

TARLOPUB00504
10/05/2017

TARLO
pp 00504-00553

PUBLIC
HEARING

COPYRIGHT

INDEPENDENT COMMISSION AGAINST CORRUPTION

THE HONOURABLE REGINALD BLANCH AM QC

PUBLIC HEARING

OPERATION TARLO

Reference: Operation E15/1982

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

AT SYDNEY

ON WEDNESDAY 10 MAY, 2017

AT 10.00AM

Any person who publishes any part of this transcript in any way and to any person contrary to a Commission direction against publication commits an offence against section 112(2) of the Independent Commission Against Corruption Act 1988.

This transcript has been prepared in accordance with conventions used in the Supreme Court.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, Mr Rajalingam.

MR RAJALINGAM: Thank you, Commissioner.

THE COMMISSIONER: Ms Sharobeem, you are still on the same oath that you took yesterday, or the affirmation. Thank you.

10 <EMAN SHAROBEEM, on former affirmation [10.11am]

MR RAJALINGAM: Ms Sharobeem, do you recall yesterday I was, I referred to a SBS program, Insight?---Yes.

Do you remember appearing on the show?---Yes.

I'm going to play a part of that show to you to refresh your memory.

20 VIDEO RECORDING PLAYED [10.12]

MR RAJALINGAM: Ms Sharobeem, do you recall saying that in the program, Insight?---It's indicated already in the video.

Do you remember listening to Danielle's story?---Who's Danielle?

30 Danielle's the lady relating the story. I think it's an alias for that person, so did you hear a story just being told?---The video clip you just mentioned?

Yes, the video clip?---I heard it, yes.

And do you remember hearing it at the time when you were sitting there in the program?---Yes, of course.

And do you recall, did you recall her talking about having depressed feelings and so on?---Whatever she said, yeah.

40 And you responded to the host of the show and all of those people who were sitting in that studio and said that you were a psychologist, didn't you? ---I said that, yes.

You knew that SBS was a national broadcasting service?---I used to work with them.

It is available on the internet?---Yes, it is.

It's available on the TV?---Yes, it is.

And there are many articles published by SBS, aren't there?---Of course.

And you knew when you said that you were a psychologist that that would be published to the greater world, didn't you?---Yes, that was wrong interpretation of who I was.

You said in your evidence yesterday that you also referred people that you saw to other psychologists?---That's right.

10

One of the organisations that you referred to was Transcultural Mental Health. Do you remember that?---That's right.

Ms Sharobeem, in fairness I will tell you that the Commission has contacted Transcultural Mental Health - - ?---Yeah.

- - - and they have advised that between 2009 and 2015 that you only referred 20 people to their service. Would that be about right?---No.

20 I'm going to show you a document.

Commissioner, there aren't any electronic copies of this particular document but I've got hard copies. Here's a hard copy.

Ms Sharobeem, you can turn, well, you can have a look at the whole document.

30 Commission, I apologise. Just before going to that document may I tender excerpts from the audio that was played yesterday in relation to ABC Radio National and then ABC Podcast and on it is also the SBS program, Insight, excerpt, so all the audio and video that we've seen so far.

THE COMMISSIONER: All on the one disc, is it?

MR RAJALINGAM: All on the one disc.

THE COMMISSIONER: So we'll just mark it as one exhibit, 27.

40 **#EXHIBIT 27 - 3 INTERVIEWS WITH EMAN SHAROBEEM – ABC INTERVIEW BY RACHAEL KOHN ON 29 JULY 2012; SUNDAY PROFILE INTERVIEW BY RICHARD AEDY ON 7 DECEMBER 2014; INSIGHT EPISODE 15 ON POLYGAMY FROM 2012**

MR RAJALINGAM: Ms Sharobeem, can you have a look at that document in front of you, the letter from Transcultural Mental Health?---I did.

You've seen that?---I did.

It's the case, isn't it, that the 20 people that you referred, some of those people may have also been clients of Transcultural Mental Health?---No. Not true.

Ms Sharobeem, you weren't in the practices of, practice of referring people to other psychologists because you were practising as one, weren't you?
10 ---No, I didn't do the referral myself, I thought it's not my job, it's the first office, the front office I mean, sorry.

I'll show you a document, volume 15, page 62. Ms Sharobeem, do you agree that this is a document with your name on the top of it?---Yes.

And is your, does your name appear as Dr Eman Sharobeem?---Underneath client details, yes.

And underneath that is a list of clients that you saw, isn't there?
20 ---Absolutely, and more.

Do you agree with that?---Of course.

And do you agree that the handwriting is that of either Ms Abboud or Ms El-Baf?---Yes.

And do you agree that the only way for those entries to have been made was for people to have come to the service to book appointments?---Yes, of course.

30 You told people that you were a psychologist, didn't you?---No.

You were aware that Ms Abboud and Ms El-Baf were telling people that you were a psychologist, weren't you?---No, I was not aware.

And this document, if we turn to the next page and the pages following that, just stop there, those pages that you've seen are pages listing clients that you were consulting with. Correct?---What do you mean?

40 You saw those people in the list didn't you?---I saw a lot of people. There's nothing here except dates but I saw a lot of people. This is something I'm proud of. I saw a lot of people and served and helped a lot of people and a lot of people wants to help me back.

Do you accept that a lot of the people referred to here in this list were people that you had made a diagnosis of?---No.

And you've treated those people haven't you?---How can I treat them if I'm not a psychologist. In the media when I say a psychologist it's just an

abbreviation of that thing which I got from the university in Egypt. How many times I need to say that to you and why are you torturing me to that extent of a fact which has already been made. I made a mistake when I say the psychologist a couple of times, more than a couple of times and maybe written but, sir, I did not treat anyone.

Ms Sharobeem, yesterday - - .---My apology, Commissioner, for being heated.

10 Ms Sharobeem, yesterday you also referred to a business card that you say you had obtained from the National Council for Woman in Egypt. Do you remember that?---Yes.

At page 421 of the transcript – pardon me, 429 of the transcript you said the following in relation to the question who organised that business card, namely the business card that I am now talking to you about. You said on page 429 at the top, “We went to Gaza to the ministry again. Lots happening with the Palestinian. And the Arab League as an international organisation, issued a card for me as doctor and I do have the card”.---Yeah, 20 that's right.

Do you have the card?---Yes.

Where is the card?---In my bag.

May you produce it to the Commission. Pardon me, Commissioner. I'm not sure if this can be marked for identification at the moment. My understanding is that my instructing solicitor wishes to copy it and then put it on a form in which it can be tendered. Can I hand this back to the witness 30 for the moment. Ms Sharobeem, can you first tell me what it says on that card. If you want to just leave the card out on the, on the table in front of you because I'll probably ask for it again.---It is what - - -

Just the front of it, can you just interpret that, is it in Arabic?---It's dated February, 2003 and it is from the Arab League and it is an official entry card and the purpose of it is for Dr Eman Sharobeem, the convoy from the Arab Republic of Egypt to attend the, the forum for Arabic human development. Something like that. The actual words can be translated by an interpreter 40 much better than me.

Can you interpret the other side of it? What does it say on the other side? ---It's the, the security of the Arab League, the high, the, the Department of Security of the Arab League.

When did you receive that card?---Obviously February 2003.

I ask that it formally be produced to the Commission, if you can give it to the court officer?---Can I keep a copy or something or - - -

It's a matter for the Commission?---Because that's the only, I just found it when I went to Egypt, it's just my (not transcribable) of documents.

THE COMMISSIONER: Well, it can be copied and the original given back, I suppose.

MR RAJALINGAM: If it please the Commission.

10 THE WITNESS: You can take copy of front and back, please.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes.

MR RAJALINGAM: What is the relationship between the Arab League and the National Women's Council, Ms Sharobeem, as far as you're aware? ---The Arab League is an organisation which similar to the United Nation and National Council for Women as a body, government body really have to have relationship with all other entities whether from the Middle East or other countries, so it's another partnership agreements to have all
20 correspondence and details between the two of them as government bodies. That's my awareness and recollection.

In your mind is that card issued by the National Council for Women? ---That's a card issued by the Arab League for people attending on behalf of the Egyptian Government as a representative to that particular event.

Was that the business card you said you received once you were told you should receive an honorary doctorate by a professor?---Oh, no.

30 Do you have the business card you received in, I think you said it was late 2002 you had that discussion?---You have it, sir, you collect it from my home.

Ms Sharobeem - - -?---And I only had one copy left which I was lucky to find and I give it to my lawyer. You have the other copy, sir, it's in your evidence.

Ms Sharobeem, do you agree that you say you had this, you said that – I withdraw that. Yesterday in your evidence you said that it was in about late
40 2002 that you had a conversation with someone about the honorary doctorate. Do you agree with that?---About that, yeah.

And then you came to Australia I think in late 2003?---That's right.

And what were you doing between late 2002 and 2003 when you left Egypt? ---Working in Egypt.

Where?---At the National Council for Women as a general manager of external relation department.

Who else was working your building?---Many people and many already left.

How many people were working your building?---Around three to four hundred maybe.

10 The HR, were they aware that you had received an honorary doctorate?
---They are the one told me.

Was there anyone else that was aware that you had been awarded an honorary doctorate?---The staff of my department and the – well, the staff of my department.

And was it would you say common knowledge amongst the office that you had been awarded an honorary doctorate by the university?---I don't know, I believe so.

20 Ms Sharobeem, you're aware aren't you that a search warrant was executed at your home by the Commission investigators?---I was invaded by you.

You're aware that they seized a number of documents from a filing cabinet next to your, in your bedroom?---You took everything I have.

Do you know if in those document you had your diaries, is that right?
---I believe you took everything I had.

30 Do you know that there were some IWHS documents in that filing cabinet.
Yes or no, do you know that?---Well, I don't know, you know more than me really, sir, you do.

In that filing cabinet, Ms Sharobeem, there were some documents from overseas, weren't there?---I don't know, seriously, I don't.

You had in that cabinet a number of references from, written by people from overseas, didn't you?---Might of, might of.

40 Do you remember having in your possession a reference from the National Council for Women?---Of course, might of.

I'm going to show you, and I think your lawyers have already spoken to you about this document that we seized from the filing cabinet.---Yes. What – I'm not sure of the point.

I'll show you that document.---Yeah, show me.

I think you were shown a document this morning - - -?---Show me.

- - - prior to coming into the Commission. There are two bundles that I'm going to show you.---Mmm.

I'll show you the first one. You agree – first of all I'll show you the bundle and I'm going to put a Post-it note on the page I want you to turn to. Do you agree that you saw that bundle earlier this morning?---Briefly.

10 And I'm taking you to in that bundle for the sake of the record the third page. Do you recognise the person signing off on that letter?---It's under the secretary general name.

Did you know the secretary general?---Of course.

How well did you know the secretary general?---She was my direct boss.

How often did you have contact with your direct boss?---Whenever I'm called.

20 Between late 2002 and 2003 how much contact did you have with this person?---Whenever I'm called for a meeting.

Would you agree what's in front of you is a reference dated 9 October, 2003 by the secretary general?---It's written here.

Yeah. And in the body of the document it describes what you have been doing at the National Council for Women. Agree?---In a nutshell.

30 And it says that you were working from 2002, February to September, 2003. Is that right?---It's actually when I signed the contract. I started before that.

But in October, 2003 the secretary general is addressing this letter to you, Ms Eman Sharobeem, isn't he?---Sir, did you notice her signature? She is signing as Farkhonda Hassan. She is Dr Farkhonda Hassan. In official letters with the flag – sorry, with the eagle, we do not put doctors. Herself is known and recognised internationally as Dr Farkhonda Hassan and, sir, her title is not there as well so she wouldn't address me as Dr Eman and not addressing herself as Dr Farkhonda. That is common practice in Egypt especially with official paper.

40

Do you agree the letter does not refer to you as a doctor?---And doesn't refer to her as a doctor as well as I just mentioned. It is a government document. This is the practice of our government.

Commissioner, I will tender – I apologise. It's the Trans-multicultural document that I showed earlier. I tender that document.

THE COMMISSIONER: Exhibit 28.

**#EXHIBIT 28 - TMHC RESPONSE LETTER TO THE ICAC DATED
13 DECEMBER 2016**

MR RAJALINGAM: And I also tender a bundle of documents located during the execution of the search warrant in Ms Sharobeem's bedroom, if that is a convenient way to somehow describe the bundle.

10

THE COMMISSIONER: That can be Exhibit 29.

MR RAJALINGAM: If that could be Exhibit 29A, Commissioner. I'm going to tender an associated bundle with that one.

THE COMMISSIONER: Okay. 29A then.

**#EXHIBIT 29 - BUNDLE OF 7 REFERENCE LETTERS FOR EMAN
SHAROBEEEM**

20

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, it won't work on the computer system.

MR RAJALINGAM: Okay.

THE COMMISSIONER: So we'll call it – the next one can be 30.

30

MR RAJALINGAM: I'll show Ms Sharobeem another document. First of all, Ms Sharobeem, have you had a chance to look through Exhibit, what is Exhibit 28, that is the bundle with the letter from the secretary general, have you had a chance to look at that carefully?---Yeah, I - - -

THE COMMISSIONER: Mr Rajalingam, when you tendered the earlier bundle where there was the reference that you took - - -

MR RAJALINGAM: Yes.

40

THE COMMISSIONER: - - - Ms Sharobeem to, there's another separate group of papers.

MR RAJALINGAM: That is the other bundle.

THE COMMISSIONER: That's the other one? Okay.

MR RAJALINGAM: Ms Sharobeem, do you agree that Exhibit 28 was located in your filing cabinet next to your bed? Exhibit 28 was the bundle I

just showed you, with Dr Hassan's signature as you've pointed out.---Where did you find that? Where did you find it, sorry?

I'm asking you a question. I'm asking you if you agree whether or not that document and the others with it, stapled with it, were in your filing cabinet in your bedroom?---Okay.

10 Do you agree with that or not?---I don't think agreeing or disagreeing will change the fact that you have paper taken from my home. Where it was, I can't, I don't know.

Do you agree it was found in your home first of all?---Well, okay.

Do you agree - - -?---You're pushing me to agree on something I have no recollection of. Where did you find it, I don't know. But that's good. My name is there. Yes, fine.

20 So do you recall this document at all, Ms Sharobeem?---Yes, I can see that my name is mentioned here, yes.

Well, do you recall having it in your possession for some time, since 2003, to when it was taken by the Commission?---Yes, of course it would be. Well, what would I say about that? I don't know. My home has a lot of paper, all right?

THE COMMISSIONER: Do you recognise them as your documents?
---Yes, sir.

30 Thank you.

MR RAJALINGAM: I'm going to show you one more document on this topic, Ms Sharobeem.---It's actually good that you have this, sorry.

I will tender - - -?---Oh, (not transcribable).

Ms Sharobeem, do you agree that that further bundle, do you recognise that further bundle as documents that you had in your possession for some time?---This one?

40 The further bundle.---This one?

Yes.---That's great. And that's even my written handwriting.

You agree that your name is misspelt in each of those documents?
---Wrongly, yeah.

I tender that bundle, Commissioner.

THE COMMISSIONER: That will be Exhibit 30.

#EXHIBIT 30 – BUNDLE OF 3 INVITATIONS TO EMAN SHAROBEEM TO ATTEND EVENTS

THE WITNESS: Oh, great.

10 THE COMMISSIONER: Wasn't 29 the other bundle? This one. So it'll be Exhibit 30.

MR RAJALINGAM: Ms Sharobeem, I'll give you an opportunity to look at that closer for another minute, if you'd like.---Yes, sir. I went through it.

All right. That can be returned. I think your lawyer has a copy of all those documents.---Thank you.

20 And I'm happy to provide him with any further copies of it, if you'd like.
---Um - - -

But that can be returned.---If my lawyer has it, that's fine. Thank you.

Ms Sharobeem, yesterday I was asking you some questions about referrals from Mission Australia. I'm going to take you back to page 121 of volume 14. I wonder if I could have access to the hard copy of that document, volume 14, page 121. I'm going to show you the unredacted version of this document, Ms Sharobeem.---Thank you.

30 So if you see at the bottom right-hand corner of that folder, it's page 121. Do you agree? Bottom right-hand corner, page 121. The bottom right-hand corner, Ms Sharobeem. Do you agree it's page 121?---Yes, it is 121.

If you go to the front of that folder, do you agree that it's volume 14? Ms Sharobeem, look at me. Go to the front of that folder.---It's written volume 14 and 121.

40 You've got it? All right. And that document is in front of you. Do you recognise that as a document that I showed you yesterday?---Okay.

Do you remember receiving this doctor's referral?---It's not a doctor referral. It's a case manager referral.

Yes, sorry. I do apologise. Do you remember receiving a referral from Mission Australia?---Remember, no. But, yes, my name is there.

And I want you to simply note in your own mind the name of the patient without referring to her.---Yeah.

And if you turn the page to 122, Ms Sharobeem, this was another document that was located at your residence.---In my residence, yeah.

Yeah. You have a read of that and I'll ask you some questions.---Okay.

You were seeing these people in Fairfield at the IWHS centre, weren't you?
---I'm sorry. What's the question again?

10 You were seeing all these people, counselling them, however you've describe it, at the Fairfield centre, weren't you?---Yes.

And you knew that that area of Sydney had a high demographic of Arabic people, correct?---Under privilege, yes.

Did you also know that there was a shortage, a serious shortage, of female Arabic psychologists in that area?---Absolutely. Not only psychologists but counsellors in general.

20 Did you know of any other Arabic psychologists, female?---Yeah.

Do you know female Arabic psychologists?---Yes.

Did you refer to them?---Yes, I did. I did.

Do you know what their names were?---I just mentioned one yesterday from Transcultural Mental Health. And I also know - - -

30 No, apart from Transcultural Mental Health - - -?---Yeah.

- - - did you refer to private female psychologists?---Well, we always did an internal referral instead of external.

Did you refer to private female psychologists?---I don't do the referrals, sir. My job is to see the clients. But referral is done at the front office.

You accept that in this document - - -?---Yeah.

40 - - - do you accept that it's a letter written to the client from the case manager?---Yes.

Do you accept that it was found at your home?---If you say so. But I can't, I don't know why it's in my home.

And you had been referred this person because you had purported to be a female Arabic psychologist, didn't you?---She wrote that. I didn't claim it.

And that's - - -?---I can't even see, remember seeing that. But if you say you found it in my home, it's highly unlikely. Letters like that would be in the office and I didn't have access to the office for quite some time before I left. I didn't even take my belonging.

When do you recall signing your first agreement with the Department of Health for funding on behalf of Immigrant Women's Health Service?
---When the agreement was due. I can't - - -

10 What year do you recall first being involved in signing funding agreements with the Department of Health?---Very hard to answer this question because at the beginning of my employment the agreement was on three years' basis and I can't remember if I started midway or after, but it's always the manager who sign the agreement. So whenever there was an agreement, I would sign, and also if management around they would sign, as long as we put the seal, I believe.

You accept that you started as manager in May 2004, didn't you?---In ah, in January 2004.

20

No, didn't you start as a coordinator first?---The agreement with the management is to start in Cabramatta so I can see what's happening there.

All right. Well, in that year when you first started do you recall signing or being involved in an agreement to obtain funds from the Health Department?---I must of, I, I can't really say I did or not.

I'm going to show you a document, volume 13, page 1. Do you recognise this as the agreement - - -?---Yes.

30

- - - the agreement you had signed between Sydney Western Sydney Local Health District and IWHS?---Yes, that's the first page.

And is that for the year 2014/2015?---That's written.

Page 3 of that document, is that your signature on the page?---The CEO.

And do you refer to yourself as Dr Eman Sharobeem?---That's right. It's actually coming written as Dr Eman Sharobeem. That's them writing it, not us.

40

You did nothing to correct their impression of who you were?---Sorry, why would I correct a title I have?

I'll take you to page 2, the page before. You agree that you're the representative signing on behalf of the service, don't you?---Yes, I did.

And was the representative from the Department of Health a lady by the name of Christine Pollachini?---Yes.

When you signed this document after having worked at the Immigrant Women's Health Service for a number of years - - -?---Yes.

- - - did you understand that funds that the service received from the Department of Health were only to be used in accordance with the agreement?---Of course.

10

I'll take you to page 4. You've always been aware of what the service was about, haven't you, Ms Sharobeem?---Yes.

And do you agree with the service description that is contained there? ---Yes.

It's an agreement in relation to funds that were received in that financial year, isn't it?---Yes.

20 2014 to 2015?---Yes.

Do you know that for that period of time an amount of \$349,600 was received by the service?---Yes, and I was pushing to increase the amount so we can employ more people to help me and Christine can witness that.

For how long had you been signing agreements like that, Ms Sharobeem? ---As long as I've been there.

30 So since about 2004?---Since I've been there, yes.

Since you were working at or since you were managing the service, was it also the case that you would attempt to obtain funds from other sources as well?---Of course because we were running on a very short budget.

And do you recall making applications to Fairfield City Council - - -?---Yes.

- - - for funding?---Yes. Either I do it myself or partners.

40 Do you know when that started, when you started applying to the council for funding?---Whenever there is any opportunity we'd apply.

Do you know what year? After you started at the service, do you know how soon it was that you started applying to the council?---No, not really, not precisely, but I'm saying always, whenever there's any opportunity we try.

I'll show you a document volume 13, page 39. This is an example of an application for funding, isn't it?---Yes.

Page 2 of that, your name appears again as Dr Eman Sharobeem. Do you agree with that?---Yes.

And you are the contact person. Correct?---I'm the, yeah, the contact for the organisation whether the application is signed by me or written by me or not it's always the case.

10 So in relation to the Fairfield City Council funding applications you were always the contact person weren't you?---Not only with Fairfield but any other application or document. I'm the public officer registered as the public officer of the organisation.

I'll take you to part B, section 7. That would you agree describes the project for which funds were sought?---Yeah.

Do you recall typing that into the application form?---No, sir. We have many people filling applications for funding so that doesn't mean that - - -

20 Who assisted you in applications for funding?---Management member, firm members, Fairfield - - -

Sorry, who by name, who by name was helping you with applications for funding?---You will find that many people already and it's document helped with the application for funding.

Who by name, Ms Sharobeem?---Names like Hien Le.

Who?---Hien Le.

30 Okay. You're going to have to spell that please.---H-e-i-e-n Le, L-e, Julie Watton, Nada Damcevska, Audrey Lai, the staff of IWHS, Luong - - -

No, no, no, no, hold on. Ms Sharobeem, I'll just - - -.---I'm trying to make a point.

We'll take it slowly, take it slowly.---Yeah. I'll, I'll just explain to you how - - -

40 I'm talking about making applications for funding.---Absolutely, sir. Let me just explain.

And you've refer to these people Hien Le, Julie Watton and Nada Damcevska and then you said Audrey Lai.---Right.

Who else helped you - - -?---Wafra El-Baf, Marie Abboud, Luong, Joelle Moukhaiber. Can I just explain this point, would you please allow me?

Well, by all means.---Thank you. For an NGO to have core funding is something but to (not transcribable) and provide projects we have to have extra funding and that's when we all applied for funding. So as public officer of the organisation my name would be written on all applications but also under that umbrella (not transcribable) which I was a co-convenor of would apply. So any member of (not transcribable) which had many, many members and they all registered with you would have the opportunity to chip in, put some points. We would circulate the application among us and each one would fill a part of it. I'm just explaining the system and what we
10 did.

THE COMMISSIONER: But you were aware that your name was being used on all these applications?---Yes, sir.

And you - - ?---Because it's - - -

You agreed to that?---Yes, sir.

MR RAJALINGAM: I'll take you to part B, section 9 next. Do you
20 remember Ms Alazawi?---Yes, she was an artist. She did art workshops with us.

You remember filling this out don't you?---No, she actually had to write about herself if it's about her.

Well, do you remember writing in the application form, Ms Sharobeem, these details?---No. Actually it would be the artist writing and filling it because she would be the one receiving the money and doing the project.

30 I'll take you to part C, section 13 and part C in these application forms would you agree deals with the amount being sought?---Yes, sir.

And it describes a budget for the project whatever it might be?---Yes, sir.

And in this particular case is the budget \$4,000?---Yes, sir.

Part C, section 14 if you keep going through. You agree that's just – sorry, back. That's your signature isn't it on - - ?---Yeah.

40 - - - at page 48 of the - - ?---The declaration, yes.

- - - the brief and that's your declaration?---Yes.

And what does it say above your signature?---Above?

Yes.---“I declare that I have read and to the best of my knowledge the information provided in this application is correct. I've also read the Community Cultural Development grant program guidelines.”

Page 91. Does this document relate to the project for which funds were being sought?---No.

Turn, well, you haven't – there's only the first page there. Turn the page. Turn the page. Do you know if that document related to the application for funds?---Resala's name is mentioned here but Resala was an artist that's not employed by us, so we just helped her to get the fund and deliver the project.

10

I'll take you to another application. Volume 13, page 60. Sorry, volume 13, page 3. Pardon me, Commissioner. Sorry, page 94. Ms Sharobeem, after an application to the council is made and is successful, is it the case that a memorandum of understanding is signed with respect to the application? ---In many of the cases with different department, yes.

And is what you see in front of you an example of a memorandum of understanding?---Yes. That was a successful project.

20

And this describes a project in relation to Interwoven, doesn't it?---That's right.

And what was that about?---It was a project to – an idea was created by Fairfield Council. It was a successful project and some significant part still exists in Fairfield, in Smart Street. It was to engage migrant and refugee women with the other women from originally Australian background, where they can engage and exchange ideas and cultural norms, so we can reduce the gap between cultures and create more harmony in the area.

30

It was a program that had craft workshops and so on, did it?---Different steps but one of them is craft.

And exhibitions of what was produced, is that fair?---I believe, yes, that was delivered by the council.

And at section 6, page 98 of the brief, you'll see again a budget described in amongst the memorandum of understanding, and would that replicate what's in the application form?---The budget here, it's written, yeah.

40

Yeah. And in this case was \$5,000 agreed for that project?---Might have. I can't remember which year was that.'

Well, that's what it says in this document, doesn't it?---It might have. I can't see it in front of me, but, yeah, okay.

Do you recall signing memorandum of understandings like this?---I sign everything, sir. I am the manager. Whether I read it or not, by the way, and it's my fault but I didn't have time.

Page 102. That's your signature, isn't it? And the date?---Yes, it is.

I'll take you to one more memorandum of understanding, page 160 – sorry, this is an application form. Do you remember applying for funding in relation to a film that was being made?---Yes.

And do you recall this project?---Recall, let me see which year.

10 It's not too long ago, it's in April 2013?---I believe, yes, there was more than one film, one about forced marriage, so I can't remember which one is that.

Well, if we turn the page, part A you'd agree that in amongst that document you specify doctor as your title. Do you agree with that?---Of course, yes.

You're the contact person essentially, aren't you, in relation to this?---Yes, in all.

20 And these funds were to be used to pay a filmmaker, weren't they?---If that's the one, it doesn't show on the screen but - - -

If we just keep turning through?--- - - - could be, yeah.

Have a look at the entire document and - - -?---That's an empty page, mmm. Yeah, A Woman's Voice, yes, I remember the name.

And if we turn to part C, so you remember the documentary A Woman's Voice?---Yes, I do remember, I do recall.

30 And do you agree that \$4,500 was being sought?---Yes, it's written.

Do you recall receiving these funds from Fairfield City Council?---It must of went to the organisation account. I don't receive it personally.

Well, do you recall the organisation receiving funds in relation to this particular program?---If we delivered the project, then we did.

40 In relation to this Woman's Voice program - - -?---It could be - - -

- - - do you recall receiving funds from Fairfield City Council, Ms Sharobeem?---I, I'm here to say the truth. You're asking me if I recall, no, I don't, but I know that we did the project so it must. I'm just trying to be very careful with every word I say.

I'm going to show you a number of invoices, I'm going to ask the investigator to turn through, once you've considered each I won't ask you a question - - -?---Sure.

- - - but what I'll do is, I'll state the page number I'm taking you to of the brief - - -?---Sure.

- - - and I'll ask you to look at it and consider the invoice and I'll ask you a question at the end?---Sure.

10 If I take you to page 239, well, I might – I'll do it separately. Firstly, Ms Sharobeem, the stamp, do you recognise as a stamp essentially stating that this invoice has been paid or that that's what it appears to be, doesn't it?
---(No Audible Reply)

A paid invoice?---Yes.

All right. You agree that that's in relation to Interwoven for \$5,000?
---That's right.

20 And the next one is 241. If you need more time to consider these invoices – but you accept that - - -?---I'll let you know.

- - - they are invoices that were sent by the service, weren't they
- - -?---Yeah.

- - - to Fairfield City Council?---Yeah.

To page 241. Invoice of 1,100 to Fairfield City Council. Do you agree?
---Yeah.

30 And in the same vein I'm going to ask the investigator to turn through the remainder of invoices, Ms Sharobeem?---Yeah.

Do you understand that?---Fine, yeah.

243?---Yeah.

244?---Yeah.

246?---Yeah.

40 249, 251?---Yeah.

And do you see that these are all in chronological order from 2009 we're going forward?---Yeah, yeah.

2011, page 253?---Yeah.

Page 258?---Yeah.

Page 259?---Yeah.

Do you recognise any of the handwriting on that document?---No.

Page 260. You see that?---Yeah, yeah.

Page 264.---Yeah.

10 265.---Yes.

266.---Yes.

267.---Yes.

269.---Yes.

271.---Yes.

20 268.---Yes.

I haven't shown you 268 yet. 268?---Yes.

270 is for 11 June, 2013. Do you agree?---Come again? What's the question?

270 is for 11 June, 2013?---Yeah.

262 is for 19 June, 2013?---Which one you're referring to now?

30 This one. 19 June.---Yeah.

25 June, 2013 at 272. See that?---Yes.

And the next page, 273, for October 2014?---Yes.

And then the next one appears in the middle of 2014 at 275.---Yes.

Page 276. 30 June, 2014. Do you see that?---Yeah.

40 Page 277. 16 days, event for 16 December. Do you see that?---Yes.

Page 278. Refugee Week celebration. 880 for 25 May, 2015.---Sure.

And 9 October, on page 279. Do you see that?---Yes.

You were, as a chief executive officer of the Immigrant Women's Health Service, aware of these other payments being made by Fairfield City Council, weren't you?---Payment made, no. Funding made, yes.

But you were aware of these invoices being paid by the council, correct?
---Yes. We need to deliver the project so they make the payment.

Was Fairfield City Council also paying for other services of the IWHS? For example, other buildings and so on? Upkeep for other centres?---What do you mean?

10 Was Fairfield City Council assisting in the payment of any other services for the Immigrant Women's Health Service?---Yeah. We had different projects with them.

Yeah. Apart from projects, were they responsible, for example, for pest control and that sort of thing?---Pest control?

Maintenance?---Yes, sometimes if they have a special grant and they need some work around, and I would ask for help. If they have extra money here or there, they would support us and they always did.

20 All right. Moving to another section, Commissioner, but it's only 5 past 11.00. Actually, I'll probably finish this in about half an hour or so. Ms Sharobeem, I'm going to move to a different topic. The Commission has heard evidence about programs being conducted at Immigrant Women's Health Service.---Yes.

Do you understand that?---Yeah.

And by programs, I'm talking about programs being run by the service.
---Yes.

30 Group activities.---Yes.

And facilitators being involved.---Yes.

Volunteers being involved.---Yes.

You're obviously well aware of this, aren't you?---Yes.

40 Okay. Can you describe for me at Fairfield centre, from Monday to Friday, the types of programs that would be conducted in the later years, so after 2013, for example.---We became very busy.

So start with Monday and then list the programs that you say were being conducted.---Last time I organised this was in early '15, so it's been two years. I'll try to the best of my memory, with the situation I am in now, to address this truthfully. Because of the work I've been doing, the number of programs have been increasing dramatically. It wasn't only Monday to Friday. We also had the weekend when I was doing consultation with

specific communities in particular and also other program running during the weekend.

Hold on. Ms Sharobeem?---Yeah.

I was asking about Monday and about groups on Monday.---That's not my job, sir - - -

10 You're now talking, yeah, okay.--- - - - to address all the groups.

Well, I'm - - -?---I'll just say to my recollection.

Yeah.---Yeah.

20 Do you recall the groups that were being conducted on Mondays?---Not all of them. Not all of them. But I'll do my best to my recollection. We had the Jordanian group in the morning, conducted in the kitchen. We had also the Assyrian women group conducted in the bigger room. I remember because they always had conflict who sits where. In certain stage we had the Serbian women group on Monday as well. We had constant need for English classes so we were rotating all of them around, Monday, Tuesday, Wednesday. So there was also English classes on Monday. We also had groups happening once a month for the breast cancer - - -

30 Hold on. Is that Monday? Is that Monday?---Monday, yeah. Breast cancer awareness group for the Assyrian women. We also had the Turkish breast cancer group also running some Mondays. I think the best way to get all this information is by looking at the calendar because it would say more. My mind is not that sharp to remember which is which, I'm sorry.

40 What do you recall happening on Tuesday?---Tuesday we used to have English classes also. We used to have the Arabic group. English classes were back to back and in different rooms. It was very popular because we used to have people speaking English as the only language so that language was more specific. I can't remember what else, I'm sorry. The last three years of the organisation, my employment there, I was in and out all the time and I was doing a lot of advocacy and engagement with decision makers, trying to alleviate the position of the organisation, especially after my life was used to highlight the issues affecting migrant and refugee women.

On Wednesday, what do you recall happening at the Fairfield centre?---I recall the Turkish group because I usually go and spend time with them and do some sessions. I also recall - - -

Sorry, just stopping there. How often would the Turkish group meet a week?---Weekly.

How often per week?---How often per week? Once a week.

Well, you mentioned - - -?---That's different group. The other breast - - -
- - - the Turkish group before.---Yeah, yeah.

And on - - -?---That's another one.

10 As having being conducted on Monday, didn't you?---That's another one,
yeah.

And that was a one-off breast cancer group, was it?---No, it's not one-off.
Usually they meet once a month regularly. And sometimes if they have
extra information or they would like to do a special project, they call and
ask for time in the afternoon. And usually they ask for time in the afternoon
because our mornings are always busy and the administration is there in the
morning, so I would be attending to them in the afternoon if I'm available.

20 And what about on Thursdays?---Thursdays. I'm usually on Thursdays in
the front area. We usually have lawyers or psychologists back to back with
appointments. So what's happening there, and it's a big centre. It was one-
off, huge place. No, I can't really recall Thursdays.

30 Why don't you try Friday?---Friday it was a popular day as well. It was
busy because we had the Mandaean women's group, which I built and I
supported the community from scratch, when we had only 200 people and
now there are more than 7,000 families, so they grow with me. That's the
room inside. The child care was busy with that area. And also we have, in
the big room, the Middle Eastern senior group. And sometimes we would
have other activities outside where, the kitchen area which was used as a
class, and also the counselling room which was used as a class. So that, that
would happen everywhere around the service.

I'll ask you to think about the Cabramatta centre.---Cabramatta, yeah.

And we'll do the same exercise. Monday, what do you think – what can
you recall being conducted at the Cabramatta centre – withdraw that. Sorry,
just - - -?---Oh, sorry.

40 Pardon me, Ms Sharobeem.---Sorry.

Before we get to the groups, can I ask you this.---Mmm.

How often would you be at the Cabramatta centre?---Not very often. If I
have a meeting there in the afternoon, if I have a meeting with Luong if she
wants to talk to me away from anyone about any conflict with the staff or
issues affecting her. We received – I received a couple of unsigned letters
complaining about her so I had to address that to her in a couple of

engagements so I went there. Usually Luong would come to me once a week to hand the staff time sheet and whatever so we would have a quick chat in the office. We usually talk on the phone every time she needs me. I am there on the weekend if there is group running or consultation I'm there and at night if that's happening as well. So it was on and off.

All right. Well, let's just think about Monday. Do you know what groups are being conducted on the Monday?---I remember very well Wednesday we had the Spanish group because we had, yes - - -

10

Sorry, did you say Wednesday?--- - - - Wednesday Spanish as well.

Did you say Wednesday, Ms Sharobeem?---Yeah.

Okay.---Wednesday. I remember Wednesday because it's the Spanish group (not transcribable) between Fairfield and Cabramatta we have Spanish group here and there, we had two.

20

Was there – in relation to that Spanish group was there a teacher for that Spanish group?---We had facilitators and we had - - -

So someone teaching Spanish?---I can't really, I can't really say exactly we had a teacher or not, sorry, but the details of all these groups is registered and it's very – micro details I wouldn't be able to remember it. I was looking at the huge picture.

Okay.---And it was huge.

30

Ms Sharobeem, let me put it this way. You spoke about Ms Luong. ---Mmm.

Am I pronouncing that right, Luong?---Yeah, Luong.

Luong. And she was the service co-ordinator wasn't she?---Yeah. I appointed her myself.

And she had been the service co-ordinator since about 2004. Correct?---I think about that.

40

And she'd worked you know to the end of the service didn't she?---I left before her so - - -

So she was there from 2004-2016 would you agree?---I don't know when she left, sir, but I know that I appointed her.

She left very recently.---Okay.

In the last couple of years. Would you accept that?---I accept your word, of course.

She was certainly there in 2015 wasn't she?---Yeah.

All right. Well, do you agree that she was working 9.30 to 2.30 at the centre Monday to Friday?---And sometimes it varied because of her childcare needs.

10 But she had been there for quite some time hadn't she?---Yes.

She was the manager or the co-ordinator of that centre. Is that fair?---She was the co-ordinator.

So she had the hands-on control of that centre didn't she?---During her working hours.

20 You accept that she would have been aware of what was going on in the office?---During her working hours.

She gave evidence at this Commission about the groups that were being conducted at the centre.---All right.

On Mondays she said that there would be a Cambodian middle-age women's group. Would you agree with that?---If it's during her working hours, yes.

30 In the afternoon she said that there was a partnership with multicultural health which was on and off. Would you agree with that on the Monday afternoon at Cabramatta?---Did she specifically say when she's talking about these programs because we rotate the programs every 10 weeks - - -

Ms Sharobeem, she - - -?--- - - - so we would have different things.

She gave, she gave evidence that - - -?---It wasn't set programs.

Well, just hold on.---Sure.

40 She gave evidence that between 2004 and 2006 that here may have been some changes to the programs but that the nature of the programs themselves didn't change. So that's what her evidence was and she said on Mondays that in the morning there would be a Cambodian program and she recalled a program relating to multicultural health.---Right.

Do you remember her saying that in evidence?---Right. Well - - -

Do you remember listening to the evidence?---I, I didn't pay attention to every word but let me just explain what that mean.

Just on that point, you were outside in a room weren't you watching a TV screen with what was being going on inside this room weren't you?---Yeah.

And so you saw what was being, the evidence that had been led for the last week?---I didn't pay attention to all of them, I was just trying to focus on some - - -

10 Do you remember Ms - - -?--- - - - particular point but I just would like to explain to you something very simple. The programs running at Fairfield and Cabramatta might have for example if we say we have the Mandaean group or we have the Cambodian group, yes, the name is the name, we have these people from this community but the partnership change and the content of the program change and what we delivered at that time change and we might actually change the program based on the need of the community, we might add parenting program to the Cambodian and amalgamate it with it, so it was a dynamic service, not a stagnated one.

20 If I understand your evidence correctly - - -?---Yeah.

- - - are you saying that although the name of the program would have stayed the same over the years, the things that were being done in the programs might have been changed from time to time?---Yeah.

All right?---Yeah, that's what I wanted to explain.

Ms Sharobeem, I'll just, I'll tell you what Ms Chan said to this Commission - - -?---Sure.

30 - - - to be clear about it. On Tuesday she said that there was a Cambodian parenting group. Would you agree with that, at the Cabramatta centre?
---Not from the beginning, towards the end.

She said that that group was being run in partnership with the Cambodian-Australian Welfare Council?---Not all the time.

40 She said that on the Tuesday, and she's saying this in relation to the whole time she was there, Ms Sharobeem - - -?---No, we didn't have the agreement all the time.

She said that - - -?---That's not right.

Well, she said that the Cambodian-Australian Welfare Council paid for those facilitators that helped with that program on Tuesdays?---When we had the agreement they might of.

So you accept that whilst there was an agreement with the Cambodian-Australian Welfare Council, they would have paid for the facilitators?

---I wasn't really involved in that, so if she said that, that's her word.

On Wednesdays she said that there were English classes being taught by volunteers. Would you agree with that?---I paid for the volunteers.

You paid for the volunteers, did you?---Yes, we have - - -

And how did you pay for them?---Volunteers are reimbursed for their transport or lunch money, so we call it pay for the volunteers.

10

Did you pay them an hourly rate - - -?---No.

- - - for their time?---No.

But you say you reimbursed them for food?---We call it reimbursement for food or petrol, just to be fair to our volunteers.

20

She said that on the Wednesday there was a Spanish-speaking group led by a member of staff. Do you recall that?---Member of staff? We didn't have staff speaking Spanish.

Are you sure about that?---No, it's a facilitator.

Do you know who that facilitator was then who was speaking Spanish?
---Ilma.

What was her name?---Ilma. I can't pronounce her surname.

30

On the Thursday she said that there was a Chinese older women's group?
---Yes, that was very popular.

There were no other groups on Thursdays regularly, apart from one of partnership groups. Would you agree with that?---No, we always had regular, we always have regular programs.

What was the group on Thursday afternoon?---It's actually written in the calendar, I can't recall, but we always had it.

40

What calendar are you referring to?---Every school term we developed a calendar where it's, I put the draft work or artwork in it and I left it between Watfa and Marie and Luong to put the data in it.

On Fridays Ms Chan said that there was a Vietnamese women's health group. Do you agree with that?---No. It's a Vietnamese group and sometimes they would do health or other things.

It was a Vietnamese group, wasn't it?---I believe so.

It was a group being conducted in the morning?---Actually it's during the hours she's there, not only morning, it's more than three hours. The, the group was a bit big to manage in two hours and they had a facilitator.

Do I take it your understanding of the Fairfield Centre is obviously better than your understanding of the Cabramatta centre?---Because of the population, yes.

10 Can I ask you then to describe the layout of the Fairfield Centre?---Yes. As physically?

20 Yes?---From the door you walk in. As soon as you walk to the right, there is the room which has two to three desks. It varied based on the time. We tried always to keep a space in the middle so we would use it as a classroom as well. Towards the end, one desk was used for the project officer and it was used before for the Smith Family project officer. And next to it there is the bookkeeper, computer and desk and files, financial folders, sorry, cabinet. And there was also a huge cupboard built in, where it has all the kitchen equipment and also if we receive, like, any donations like toothpaste or whatever, so we can give it to women and clients.

That's in the first room?---That's first room to your right, when you walk in. That room also - - -

You're pointing to your left. Do you mean - - -?---To my right.

30 To your right?---To my right that's the room. Sorry, when you walk into your right, that's the room. Also this room was used as the room for the lawyer when we had the weekly law free advice. And then we have the weekly psychologists, and also we have the weekly, in certain time we had weekly psychologists also from STARTTS, so we were rotating. It was a very busy room. To your left you will find, when you walk in, the reception area, which was always a place where I wanted to make bright and shine. We had two desks. One we had the database computer on, and it was always trouble for people to use it, and we always had to put signs so people wouldn't touch it. And there was, behind that, several cabinets for different documents, and then the reception desk and then reception area, where sometimes the reception area was used for meetings of management or meetings for NESH or gathering for guests or to receive whoever we have, and also clients waiting. When you finish with those, you continue walking in. There is my little room, and it was the smallest because I always say I don't need big room. I always have maximum of three people in this room and it's very squeezey. I had my desk. There is a computer. There is a shelf.

40 Sorry, what sort of computer did you have?---What sort of computer? No, I can't answer this question. A desktop.

Really? You can't, you don't remember the type of computer you were using at the IWHS? Was it a laptop or a desktop?---We had both. We had two laptops.

Did you on your desk have a desktop?---Yeah.

Did you have a laptop as well?---On the computer? On the desk? No, the two laptops with the reception.

10 Okay. So there's, all right. Go on.---In the reception there is two laptops and the projector for the facilitators to use. Yeah, my little room had the desk, two chairs and a cupboard behind me where we had everything, and also my blanket, because I used to sleep there when there's the need. Books and all the presents and little gifts I received from clients, because I had a policy that I don't receive personal gifts, so it was always left in that cupboard. And people have access to my room all the time. There was sometimes a key if - - -

20 I'm just asking about the room.---Room, sorry, sorry. We finish - - -

So how big was your room, do you think?---Very, very small, really.

In terms of metres?---I'm bad with that but I can just give you the size.

Just numbers and metres, Ms Sharobeem. Just have a think about that without - - -?---I'm very bad with that but I can tell you that, like, from this wall to this and maybe up to here. It's a very small room.

30 And what about the reception area? How big was the reception area?
---Reception was big.

How big, do you think? Just in relation to this Commission room, what do you think?---If I'm not wrong I would say up to this edge. But it was very roomy, like, big room. I, I would imagine - - -

6 by 12 metres or so?---I'm, I'm, that's not one of my skills, I'm sorry. I never know.

40 What about the classroom, was that bigger than the reception room or smaller?---Oh, yeah, much bigger.

And how big do you think the classroom was?---The two community - - -

Have a look around you and you can point to - - ----The two community rooms we can fit - - -

No, how big was it?---How big.

Ms Sharobeem, if you can't, if you can't estimate - - -?---Mmm.

- - - don't.---Yeah.

I'll go to the next question.---Oh, sure.

These groups that you've talked about at the Fairfield centre - - -?---Do you want me to continue explaining the physical?

10 No.---No.

Unless you want to.---No, no, it's up to you really. You're asking me.

These groups that you've talked about in your evidence today - - -?---Mmm.

- - - the Jordanian group that met in the kitchen - - -?---Yeah.

- - - at the Fairfield centre - - -?---Yeah.

20 - - - how many people?---It would vary really because they were very specific group but they – sometimes I would see - - -

Just can you give me a number in relation to how many people you think would have attended over the years - - -?---Over the years?

- - - per group, per occasion?---Oh, per occasion. So with the Jordanian in particular?

30 The Jordanian group you've referred to - - -?---Yeah.

- - - on Monday morning - - -?---Right.

- - - how many people would attend per group?---Would be between seven and nine each time, seven people, nine, 10, around that.

The Assyrian group - - -?---Oh, that was big.

40 How many people do you think attended that group?---In my own recollection, because I only look at numbers, I don't see them physically every time, sometimes I see the room has 25 and sometimes I see 15. It's varied.

When did the Assyrian group meet on the Monday?---Monday afternoon and they would go on until 3.00, sometimes 4.00. Depends.

What about the Jordanian group, when would they meet on Mondays?---To my last recollection it was Monday morning. I don't know if they changed because they were very demanding and they always wanted changes.

The Serbian group?---Serbian they used to be Wednesday and they might have changed to Monday or, or the opposite.

Are you sure when they met, Ms Sharobeem?---It's definitely written in the calendar.

10 Are you sure?---I attended to this group and I celebrated their celebration with them but I can't – I'm confused between Monday and Wednesday, that's all.

Okay. How many people attended that group?---Oh, they were big. They were celebrating life. Sometimes because it's a partnership with STARTTS sometimes we have 30 people in the room and sometimes more. It depends on what type of activity they do and also the psychologist seeing them or talking with them from STARTTS.

THE COMMISSIONER: Is that a convenient time, Mr Rajalingam?

20 MR RAJALINGAM: Yes, Commissioner.

THE COMMISSIONER: We'll take a morning tea adjournment now for the next 20 minutes.

SHORT ADJOURNMENT

[11.33am]

30 THE COMMISSIONER: Now, I'm informed that the business card has been photographed.

MR RAJALINGAM: Yes.

THE COMMISSIONER: So you can give the original back to Ms Sharobeem.

MR RAJALINGAM: I think, yes. The original is there. I can tender a colour copy of the business card - - -

40 THE WITNESS: Can I please tender something else to you?

MR RAJALINGAM: - - - as it's been described.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you.

MR RAJALINGAM: And there are a number of copies of that as well.

THE WITNESS: Sir, can I also present something else to highlight to the Commission?

THE COMMISSIONER: Just one moment, please.

That will be Exhibit 31.

10 **#EXHIBIT 31 - IDENTITY CARD PRODUCED BY EMAN SHAROBEEEM**

THE COMMISSIONER: Now, you wanted to present something else?
---Yes, please, sir. This is just a photocopy, sorry, one copy only, from Wikipedia and from another website about Dr Farkhonda Hassan, her credentials, and that it is, it is official that in the government people don't put their initials or use their, sorry, not initials, but education, so it's just that the governmental way of dealing with official peoples with the eagle stamp.

20 But is there a difference between the person who's writing - - -?---Yeah.

- - - the document but if the document is a reference - - -?---Yeah.

- - - wouldn't you expect any relevant qualifications to be included in the reference?---Not at all, sir, because at that time the regime was very tough, no one would have any credential but the top lady which is the first lady, that's why even the secretary general, while she was and she is still a world known person, she doesn't put her credential next to her name. That's what we used to have or see over there as our government ruled by
30 dictatorship [sic] somehow.

Yes, thank you.

MR RAJALINGAM: Ms Sharobeem, you will have your business card I think in front of you?---Yes.

You've said in your evidence before the break that the investigators from the Commission took a business card that was given to you by the National Council for Women in Egypt?---Yeah, my, my usual business card, yeah.
40

How many business cards do you say that you had in your possession?
---What I had left from my job there, maybe a stack of them, like some.

Can I say to you, Ms Sharobeem, that after inquiries have been made - - -?
---Yeah.

- - - with what was seized from your premises, that the Commission does not hold your business cards from the National Council for Women?

---I have to believe you. There is another copy with my lawyer. You can
- - -

Do you have a copy of your business card from the National Council for Women?---Yes, I have it and I gave it to my lawyer.

Well, I ask that that be produced?---Sure.

10 MR CHHABRA: Commissioner, if I may at this juncture, any card or document that's been referred to would have been shown to my instructing solicitor, Mr Wassef, who's not present at this time. I will make inquiries with him.

MR RAJALINGAM: I thank my friend.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you, Mr Chhabra.

20 MR RAJALINGAM: Ms Sharobeem, I was talking to you before the break about the groups at the Fairfield centre.---Yes.

You recall Ms Abboud giving evidence to this Commission?---Yes.

And do you remember listening to her evidence?---Yes, to most of her words.

Okay. Do you agree that she had been working prior to you having started at the Immigrant Women's Health Service?---No, she wasn't working as an administrator. She was actually a facilitator only. Three hours a week.

30 Prior to you starting at the Immigrant Women's Health Service, she was already there involved in some capacity, wasn't she?---She was a facilitator, casual facilitator, three hours a week.

By the time you arrived at IWHS, was it the case that she was working as an administrator as well?---No. I actually started training her as assistant secretary and then give her the education bit by bit to grow.

40 She said to this Commission that she had been working as an administrator on Mondays, Thursdays and Fridays since 2001. Would you accept that?
---No, the title wasn't administrator, no. She grew to be.

And she said that she was also working as a facilitator for the Arabic speaking group on Tuesdays.---That's right.

At some stage, then, do you accept that she was working in some capacity at the service on Mondays, Tuesdays, Thursdays and Fridays?---On Monday and Wednesday and Friday. Sorry, Monday, and Thursday/Friday she was

administrator 15 hours a week, and then three hours on Tuesday as a facilitator for the Arabic group.

She talked about having – was she a facilitator in the Arabic group from the beginning?---Yes.

She was the only facilitator of that group, isn't that right?---In most of the time, but when the group was big we had to get some assistant for her because of the size. But then things changed.

10

She said that there were about 35 attendees to the group, of the group. About 35 people?---I have to take her words for it. I only receive numbers at the end. But it was always big and busy group.

She referred to in that group speaking Arabic. That obviously happened? ---That's right.

And she also spoke about a jewellery making course. Do you recall that? ---In one of the stages they were doing one of the courses for jewellery.

20

Were you quite familiar with that course, jewellery making course?---Her group, yeah, to some extent.

Were you aware of the teacher who was assisting with that group?---Not the name, of course, but I remember, yeah.

She talked about a Zina from TAFE.---Yes.

30

Do you remember her?---Yes, yes, yes. We did that with the - - -

And you accept that TAFE paid for her, don't you?---That's only for one term only.

I suggest to you that the Immigrant Women's Health Service didn't pay for Zina to conduct a jewellery making course at any stage.---That one course, no. But then I believe Marie talked to me and then we tried to employ her even after TAFE. That's my recollection.

40

But the fact is that she wasn't employed by the Immigrant Women's Health Service, isn't it?---What happened in these incidences - - -

Was she employed or not?---I can't recall.

Okay. Well, that's - - -?---The financial people will tell you. But if we find a good teacher, we try to employ her after that outside her contract.

She said, Ms Abboud said that on Mondays there were English classes. Would you agree with that?---Yes, there was.

How many English classes on Monday, do you recall?---If it's not one, will be two.

When did the English class meet?---No, I can't really be specific about that.

It would have been in the morning, wouldn't it?---English classes morning or afternoon, really. It depends on when we have the room available.

10 Do you recall a women's unity group being conducted in the morning?
---That's the Jordanian group, yeah.

And she also spoke about the Assyrian group on the Monday. Would you accept that?---Yes, I think they moved, yes.

There were no other groups on Monday, were there?---There may be. My memory doesn't really help.

20 You cannot say now that there were any other groups can you?---Yes. I mentioned before that there was the Assyrian breast cancer group and the Turkish breast cancer group but I know that they meet in the afternoon but I can't really recollect in my mind.

The - - -?---Everything is documented, sir.

Would you agree that the breast cancer group would only meet from time to time, it wasn't a regular group was it?---It was once a month group regular.

30 Ms Abboud said that on Tuesdays there were two English classes. Would you agree with that?---Yeah, maybe.

And she said that there was an Arabic-speaking group facilitated by her. Would you agree with that?---On Monday, no.

Tuesdays I'm talking about.---Tuesday, yes.

40 Was Tuesdays also the evening where Mr Gerrin from TAFE assisted the service?---That's not in Fairfield office. That's in NESH Guildford office and before that it was in Fairfield in the premises of Smith Family.

But a program was being conducted by the Immigrant Women's Health Service - - -?---Yes.

- - - at the NESH facility on Tuesday evenings wasn't it?---Towards the end. At the beginning it was in Fairfield.

For the last couple of years would you say?---Yes, might of.

On Wednesday mornings was the yoga?---We did two yoga on Wednesday morning. It was very popular.

And were there about two English classes on Wednesday?---Two to three actually. Sometimes because of the demand we would break the two groups into three or four because some women wouldn't be able to understand so we do one to one or three to one, it depends. So we – that's when we all have to work to divide women, some in the kitchen, some in the childcare room, some in, in the psychologist room and so on and if I'm not there they occupy my room as well.

Do you recall any other groups on Wednesday?---I believe the Turkish group was on Wednesday, Spanish group was on Wednesday, yeah, some other groups at the evenings. You're asking about evening or day?

I'm asking about the entire day, Ms Sharobeem.---Oh, the entire day. At night we would run different other groups, it depends, and also - - -

Ms Sharobeem, I suggest to you that you weren't running programs at night at the Fairfield centre. What do you say about that?---Yes, in some incidents we did many groups, not only on Wednesday but on different nights. I can't remember really the nights now.

Can I take you to Thursday.---Yeah.

Do you recall what groups were being conducted on the Thursday?---On Thursday, no.

Well, take your time. Think about it.---See some of the, the information you deal with every day, if you don't need to know it you just look at the paper.

So you don't know the answer?---I can't remember.

What about on Friday, do you agree - - -?---I was doing humongous number of groups.

Ms Abboud said that on the Friday there would be a Mandaean-speaking group.---Mandaean.

Mandaean. Apologise. She said that it was funded by HomeCare. Would you agree with that?---No. I disagree with that fully.

Ms Abboud said that on Friday - - -?---I think the information here is mixed up. Maybe she is talking about MESHG which is Middle Eastern senior group not the Mandaean group.

She said that there was also a Middle Eastern seniors group on Friday. Would you agree with that?---That's right, there's two different groups.

And what was the MESHG - - -?---That's the one, MESHG, yeah.

And who funded MESHG?---It's actually partly. We have partnership with at that time called Home and Community Service and the other part we provided ourselves and it was more than one group.

You accept that the groups were conducted on Mondays at Bankstown?
---There was groups in Bankstown on Monday morning.

10

And do you accept that IWHS did not have to pay for the hire of the hall at Bankstown?---Part of the agreement is for them to pay for it, yes.

When you say them, do you mean HomeCare?---That's right.

And do you agree that on Wednesday there was a group meeting at Bossley Park in relation to the MESHG program?---The senior groups as well.

And that was also funded by HomeCare wasn't it?---Partly not fully.

20

And who else do you say funded the Bossley Park MESHG program on Wednesdays?---IWHS supported running of the groups also from our funding, the three of them.

Do you remember Ms El-Baf well?---I hired her when she came to me as a client from Commonwealth Rehabilitation Service and then she decided after she finished her program to stay with me as a volunteer and then when opportunity opened I gave her the chance to grow with us and find opportunity to work.

30

She started in about 2005, would you agree?---If the records show that.

But do you recall her starting about a year after you commenced as a manger?---No, she would started after that. Thank you for the note. I don't think one year only, I think more than that.

How many years?---She did at least six months with us as a patient from Commonwealth Rehab and then she worked with us as a volunteer for some time, so definitely it would be maybe '06, '07, the paper will tell more than my memory.

40

And when she was employed at the Immigrant Women's Health Service was she an administrator?---When she started she was an assistant and then she grow with a title as well as anyone else.

Do you recall her working on Tuesdays and Wednesdays?---Yes, because she was receiving commonwealth payment from Centrelink and she said to

me she can't work extra hours because of her pension, and she used to live in housing department dwelling.

Ms El-Baf gave some evidence about the multicultural parenting program?
---Yes.

She said that it was only conducted for about two to three years only.
Would you agree with that?---No.

10 She said that it had been conducted since, it had stopped after 2012. Would you agree with that?---Absolutely not.

And she said the facilitators of the multicultural parenting program when it was being conducted were Ashraf Sedrak and Ban Khoshaba?---They started with those.

And the program was conducted by them in a school somewhere. Would you accept that?---No.

20 It wasn't conducted at the centre?---No. I didn't, I don't accept that.

Do you recall Mr Sedrak lingering about the office with nothing to do at some stage - - -?---No, never.

- - - as a facilitator?---No. He wasn't a facilitator.

And Ms El-Baf said that he would come into the Fairfield centre, have nothing to do and leave?---That's absolutely wrong.

30 And that he would often ask you for work?---That's absolutely wrong, absolutely wrong.

You told him that funds for the multicultural parenting program had stopped, didn't you?---Yes, at that stage.

You told him in about 2012 that there were no more funds for the program?
---That's right, at that stage.

40 You told him there was no more work, didn't you?---That's right, at that stage.

Yeah, and you got rid of him. Correct?---That's a very harsh word, I can't accept it.

Well, you - - -?---I'm sorry but I can't accept it.

He stopped working at the Immigrant Women's Health Service, didn't he
- - -?---So - - -

- - - in 2012. Is that right or wrong?---Could be according to your record.

Well, did he at some stage stop work at the Immigrant Women's Health Service?---He wasn't working for Immigrant Women's Health, he was working under the Arabic and Assyrian parenting group. At that time the program ceased for the Arabic and Assyrian and then I applied for the funding again under the multicultural parenting group, that's when we get new funding and new people, and that's where Watfa is absolutely wrong.
10 And I can't blame her, she used to work only for 10 hours a week.

Do you know Ban Khoshaba?---Yes, she used to work for the Arabic and Assyrian parenting group.

She wasn't involved with the multicultural parenting program, was she?
---No, she wasn't.

In 2012?---No, she wasn't. She was involved with the Arabic and Assyrian parenting program.
20

Who do you say was involved with the multicultural parenting program?
---Other facilitators after that.

Who by name?---I can't remember the names, but many of them already registered there.

Do you recall Ms El-Baf raising the fact that the multicultural parenting program had stopped in 2012 but was still being advertised in the newsletter?---It's always advertised because it's a project we do and we worked on it, including me giving one-to-one as part of the agreement with the Smith Family.
30

Do you recall Ms El-Baf raising it with you and you saying to her, "Leave it. Leave it. It's good. Maybe we can bring some. The group will be starting again"? Do you remember saying that to her?---Say that about the multicultural parenting program? Absolutely false. No. I said that about the Swahili group, which was there for some time, and I said to her please leave it. We are trying. I have a consultation and we're trying to recruit more people.
40

Pardon me, Commissioner. Are you able to name anyone, Ms Sharobeem, that was involved with the multicultural parenting program after 2012?---I actually got Jihan Hana to work with them for some sessions. My memory is not helping but I definitely can refer you back to all the documents in the organisation.

Do you know anyone else involved with the multicultural parenting program after 2012?---Yes. I was involved and other people as well.

Do you know their names?---I can't remember now.

That's because it wasn't being conducted, wasn't it, Ms Sharobeem?---Of course not, sir. You have documentation in your hand and you're able to see it more than me. But please don't try to dig my memory, which is already very ill because of what's happening with me. I'm trying my best.

10 In the middle of 2012, you signed an agreement on behalf of the Immigrant Women's Health Service for funding for the multicultural parenting program, didn't you?---Yes, and we delivered.

Volume 11, page 47. Page 23 of the actual - - -?---I just remembered the name. Georgette, um, Georgette, I remember Georgette. There is, you will find her name there. I just, the name came to me. And Genat. Georgette and Genat. G, Genat. G-e-n-t or something. And I'll try to remember more.

Is that your signature on the document?---Yes.

20 Is it dated 3 July, 2012?---Yes.

With your name?---Yeah.

Do you remember signing that document?---Yes. My signature is here.

IWHS, if you go back to page 47. In these documents, would you agree that IWHS is referred to as the community partner?---Yes.

30 At page 48 it talks about the community partner's obligation, doesn't it? ---Yes.

Are you familiar with this document, Ms Sharobeem?---It's the document we sign as an agreement.

Schedule 2 at page 29, which is 76. Page 29 of the agreement is schedule 2, do you agree?---On what? Agree on what?

40 Do you agree it's schedule 2 of the agreement?---That's what's shown on the screen.

And does schedule 2 relate to the budget?---Yes.

And does the agreement relate to a budget of \$120,000?---Yes.

And this was for funding from 2012 onwards wasn't it?---Based on the funding time or the funding period not onward.

If we go to schedule 1 just a couple of pages before.---So it's from '12 to '15 or something.

And you are the person who is referred to in schedule 1 as the agreement manager?---Yes.

You accept that you were the person responsible on behalf of the Immigrant Women's Health Service to enter into this agreement?---Yes.

10 Clause 3.1. You know what clause 3.1 is about don't you, Ms Sharobeem?
---What is it?

Have a look at clause 3.1. You know what that's about don't you?---Yes.
It's an agreement.

What does clause 3.1 say?---Expenditure of funding.

And what does it say about that?---Do you want me to read it?

20 Yes.---Yes, please tell me and I'll do it. "The community partner must
expend the funding consistently with the budget and solely and specifically
for the project in accordance with this agreement."

Did you know that if funds were not spent in furtherance of the agreement
that it would have to be refunded?---Or we talked to the partner and they
rule over the fund what we call so we say you can actually use it in the new
year or you have a special event or you can do extra thing with it or you can
refund it. So it's by agreement with the funding body.

30 And you know that clause 3.2 relates to that don't you?---That's what's
written here. I don't think you expect me to read all these agreements word
by word and remember it. Of course not.

But when you signed it you were aware of the contents weren't you?---To
say the truth not every agreement I sign I was aware of all its details and this
is actually the exact truth. I'm not talking about this only.

You were aware of - - -?---But that's the norm.

40 - - - the basic detail that you were only meant to use funds - - -?---Yes.

- - - in accordance with the agreement - - -?---Of course. As I said.

- - - weren't you?---Yes, and at the end of the financial year we talk with the
funding body and we see if we can, if there's any fund available to roll it
over or use it for a special project as I said. That's the norm in the, in the
sector.

You knew for each agreement that you entered into that annually the funds received would need to be acquitted?---That's right.

And what did you understand by that?---It's just simply saying all the documentations goes from the bookkeeper to the auditor for the auditor to look at it, observe it and then give his or her opinion.

About what?---About the documentation provided for that project.

10 And did you know that it was essential that the funds spent needed to be related to the service?---Yes, of course.

And if they weren't they would become what's referred to as unspent funds. Would you accept that?---If it's money in the bank it's unspent, yeah.

Do you agree that in around about the same time in August of 2014 you signed another agreement in relation to the Multicultural Parenting Program?---Yes.

20 I will show you that document briefly. Volume 12, page 11 and at page, page 11 will you accept is the front page of the agreement. I appreciate it doesn't have a date but that is another agreement. Do you agree?---It's a page of an agreement.

Page 20. Does – page 31, rather. Do you agree that again your name appears there as - - -?---Yes.

- - - the authorised representative for Immigrant Women's Health Service? ---Yes.

30 If we go to schedule 2 for this agreement. Do you agree that this agreement relates to funding of about \$60,000?---It's written down here, yes.

And that's for the period 2014 October to September 2015. Is that right?---I don't think this is the multicultural parenting group. I think this is the other project we did with the Smith Family. STEPS to Employment, it's called.

40 I'll take you to page 32 of this document, which is actually – I'll take you to page 21 of the document, page 32 of the brief. That is schedule 1 to the agreement, Ms Sharobeem.---Okay.

Do you see your name there as the agreement and implementation manager?---Yes.

You remember, you recall signing the document, didn't you, in 2014?---I am the only one signing all agreements, so I have to say yes.

Do you see what's contained in the project description?---Yes. Yes, I do.
And it was delivered to the letter.

Who were the facilitators that assisted you in this program between 2012 to September 2015?---I need to refresh my memory about their names. I can't really remember anyone. But Ban would have worked with us. After that Georgette. I did a lot of sessions.

10 When you said Ban, when you said, hold on. When you said Ban, are you talking about Ban Khoshaba?---Yes, Khoshaba.

Okay. Who else?---Georgette. Hilmi her surname. Hilmi. She did a lot of work, a lot. Now I do. And - - -

THE COMMISSIONER: How do you spell her last name?---Hilmi. Just one sec. H-e-l-m-y [sic].

20 Thank you.---Thanks. Myself, I did a lot of work as a facilitator as well in the project. There was also - - -

MR RAJALINGAM: Just on that topic.---Yeah.

Where were you when you were doing facilitator work for the multicultural parenting program? Where were you doing it?---I did a lot of programs with churches, community centres. I did also at NESH. I did at IWHS during the weekend.

30 Who was there with you on the weekend at the IWHS?---I usually had Richard, my son, helping whenever I needed help with food and catering.

How many people attended on the weekend, do you say, to the multicultural parenting program?---We were doing a very unique project with parents instead of women only. So I would say between four to five couples each time because it's smaller groups. That's again from memory. It's been a while.

40 Do you remember any of these couples?---No, but their names is all registered. I wouldn't remember all those clients, I saw thousands of people, thousands.

And when you saw couples for the multicultural parenting program at the Fairfield Centre, was that always on the weekend?---No, it was also at night and we used to use the middle room because we used to separate the children.

Who's we?---I myself and Richard to help and there was somebody else, if I'm not wrong we used to have a childcare worker called Manel, Manel, the surname is Awrahm, I'm going to spell the surname A-w-r-a-h-m, Awrahm.

Where else do you recall the multicultural parenting program being conducted?---I shared with the Smith Family manager that the program is
- - -

10 Who, who, who was that?---There were a couple of them, but I recall my conversation with Joanne, I can't remember the surname, and I told her that the program is very popular and that if I can have an allowance instead of just serving the community within the boundary of the program that we continue serving in other areas like Bankstown and also outside Guildford because the program was very specific to Guildford West or specific numbers, so she agreed with that and I was delivering also in the other areas. We also delivered in Punchbowl, that's all from recollection of memory as far as I could, and again I'm saying if I don't remember people will think better and much, much clearer than me.

20 When you keep referring to we, who are you talking about that was involved in the multicultural parenting program?---Maybe I'm referring to myself and somebody else, it will come to me while I'm talking.

You're not sure who that person is, are you?---At the moment my memory is very fading, it's just not that sharp as usual.

Are you sure it even happened, Ms Sharobeem?---Oh, of course it did.

30 After 2012?---I even visualise it. Oh, yeah, '12, '12, that was the Assyrian and Arabic parenting group. Since then we started the multicultural parenting program which is different. We cater for everybody instead of only Arabic and Assyrian-speaking.

And you keep saying we?---Myself and the facilitators.

The only person you can recall doing this is yourself, isn't it?---Myself and the facilitator, as I said.

40 You're not able to recall which facilitators apart from Georgette and Ban Khoshaba?---And myself as a facilitator as well, and I used Richie as a facilitator as well, Manel as a childcare worker and there was some other people. I seriously can't remember but I'll try to dig deep and come back with names. I just need to refresh my memory.

I'll take you to volume 11, page 115. Do you recognise this document?
---Yes, it's a report.

What is it a report about?---About the period from January to March 2013.

For what?---Delivering the multicultural parenting project.

If you go to section 2.3, do you accept that for the period January to March 2013, you are suggesting that the program took place at Guildford, Fairfield and Carramar?---Yes. Some of the addresses here, as I just mentioned before you showed me this, we would have delivering in other areas outside the restricted area by funding but with permission we can just mention those, just to satisfy the reporting.

10 Are you suggesting in this report that there were 71 people who attended the program over the three month period?---Right. I need to explain this carefully and clearly. Sorry, I need to look at the number first before. Yes. The 71 adults is actually the number of people attended in whole. So if we have, for example, 10 people attended at one session and we run 10 sessions, then 10 time 10 is equal 100.

So how do you think you got to the 71 figure here?---That's the calculation number of the number of people attended.

20 Is it a total of mothers, fathers and grandparents?---That's, yeah, as it's written here.

Section 3.1 - - -?---We just look at each one of them.

- - - also represents that 22 children in effect attended the MPP program over the relevant period, doesn't it?---There's no other page. That's the same page I have. Sorry, what's your question?

30 Do you agree that the children who attended the program, as suggested by this document, was 22 over the three month period? 15 and 7?---15 and 7, 22, yes. We were calculating the number patron each group.

I'll show you another document, page 137, volume 11. Do you see that this is a report for January to June 2013?---Yes, it's written here.

I'll just ask you some questions, firstly, Ms Sharobeem.---Sure.

You said previously that the numbers that you were giving were for the entire period for the number of sessions undertaken. Is that - - -?---That's the calculation of service delivered.

40 There were 71 people from January to March 2013 that you said. Withdraw that. You say that between January to March 2013 there were 71 occasions of service, would you accept that?---Yes. Yeah.

In light of that number, how many people do you actually think were attending the program, not counting them twice over the period?---It's not counting twice.

Well, how many actual people turned up?---In each session? Would be - - -

I'll put it differently. How many people were involved in the multicultural parenting program from January to March 2013?---It's - - -

So enrolled.---Okay.

Registered with the service. Don't count them twice. Count them once.
---I'm never counting anything twice, but there is a way to calculate in the
NGO sector reporting, and that's what we all used to do as a sector. So
10 because you deliver service, you are using the government money.

Okay. Hold on.---So you look at the number of people - - -

I'm talking about a specific period between January to March 2013.---Right.

Just take your mind back there. I'm asking you about that time.---Mmm.

I've shown you a document that says that across that period there were 71
occasions of service. Would you accept that?---It's written down in the
20 report so it must be true.

All right. So just focus on that number. 71.---Ah hmm.

And the next part of it is three months. I want you to think about how many
actual people were involved over that three months.---It's impossible to
answer your question with full honesty. But to my honest answer, I have to
say that the people attended the program over the three months, can be 10
people at the first session and then they are reduced to eight people at the
second session. And the third session new parents came in, so it became 12.
30 And then the fourth session it will be reduced to – or reduced to six, and
then elevated again with new people. So we look at a summary of the
whole. We do not calculate twice.

If you were to think about all the names of people that attended that
Multicultural Parenting Program in that three month period how long would
the list of names be?---It would be between – it would be around 20 maybe
people per list per group and the group is around three sessions to five
sessions so you can repeat that, and by the way - - -

40 All right. Well, that - - -.--- - - - the Multicultural Parenting Program - - -

No, no. No, no. Please.--- - - - it wasn't a program - - -

Ms Sharobeem, I've asked you the question and you've answered. I'm
going to show you the document.---You have the wrong impression about
the program.

I'll show you page 137 of volume 11 again.---And that's not a full complete picture of it.

Do you see section 2.1, can you read the bold writing aloud please.
---Audited.

10 Sorry, go to section 2.1. You can read the entire bold section aloud to the inquiry.---“Total participant numbers for this project across all sessions in reporting period. Please count each participant once only, only once. If a person participated in more than one of your activities please count them only once. Do not include parents under youth” - - -

Well, that's enough, that's the bold isn't it.---Okay.

It's fairly clear from the first page of this reporting document - - -?---Yes.

- - - that you're only meant to count each participant once for the six month report isn't it?---That's right, and obviously that's what happened at that time.

20

Well, here you're saying over six months there were 166 different people who attended the program aren't you?---This is what I'm trying to explain to you, sir, and you're not giving me a chance. This is not one program. This is not a program stagnated in a place. This is multiple programs running for three to five sessions only and sometimes we do one big event. So that's exactly the number at that time calculated.

What did you use - - -?---Do you think it's a program of 10 sessions? No.

30 Just what did you use to calculate that figure 161?---Number of people reported from events happened while the program is delivered.

How did you know how many people attended a certain program?---It depends on the reporting from all facilitators and people deliver the service.

Where did you get the numbers from, Ms Sharobeem?---Sometimes from myself as a facilitator attended those events or the other facilitators as well and all documents should be there.

40 Would you ever obtain numbers for a program from the database, computer database?---For this, no.

Not for this, for anything?---Oh, of course, from the database some. The database is different story and bigger story but I never relied on it only to present the numbers to the funding body because it's not a complete database. It's a trial.

Ms Sharobeem, you said that over a three month period you thought the list of names would have been about 20. How does it - - -?---In one program you're asking me about one event.

No, I asked you about the Multicultural Parenting Program.---And you didn't at that time give me a chance to explain what is the program, sir. Unless you're trying to trap me in something please give me a chance to tell you.

10 Ms Sharobeem, are you suggesting in this document here in front of you that there were 166 people registered to attend the program over that period? ---Not registered, no. It's not registered. Attended already. Delivered.

Are you, are you - - -?---Received the service.

Are you referring to occasions of services or - - -?---No.

- - - a list of participants, what are you referring to in this document?
20 ---Number of people receive the education about parenting from the multicultural community.

Are you counting people twice?---Absolutely not. In this event, no.

How do you then say in evidence that there were only 20 people registered over a three month period and now you're saying that there are 166?---Let me say it again, sir. Registered over what? I'm just saying the program, if you look at the description of the program you will know it's only three to five sessions. So in each time we deliver the program it's only three to five sessions and then we repeat it again and then we repeat it again or we also
30 do what is called community event which hundreds of people attending to it. So at that event we do promotion, we talk about parenting at large and I did heaps of them at Barbara Street community hall, at the church in Guildford and other churches in Punchbowl and many other community events and mosques so it's not a stagnated project of 10 sessions like the other program running at the service. It's different.

You also - - -?---And also let me add this. Sorry to interrupt you. And also in agreement with the funding body, the other way we used to deliver the multicultural parenting project, because of its sensitivity, it's the way I was
40 dealing with parents. So we had the one, which is me as a caseworker, as a person who is delivering parenting education, sitting with the parents in my room and talking about parenting. And I did that with many couples to count.

Can you read the italics under the bold print?---“Do not include parents under youth regardless of age. Please include them as adults. Do not include professionals or staff unless you are contracted to be providing

professional development. Do not include family fun days or promotion events where you did not collect feedback.” Absolutely.

You have referred in your evidence to promotional events, haven’t you?
---But, sir, it’s written clearly “where you did not collect feedback”. Are you accusing me that I didn't collect feedback? There is heaps of evaluation paper included in that folder, and please go ahead and see it. There is heaps of evaluation written. For people even cannot read or write, we use the pictures, we use the faces, so people can report back.

10

Where did you keep a list of participants for the multicultural parenting program?---Always in the office. Always.

Whereabouts in the office did you keep a list of people?---You ask me the description of my office. My desk, on the top of the desk there is like a shelf and it had many folders for the multicultural parenting project and maybe two or three only for the STEPS to Employment, because we didn't do much of it. So it’s only one year for STEPS to Employment, and at least four to five folders with the bulk written next to it MPP, including one of them for the project itself which I wrote myself and translated myself.

20

Can I take you to section 3.2? Why is that redacted?---And by the way, that project won an award in 2015 maybe.

Ms Sharobeem, at section 3.2 it describes where the service was being conducted. Would you agree with that?---Yes, it’s written here.

And it says it was being conducted at the centre at Fairfield, do you agree?
---Yes.

30

And do you agree that it was also being conducted, according to this document, at the Fairfield Public School?---That’s right.

The blacked-out entry, if you'll take it from me, is a reference to a location at Yennora.---Yes.

Would you agree that in your three-month report you refer to a Carramar address - - -?---Yes.

40

- - - but in the six-month report you’re not referring to the Carramar address?---Sorry, I don’t understand the question.

In the three-month report in this period you referred to the multicultural parenting program being conducted at Carramar, and I’ll take you back to that, page 115?---So what is the – sorry, what is the question? I referred to it once and I didn’t refer the other one?

Just go to section 3.2?---Sorry.

Sorry, 2.3. You see there the references to where the service is purported to be conducted?---Yeah.

It says Carramar, doesn't it?---Yes.

It says that one program was being conducted at Carramar. Correct?---It's written here.

10 Yeah. And it also says that three programs were being conducted at Guildford. Do you agree with that?---Yes.

Ms Sharobeem, what I'm saying to you is, in that same period, but over six months from January to June, the end of June, in the report those two locations were not included?---I don't know, maybe a mistake in the writing between this and that. I, I, I mean I can't see that it's something major or something I should try to squeeze my memory to remember why that happened. I don't know why. Maybe, I don't know, really. I can't, I really can't respond to this. Maybe it's an error in writing.

20

Commissioner, I'm only going to go to another report after this?---But definitely if there is an appoint the manager should pointed me to the mistake at that time. I don't know which year that. Yeah, the manager at that time should talk to me back and say, Eman, this is reported this way, incorrect.

Sorry, the manager of who?---Smith Family manager which received the report from us. Usually if they're not satisfied with the report they talk to us directly.

30

Commissioner, is that a suitable time to - - -

THE COMMISSIONER: Okay. We'll adjourn for lunch.

THE WITNESS: Sorry.

LUNCHEON ADJOURNMENT

[1.00pm]