charleston lounge isn't it the receipt or the invoice?---And it's kept in Cabramatta so the staff would know about it. It's, it's, it's not air, it's furniture so people would see it.

And what happened to the Charleston lounge?---I believe that's the name. Names doesn't mean anything. Maybe colours for me.

Did the Cabramatta service use the lounge?---I bought them over the years, more than four lounges, and one of them - - -

40 Must have been this one?--- - - - is in my house now, which is the beige one. And the blue one was for Fairfield. That's all to my recollection. The names, Charleston doesn't mean anything to me. And it's leather cover, so maybe I just photocopied this or maybe they photocopied this on the top of that just to put them all together.

Volume 4, page 152.---And this is not from Harvey Norman.

Well, it is from Harvey Norman.---So it is, then.

Do you recognise that invoice, Ms Sharobeem?---So it's here and it's written.

I'm going to ask that you be shown page 152 of the hard copy of volume 4. You've probably got it in front of you, but can you please let the court officer turn the page to page 152.---Yes.

So what's the delivery address on this invoice?---My old address.

10 So it went to your old address, didn't it?---No. The beige was in Cabramatta and it was delivered again to my address when it was recycled.

It was never recycled, Ms Sharobeem. Ms Chen gave evidence at this inquiry and she never saw any new lounges at the Cabramatta centre. She worked there for years regularly, 9.00am to 5.00pm.---Can you please close the screen? Can you please close the screen?

THE COMMISSIONER: Turn off the screen.

20 THE WITNESS: Oh, you mean I can't ask you? All right. That's not true, that is an absolute lie. Other women can witness what the furniture would be over there, not only that but also we had other staff which is Thi, we also have the nurse over there which you can check with her, we also have other people attended community engagement activity over there at nights and during the weekend and Luong, as far as I remember, said that there was a lounge or a beige lounge, and please go back to her witness because I remember she witnessed that.

30 MR RAJALINGAM: I'll show you volume 25 page 36?---Sure.

That's the new-looking Charleston lounge, isn't it?---No, I actually had to buy wax specially and re-wax it. It's not new-looking.

It's not torn, is it?---Is it – that's the Charleston, the beige?

That's the Charleston?---Yeah.

Yeah?---All right.

40 It's not second-hand-looking, is it?---It is actually, it's ripped from the back.

It is. All right. Well, that lounge suite was found by the Commission during the execution of a search warrant. Do you, do you accept that? ---When you invaded my home and this is actually the one I just said earlier and even before seeing this that it has been recycled to my home, equal to another blue one recycled to Marie home in her holiday house and the TV to Watfa and another screen to Watfa and Luong took the other blue with red flowers. That is the norm of the organisation, sir. The statement I'd like to

make because I am now grasping exactly what the Commissioner is trying to get to, the Assistant Commissioner, I'm sorry. Basically there is a policy, unwritten policy in the NGO sector not only belong to us that if we get any item and it's to be recycled it's either offered to the staff or offered to the community members or put for a minimum amount for sale or it's recycled by the council, and because we are an organisation very small, we used, instead of advertising like other organisation we used to just spread the word around. So as I said, two sofa beds were taken by Luong to her home when she said that one of her relatives coming from Cambodia, a lounge suite was taken by Marie, a TV, an office chair, computer, computer desk was taken by Watfa, other items like a fridge and an old washing machine was taken by a client, also there was another item taken by a client of DV case which actually some new items were given to her because she had nothing in the house, and that house belonged to NESH.

THE COMMISSIONER: Well, I can understand what you're saying. I think the point that's being put to you to answer is the fact that the document from the retailer indicates that when it was new it was delivered to your house?---I can see that and I don't understand why. The only explanation I have in my mind now is the same thing happened with the message chair, when they take the information from my card, the credit card details.

Okay?---That's the only explanation I have.

All right. Thank you. We'll adjourn.

30 **LUNCHEON ADJOURNMENT**

**[1.05pm]**