

TARLOPUB00409
09/05/2017

TARLO
pp 00409-00464

PUBLIC
HEARING

COPYRIGHT

INDEPENDENT COMMISSION AGAINST CORRUPTION

THE HONOURABLE REGINALD BLANCH AM QC

PUBLIC HEARING

OPERATION TARLO

Reference: Operation E15/1982

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

AT SYDNEY

ON TUESDAY 9 MAY, 2017

AT 10.00AM

Any person who publishes any part of this transcript in any way and to any person contrary to a Commission direction against publication commits an offence against section 112(2) of the Independent Commission Against Corruption Act 1988.

This transcript has been prepared in accordance with conventions used in the Supreme Court.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, Mr Rajalingam.

MR RAJALINGAM: Commissioner, I call Ms Eman Sharobeem.

MR CHHABRA: Commissioner, if I may whilst she's entering the witness box formally state that she makes objection to answering any questions put to her in the Commission or producing any documents if so required.

10 THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, thank you. Have you spoken to her about section 38?

MR CHHABRA: I have. I'll be seeking the declaration.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, thank you. Ms Sharobeem, will you take an oath or an affirmation?

MS SHAROBEEM: Affirmation.

20 <EMAN SHAROBEEM, affirmed [10.04am]

THE COMMISSIONER: Just take a seat there. Now, Mr Chhabra has spoken to you about the order under section 38 and you know from your previous attendance about it.---Yes.

30 So I will make an order which will protect you against civil or criminal ramifications from anything that you say. So, pursuant to section 38 of the Independent Commission Against Corruption Act, I declare that all answers given by this witness and all documents and things produced by this witness during the course of the witness's evidence at this public inquiry are to be regarded as having been given or produced on objection and there is no need for the witness to make objection in respect of any particular answer given or document or thing produced.

40 **PURSUANT TO SECTION 38 OF THE INDEPENDENT COMMISSION AGAINST CORRUPTION ACT, I DECLARE THAT ALL ANSWERS GIVEN BY THIS WITNESS AND ALL DOCUMENTS AND THINGS PRODUCED BY THIS WITNESS DURING THE COURSE OF THE WITNESS'S EVIDENCE AT THIS PUBLIC INQUIRY ARE TO BE REGARDED AS HAVING BEEN GIVEN OR PRODUCED ON OBJECTION AND THERE IS NO NEED FOR THE WITNESS TO MAKE OBJECTION IN RESPECT OF ANY PARTICULAR ANSWER GIVEN OR DOCUMENT OR THING PRODUCED.**

THE COMMISSIONER: Now, that provides you with the protection but as I indicated to you before, it doesn't protect you if you tell lies when you've taken an affirmation because you would still be subject to perjury charges.
---Sure.

Thank you. Yes, Mr Rajalingam.

10 MR RAJALINGAM: Thank you, Commissioner. May you state your full name for the record.---Eman Sharobeem.

How do you spell your name?---First name E-m-a-n, surname S-h-a-r-o-b-e-e-m for Mary.

Have you got a glass of water?---I will need it. That's absolutely right.

20 Okay. Why don't you grab a glass of water first.---I also would like to add that it is obvious that my mental health is not really in good shape and also my physical health. I am sorry to say and admit I have been bleeding heavily. So if I would need with your permission, Commissioner, every now and then I will just need a bit of a break.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes. Please feel free to tell me if you do need to break.---Thank you.

MR RAJALINGAM: When were you born, Ms Sharobeem?---The birth certificate indicate that it's 3 June, '63.

30 Is that the date you understand you were born?---That's the birth certificate, yes.

Where were you raised?---In Cairo.

By who?---My parents.

What were your parents' names?---Mum's first name Smah and - - -

40 Can you spell that?---In English S-m-a, sorry, S-m-a-h.

And her last name Sharobeem?---No.

What was her last name?---Women don't take a husband's surname back home in Egypt. It should be Raphael.

What about your father's name?---Adly.

How do you spell that?---A-d-l-y.

And did he have any other names?---Grandfather is Sharobeem, our – like a family name which is - - -

Ms Sharobeem.--- - - - belong to the family. It's called Al Bakori.

What did you call your father?---Dad.

10 Did he – did you call him – did you know him by a particular name?
---Mr Adly.

Did you go to school in Egypt?---Yes.

How many years of school did you complete?---I finished HSC, equivalent to HSC Australian system.

20 Did you do about 12 years of schooling?---Actually less because both parents used to work in the education department so my schooling was a bit rapid, speeded.

What did your father do for a living?---He was the – he finished his life as – in the position with the education department as a principal I believe.

What about mum, what did she do?---The same.

Did you have any brothers or sisters?---I had a sister which is just passed away last year.

30 Older or younger?---I'm the youngest.

You're the youngest?---I am the youngest, and my brother which is in Europe.

Is your brother older or younger than you?---Older.

How much older is he?---Could be four or five years, three years, something like that.

40 What's your brother's name?---Emad, E-m-a-d.

What's your sister's name?---Suzanne.

What did you do after school, Ms Sharobeem, in Egypt?---I went to university.

Which university did you go to?---Ain Shams University.

How do you spell that?---Um, first one is Ain, A-i-n, Shams, S-h-a-m-s.

What did you— did you complete any degree at the Ain Shams University?
---Yes.

What did you complete?---A degree in accounting and business
administration. That's the equivalent working in Australia.

What was it called at the Ain Shams University?---The actual translation
degree in commerce.

10

Did you attend any other university while you were at Egypt?---I didn't get
the chance, no.

After school did you do any work?---I did volunteer work at a couple of
institutions to support underprivileged families and girls.

Where did you work?---The volunteer work, in a, the equivalent of an
orphan called Saint Stefano's and Saint, the Archangel Mikhail.

20 Can you repeat that?---The first one - - -

The orphanage that you worked at what was it called?---Um, Archangel
Mikhail, which belongs to the church or so I recall. Saint Stefano's Orphan,
Orphanage. Yeah, I just did voluntary work for the church in different
organisations at that time.

Was this after school you're talking about?---We're not allowed to do any
work while we study.

30 I'm asking you after school did you - - -

THE COMMISSIONER: After you'd finished school?---Between my
school years and also university and also after university as a continuation.

MR RAJALINGAM: How much time did you spend doing volunteer work
after you finished school?---How, how many months? Maybe a year or so
or more. I, I can't be specific on that. See in our culture we do volunteer
and we don't count.

40 Yep. Okay. Did you meet your first husband around about that time?---No.

When did you meet your first husband?---He was my first cousin, so I met
him at birth. And I, I knew of him since I was a little child.

Did you marry him?---Did I marry my first husband?

Yes?---It is, yes.

When did that happen?---It could be 1984. I think 1984.

Do you know what you were doing when you – around about that time?---I was still studying.

Were you at university?---Yes.

Were you at the Ain Shams University?---Yes.

10 How many years did you attend the Ain Shams University?---Either three and a half or four. Their school year is different.

At some stage did you travel to Australia for the first time?---Yes.

Who did you travel with?---With him.

And what was his full name?---Gamal Shawky Sharobeem.

Is Gamal spelt G-a-m-e-l?---A-l.

20

A-l at the end. How do you spell his middle name?---Shawky, S-h-a-w-k-y. It's, the spelling it varies between different people using the word.

Where did you settle once you arrived in Australia?---In Parramatta.

Was it in a house or a unit?---A unit.

How many bedroom unit?---Um, two.

30 Did you have any money when you came to Australia?---He has, I had nothing and on me I had no power to have anything. Even if my parents would give me money I wouldn't hold anything.

Was Gamal a wealthy man?---We're coming from a good family, yeah.

Did you purchase a unit in Parramatta or were you renting?---No, we were renting.

Did you have children with him?---Yes.

40

When were they born?---When? Charlie was born - - -

Who's that?---Charlie. 4 June, 1988. And Richard was born 21 February, 1992.

After they were born did you obtain any work when you were here in Australia?---Much earlier than that. I started working not long after I arrived.

How long after you arrived did you start work?---Not more than six months.

Do you know where you started work?---Yes. I started at Doonside High School as liaison officer and then full-time employment at Granville Multicultural Centre as welfare worker, and that's developed as case worker and also family support worker. And then after that, sorry, am I supposed to continue or that's all the information you want? I'm sorry. Just closed my eyes.

10

You referred to Doonside High School as a liaison officer.---Yes.

Do you know how long you spent there?---A few months.

What about as a welfare officer at Granville Multicultural, I think it was, did you say?---At least five years.

Did you find any work after that Granville Multicultural Health?---Granville Multicultural Centre?

20

Oh, sorry.---Centre, yeah. There wasn't any time that I was not unemployed, so I wouldn't leave a job until I find another - - -

Where did you work after - - -?--- - - - because I was the breadwinner of the family.

Where did you work after Granville Multicultural Centre?---Yeah, I moved into Fairfield, to Immigrant Women's Health Service as a program coordinator.

30

How did you get the job?---I applied and I got the job?

How did you find out about the job?---I think it was circulated by an email.

By who?---Sorry, I can't really remember that.

Did anyone tell you about the Immigrant Women's Health Service?---Did anyone tell me the advertisement? Like - - -

40

Who sent you the email?---Oh, I wouldn't remember that. I even, I'm saying, I'm assuming that it was an email but I can't even remember. At that time, we're talking about 1990, I believe, so I really can't remember if it's word of mouth or if it's a newspaper or if it's an email. I'm so sorry. I can't really be sure.

Do you recall applying for the job in the early '90s at the Immigrant Women's Health Service?---Yes, I did.

Do you recall how you applied for that job?---I would assume that I sent my resume. Whether they left a phone number for them to call them or not, I'm sorry, but I can't really remember.

Do you know how long you worked as a program coordinator at the Immigrant Women's Health Service in the '90s?---Yes, around two years. And the reason I remember is because I was trying to allocate time and years and what I did in those years.

10 Did you do anything after that at the Immigrant Women's Health Service after you finished there?---I didn't finish. As I mentioned to you, sir, I was the breadwinner so I had to move if I want to. So there was another job offered. Again, information circulated in the sector about Parks Community Network as a manager, and I applied for it and I got the job.

You said that you were the sole breadwinner?---Yes.

20 Were you the sole breadwinner at around about the time you were working at the Immigrant Women's Health Service in the early nineties?---Yes.

Is that what you're saying?---Yes.

Where were you living in the early nineties working at the Immigrant Women's Health Service?---In a Housing Department flat in Guildford.

With who?---With the father of the children.

And were the children there as well?---Yes.

30 And what was the father doing for work if anything?---It is against my culture to speak of the dead but I will because of this inquiry. He had various mental problems.

Just, Ms Sharobeem, I'm asking you about the early nineties, if he was doing anything for work when you were living in a Housing Department unit. ---Yeah.

40 Was he doing anything for work at that time?---This is what I'm trying to tell you, sir.

Well, is the answer yes or no?---About what? I didn't give you an answer yet,

Was he working in the early - - --?---No.

Was he alive in the early nineties?---Yes.

What was he doing in the early nineties for work?---Yes, he was mentally challenged.

Was he doing anything for work, Ms Sharobeem?---And he was filling his time - - -

Ms Sharobeem, I need - - -?--- - - - with writing.

10 I need an answer yes or no. Was he working in the early nineties?---No, no.

What was he doing before that for work?---He never worked in a proper job.

You said earlier in your evidence that he came from wealth, didn't you?
---No, not wealth. We're coming from a good family.

A good family.---Yeah.

20 Did he have money when you came to Australia, Ms Sharobeem?---Very – I can't tell you exactly how much but very minimal.

So you would say that when you came to Australia you and your husband were people of modest means. Would you agree with that?---No, I can't because I didn't know how much he has.

Okay.---And also he was a gambler so I never knew how much he has.

Well, in your experience of your relationship with this man, do you recall living a modest lifestyle?---I need to think what is modest is.

30 Well, where were you living when you first came to Australia, I think you said Parramatta?---Yes.

It was a two-bedroom unit wasn't it?---That's right.

Did you pay rent?---He did.

Do you recall how much rent was being paid for the unit?---No.

40 Was it a lot or a little bit, Ms Sharobeem?---I seriously don't know.

Okay. Was it carpeted or was it – were there floorboards in the unit?---It was a carpet, yeah.

Okay. Was it dirty or clean carpet, Ms Sharobeem?---It wasn't clean.

It wasn't clean?---No, it wasn't.

Okay. Where was the unit?---In Parramatta.

Did it have a lift – which level were you on?---No. Third floor.

Okay. You used stairs to get up to your unit?---Yes.

Do you recall that?---Yes.

There was no lift was there?---No.

10 It wasn't a fancy unit was it?---No. It was normal, the Australian standard, but I didn't at that time know any difference to compare and he was a gambler so I never knew how much we have and I didn't have any control over our accounts.

You worked at the Doonside High School as a liaison officer. Is that – you agree with that?---Yes.

How much were you being paid in your role as a liaison officer?---No, I can't remember.

20

Were you being paid anything?---Yes.

Were you being paid a wage on a weekly basis or a salary?---I think weekly basis. I think.

How soon after you arrived in Australia did you start working at Doonside High School?---Maybe six months.

30

It was your first job in the country wasn't it?---Yes.

You were fairly excited about getting a job in Australia weren't you when you started working at the high school?---I was young and I didn't know anything else except trying to make a living.

Yeah. You were quite grateful that you had work weren't you?---Yeah, of course.

40

And, Ms Sharobeem, you've already told the Commission that you yourself didn't have much money when you came to this country. How much - - -?
---I have no control over anything.

- - - did you think you were making from Doonside High School per week?
---If it's necessary for you, sir, I can try to find out but I can't remember now and I don't want to tell a lie. I'm, I'm just being so precise with everything I say.

You first travelled here on an Egyptian passport didn't you?---Yes.

I'm going to show you a document, Academic Qualifications Brief, volume 14, page 1. Does that look like a copy of the passport you used when you came to Australia?---That's right.

Okay. Do you recall writing in that passport that you had completed a Bachelor of Commerce?---It's written down here, yes. But recall writing, no. We don't write these passports.

10 All right. Turn the page. Would you turn the page again? Turn the page. Do you see there, that is page 4 of your passport?---Yes.

Do you see the writing on the passport?---Yes, I do.

It's your writing, isn't it, Ms Sharobeem?---No. No, we don't, we do not write this passport.

Someone wrote on that passport, didn't they?---Of course.

20 And it's written there Baclier de Commerce?---Yes.

Would you agree with that?---Yes.

Had you obtained a Bachelor of Commerce in Egypt?---As I mentioned to you, yes.

Are you sure about that?---Yes.

Was it called a Bachelor of Commerce - - -?---Yes.

30 - - - from the Ain Shams University?---Yeah, I believe so, the translation, yeah.

When did you complete that degree in commerce?---Either '84 or '85.

How long was the course?---Between as I said, three years and a half and four years.

Did you attend all the semesters?---Yes.

40 Do you know what mark you got at the end of it?---No. I, I didn't find out.

Wasn't this the only course or degree that you'd ever completed?---Yes.

And you don't know what you received at the end of it?---I know that I have a bachelor degree.

Did you know whether or not you got a distinction, a credit or a pass?---I think it was a pass because towards the end I was extremely busy.

You talked about coming to Australia in – what year was that when you first came here?---1 April, '87.

Once you had arrived in Australia, I think you gave some evidence of starting a family with Gamal. Correct?---Um - - -

You had kids, didn't you?---Starting a family with Gamal would be very overstated statement if I may say so.

10 Okay. Did you have children in Australia once you arrived here?---I was forced into sex, rape at marriage and I'm grateful that I have two children. If you want the truth, here is the truth.

Did you, once you, once you - - -?---So please this, this area of my time was very, very painful.

Ms Sharobeem, I haven't asked you a question.--- - - - and I'm sorry if I'm a bit tense, but it was painful time for me.

20 Once you arrived in Australia did you complete any tertiary education?
---No.

Did you attend any university?---No. I attend university but I didn't complete.

Okay. Was it the case that you had enrolled in a Diploma of Community Organisations at UTS?---Yes.

30 Was that in '94?---Sir, can I also say something else. I just recall - - -

No, I'm going to ask you questions and I'm going to ask you answer those questions, Ms Sharobeem?---I'm sorry.

Do you understand that?---Because, absolutely, my apology.

Let's just keep it to that.---Because you ask me question, I didn't fully say it right.

40 All right. Okay. If there's any need for you clarify the evidence, you can speak to your lawyer at the end of my questions. Do you understand?---But that will forbid you from knowing the full truth.

Well that's – Ms Sharobeem, I'll ask the questions, you answer. All right?
---Sure, sure, sure. My apology.

MR CHHABRA: I object, Commissioner. Commissioner, I base an objection. The witness is trying to answer the question. She should be

allowed to complete the answer. It may take a moment to formulate or maybe a second's pause in between, but she should be allowed to complete.

THE COMMISSIONER: What did you want to say about that?---I just want to clarify that I went to TAFE and completed a course, but when I said no it wasn't in my mind. So I just to say that yes, I also had when I arrived after arrived, a degree, sorry, a course at TAFE, Granville TAFE completed.

What was that course?---For office management.

10

And how long did the course take?---It might be around four to six months. What happened is at that time I went to AMS for English classes and my teacher said you don't really to attend English classes, go there.

Well we don't, we don't need the, we don't need that explanation but – is that what you wanted to say?---Yes, that I have, I attended another qualification.

Yes, thank you.

20

MR RAJALINGAM: Thank you, Commissioner. Did you start the diploma in about 1994 at the University of Technology Sydney?---I can't remember the years, I'm sorry.

I'll show you a document, academic qualifications volume 14, page 12. Do you recall completing about two years of study, Ms Sharobeem?---I think so, yes. I was under the impression that even it was one year. Thank you for reminding me.

30

Do you recall nominating, and that was over 1994 and 1995, wasn't it, you studied at UTS?---If the document say so. I can't even remember.

I'll ask you to go to page 6 of that. Ms Sharobeem, do you recognise that as your transcript, academic record of transcript? It's an internal document. You can have a look at it.---I'm sorry, I never saw it before so I just need to look quickly. Yeah, my name is there and the birth date, yeah.

I'll just ask you to turn to the next page. You see that?---I can see it, yes.

40

Do you accept that those subjects that I've shown you on that record relate, if you go back a page, to the Diploma of Community Organisations? Where the mouse is at the moment. BB05.---Ah, yes. Yeah, I believe those are the subjects.

And what were the subjects that you did?---Whatever written in this document, really, because I can't – my memory cannot at all remember anything.

You agree that you did not complete the diploma, don't you?---I didn't attend the exams, yeah.

If we turn back to page 12. Would you agree that at some stage you nominated to do a course in relation to funding, by looking at that page? ---Well, the paper indicate that and I have to agree with the paper. I can't really recall at all.

10 Did you ever do a course in relation to funding?---I can't really recall, I'm sorry. But if you have a document saying so - - -

It's clear, isn't it, Ms Sharobeem, that you've never completed any tertiary education at the University of Technology Sydney by obtaining a degree at the end of it?---That's right.

And you didn't commence any other education in Australia of a tertiary kind, did you?---No.

20 You've referred to a course at TAFE.---Yes.

Was that the only other training that you did in Australia?---No, training I did a lot of training. But university is different.

Did you return to Egypt, after you'd arrived in Australia, for some time? Go back to Egypt?---I did, for a visit, short visit in '95, to baptise my son.

What else was going on about that time, Ms Sharobeem?---Extreme violence, physical and emotional and economic and everything else.

30 Were you still living with your husband?---Absolutely.

Did he go with you to Egypt?---No.

Can you describe what happened the first two weeks of you returning to Egypt?---It was only a visit for two weeks when I went in 1995.

40 Did you go again for a longer period of time?---In 1997 when the priest in the church couldn't really tolerate what's happening with me because the violence was extremely extreme at that time and I'm sorry if I'm – just one second. His violence escalated to the extent that the priest from our local church booked a ticket for me and the children and he say to him she will go and spend a couple of weeks with her parents and if you are ready to apologise and try to get your family back we will allow you. So I went there in 1997.

And in the first two weeks of you arriving in Egypt what happened?---He called us and at that time I didn't tell my parents or my sister anything about what he was doing. Just one second. So he called and he said that he would

like to come and ask for my forgiveness in front of my family and make peace and gain back his family. And sorry, do you want me to continue? And he came. I went to pick up – pick him up from the airport. He did – he was sitting at the first seat next to the driver of the taxi and I was sitting at the back and he said to me just give me the kids’ passport and your passport so I can process the Egyptian identity for the kids because they were born in Australia. And I said to him yes, of course and then I give him everything. He slept at my parents’ house and in the morning, yeah, him and the kids disappeared and I stayed for 55 days trying to find him. I called the
10 Australian Embassy and I was trying everywhere to find him until I received a call from him and I recall very well that Charlie was screaming at the back and he was saying mum, come and get us. So whatever condition he put there for me to go and get the kids I accepted, including signing off on anything and everything I ever made and had in Australia. And I did and I got the kids and then he, he asked for me to come to Upper Egypt to get the kids. That was his condition. So I went and he kept me imprisoned in his family house for at least 10 days. Every day he would abuse me by all means and then getting drunk to the extreme and then some of my cousins
20 were able to allow me to escape in the middle of the night and all that I remember at that time is I was holding the kids tight and he was awake and hit his mother and left the house and came after me and tried to run into the train but many men in the family and on the platform held him and I was able to move with the train and the kids and we arrived to Cairo where my sister and cousin just received us and I've been holding the kids since then. Sorry.

Do you need a break, Ms Sharobeem?---If you can please.

30 THE COMMISSIONER: We’ll adjourn for 10 minutes.

SHORT ADJOURNMENT

[10.39am]

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, Mr Rajalingam.

40 MR RAJALINGAM: Thank you, Commissioner. Ms Sharobeem, you were giving evidence about returning to Egypt in 1997, just before the break. Do you agree with that?---Yes.

And you told the Commission what happened when you returned to Egypt. Do you agree with that?---Yes.

How long have you returned to Egypt was it that Mr Gamal Sharobeem – was that his last name?---Sharobeem his last name.

How long after you returned to Egypt did Gamal take, take off so to speak? ---Sorry, I didn’t understand.

How long after you returned to Egypt did Gamal leave? This ordeal you've referred to, how long was that? He went back to Australia, didn't he?---I, no, I don't know if he went back straight or stayed.

You never saw him again though, did you?---I saw him from a distance during my father's funeral in December '99.

10 How long did this ordeal in Egypt take where he was trying to get in touch with you and being controlling and violent?---At least two months. Oh, no. Okay, I stayed without the kids for 55 days and then um, the call came and then he imprisoned me in his family house in upper Egypt for around um, 10 days or so. And then the family arranged my escape. Then I went back to Cairo. So altogether, yeah.

So that's about two months. Would you accept that?---Roughly.

20 And when you say you went back to Cairo, where did you go exactly?---I went to my parents' house.

Were your siblings there at your parents' house at that time?---No.

Was it just you and your parents?---And the kids.

And Richard and Charlie, is it?---Yes.

How long did you stay in Egypt?---Six years.

30 And in those six years you had no contact with Gamal, did you, apart from some funeral you referred to? Was it your father's funeral?---You ask about seeing him and that's when I saw him, but he was constantly calling and abusing and swearing and trying to talk to different family members and getting so drunk and abusing other members to get money from them.

Did you see him after he had left?---As I said to you, sir, I saw him the first time in the funeral.

And how much – when was the funeral?---'99. As I said in December.

40 So for about two years you didn't see Gamal but you'd heard of what he was doing. Is that fair to say?---Roughly speaking, yes.

Did you do any work while you were in Egypt?---Oh, yes.

What was the first job that you held? This is after '97?---Yes, my parents supported us and then I started to look for work. It didn't take long and I was, I found a job as the secretary-general of the Young Women Christian Association of Egypt.

How long were you there for?---How long I held the position?

Yes?---Um, maybe roughly speaking again, it could be eight months to a year, something like that.

What did you do there?---I was the secretary-general of the YWCA Egypt which is responsible about all the branches around the country. And also delegating with other YWCA in other countries, as a secretary-general.

10

How did you get that job?---Through friends, oh, a friend told me about it and then I met the chairperson and the chairperson offered me the job after the meeting. I believe so.

Was there any formal recruitment process that you went through to get that job?---Yes, in comparison to Australia, yeah.

You only stayed there for 8 months. Why was that?---I'm saying again roughly 8 months.

20

Do you agree that you stayed there for a short time?---Not very short, but not very long as well because the, in Egypt in stayed for six years, so I'm just trying mentally to locate the time, how long I stayed in each position.

What did you do after that?---Um, during my time there and in one of the conference, conferences I was told about an international organisation, belong to the UN and funded by USAID, doing training for entities from Egypt and across based on partnerships, and I applied for a job as a manager there.

30

Where?---And I got the job. It's called DT2. D for David, T for Tom, 2. It's abbreviation of something, I can't really remember at the moment what it was, so, yeah.

How long were you there for, Ms Sharobeem?---I was a unit manager in the organisation for two years and, yeah, around that, yeah.

Where was the office based, the DT2 office based?---In Mohandessin. In Mohandessin suburb.

40

What does - - -?---In, sorry, Dokki. Dokki in particular.

What did you do in that role in your job at DT2?---I was a manger of a unit.

What were you actually doing though?---Again from memory, I had staff and with the staff our unit across other units as well deliver – design and deliver training components for officials in Egypt such as ministers and high officials and engage them in training abroad and because it was high

officials my role as a manager always to communicate and to address the need of those units whether it's governmental or nongovernmental. That's again it's roughly - - -

You don't know what DT2 stands for do you?---I would say development and training phase 2.

Of what, Ms Sharobeem?---Of the training agreement between USA and Egypt.

10

Who was conducting this agreement, who was overseeing it?---Americans not the Egyptians.

Okay. In what capacity?---As the seniors.

What type of Americans, Ms Sharobeem?---Type. As workers.

Who were they working for?---USAID I believe. Funded by USAID.

20

What?---The USAID, USAID in Egypt and in partnership with United Nation. That's as far I know.

You were working there as a manager, were you?---Yeah.

What experience did you have at that point to be doing work as a manager for this organisation?---What experience I had? From Australia I was a manager before I left and when I arrived there I worked as secretary-general of YWCA which is an international organisation as well.

30

Did you have any qualifications to be holding these positions?---The qualification is as you mentioned, sir, and that's what I submit but in many positions you look at the qualification but you also look at the experience and the presentation of the person and how much that person is holding as experience and of course you know around the world many people wouldn't have qualification but they would be very experienced in what they do.

40

Did you do any other further study while you were in Egypt when you were holding these jobs?---USAID and UN believed in the continuous training of staff so we had staff development all the way all the time. We would have different courses nonstop.

What would you do in these courses?---We would do – if it's not organised by us and organised by management, the senior management it would be communication skills, computer skills. We would do also special software and programing. We would also do office work, organising and establishing organisations across as in management. That's again from memory. I'm just recalling visions of the post.

Did you obtain any other qualifications when you were in Egypt?---During the six years?

Yes.---Towards the end of my stay there I received an honorary degree from the AUC because of the severe work and research I did with women and girls and because of my work with the microfinance and management as well.

When did this happen?---I believe roughly in 2002.

10

How did this honorary degree come about?---At that time I was working as a general manager for the external relation department at the National Council for Women in Egypt, and I was actually organising various international conferences and speaking in many of them. And my focus was on women and girls. I was focused also on the female genital mutilation and the domestic violence in particular. And in an event where we were at the AUC, we were speaking and then one of the professors say that the university is planning to honour me a degree because of the massive research I have been doing in that field, either in Australia or in Egypt. I didn't take his word as it's going to happen, but not long after I received a call from our HR and they told me, congratulation, you received an honorary degree. And I said, thank you, wow, that's great and that was the end of it. After that straight I received my business card from HR, having the title of PhD and also I was called from now, from that time going, Dr Eman Sharobeem.

20

Did you receive a certificate?---No. Sir, you're under a dictatorship regime. You don't ask - - -

30 So the question was did you receive a certificate? Yes or no?---No, yes, sir, no.

All right. This person that had - - -?---I would be killed if I asked.

You said you had a conversation with someone at the Women's National Council, is it?---As I told you, sir, last time, yes. Her name was Mrs Mona and she was part of the HR department - - -

40

Ms Sharobeem - - -?--- - - - and I tried to locate her.

You've just referred to that same person as a male.---Yeah. Male? No.

A male person.---No, no. Mona is a female name.

And, well, previously in your evidence you referred to that person as a male, a man.---No, I never. She's a female.

I wonder if we can check the transcript reference. Is that possible?

THE COMMISSIONER: Is the transcript – it's being transcribed. Could we go back to – which question?

MR RAJALINGAM: Should be some two minutes ago in one of Ms Sharobeem's explanations of how she obtained the doctorate.

THE COMMISSIONER: I think she said - - -?---Oh, no.

10 I think she said at the beginning that it was a professor.---Yes.

- - - who said to her. Is that professor a male or a female?---Male.

A male?---At university, yeah.

So the male professor said the university is thinking of giving you an honorary degree.---An honorary degree. Yeah.

20 And then the next communication you had about it was from the human resources section of the organisation you were working for.---That's right.

And was that a woman who said that you - - -?---Yes. Mrs Mona.

And - - -?---I'm sorry. I was referring to a previous meeting I had here when I said her name, so - - -

Yes. No, so that it was a woman in the HR department who said, congratulations, you've been given a degree?---Yes, that's right. A doctorate degree, yeah.

30

A doctor's degree.

MR RAJALINGAM: And this conversation you had with the woman, was that on the phone or something?---Yes.

It wasn't in person, was it?---Like, she came to my office?

Yes.---No, of course. Who am I for her to come to my office?

40 THE COMMISSIONER: And did you say that then you received a business card with - - -?---Yes.

And who organised that business card?---HR. No-one have any power to issue the eagle stamp. This is governmental. And we were under the first lady directly. We had no power except to do what we're told.

No, just - - -?---Sorry.

We're just trying to find out about, so the only communication that you had to entitle you to call yourself a doctor was the fact that somebody from HR said to you that you've been given a degree?---That's right. And even though I didn't call myself a doctor, I was called a doctor. I didn't even change my signature at that time but I received a card and I'm grateful. And even, sir, in other documentation. For example, we went to Gaza to the Ministry against what's happening with the Palestinian, and the Arab League, as an international organisation, issued a card for me as doctor and I do have the card.

10

Yes, but the first card that you had calling you a doctor was from the HR department of – and what was the organisation? It's the HR department of - -?---International Council for Women in Egypt.

Now if it's an honorary degree, presumably it's from a university?---That's right.

Which university?---The American University of Cairo.

20 The American University in Cairo?---That's right.

So the American University in Cairo would have a record of this honorary degree?---I tried. I tried severely. I, I didn't try at that time. I tried even when this came about. I called them here several times. I also went to our embassy and I requested a power of attorney for my cousin, relative over there in Egypt to go and obtain it. I even talked in person with the Minister of Immigration, the Egyptian Minister of Immigration. I had a meeting with her here in Sydney and I asked for her support. Not only that but I actually physically, after the first, the first meeting we had here, I actually decided to go by myself and ask. And when I went there I discover that the National Council itself, the whole building was set on fire during Arab Spring, during the revolution on 28 January, 2011. And the whole building was set on fire. Not only that I kept looking to find any trace of them and finally I found one. I went to the house one time and from the get go, from the door, they received me, including the driver I used to have, as "Dr Eman, welcome back." That welcome, sir, took 13 years and they still remember me to the extent that they were saying, "We remember what you used to teach us and to tell us what to do as workers."

40 I don't think you're addressing, I don't think you're addressing the issue. ---I, I, no, I'm sorry. I'm sorry.

The issue is, is there any proof at all anywhere that the American University in Cairo actually gave you a doctor's degree?---So far with all my times I couldn't find a trace of it.

Is that because it didn't happen?---No, I don't think so. Why would she lie? Why would she give me and she's Muslim, I'm Christian, they don't give us

privilege. Why would she do that? Definitely there was a document. But my assumption after that and after long time of research and thinking, that it might be a hard copy and it was burnt in the whole building. And, and no one would deliberately lie something like that. The whole country around the world is known to see that building demolished because of, of the burn, the revolution actually burn the whole building because Gamal Mubarak used to be there.

10 You're talking away from the point again. The short end point is that there is no evidence at all - - -?---That's right at this stage.

- - - that you were given a doctorate?---Except, except and this is my finding now, except the business card and the other card I have from Arab League. That's the only evidence I have. And also people words. When they receive me, "Dr Eman, Dr Eman." And that means - - -

No, well, people call you that but we're, we're looking for evidence that you actually had a doctorate. But in any event it was an honorary doctorate?
---That's right.

20

Yes, thank you.

MR RAJALINGAM: Thank you, Commissioner.---And I'm sorry if I, if it took me time to explain but I tried.

Ms Sharobeem, to be clear about it, the conversation you say you had about this doctorate was with, an honorary doctorate, was with a professor?---At university?

30 Yes?---Yes, it was a man.

Emir?---A man, a man.

A man professor?---A man, yeah.

Not one of the councillors?---I can't really remember his title.

All right. Well, do you recall what the professor was a professor of?---Oh no, no I, it was a conversation in a gathering. I can't really recall his title.

40

How long had you known this person for?---I didn't know him before. But he heard of me and he heard of the work I did and most precisely I believe because of the power of the National Council for Women. We as managers, general managers had that strong impression to be recognised by entities like universities and others.

Where were you when you had that conversation with the professor?---At the American University after a conference.

After a conference?---Yes.

Was there anyone else around?---Definitely there would be people around us when - - -

Do you know where you were standing, was it outside or inside a building?
---It was inside a building.

10 What time was it do you know when you had this conversation with the professor about you receiving an honorary doctorate?---It was definitely during an afternoon and I just shared with you what I recall of what he said.

Ms Sharobeem, you gave evidence at this Commission and I wonder if I can seek the Commission's leave to refer to evidence in the compulsory examination.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, I'll grant leave to refer to that.

20

VARIATION OF A SUPPRESSION ORDER: COMMISSIONER VARIES THE SUPPRESSION ORDER OVER EVIDENCE GIVEN BY EMAN SHAROBEEM AT A COMPULSORY EXAMINATION HELD ON 21 NOVEMBER 2016.

MR RAJALINGAM: You remember I asked some questions about this last year.---Yes.

30 And you gave an answer in relation to this honorary doctorate.---Yes.

Ms Sharobeem, back then you said the following.---Yes.

That - - -.---Yes.

- - - "During my work with the First Lady at the National Council for Women and because of my history working with women and girls and poverty alleviation at the AUC and one of the events, one of the counsellors said, 'You deserve an honorary degree'".---Yes.

40

You say now that it's a professor?---I'm so sorry, sir.

This moment in your life would have been pretty special wouldn't it when you received an honorary doctorate from the university?---I didn't receive it at that time.

Well, you were told you should get it.---Yeah, that's what he said.

Weren't you quite pleased at that?---People would say many things but you hear many things and you filter in your mind what you hear so I didn't - - -

You were happy weren't you?---It's a compliment. I didn't take it at that time as serious. It's like when people come to me and say you're an inspiration. I don't take it personally. I'm talking – when people say that to me I refer back and said what I say inspirational but not me. The same thing, same attitude. I never changed.

10 You recently went to the National Women's Council didn't you?---Went to it. I was working there.

You made some inquiries with the National Women's Council didn't you?
---Oh, yes, yes. Yes, I did.

And you asked for them to clarify what you had done with that organisation?---Yes, they did. They did.

20 And they refused didn't they, Ms Sharobeem?---They refused?

They refused to provide you with anything.---No, no. No, they didn't refuse. I didn't say that.

Weren't you just a trainee at the National Women's Council?---Oh, never.

All right. So you say that after your time there you were – you had received an honorary doctorate?---After my time. No, during my time.

30 All right.---And I've never been a trainee of this organisation, never. That's what the media said and I laughed.

What happened after your time at the National Women's Council?---I returned back to Australia.

When did you come to Australia for the second time?---It was end of November, 2003.

40 At that point in time you've got a Bachelor of Commerce. In your evidence is that what you say in 2003?---The Bachelor of Commerce it's my first degree.

So you have that don't you - - -?---Yeah.

- - - in 2003?---Yeah.

And you have a doctorate of psychology or honorary doctorate. Is that correct?---That's what I was told, yes.

What other qualifications did you have in 2003, Ms Sharobeem?---Short courses and the unfinished diploma and the short course at TAFE which I just remembered.

You started – when you returned to Australia in 2003 did you start work at the Immigrant Women's Health Service again?---Not straightaway, no.

Well, did you start in about 2004?---That's right, yes, and how this came about it was again informal.

10

By that stage you knew what the organisation was about didn't you?
---When I came back one of my friends said the AGM for IWHS is happening. Come and say hi to your friends. So I went and I found a very dying organisation with manager have been away on a union conflict with the management for a year. The organisation didn't have a manager. They actually – the management committee at the time requested that I aid them to get the organisation up and running again because of my passion.

20

But you certainly knew what the organisation was about, didn't you?
---What's it about?

Yeah, what's it about.---Yes, of course.

You knew what it was about.---It was a very small organisation.

Yeah. Did you know – withdraw that. You knew that it provided free educational programs to people?---At that time it was a small organisation. It had - - -

30

Well, yes or no? Did it provide free educational programs to people at that time, in 2004?---Not precisely the wording. It was an information service.

Okay. You understood the service assisted people who were either immigrants or refugee women, weren't they?---Not as the wide range of it, but, yes, it's available for them.

Were they referred to as CALD?---No, at that time it was referred to as NESB, non-English speaking background.

40

It was a service that was located in Western Sydney, would you agree with that? In Fairfield?---South-west, not west.

And you'd lived, you'd grown up in Granville for some time, hadn't you?
---No, I never been to Granville.

Sorry, Parramatta. You'd grown up in Parramatta, hadn't you?
---Parramatta. I lived in Parramatta for four years.

So you were familiar with Western Sydney?---I am familiar with Western Sydney.

And you knew that the service essentially assisted people coming from a relatively low socioeconomic background, didn't you?---Yes, of course.

The IWHS you knew was a not-for-profit organisation?---Yes.

10 And it was providing health services, would you agree with that?---No. Health information.

Information?---Yes. It is, actually the organisation name is health information service. But because of the common name we use, we use Immigrant Women's Health Service.

Did you understand it to be funded by the Department of Health back in 2004?---Yes. South Western Sydney Area Health in particular.

20 And you know all that before you applied for the job, didn't you, basically? ---No. No, no, no. But this is the basic information available to anyone, not all the details.

You worked there in the nineties, hadn't you, Ms Sharobeem?---Yes.

You knew in 2004 it was a not-for-profit organisation, didn't you?---Yes, of course.

30 You knew that it was servicing, as you've described it, NESH, sorry, NESB.---IWHS.

N-E-S-B people.---That's right. Yes.

Non-English speaking background.---Yes. And many of my clients were there when I went back and saw them.

And when you applied for your first job at the Immigrant Women's Health Service, the view, wasn't it, that you would ultimately become the manager of the service? Is that fair?---I was the coordinator back in the nineties.

40 Yes, but you recall giving evidence last year about this particular topic?---In which sense, sorry.

Firstly, what's the answer to the question? Do you recall giving evidence about this topic last year at your compulsory examination?---If you ask me, and definitely I answer - - -

Do you recall it, giving evidence?---I recall giving evidence here, of course.

All right. At that time you said you started as a coordinator but it was always the case that you'd spend some time as a coordinator and then transition to becoming a manager.---Not at all, no.

Do you recall saying that?---No, no, no. The manager - - -

Sorry, the question is do you recall saying that last year?---I don't think I ever said that because - - -

10 Okay. Well, just wait, just wait and I'll find the reference for you.---Sure, sure, please. Because it's never what's in my mind.

Just, just wait. Just wait.---Sure, sure. Sure. Yeah, sure.

You said this in November last year, and I'll read what you said to the Commission.---Sure.

20 "I started as the centre manager, the service, like Cabramatta officer manager. Coordinator, that's the word." Then you said - - -?---Oh, sorry.

- - - in relation to whether or not you became the manager you said, "I would say around May. It wasn't really long before I moved. The idea of the management, as I said, is to give me some time to examine what's happening in the Cabramatta and then move to Fairfield."---Absolutely true.

Do you accept that that's what you said - - -?---Of course.

30 - - - last year?---I thought you're asking me about my first job as in the nineties. I'm sorry. I'm misunderstanding.

No, no. I'm asking you about - - -?---Sorry.

- - - 2004.---Yeah, yeah. Yeah, of course.

When you applied for your job at that point - - -?---Absolutely.

40 - - - the view was, wasn't it, that you would ultimately become, or you at least wanted to be, the manager?---No, I didn't want to be. That's the arrangement with the management from day one.

You were taking on, even in, when you first started – sorry, withdraw that. When you started in 2004, do you accept that you were taking on a huge responsibility for the service?---Yes, of course. It was a very dying service at that time and I spend months on my knees trying to open letters (not transcribable) for a year.

Do you recall applying for the job at the IWHS?---Yes.

Do you recall sending in your CV to the IWHS?---Yes.

Do you recall the IWHS sending you a letter confirming your employment?
---Yes. But I can't really remember. I remember the phone call about
congratulation, you've got the job.

I'm going to show you a document.---Sure.

Academic qualifications, volume 14, page 15.---Okay.

10

Volume 14, page 15.

THE COMMISSIONER: Just while that's happening, can I just ask you
this? When you were told that you were going to get a doctorate - - -?
---Yes.

20

- - - were you told what sort of a doctorate you were getting?---Yes. The
word in, with exact translation, "It is because of your work with women and
girls' psychology, and also because of your work in the microfinance area
and management." That's the exact words I'm translating from my head.

So when you were told by the person from human resources - - -?---Yes.

- - - that you had been given a doctorate - - -?---Yes.

- - - what sort of a doctorate did they say you'd been given?---An honorary
degree. An honorary doctorate.

30

In what?---That's the exact words she read.

Just an honorary doctorate?---Yes, that's - and my reply was, I didn't take it
seriously when that gentleman talked to me.

No, well, you just - - -?---And she said, no, no, actually he said that.

But - - -?---Sorry.

40

- - - the communication with you was that it was just an honorary doctorate,
not a doctorate in anything in particular?---No. When I asked why she read
me this sentence "Because of my work with women and girls' psychology
and because of my work with the microfinance and management."
Microfinance and management, projects and management.

That was the reason you were given the doctorate?---I think she was reading
because she was, like, stating those one after the other exactly. And I'm just
translating it back as it was said to me.

And as I understand what you're telling me, is that – they were the reasons you were given the doctorate but there was nothing said about what sort of a doctorate it was?---I believe it is a doctorate degree, an honorary doctorate degree, and then they write two sentence about the reason or because of. That's what I understood the whole statement would look like. I, I try to understand more but we, as I said, sir, we were not allowed to ask many questions at that time. And I, I was just walking on eggshell because of the environment around me. So I wanted to keep my job and I wanted to be quiet as much as I can.

10

So you didn't understand anything more about the doctorate than that? ---What I understood exactly is it's an honorary certificate where it's not going to add anything to my position because I'm already a general manager, and it's not going to change my status. So I didn't really pay attention to it at all and I kept going. But then less than two weeks after, they send me the business card and a stack of them. And then I was known in various circles, with ambassadors and embassies and everyone in Egypt at that time, by that title. And churches and everybody else.

20 Okay. Thank you. Yes.

MR RAJALINGAM: Thank you, Commissioner. I'm going to show you a document. Volume 14, page 15. Ms Sharobeem, do you recall that being the letter that you sent to the Immigrant Women's Health Service when you applied for your job in 2004?---It has my signature. Obviously it is.

30 Do you recall that as the letter that you sent to the Immigrant Women's Health Service?---My signature there but I can't really recall because simply I'm addressing the letter to administrative officer. And if, if that's the case and this is my letter I would address it to the chairperson. So I can't really confirm.

This is the letter that was found on your staff file Ms Sharobeem.---So it is. You're asking my confirmation and I'm just trying to make sense of it.

Do you agree that there is nothing in this letter that refers to your honorary doctorate?---I didn't even address anyone about this when I came.

40 Do you agree that there's nothing in the letter that refers to your honorary doctorate?---Nothing written here about that. And I didn't at all.

Well, that's the answer?---Sure.

All right?---Yeah.

Do you agree that there's nothing in this letter about your work for the National Women's Council in Egypt?---Nothing in this letter.

And your work there would have been, in your evidence, two years prior to you writing this letter wouldn't it?---Absolutely. But I can't even recall writing this letter, sir.

It was found on your staff file, Ms Sharobeem.---It doesn't mean that - - -

Do you agree that it's your signature on the letter?---That's right.

All right.---And I'm sorry, sir, I'm trying to give you explanation.

10

Page 16 - - -?---Because that's what's requested from me here. I believe so.

Do you see that as your curriculum vitae in your name, Eman A. Sharobeem?---Can I see other pages?

Of course.---Can you please go back to the first page? Sorry about that. So this document is the, the date is August 2003. And - - -

20

Well, is August 2003 after your time at the National Women's Council, Ms Sharobeem?---After my retirement?

After your time there?---No, I was still working there in August. I finished and came straight to Australia. I was just focused in the pages and the date down there, that's what confused me. And at that time, I never called myself Eman A. Sharobeem. That's now recent I started to use Eman A. Sharobeem.

Sorry, but the document is dated August, 2003, Ms Sharobeem.---That's right.

30

Do you agree with that?---Yes.

Do you recall this being the CV that you submitted in support of your application to Immigrant Women's Health Service in 2004?---Sir, I have to be very honest. I can't really recall that and what's making me doubt is the top. I, I started only using the Eman A. Sharobeem – I wasn't using that. It was always Eman Sharobeem.

40

Do you agree that in that curriculum vitae that was found in your IWHS staff file that it refers to only two degrees, a bachelor in commerce and a diploma in management, do you agree with that?---What's written in this page indicate that but I doubt very much that this is the CV I submitted.

There is no reference do you agree in this curriculum vitae to any education in psychology whatsoever, would you agree with that?---There is nothing written her and I didn't write it before.

And there is no reference in that curriculum vitae to an honorary doctorate you'd received from any university is there?---I didn't apply. I didn't put that. I was so afraid they will say I'm over qualified. I didn't put it, no, but I'm not again referring to this. I'm doubting this document very much.

Ms Sharobeem, it's not in that document because - - -?---That's right.

- - - the conversation didn't take place did it about your honorary doctorate?---No, no, no, no, no, I didn't, no. I was - - -

10

The question was, the conversation you had with the professor about receiving an honorary doctorate never happened did it?---Sorry, what? How?

You never had a conversation with someone about your honorary doctorate?---No, sir. I'm under oath and I say the truth.

Well, to be precise, Ms Sharobeem, you took an affirmation - - -?---Yes.

20

- - - this morning.---Sorry, affirmation, because I don't swear. Sorry. But I'm under oath, I'm under affirmation.

Well, you are under an affirmation to tell the truth.---I can say that even the, the – because of my religion I don't swear but if you want me to put my hand on the Bible I will do that. It's only because the Bible say don't swear. That's why I don't swear.

When you - - -?---And I did that in the first time. It was a mistake.

30

When you applied for the job of co-ordinator did you have a copy of the following document at page 22, did you have this job description document when you applied for the job in 2004?---I believe so. I believe so.

At page 25 you read – you would have read through the values and principles of the service before you started there wouldn't you?---Yes, of course.

40

It is in a nutshell isn't it to empower women so that they can make choices which will enable them to lead healthy, fulfilling lives in a new country. Correct?---And until now I'm still using that slogan.

Page 22. If you look at the headings that have been underlined below the middle of the page would you accept that your function as a co-ordinator would have been to service the co-ordination in accordance with what's contained there in that document, that's your job isn't it?---Yes.

The next page.---That, that was the job as a co-ordinator.

You were being tasked to manage staff - - -?---Yes.

- - - weren't you?---Yes.

Were you involved in project development when you started?---Always, yes.

What about policy development?---Yes.

10 What about advocacy?---Yes.

What about networking and liaison?---Yes.

And you were also responsible weren't you for funding and financial management when you started?---Yes.

And namely you were to oversee the day-to-day financial and administrative management of it should read the Immigrant Women's Health Service.

Would you agree with that?---Yes.

20

You were in your capacity as a co-ordinator of the Cabramatta centre being asked to prepare annual - - -?---Co-ordinator of the service not Cabramatta only.

So at the beginning you were co-ordinator of the entire service were you? ---I was told Cabramatta has a lot of issues. Start there and don't – and try to understand what's happening because it has a lot of closed issues and then move to Fairfield.

30 When you started at the service there weren't many other full-timers were there?---There's no full-time ever except one.

You were the only full-timer weren't you?---That's right.

The rest of them were part-time workers weren't they?---Yes. There's no rest, it's only two.

And who were they?---There was the 10 hours admin in Cabramatta and admin in Fairfield and then facilitators.

40

How many facilitators were employed in 2004?---One or two max.

So you were - - -?---That's roughly.

- - - boss weren't you when you started at the service?---Yeah.

There was a board of committee?---Yes.

There were two other staff members?---Yes.

And you would agree that those two other staff members would have worked part-time. Correct?---That's right.

You were in charge of the organisation from 2004 weren't you Ms Sharobeem?---That's right.

10 And you were in charge of receiving funds or apply for funds, was that correct - - -?---Yes.

- - - from that point?---Yes. Yes.

And you were in charge of monitoring expenses weren't you?---Yes.

I wonder if that's a convenient time, Commissioner?

20 THE COMMISSIONER: Yes. We'll take the morning tea adjournment till 5 to 12.00.

SHORT ADJOURNMENT

[11.36am]

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, Mr Rajalingam.

30 MR RAJALINGAM: Thank you, Commissioner. Ms Sharobeem, I was asking you some questions about your position as the manager of Immigrant Women's Health Service. Do you remember that?---Yes.

You need to say yes or no?---Oh sorry, yes.

Okay. Can you speak up a bit?---Sure.

40 When did you start referring to yourself as the chief executive officer of the organisation?---That's very recently after the attempt of the management committee to see the organisation as IWHS giving support to NESH, which is non-English speaking background housing. I can't remember the exact date, but it's recent in maybe '14, '15. I could be wrong.

2014 did you say?---Could be '13, '14, '15. I cannot be precise. And to be honest I didn't go back to my emails and check.

Was there any difference in your mind in terms of being a manager and a CEO?---No. In reality I had been doing and growing and doing non-stop since I received this organisation as zero, and I made it what it is now or what it was when I left.

I showed you a curriculum vitae before the break?---Yes.

I'm going to show you another one that was located on your staff file at the Immigrant Women's Health Service. Do you first understand what I'm saying to you?---Of course.

Okay.---I have no control or never knew what's the staff file anyway. And by the way I never had a staff file for me.

10 Sorry. Ms Sharobeem?---Yeah.

Did you understand my question to you?---The one I answered, yes.

Yes. So I'm going to show you a document - - -?---Sure.

- - - that the Commission has located - - -?---Yes.

- - - in your staff file at the Immigrant Women's Health Service?
---Absolutely.

20

Page, volume 14, page 27 of the Allegation Brief. Do you agree that on the top right hand corner there is a date 4 December, 2006? Yes or no? Do you see it?---I saw it, yes.

Do you agree that your name appears on that document as Dr Eman Sharobeem? Do you agree with that?---Yes, yes, that's what's written.

30

Is there also written in your December 2006 CV that you had a PhD? Do you agree with that?---What's written in the paper it's what you see, sir.

Do you also agree that what is contained in that document is a reference to a thesis major in psychology and minor in community management?---Yes.

Do you agree that that appears on your CV?---Yes, it appears here on my screen.

Do you, do you accept you never wrote a thesis, Ms Sharobeem?---No. Not in that, no.

40 Did you write a thesis in psychology?---No. No.

Did you write a thesis in community management?---Yes.

Do you still have a copy of your thesis?---No. No.

You mentioned earlier in an answer to a question that the Commissioner asked you, that when you had this conversation with the professor at National Women's Council, all that was said to you was that you would be

receiving an honorary doctorate. Do you agree giving that evidence?---Of course, yes.

Do you agree saying to the Commissioner that you did not know what the doctorate was for?---I just said that - - -

Do you agree saying that to the Commissioner before the break?---I actually said what it was for. I actually said that to the Commissioner what it was for.

10

What did you say to the Commissioner before the break?---What they exactly said to me, that it's because of your work with women and girl psychology. And because of your work in the microfinance area and management. That's exactly what I said.

20

I suggest to you, Ms Sharobeem, that you did not refer to psychology in your answer to the Commissioner.---I think I did. I think I did. I'm, I'm sorry, I, I believe I did. You can go back to the record. It's available. But I believe I did because it's what I have known and they repeat it. So if it's dropped, it's not intention of course. And by the way, I don't know why this is in my file. I didn't even have a file in the organisation. This is fabricated. This is fabricated. This wasn't there. This was on my computer. This is some wishful play. I put myself and it's never submitted to the organisation. I don't know why this is in my personnel folder. And I didn't have a personnel folder. I begged Marie Abboud, the secretary of the organisation, to create the files and I didn't have one.

30

This document, Ms Sharobeem, would you agree suggests that you completed a PhD?---This is a wishful play on my computer.

So is it wrong that it suggests that you completed a PhD?---Absolutely.

Then why did you just say earlier in your evidence that you had done a thesis?---You asked me about the thesis in community and, yes, I did.

But it says there in that - - -?---But in psychology I said no.

40

Ms Sharobeem, it says there you have a PhD in community management.---I just say to you, sir, this was developed on my computer, a wishful play, never submitted anywhere.

So this is a false document is it?---If it's a document used it's a false document but this was mine. That was my wishful thinking to understand how to address the honorary degree. Never submitted. I don't know why it's here and definitely if it's found on that personnel folder it's fabricated against me.

THE COMMISSIONER: Are you saying that you actually did create this document?---On my own computer.

Okay.---On my own time.

Yes. Thank you.---And it's never left my computer, sir, by, by me of course. And by the way, I never - - -

10 MR RAJALINGAM: Well, just - - -.--- - - - submit anything on the top as brief CV.

Unless I ask you a question, Ms Sharobeem, would you just - - -.---I'm so sorry.

- - - please be quiet because - - -.---I'm just eager to bring the truth. I'm so sorry.

Well, you just - - -.---Please continue.

20 - - - sit there and answer the questions please.---Sorry. But of course if you are in my position you would understand why I'm frustrated. It's not fair to be a victim again.

Ms Sharobeem, the Commission has made inquiries - - -.---Yes.

- - - with the American University in Cairo.---Yes.

30 They have advised that you have not obtained any qualifications from the university and you had only commenced study in a diploma of management but did not complete it. That's the advice that we have from the university. Isn't that correct?---University of Technology, yes.

The American University.---The American University?

Yes. Well, just - - -.---I just said that it's an honorary degree. Oh, sorry.

What did you – what do you think you received at the American University, Ms Sharobeem?---An honorary degree.

40 Did you think you'd completed any education there?---No.

Had you done a thesis at the American University?---No.

Then why did you tell me you had done a thesis at – you had done any thesis?---Because you ask about the thesis. I responded. You asked about the thesis.

Where did you do the thesis?---In community development at UTS when we were doing the program I was doing here.

Are you suggesting to this Commission you did a thesis when you were studying for a degree at the University of Technology Sydney?---Not a degree, sir.

So what were you doing at UTS?---I was doing the diploma we were referring to before.

10

Are you suggesting that you were doing a thesis whilst you were doing a diploma?---We did many thesis of course. We were doing a lot of assignments, yes.

Did you receive a PhD from the University of Technology Sydney?---No. I received an honorary degree from the AUC. I don't want to confuse you but I'm trying to respond to each question.

Well, just – I think you have responded to the final question.---Sure.

20

I'll just ask for that CV to be put up again. Do you agree that you wrote this document?---For myself, yes.

Do you see there that it has a reference to a master's in community management from the American University?---For myself, yes.

Yeah, that's not right is it?---Yes, it's not right and I never used it.

30 You hadn't – Ms Sharobeem, you hadn't even completed your diploma in community management at the American University had you?---Yes, yes.

So you're agreeing with me?---Of course, sir, and I agreed with you in the first inquiry as well.

Did you also write in this CV that you had obtained a diploma in management community organisations from UTS?---If it's written here I didn't even see it but again this is all for myself. I didn't submit it anywhere.

40 But it's incorrect isn't it?---It is my own dreams.

So you would never submit a document to anyone with these qualifications on it. Is that what you're saying?---I can't recall. I can't recall. Seriously I can't recall. I never obtained employment because of this. It was my wishful thinking or in a matter of fact wishful thinking is wrong the expression. The expression is trying to understand how to phrase the honorary degree in simple terms.

How do you spell Ain Shams University?---Ain, A-i-n, Shams, S-h-a-m, Shams.

You agree it's misspelt in this document don't you, in the CV?---No. It's wrongly spelt here. It's - - -

That's what I said.---Yeah, I - - -

10 It's misspelt in this document isn't it?---Yeah.

It's spelt with an E isn't it in this document?---That's right. That's right.

Is it actually spelt with an A-i to begin with?---Yes, A-i-n, yes.

You wrote it in that way so that no one would find out, didn't you?---Of course not. Of course absolutely not.

20 It's a false statement about your qualifications, Ms Sharobeem. Do you agree with that?---No, I don't agree it's false statement because it's my own little thing on my own computer.

Ms Sharobeem, do you agree that it's false?---If you write anything to yourself, you don't classify it as false or true. It's for me. It's not for anyone else.

Is the reference in that document to you having completed a degree - - -?
---Of course I said, yes, it's not. I did not complete all those – this is created for me only.

30 So it's incorrect, isn't it?---Yes, of course it's incorrect.

I'll take you to another document that was located in your IWHS file and located by the Commission. It's at page 30 of volume 14?---Again I would like to state that I didn't have a file at IWHS.

Well, why don't you wait for the document to be shown to you, Ms Sharobeem?---Sure, sure.

40 Do you agree that the title of page 30, do you agree it's dated 15 June, 2007?---That's what's written on the top.

Pardon me, Commissioner.---That's not even my handwriting.

Sorry, page 36. What does Psy.D mean there? P-s-y, dot, capital D?---It's doctor in psychology.

And where does that come from?---Where does what?

Where does a doctorate in those words come from?---It was my trial to find out exactly what's honorary degree in.

You don't know where Psy.D comes from, do you?---Sorry, where it's coming from in what?

Do you know the differences are between the various ways in which you write a doctorate, PhD, Psy.D?---Of course I do.

10 What are the differences?---The PhD is doctor in philosophy and the Psy.D is doctor in psychology. That's during the time I was trying to identify what is my honorary is about.

Did you prepare this document?---No.

Do you see your name at the bottom of the left hand corner in the footer?
---No. And no.

20 Do you see it in the bottom left hand corner in the footer?---It is a footnote, yeah. But no, I didn't prepare this. And I never put the, the brief CV as like that.

I might come back to this document, Ms Sharobeem.---Sure.

Would you like to have a look at the rest of that document Ms Sharobeem?
---If you wish. I'm not sure. If you want to ask me - - -

I'll show it to you.---Sure.

30 Page 41. Sorry, page 36. Do you see the employment history list at the bottom of that page?---Employment history, yes, I do.

The next page, 37, do you see the list of professional organisations in that document?---Yes, I do.

And the publications and involvements in that document?---Yes, yes I do.

40 There's a reference to your work at the Granville Multicultural Centre, isn't there?---Yes, it is.

The next page is 38 to 39. They're all links to media articles about you, Ms Sharobeem?---About the work and the advocacy I've been doing.

Well, they're all, they all have references to you, don't they?---Because I'm the spokesperson of the organisation.

Ms Sharobeem, you put those references in this particular document, didn't you?---Yes. But not in this document. I always mention everything written about the organisation.

You wrote this document, didn't you, Ms Sharobeem?---At the first page, no, I didn't see that I did. I don't write in this way. But the content after, it reflects on my own words.

10 Did any of your family help you draft this document?---I didn't work from home at all. It's always working from the office and the office was home, really. To spend more than 12 hours in one place, yes, it's home for more than 12 years.

I'll show you a document, volume 14, page 41. Have you – did you see that document when you started work as a manager of Immigrant Women's Health Service?---Sir, I might have. I can't really recall. I'm sorry.

20 Perhaps we go to clause 7, page – do you agree that it reiterates what your role and function in the organisation's about?---Yes.

Throughout that document?---It's - - -

Do you agree with that?---Yes.

And when you became manager, you were well aware of your responsibilities with respect of funds, weren't you?---Yes.

30 And you're well aware of your responsibilities with respect to the expenses of the organisation, weren't you?---Yes.

When did you start going by Dr Eman Sharobeem?---It was when I started to talk about my – when I started to talk publicly about violence against women and forced marriage and female genital mutilation that it happened that I met one of the journalists. And as clever as they are, she was trying to - - -

40 When did you start referring to yourself as Dr Eman Sharobeem? The question is when.---Honestly, I'm trying to find the time. I'm trying to, to just tickle my mind a bit, and please help me because I am not well enough to be able to answer you spontaneously. And if you want the truth, please help me.

Ms Sharobeem, you say that you received this honorary doctorate - - -?---Yes.

- - - in about 2002 or 2003, is that right?---'02. '02.

So when did you start referring to yourself as Dr Eman Sharobeem?---In Egypt until now I am known as Dr Eman Sharobeem.

You always referred to yourself as Dr Eman Sharobeem, didn't you?---No, not, not, no.

Since coming back to Australia in 2003, you have referred to yourself as Dr Sharobeem, haven't you?---No, no. Since '03, no. I actually - - -

10 But when was it?---That's what I'm trying to remember, exactly when. And that's when I met the journal and I told her about that and she said to me, "You should be mentioned as Dr Sharobeem. Don't ignore that." So it might be around '06, '06, '07. 2006 or 2007 or '08. I can't really recall exactly.

Was it when you started at the service in 2004?---No.

20 Are you sure?---I can't remember. No, I'm not sure. But I can't remember that I submit anything or told management committee about it. I was afraid that they will feel I am overqualified. They already felt I'm overqualified and asked me to stay as much as I can. And I stayed for 12 years because of my passion.

So you say that because you thought the management committee would think that you were overqualified - - -?---Yes.

- - - you did not refer to your qualifications as a doctor?---Because - - -

30 Is that right? Is that right? Am I understanding you correctly?---That's, that's my feel at that time.

And you also – do you agree that you also didn't refer to your position as a CEO as well for that same reason?---No, I wasn't the CEO at that time.

Okay. Well, maybe – have I got that wrong, then?---What is it, sorry?

40 When did you start referring to yourself as CEO?---I just said when the organisation as IWHS tried to look into a new structure to help NESH. That's when. And maybe before a bit, yeah. But documents would do it, maybe refer more.

Well there's 38 volumes of documents, Ms Sharobeem, I'll take you to Volume 14 page 44.---That's fine. I just like also to tell you - - -

I'll take you to the document Ms Sharobeem.---You have all the documents, I don't so, you would have better memory.

Can you read that first?---Yes, it's there, that's - - -

Read the whole thing Ms Sharobeem.---Okay. I did.

You've read that.---Yes.

Do you agree that it's an email that you send from IWHS email to a Ms Laurence of the Calvary Chapel?---That's right.

What is the Calvary Chapel?---It's a church.

10

And what sort of things were they doing at the church apart from praying?
---All community activities.

Do you agree that the email is sent on 25 October, 2004?---Yes.

Do you agree that you sign off as Dr Eman Sharobeem?---Yes, it's written, yes, so obviously I had my title there, yes. I just said, sir, that I can't even remember and I didn't look at all this, I even can't remember this incident but yes, if it's in my signature then I was acknowledging my honorary degree.

20

As the service manager of the Immigrant Women's Health Service, you were from that time, weren't you, purporting to be a doctor?---Yes, it's written, yes.

That was false wasn't it, Ms Sharobeem?---No, it's true why false? If I have an honorary degree and if I was called before I arrived back to Australia as a doctor, why wouldn't I continue? Why it's false?

30 Just to be clear about this, this event at the National Women's Council, do you know which year it was in?---2002, roughly.

2002 or three?---I never mentioned three, I came back here 2003.

So was it late 2002 or early 2002?---I believe late because I started the Council 2001 so my assumption is at least it would take people in the community around me to know me and to acknowledge what I'd been doing at least a year.

40 What did you mean by Dr Eman Sharobeem?---To have an honorary degree or honorary PhD you have the right to call yourself a doctor.

What did you think - I withdraw that. What were you suggesting you were a doctor in?---I didn't suggest that I'm a doctor in anything at that stage and hence, I was a doctor trying to find a way - - -

So you're suggesting you are a doctor of thing?---Sir, I just said and maybe I didn't hear me, I'm sorry.

No, I'm not understanding what you're saying to me Ms Sharobeem. What did you think you were a doctor in?---At that time - - -

Ever in your life Ms Sharobeem?---The honorary degree indicate that I have being recognised because of the work I did with women and girls psychology and my good finance as well, management, that's what I have been working on in my life and advocating for in my life.

- 10 Did you ever use your qualifications as having a doctorate in any way - - -?
---I never claimed any financial thing, benefit, I never claimed any position because of it.

Did you use those qualification to obtain referrals of clients to the Immigrant Women's Health Service?---No sir, only the clients would refer to the service - - -

That's the answer, that's the answer.---Sure.

- 20 I'll show you Volume 14 page 45. Have you read that email Ms Sharobeem?---I am reading it now. Yes, I read the email.

Do you agree that it's an email from a domestic violence worker dated 29 October, 2004?---Yes.

It purports to attach a document about a client of hers. Do you agree with that?---Attach a document?

- 30 Do you see the attachments?---Yes, there is a PDF. You are right.

If we turn the page. Page 47. Who was Breda Dee, Ms Sharobeem?---It's written that DV project officer.

Do you remember? Do you remember her?---No.

You don't?---No, I don't.

- 40 Turn to page 47. Do you see the paragraph beginning with "Eman, thank you for your support in this matter"?---Yes.

Do you see that? Can you read out aloud what is after the comma?
---"Eman, thank you for your support in this matter. I have attached the 1-0-4-0 as discussed. I believe it would be very helpful if you could mention in your introduction that you are a trained psychologist as DIMIA view this very favourably. Thank you once again. Please let me know if you require any information." Yeah, I can read that.

Did you understand DIMIA to be a reference to the Department of Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs?---Yes, that was called at that time.

I'm going to show you another document, volume 14, page 48. Do you understand that this is a statutory declaration?---Yes.

10 Being made in the context or one that can be made in the context of a decision to allow a person to continue with their application for a visa?
---That's right.

Do you know what a competent person is - - -?---Yes.

- - - in relation to this particular document?---Meaning a person can sign the stat dec.

And what type of person can sign as a competent person?---Of course it's written here somewhere.

20 You know who it is, don't you, Ms Sharobeem?---Of course it is written here somewhere.

You know that a psychologist is a competent person for the purposes of this form, don't you?---I believe that's what referring to from the letter.

Do you know that?---I believe that's what referring to - - -

30 Do you know that?---Well, that's what's referring to. I'm, do you want me to say yes or no in something I am not sure of?

You're not sure about whether or not a psychologist is a competent person? Is that your evidence?---A psychologist is a competent person. I'm not sure what you're referring to.

Well, is that your answer? A psychologist is a competent person?---Yes, it is.

40 Did you understand – if we go back to that email. Just leave it there. Did you understand Ms Dee's request of you was essentially to provide a statutory declaration on behalf of a client, which we won't name?---That's right. That's right.

She was asking you, wasn't she?---That's what's written, yes.

She was asking you as a trained psychologist, wasn't she?---That's what she wrote.

She asked you that because you had given her the impression that you were a trained psychologist, hadn't you, Ms Sharobeem?---I don't think I did. I can't remember anything - - -

Were you registered as a psychologist at the time?---Never. Until now I'm not. I'm not registered as a psychologist. Neither or nor or before or after.

10 I'll show you another email between yourself and an officer of the Department of Education and Training dated 9 December, 2004, Volume 14 page 57.---Okay.

Please take your time to look at that document Ms Sharobeem.---Sure. Thank you.

Do you accept that it was - have you read it?---I am actually reading the article thing - - -

No, no, read the whole thing.---Okay.

20 Read the whole page.---I read to the end.

Do you remember this person Hien Le?---Yes.

How long had you known her prior to this email?---Years - when was the email, April 5, no that would be the beginning of the relationship because I was just there for a year.

Do you agree that you sign off Eman Sharobeem with a PhD?---That's right.

30 And you did that in April 2005?---Yes.

Who was Ms Hien Le?---She's a colleague from the Health Department but at that time she was working for (not transcribable) or something.

You wrote the top email didn't you, Ms Sharobeem?---It's obvious, yes.

You wrote your signature block in that way didn't you?---Yes.

40 There's no reference to Dr Sharobeem in this email but a different way in which you've spelt out your qualifications, would you agree?---Hence my confusion all the way and the different signature and the different CV, yes.

What were you confused about?---I'm trying to make sense of my honorary degree to be able to present myself right.

What were you doing to make sense of your honorary degree Ms Sharobeem?---Sir, are you charging me because of my own time, because of the time on my own computer working and trying to understand - - -

I'm ask you, I'm asking you what you did to clarify your own understanding of your honorary degree?---What did I do to understand? I tried to communicate, sorry, I tried to research until recently, I tried to communicate with them on several occasion to the extent to talking to Ministers from a Government where no one talks to them to try to get me my right from this organisation. I tried all my best, it's not my fault that there is an Arab Spring and the whole building is burnt out, it's not my fault that Mubarak is corrupt, I wouldn't be corrupt equal to him, I'm sorry, I'm so sorry, I'm so sorry. I'm usually a calm person but when, when all this happen to a victim it's not fair.

Ms Sharobeem did you also promote this qualification of you having a doctorate to officers of TAFE?---I do have an honorary degree, yes, maybe I did.

Did you suggest to officers of TAFE that you had a PhD?---I do, yes.

You accept that your signature block here in this email doesn't refer to an honorary PhD it refers to a PhD doesn't it?---Of course sir, because there is nothing to refer to as an honorary, if you have an honorary PhD you can refer to yourself as a doctor, this is the truth.

Could I show you Volume 14 page 59. Ms Sharobeem, unless I'm mistaking your evidence, have a look at, look at me?---Oh sorry, look at you.

Did you study any course in psychology?---No, a course at university?

Yes.---No.

Did you do any, did you complete any thesis in psychology?---No.

Well, have a look at this email, it's dated 30 May 2005 to an officer of TAFE.---That's exactly what I'm saying, that is wrong, what is that, sorry, just leave me read. Obviously there is a mistake here, I admit there is a mistake here. The only thing I can relate to from here is wrong is the Master in Community Management and I'm sorry, it's a mistake but the rest of the information is all true.

How is you having a PhD majoring in psychology and minoring in management true, Ms Sharobeem?---Yes. Because an honorary degree is exactly saying that because of your work with women and girls psychology and also the micro, the microfinance and management so in translating that in short sentence this is exactly it, the PhD, the major in psychology and minor in management and that again was a trial from me to explain what's the honorary degree about. It could be wrong and I'm sorry about that but that's exactly what happened and the only wrong in this, and I admit it was

a mistake, it's the master in community management. Definitely I was at that time trying and it's both and wrong to put it as master.

Do you remember why you were sending this email to an officer of TAFE?
---No, no, seriously, no. I don't know why it was requested from me in May, '05.

Do you see there a description of your career background in that email?
---Career background. Yes.

10

Do you accept that your work experience at the National Women's Council in Egypt isn't literally at least spelt out in that email?---Yes, it's not.

Because it never happened in the way in which you say it happened did it, Ms Sharobeem?---No, sir, it happened and I lived it equally to anything else I lived equally to the day I am here today and looking at you. And by the way, people alive can witness.

I don't want by the way. It's just questions and answers otherwise we'll be here - - -?---Yes.

- - - for weeks, Ms Sharobeem.---I do have enough witness - - -

So just please - - -.--- - - - of my work - - -

Okay.--- - - - at the National Council for two years and I can bring those witness whenever you want.

You're providing a bio essentially of yourself to an officer from TAFE aren't you in this email?---I don't know the purpose of this and there's definitely series of other emails about it and I admit that it was wrong for this.

30

Ms Sharobeem, that's not a social email is it?---Social email meaning what, what do you mean?

It's not an email about meeting with this officer from TAFE is it?---I never had any position at TAFE.

This is an email about you, Ms Sharobeem. Would you agree with that?
---Yes.

40

This is an email by you talking about yourself. Would you agree with that?
---That email show it like that but also, sir, there is something very weird. In May, '05, and I'm not referring to myself as a doctor and you have previous emails where I'm referring to myself as a doctor. Don't you see this is a bit weird as well. So why I'm not referring to myself as a doctor

here. Why it's not in my signature. There is definitely something not right about this.

You wrote there that you had a Bachelor of Commerce.---Yes.

Is that true?---Yes.

You accepted the master's degree is false?---Yes. I already said that. It was fault, it was a mistake.

10

I suggest to you that the PhD, the reference to the PhD is also false.---Why? If it's an honorary PhD you are allowed to write that you are a doctor, a PhD holder. Why it's wrong?

THE COMMISSIONER: Ms Sharobeem.---Sorry.

If someone said to you that they had a PhD with a major in psychology wouldn't you interpret that as being somebody who had earned a doctorate majoring in psychology?---Yes, sir.

20

And isn't that what somebody would interpret that as?---That's right, and my apology if it, if it was misleading.

MR RAJALINGAM: Thank you, Commissioner. Do you agree that from 2004 onwards you had misrepresented yourself as a doctor?---Yes.

In May of 2006 did you have some involvement with the Coptic Orthodox Church?---I always had.

30 You are a woman of faith, aren't you?---Yes.

Did you identify yourself to the Coptic Orthodox Church as a psychologist? ---Not in, not in particularly. That's also something else.

Are you sure about this? Because I'm going to show you another document, Ms Sharobeem.---I'm willing to accept all documents. As I said, sir, you have all my documents. I don't have it. But also in the Middle East in particular in Egypt - - -

40 I'm not, I'm not asking about the Middle East, I'm asking about your involvement with the Coptic Orthodox Church. You said yes. I'll ask you the next question.---Sure.

I'll show you volume 14, page 61. Do you agree that you are writing an email to Ms Iskander?---Yes, I can see that.

The email is dated 7 June, 2006. Do you agree?---It's yeah, written there.

You have written in the body of the email that you've attached minutes. Would you agree with that?---Yes, it's written.

You have written in the email that you have proof read those minutes. Do you agree with that?---It's written.

Shall I show you the minutes, Ms Sharobeem - - -?---Please do.

- - - that was attached to your email?---Yeah, sure.

10

Page 62. That's the first page with the minutes. Would you agree with that?---Yes, it appears.

Do you recognise these minutes?---Yes.

Yes or no, Ms Sharobeem?---Maybe. May I see the second page?

Do you, well, by looking at the first page can you tell who was present at the meeting?---Oh, it's here. Yes.

20

Who was present at the meeting?---The names mentioned.

Who are the names? Yeah, mention the names.---You want me to read it out? Okay.

Yes, read it out?---His Grace Bishop Daniel, Eman Sharobeem, Nagi Iskander, Richard Hanna, Seham Girgis, Soubhi Iskander.

Six people including yourself. Would you agree with that?---Yes.

30

One of those people is a bishop. Would you agree with that?---Yeah, yeah.

Did you introduce yourself as Dr Sharobeem at that meeting?---Yes.

Page – before you turn the page, when you introduced yourself as Dr Sharobeem, did you say anything about having completed any study in psychology?---No. I'm sitting among the church people. We don't brag and talk like that.

40

But you wouldn't have mentioned anything about having completed study in psychology to the bishop?---In May '06? I can't remember what I ate yesterday, sir.

Go to the next page. Can you read out the first box?---Discussion detail.

Yes.---Dr Sharobeem introduced herself to the - - -

Slowly, please.---Oh, sorry. Dr Sharobeem introduced herself to the committee, PhD in psychology, head of Immigrant Women's Health. In church engaged various activities with Bishop Moussa, bless, and in Sydney since '87 and putting political issues to young Copts as well as working with small ethnic groups with social needs.

Stop there if you like.---Sure.

10 You, did you prepare these minutes?---No.

Did you proof read them?---Yes.

When you proof read them did you – you must have seen that?---Yes, now I see it.

And you agree, you must have agreed with that description of yourself at the time didn't you?---The PhD in psychology?

20 Yeah?---That's the, the, the term I use because there is no other term in the Egyptian language about psychology.

You were not – were you speaking, speaking in Egypt at the meeting, Egyptian?---Yes. We were speaking Arabic.

You were speaking Arabic?---Yes. Of course you will speak Arabic, otherwise you will not get anything through.

30 Ms Sharobeem, these minutes aren't written in Arabic. You agree with that?---It is a translation. That's right.

Yeah. It's written in English.---That's right.

And you have proofread the minutes, haven't you?---It's written that I did, yes.

You were at this meeting - - -?---Yes.

40 - - - purporting to be a psychologist, weren't you?---No, it's not written that I'm reporting to be a psychologist.

You were, you were - - -?---I am PhD in psychology.

Ms Sharobeem, you were suggesting to the bishop that you were a trained psychologist at the meeting, weren't you?---No.

You don't remember that?---No, no. It didn't happen. I didn't say that I'm a trained psychologist.

Did you say to the bishop you had any qualifications in psychology?---I have a PhD, an honorary PhD. People know that. But I assumed that the person who wrote the minutes couldn't write all the details. And as you can see, it's only a summary of the minutes.

All right. Well, I'll take you – ask you this question. Do you recall a flyer being created in partnership with the Coptic Orthodox Church?---If you will show me, I'll recall it.

10 Well, do you recall the flyer?---No. But if you will show me, I'll tell you.

Do you recall doing any activities with the Coptic Orthodox Church?
---Always.

Do you recall purporting to be a psychologist at those activities?---No. No. It's known that Eman has a PhD. But, sir, there is nothing called psychology in our culture.

20 Okay. All right. No, no, no, no. I have not asked you a question, so if there's anything you would like to clarify - - -?---Yeah.

- - - as an afterthought, talk to your lawyer about it.---You don't want to hear the clarification?

I don't want to hear it. I'll show you volume 14 - - -?---So you're trying to accuse me without hearing my honest truth?

30 Well, what would you like to say, Ms Sharobeem?---I just would like to tell you, sir, that there is nothing, no translation of the word psychology in our culture, no even training for the word psychology in our culture. You are either a social worker or a psychiatrist. And that's why to say you are a psychologist in English, you need to give an interpretation. Hence in all my engagement with the Arabic community, which is 99 per cent of my work, it's referred to as (not transcribable) either a psychologist in the Australian term or a PhD. So it's always confusing and I didn't make that. But go back to the Arabic language, to the Egyptian culture, and you will not find a university graduating psychologist because we do not believe in it. That's in a nutshell. And I am trying to run to tell you what I mean.

40 I'll show you – if you're finished?---Thank you.

Volume 14, page 66. Do you recall receiving an email from Ms Iskander, and that was a lady who you sent the minutes to. Would you agree with that?---Soubhi is a man.

Soubhi is a man?---Yeah.

Mr Iskander?---Yeah.

You agree that you sent him the proofread minutes earlier?---Okay.

Do you agree that in this email he has sent you a flyer?---Yes, that's what's written.

And attached it to the email.---Sure.

You agree with that?---It's written.

10

I'll show you the flyer, the next page. Do you remember that flyer, Ms Sharobeem?---I'll try to read it. Yes, I do.

Can you read and speak English well?---Myself?

Yeah.---Yes, I do.

Okay. Well, do you see there that you are introduced in the flyer as a psychologist?---That's right.

20

And you are introduced as Dr Eman Sharobeem.---That's right.

Hyphen, psychologist.---That's right.

You had no training in psychology, did you?---That's right.

You had never received training to treat patients, had you?---I didn't treat patients, no. I saw clients and assist clients. And I did that for many, many years and saw thousands of people since 1988.

30

I'll show you another - - -?---And I didn't write that.

You didn't write this?---No, no. I didn't.

Were you at – do you recall attending the Archangel Michael & Saint Bishoy Church at Mt Druitt?---No.

You didn't go there?---No, no. That event didn't take place. They just created the flyer. But I apologised and I didn't go.

40

But you recall receiving the flyer from Mr Iskander, don't you?---And I don't think I attended the event.

Did you think that Mr Iskander had drafted this flyer?---Or the office, I can't even remember who is Mr Iskander to be honest but either himself of somebody in the office.

Do you accept that the only basis for him to think that you were or someone else from his office to think that you were a psychologist because of the meeting that you had on 6 May?---Yes, but see that's what I'm saying sir, if it's written PhD in psychology it's translated to psychologist because we don't have the meaning of translation, we don't have the word psychologist to be written in Arabic to people, it doesn't exist and I have lectures about that even given to people about the psychology of the women from the Middle East.

10 I'll show you another email Ms Sharobeem, Volume 14 page 71. Can you read that email first.---I am. Yes, I can read that.

Do you agree that it's an email that you sent on 14 December, 2006?---It's written here.

Do you agree that you identified yourself in the email as Dr Eman Sharobeem?---That's right.

20 Do you agree that the email was sent to three different parties?---To, yes.

Who were they?---A person from TAFE, person from Department of Education, person from South Western Sydney Area Health, and I can't remember what's this about.

There are in fact only two people but three email addresses, would you agree with that?---Yes, that's right.

One of those people is Ms Brenda Slade?---That's right.

30 And the other is Elizabeth Millen, would you agree?---That's right, yes.

How long had you known them prior to sending this email?---No I can't remember anything, sir, I can't remember even the persons themselves with this respect.

Do you agree that in that email you attach a document?---It's written down, yes.

40 What does it appear to be?---The CV, it's CV brief in 06.

Do you remember sending this email attaching a CV on 14 December, 2006?---No, it's very long ago, no I can't remember.

Do you remember sending your CV to workers from TAFE and The Health Department?---I even didn't, didn't work I mean, did not get employment with them, I don't know what the CV is about, it's not even mentioned in that email I don't know the purpose.

I will show you the next page.---Okay.

That was the document that was attached to the email Ms Sharobeem, do you agree that it's your name in the Curriculum Vitae?---Yes, it's my name and the educational background is not right.

You sent the email didn't you Ms Sharobeem?---I can't recall.

10 And you sent a CV with false qualifications didn't you?---I can't recall and I never been employed by them.

It's pretty obvious from the email Ms Sharobeem?---That you mean is as I saw and I can't really recall sending this and I've never been employed by TAFE and I never gained position with TAFE.

20 I'm not suggesting that you're asking for employment but for one reason or another you're sending your CV to an officer from TAFE, don't you agree with that?---I can't agree because I can't really relate. I have to accept what you're saying but I can't really agree.

Do you agree that this particular document that I'm showing contains the false qualifications we've referred to before, firstly, the PhD in psychology, you agree that that is false, you didn't complete one, you're referring to an honorary one?---Yes, of course it's wrong. That's
- - -

An executive - - -?---If it's written it would be in my computer.

30 Well, the executive diploma in management from the American University that never happened did it?---No.

The diploma in community management from the UTS you never completed that did you?---I didn't attend the exam. No. That, that shouldn't go out at all. This is as I said all was my trial on my computer. I never used for any purpose and I would be interested to see what's the outcome of this. I can't even recall.

I'll show you before the lunch break another document.---Sure.

40 If that's convenient, Commissioner. Volume 14, page 75. I want you to read that email first.---Yes, I can see now here the purpose is outreach teaching position which I never did. It never did. I never been an outreach worker.

Well, I'm not asking about that yet.---Yes. All right.

Not asking about that.---You asked me to read it.

I'm asking you – this is the question.---Sure.

If the investigator goes back to page 71. Do you see that again?---Yeah.

Now, go back to page 75. A month later in January of 2007 you are sending your CV to the same email addresses referred to - - -?---Why.

10 Ms Sharobeem, I'm asking a question. Let me finish. You are sending an email a month later to the same people I've taken you to in the last email in December attaching your CV.---Yeah.

You tell me why, Ms Sharobeem.---The honest truth and the exact truth I can't even recall and there is no logic of one month sending the CV and then a month after sending it again and saying sorry, it took me too long. There's no logic - - -

Go back - - -.--- - - - if it's the same people.

20 We'll go back to page 71.---Okay.

Do you see in the body of that email it refers to a full version?---Oh, right.

Now, we go to page 75.---Yes.

An email a month later you provide a briefer version of the full version. Do you agree with that?---Yes. It's – now it makes sense.

30 We'll go to the next page and the page after that.---It's the same thing. It's not even brief.

It's the same document you're attaching aren't you?---That's what appear here.

You intended to send, first to attach this document didn't you?---No, I can't even recall.

And it was your purpose in giving these people the impression that you were a trained psychologist wasn't it?---No, not at all.

40 Your purpose was to give these people an impression that you had a doctorate?---The impression is right, I had an honorary doctorate. But it doesn't make sense for a person to say this is the brief and you're giving me the same document, isn't it? Definitely there is something wrong here. Why shouldn't I say it's a brief when I'm sending the same document?

Commissioner, I, I'm still in – keep going, but perhaps it's a convenient time. There's another CV to show.

THE COMMISSIONER: Is it the same document as that second page attached to the earlier one?

MR RAJALINGAM: That's 73 and 77.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, it is.

MR RAJALINGAM: The next one? I think that's right.

10 THE COMMISSIONER: Mmm.

MR RAJALINGAM: It might be spaced a little bit more, but it's the same -
--

THE COMMISSIONER: The same document?---So why would I do that?

MR RAJALINGAM: I'm not asking you a question yet.---Well the logic would ask why a person would do that and call it a brief.

20 I'm content to proceed after lunch.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, we'll adjourn until 2 o'clock.

LUNCHEON ADJOURNMENT

[1.01pm]