

TARLOPUB00378
08/05/2017

TARLO
pp 00378-00408

PUBLIC
HEARING

COPYRIGHT

INDEPENDENT COMMISSION AGAINST CORRUPTION

THE HONOURABLE REGINALD BLANCH AM QC

PUBLIC HEARING

OPERATION TARLO

Reference: Operation E15/1982

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

AT SYDNEY

ON MONDAY 8 MAY, 2017

AT 10.25AM

Any person who publishes any part of this transcript in any way and to any person contrary to a Commission direction against publication commits an offence against section 112(2) of the Independent Commission Against Corruption Act 1988.

This transcript has been prepared in accordance with conventions used in the Supreme Court.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes Mr Rajalingam.

MR RAJALINGAM: I apologise for the delay, there was some issue in relation to the witness and a mix up. I'm in a position to call the first witness but before I do that can I ask The Commission go back to Friday afternoon, I asked for an order in relation to the publication of all material and I think one part of that was missed out. The order currently reads, publication material on the public website to be limited to The Statement Brief excluding the allegation and bank statement brief but if that could also include The Statement Brief and Exhibits separately tendered from and including Exhibit 17 so to allow publication of The Statement Brief and all Exhibits separately tendered including Exhibit 17 and onwards.

THE COMMISSIONER: Okay. Well, I'll amend the order to include, what is it?

MR RAJALINGAM: The Statement Brief and Exhibits - - -

THE COMMISSIONER: 17 onwards.

MR RAJALINGAM: 17 onwards.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you.

**PUBLICATION ORDER LIMITED TO THE STATEMENT BRIEF
AND ALL EXHIBITS SEPARATELY TENDERED INCLUDING
EXHIBIT 17 ONWARDS**

30

MR RAJALINGAM: Please Commissioner, I can call Reda Shehata.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you. Will you take an oath or an affirmation Ms Shehata?

MS SHEHATA: Oath on The Bible.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you.

40

<REDA MOOSAD SHEHATA, sworn [10.27am]

THE COMMISSIONER: Just take a seat there will you. I see you're not represented. It's unlikely that anything that you say today will have any repercussions so far as you're concerned but I can make an order that nothing that you say can be used against you in either civil or criminal proceedings so I will do that just to make it easier for you.

THE WITNESS: I didn't have chance to see a legal representative or anything.

10 THE COMMISSIONER: So pursuant to Section 38 of The Independent Commission against Corruption Act I declare that all answers given by this witness and all documents and things produced by the witness during the course of the evidence of the witness in the public inquiry are to be regarded as been given or produced on objection and there is no need for the witness to make objection in respect of any particular answer given or document or thing produced.

20 **SO PURSUANT TO SECTION 38 OF THE INDEPENDENT COMMISSION AGAINST CORRUPTION ACT I DECLARE THAT ALL ANSWERS GIVEN BY THIS WITNESS AND ALL DOCUMENTS AND THINGS PRODUCED BY THE WITNESS DURING THE COURSE OF THE EVIDENCE OF THE WITNESS IN THE PUBLIC INQUIRY ARE TO BE REGARDED AS BEEN GIVEN OR PRODUCED ON OBJECTION AND THERE IS NO NEED FOR THE WITNESS TO MAKE OBJECTION IN RESPECT OF ANY PARTICULAR ANSWER GIVEN OR DOCUMENT OR THING PRODUCED**

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you. Yes.

30 MR RAJALINGAM: Thank you Commissioner. Ma'am, may you state your full name for the record.---Reda Moosad Shehata.

Can I ask you to spell your name.---Reda R-e-d-a, Moosad M-o-o-s-a-d, Shehata S-h-e-a-t-a.

Are you in the printing business Ms Shehata?---Yes.

And are you in that business with your husband?---Yes.

What's your husband's name?---Safwat Sami Shehata.

40 And how do you spell his name?---S-a-f-w-a-t, Sami S-a-m-i, Shehata S-h-e-h-a-t-a.

And is it a partnership your business, between you and your husband? ---Yes.

Do you have any employees at your business?---No, we don't.

Is it the case that you run the business from home?---We used to run it from outside renting a shop but due to my husband health, we have to shut the shop and run from home.

When was the shop open, what years?---More than fifteen years.

So fifteen years ago?---Fifteen years ago, more than we started.

10 When did it shut?---Could be seven or eight years ago.

Have you known Ms Sharobeem for about ten or so years?---Yes.

Where did you first meet her?---We met her through a friend and community and church.

After you met her, how often would you see Ms Sharobeem?---It depends, sometimes a month, two months, it depends, yes.

20 So it was a on and off meeting that you would have with Ms Sharobeem at various places, is that - - -?---Yes.

And would you see her at church?---Yeah.

Where else would you see her?---Family gathering, yeah.

Did you also know her family as well, Richard, her son?---Yes.

What about Charlie? Did you know him as well?---Yeah.

30 And her partner, Haiman Hammo?---Yeah.

Okay. Sometime after you first met Ms Sharobeem, did she ask you to do some printing work for her?---After we saw her?

After you met Ms Sharobeem - - -?---After - - -

- - - some years later, did she ask you to do some printing work?---No. As far as I remember, no.

40 You don't recall Ms Sharobeem asking you to do some printing work for the Immigrant Women's Health Service?---I can't remember. We done the - - -

Do you remember doing any work for the Immigrant Women's Health Service?---I remember we done for NESH.

NESH?---Yeah.

But do you remember having a conversation with Ms Sharobeem about that work?---About the printing?

Yes.---About NESH? Yeah.

Okay. So I'm asking you if Ms Sharobeem asked you to do some printing work for NESH, is it?---For NESH, yeah.

10 So you understood that it was not for IWHS. Is that right?---I think so, yeah.

In the middle of 2014 - - -?---Yeah.

- - - do you recall Ms Sharobeem asking you to do work, printing work for NESH?---Yeah.

Was she asking you to do printing work in relation to some booklets?---Yes.

20 Do you know if they were titled "leadership" booklets, roughly?---Yes.

Do you remember initially providing her a quote for about \$7,000 because you didn't know the full extent of the job?---Yes.

What did she – can you remember what she asked you to do initially at that stage when you provided that quote?---I think it was three booklets need to be printed. But we didn't know how many booklets, like, the quantity, how many pages in the booklet, so that adding to the cost. So we give her roughly estimate of 7,000.

30 And can you describe to the Commission the process involved in printing a booklet, making and printing it?---Usually you provide the information, type it in, or if she provide the typed thing we need to do, like, adjustment to build it up. Like, there is artwork in the process. And then she check that and we do some changes until we come to the final printing process.

When you first spoke to Ms Sharobeem and you provided her that quote for 7,000, was it the case that not much work happened until a lot later in that year?---Yes.

40 And later in that year do you recall giving her some fresh invoices to actually pay?---Yes.

I see. I'll show you some invoices. Firstly I'll show you the booklet. ---Yeah.

Which should be, pardon me, volume 2 of the brief statements at page 190. Is that the booklet that you made for Ms Sharobeem?---Yeah.

And did you make it on the computer?---Yes.

And then how did you print it? Did you print it after you made it on the computer?---Yeah, we sent it to the printer.

Ah hmm.---Print it, yeah.

So your company didn't print it itself?---We didn't print.

10 You sent it to another - - -?---Because we didn't have the machine at the moment, so we do the artwork and collating and stuff like that. And, yeah, we provide it to the customer.

You don't need to look at the rest of that booklet? You're fairly confident that's the one?---Yeah. Yeah, of course. Yeah, that's what we did.

Okay. I'll take you to the first invoice, dated 2 December, 2014.---Yeah.

20 Pardon me, Commissioner. Volume 17, page 294. Can you skip that? Keep going, keep going. Keep, yeah, that's the one. Ms Shehata, do you recognise that invoice?---Yes.

Did you create it, did you draft the invoice?---Yes.

And do you recall that being the first invoice in relation to the booklet that I showed you?---Yes.

Do you know if that invoice related to the printing of 100 booklets?---Yes.

30 And is that indicated on the left-hand column?---Yes.

You know that you were paid for that invoice don't you?---Yes.

And how do you know that?---By the bank statement.

And do you also know that because you've signed it?---Usually I sign it and give it to the customer and then when they pay I write a note for myself it's paid, transferred money or something.

40 Ms Shehata, the Commission has the evidence that these transfers have been paid to your account. Are you also confident that this amount was paid? ---Yes.

Yes. Okay.---Yes.

I'll show you, if you go back two pages. Do you see that invoice for – Ms Shehata this is another invoice is it?---Yeah.

And this is also an invoice for the leadership booklets?---Yes.

This time the quantity is 400.---Yeah.

Why is the price only marginally higher than the last invoice which was for 100 booklets?---The 100 booklets was printed digitally, like digital. It's like a photocopy and it's quick to produce. This one is a printing with a normal printing, making a plate and - - -

10 Is digital printing faster but more expensive, is that - - -?---Yes.

I'll ask you to go back. Okay. Ms Shehata, do you see this invoice?---Yes, for 1,000 booklet.

Would you agree – I'm going to show you a document.---Yeah.

This is not on the electronic brief as I understand it.---Yeah.

20 Ms Shehata, is that the booklet that relates to this particular invoice?---Yes.

Was it a bit smaller than what I've shown you?---Oh, yeah.

Can you show – was it 148 millimetres by 148?---Something like that.

Okay. It's described in the invoice as 148 by 148.---Yeah.

Was that the size?---The size, yeah.

30 Okay. So it's a square booklet?---Yeah.

And did you make 1,000 of those?---Yes.

And do you know if that invoice was paid?---Yes.

All right. I'll ask you to turn to page 4. Do you know if this invoice later in June 2015, so the invoice I just showed you was for the 5th June, this invoice some weeks later in the same month, was this invoice in relation to the same booklet?---Yes.

40 Was there any difference to the booklet in June 2015?---It was some changes, yes, in the booklet.

And who made those changes?---Eman.

How did she make those changes?---She asked me to make.

How would she ask you, by email or phone, do you know now, it doesn't - - -?---It could be by email she sent me some changes.

By 2014 you would have known Ms Sharobeem quite well, would you agree?---Yes.

You knew her as a Dr Sharobeem, didn't you?---Yes.

You thought she was a psychologist?---Yes.

10 Did you also think she was a psychologist practising from the Immigrant Women's Health Service?---Yes.

You knew that she had a lot of involvement at that service, didn't you? ---Yes.

And that she was the CEO of that service?---Yes.

20 And you're preparing these booklets you could see that they were for the Immigrant Women's Health Service wouldn't you, when you were making them, is that a yes?---Yes.

I'm not trying to point the finger at you in anyway Ms Shehata but I just want you to know, and the purpose of this whole thing is to get information so that we can investigate. Can you tell The Commission why they're addressed to NESH these invoices?---I think, I ask her about the invoice and that's what she said as far as I remember.

I'd ask you to try and be, give as much detail as possible, was it in a phone call or an email that she asked you to address them NESH?---May be - - -

30 Or did she do it in person?---May be a phone call, I can't recall that.

But do you at least recall her giving you those instructions to address those invoice to NESH?---Yes.

Would you agree that you would not have done that on your own accord? ---Yes.

So you wouldn't have done it?---No.

40 And you would only have put NESH on this invoice if you were asked to do so by the person who's asked for the services, correct?---Yes.

And that was Ms Sharobeem, correct?---Yes.

Did you and I think your husband's name I think you said was Safwat?---Yes.

Did you and your husband volunteer at NESH for some time?---Yes.

And I think, did you volunteer at the Guilford office?---Yes.

Can you describe the Guildford office just in terms of what it looked like?
---It's - - -

How many rooms, first of all?---It's a shop and one, two, three and then a big hall.

10 What's three?---Three bedrooms as far as I remember, one, two three and a big hall with a kitchen area, kitchen.

Do you know if it in your mentoring booklet there was a picture of the Guilford Centre?---Yes, where we meet in the - - -

There was a picture, wasn't there, inside the booklet?---In the hall, yes.

20 Can I show you Brief Volume, Brief Volume Statements Volume 2 page 192. Just looking at the top left hand corner, do you recognise that as the room at Guilford?---That's the hall, yes.

The hall.---Yes.

Are all of those pictures of the hall?---Yes.

The person standing up in the bottom left hand corner, sorry the bottom right hand corner Ms Shehata.---Yes.

30 Do you recognise that person?---This is Mark Geerin.

You knew him as Mark?---Mark.

Did you know his last name as well?---Geerin, I can't may be pronounce it.

Do you know where he was from?---He's from the TAFE.

Did you know his name is Mark Geerin?---Geerin, yeah.

40 Did you assist these groups?---Yes.

Did they take place on a Tuesday afternoon?---Yes.

What time on Tuesday?---Around 6.00.

And did you first start assisting with this program in about May, 2014?
---Yes.

And did you assist in the program by buying food and helping with the cooking?---Yeah.

Did you also do some interpreting?---Yes.

What was the group about, what did they do in the group?---Just we done various like topics, volunteering, mentoring and leadership and how your good – the good communication, like communication skills and how you apply for a job, finding jobs and settling in the country.

10

Was there anyone in the group that was teaching how to do hairdressing?---No.

Was there anyone in the group teaching how to make jewellery?---No.

Was Mr Geerin, did it look like he was in charge of the group?---He was the, he was the lecturer, yeah.

20 And was he the lecturer for the entire time that you were helping with the group?---Yes.

I understand that you helped for about one year. Is that right?---Yeah, 10 months.

From about May, 2014 to March, 2014 [sic]?---Yeah, 10 months roughly, yeah.

30 Over that time how many people attended the group roughly per week?---Roughly between 15 to 25/30, around that number on and off.

Was it only held once a week?---Yes.

How do you know that?---Because that's what I was involved with.

And you were involved in it for one year, weren't you?---Yeah.

The people that came to these groups, did you see them often, were they the same people that came to the group?---Most of the time, yeah.

40 How many new faces did you see over the year that you were there?---New faces. What do you mean by new faces?

Well, new, new people that came to the group. Over the year from May, 2014 you saw some regular faces.---Yeah.

But then after that did you see any new faces or people that weren't in the group before?---I think it's the same people, like it's around 15 to 30,

between that number on and off, yeah, but it's the same people. Some don't – they might come twice or three times, yeah.

Were you paid for your time assisting with this group?---No.

So I think – did you do anything apart from cooking and interpreting?---And transporting the people, bringing the people, yeah.

10 How would you transport the people?---We got two cars so my husband - - -

When you say you, you and your husband personally have two cars. Is that what you're saying?---Yeah.

Okay.---Yeah.

Keep going.---So he was driving the car, I'm driving the car so, yeah, he picking some people and I pick some people.

20 And what language were you interpreting?---From English to Arabic.

Did you do that type of work for IWHS or NESH on any other day?---No.

Had you done it on any other occasion for IWHS or NESH, interpreting? ---No.

It was only on the Tuesday evening wasn't it?---Yes.

30 You said you did some cooking. First of all I want to know what did you cook on the evening on the Tuesday?---Usually I prepare some food, chicken and pasta and sandwiches, whatever easy for me on the day to do.

And where did you purchase – where did you get the food from to cook?---I purchase it from the stores, whether Woolies, ALDI or whatever next to me.

Were they the local stores around Guildford?---No, around my home.

Oh, where's that?---Punchbowl.

40 Oh, yeah, yeah.---Yeah, Punchbowl or if I'm somewhere else I buy it from the nearest shop and then I prepare it.

And how much would you spend per group on food per day?---It depends. Sometimes 60, sometimes a bit less, a bit more.

Was a budget set for the amount you could spend on food?---Roughly, yeah, around that - - -

Around what?---Around that mark, whether 80, 60, depends.

And who set the budget?---Yeah, Eman.

Did you ever ask her for more? To be able to use more money?---I try to budget as the budget I have at the moment.

So you never asked her if you could spend more?---Not really. Yeah.

10 Well, I'm going to show you some receipts. NESH allegation volume 19, page 188. And what I'll do, Ms Shehata, is I'll give you a calendar as well.

That's a clean copy of the 2014 and 2015 calendar. The 2015 calendar is on the top.---Yeah.

Ms Shehata, whenever you purchased food - - -?---Yeah.

- - - for these groups, is it your recollection that you always sought reimbursement for what you purchased?---What do you mean by that?

20 So whenever you purchased food for Guildford - - -?---Yeah.

- - - did you always seek reimbursement from Ms Sharobeem?---Yes. But not all in the same day, like - - -

Yes.---Yeah, I do the what they were spending and then, yeah.

So whatever you spent for these groups, for as long as you've been involved in them, you have been reimbursed the money?---Yes, yeah.

30 I see. If I asked you to look at the first page, 188, you'll see that it is for 31 March.---Yeah.

The receipt. And can you tell the Commission what day 31 March is? ---Tuesday.

Yeah. And the next page. You'll see that they are receipts for 24 March and 31 March. Do you agree that they are both Tuesdays?---Yes.

40 And if we continue you'll see receipts for 3 March and 17 March. You agree that they are Tuesdays?---Yes.

The next page. There you'll see receipts of 24 February.---Yes.

And 24 February again. And do you agree that that's Tuesday?---Yes.

And the next page. You see that it's a date of 10 February for that receipt and 17 February for the receipt next to it?---Yeah, Tuesday.

And that's the 17th. If we can just go back to the page before. Now the page ahead. Forward, sorry, yeah. Ms Shehata, just by looking at what you've purchased on 17 February, for example, can you tell the Commission what you would have cooked using what you purchased?---Which one? 17th? Yeah, the way, yeah, when you pointed, I made sandwiches.

Yeah.---Cheese and toast and tomato, and have a drink with it.

10 Next page. That's an invoice for 25 November, 2014 and 2 December, 2014. Do you agree that they are both Tuesdays?---25th sandwich day. The other day.

Do you agree with that? Both Tuesdays?---Yes.

And I think you were making sandwiches on this particular day as well? ---Yeah, could be.

Fair to say?---Yeah.

20 On 25 November, at least.---Yes, one of them pizza, one of them sandwiches.

Now the receipt for the 2 December looks like a purchase for some frozen pizzas?---Yes.

Was that something that would be given to the attendees of the group?---It's frozen and then I cook it like, I put in the oven and bring it cooked.

30 Next page. So they are receipts for 21 October, 28 October, do you agree that they are both Tuesdays?---Yes.

Next page. That's a receipt for 7 October and I think that's 14 October. ---Yes.

They are Tuesdays?---Yes.

Sometimes you only spent less than \$20?---Yes, depends whatever easy for me and some of the other days may be spend a bit more, I don't know.

40 There's only a couple more, Ms Shehata, so I'm going to take you through all of the receipts just so that we were sure that they were all Tuesdays.--- That's fine.

196. 16 September, 2016, do you agree that that was a Tuesday?---Yes.

And there was another receipt also for 16 September.---Yes.

You bought rice, brown onion, some nutmeg and some spice.---Yes, maybe I made rice, fried rice or something.

Next page.---Yes.

Linda's Discount Warehouse is that for - - -?---That's like if the food need container, I buy the containers so it's easy to carry.

And that's on 9 September, do you agree?---Yes.

10

There is also invoices for 2 September and there's another invoice for 9 September.---Yes.

Are you making chicken sandwiches on 9 September, 2014?---Yes.

Next page. 25 August, do you agree that that's a Tuesday, 26 rather?---Yes.

20

And on, there's another invoice for 2 September. Do you recall making sandwiches often for the program?---Yes, it depends what's easy on the day because, yes, I have commitment in the morning and then I do the food, whatever easy I take it to the group.

Were you working on the same days in another job?---I had other commitment, I had The Bible study in the morning, so.

Just to the next page see that's the invoice for 12 August, that's a Tuesday isn't it?---Yes.

30

And you bought some falafels.---Yes.

And was that just to serve to the - - -?---That's a ready-made one and served to the group, yes.

There's an invoice for petrol on the other side on the right hand side.---Yes.

And that was for 26 August. Did you always claim for petrol?---From time to time, not all weeks.

40

And would you only claim for petrol after you thought you'd spent a whole tank on the service?---Yes, yes.

And the next page. Invoice for 5 August, I believe that's a Tuesday.---Yes.

There's two invoices for 5 August and also 12 August, do you agree with that?---Yes.

Both Tuesdays.---Yes.

Next page. Do you agree that these are invoices for 22 July, that's a Tuesday isn't it?---Yes.

15 July is a Tuesday, isn't it?---Yes.

And were you making fried rice on 22 July or what is that, can you tell by looking at the receipt, tomato paste, rice, the one on the right from Aldi?
---From Aldi.

10 Canola oil.---Yes I got something like Arabic food, it's rice and lentil and yes.

Do you know if any meat was served with that, with the rice, or was it just like a small snack for the attendees?---It's a lentil, could be a lentil, yeah, another invoice from other, yeah.

Okay. Next page.---Could be fried rice or lentil. I don't know. I'm not sure, yeah.

20 17 June. Is that a Tuesday?---17th. Yes.

And you've bought some bread?---Bread, yeah.

15th of July is also a Tuesday, do you agree?---Yeah.

And the other receipts, you can't read them so I'll go to the next page.
---Okay.

30 10 June. That's a Tuesday, isn't it?---Yes.

And you've bought a container from a Home store. Do you remember that?
---Yes, yeah.

There's an invoice for 17 June. Do you agree?---17 June, yeah.

You bought Lebanese cucumbers and some tuna. What were you making?
---Sandwiches as well.

40 Okay. Next page. An invoice for 3 June. Do you see that?---3 June, yeah.

That was for some printing work at Officeworks. Do you recall what you were doing?---It was like for photos for the group.

And the invoice next to it is for 10 June. Do you agree that that's Tuesday?
---Yes.

And you bought some drinks and potatoes.---Yeah.

Next page. Invoices there are dated 3 June. Do you agree with that?---Yes.

Do you agree that that's a Tuesday?---Yes.

They're both a Tuesday. What do you think you were making on 3 June?

---It was sandwiches as well.

Were they salmon sandwiches?---Yeah. The tin one and eggs and - - -

10 And some eggs?---Yeah.

Next page. See that that's an invoice on 20 May.---Yeah.

27 May.---Yeah.

Do you agree that they are both Tuesdays?---Yes.

You bought a folding chair from Officeworks.---Yeah.

20 What was that for? Six of them.---That's for the centre to use it.

Do you know if – how many chairs did the centre have before you bought these ones?---We didn't have much in the centre so we bought some chairs, yeah.

Can you remember what you had in the centre, what you could see in the centre?---How many chairs and stuff?

30 How many chairs roughly?---I can't remember, yeah.

Were they good quality – were they good - - -?---But it wasn't enough.

Sorry?---It wasn't enough for the group.

Ah hmm.---So we bought some more.

Were they good quality chairs, did you see? The ones they had?---The ones they had. Reasonable, yeah.

40 What were they made of? Were they plastic, leather?---Can't remember.

Were they leather chairs?---I can't remember.

All right.---To tell you the truth. Sorry.

We'll go to the next page. That's fine, Ms Shehata. That's an invoice for 27 May. You agree that that's a Tuesday?---Tuesday, yeah.

And also the one on the right-hand side is for 27 May. Do you agree?
---Yeah.

Next page. These invoices are for 13 May. Do you agree with that?---Yes.

And 20 May.---And the what?

20 May.---20th, yeah, yeah.

10 Do you agree that they are both Tuesdays?---Yeah.

Next page. That's an invoice dated 12 May again. Sorry. 12 May. Do you agree that that's a Monday?---Monday, yes. We - - -

And was it - - -?--- - - - bought the stuff to prepare it for Tuesday.

Now, there's - I'm not sure that there are any other receipts apart from that, Ms Shehata. Do you know if in May, 20 May or 12 May, was that around about the time you started doing this type of work?---Yeah.

20

Do you know what you cooked on the first day that you worked?---This was, I think, the launch so we had a barbecue or something like that. Yeah.

And you spent about \$150 odd dollars?---Yes.

That was the most you'd ever spent buying food for this group, wasn't it?
---Yes.

30 Do you know if anyone else was buying food and being reimbursed for this particular group on Tuesday afternoons?---I don't know.

Did you see anyone else serving food?---No, no, it's on Tuesday afternoon?
No, I'm the one - - -

Who was serving food?---I am the one who's, yes.

Ms Shehata you knew, you thought that Ms Sharobeem was a psychologist?
---Yes.

40 You thought she was a doctor?---Yes.

I know that there was someone close to you who might have had some contact with her?---Yes.

I'm going to ask you some questions about that but I don't want to refer to that person's specific details.---Yes.

Are you aware of someone that was seeing Ms Sharobeem as a psychologist?---Yes.

For how long was that person seeing Ms Sharobeem as a psychologist?---I can't remember how long but I can say it's over.

Do you know if it was in the order of years or months that this person was Ms Sharobeem as a psychologist?---May be couple of months.

10

And from time to time, would government agencies - I withdraw that. Do you know if when this person was seeing Ms Sharobeem that they, that Ms Sharobeem was that persons treating psychologist?---She was seeing him as a psychologist.

Do you know how often - - -?---He was seeing her as a psychologist.

Do you know how often?---Could be once a week.

20 Do you know when in the week?---It depends, I'm not sure, I can't remember the days but I remember dropping him.

That's the evidence Commissioner.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you. Mr Chhabra?

MR CHHABRA: Ma'am, just a question regarding the last part of your evidence that you were aware, you say, of Ms Sharobeem seeing somebody as a psychologist?---Yes.

30

To the best of your knowledge, was she paid to see that person in whatever capacity?---I'm not sure, we didn't pay anything.

Nothing further.

THE COMMISSIONER: Anything?

MR RAJALINGAM: No, Commissioner.

40 THE COMMISSIONER: There's no reason why Ms Shehata can't be excused?

MR RAJALINGAM: No.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you for coming in, Ms Shehata.---You're welcome.

You're excused if you'd like to leave.

THE WITNESS EXCUSED

[11.08AM]

MR RAJALINGAM: Commissioner, Ms Shehata has provided a statement to The Commission, I was hoping to tender that at this point.

THE COMMISSIONER: Any objections?

10

MR RAJALINGAM: I've got two copies, I'll have more.

THE COMMISSIONER: Exhibit 25 I think.

**#EXHIBIT 25 - STATEMENT OF REDA MOOSAD SHEHATA
DATED 8 MAY 2017**

20 MR RAJALINGAM: There is also another document which has been heavily redacted which my, which I hope to tender as well. I've got two copies of that and I'll provide a copy to Mr Chhabra.

THE COMMISSIONER: Exhibit 26.

**#EXHIBIT 26 - DCS RECORDS RELATING TO EMAN
SHAROBEEM AS TREATING PSYCHOLOGIST**

30

MR RAJALINGAM: I understand there's still a complication with the other witness, the other witness name is Ms Houda Moukhaiber. My instructing solicitor has made some inquiries in relation to where she might be, we're hoping she'll be here soon.

THE COMMISSIONER: We'll take the morning tea adjournment.

MR RAJALINGAM: Thank you Commissioner.

40

SHORT ADJOURNMENT

[11.09AM]

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, Mr Rajalingam.

MR RAJALINGAM: Commissioner, I call Ms Houda Moukhaiber.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you. Ms Moukhaiber, will you take an oath or an affirmation?

MS MOUKHAIBER: I will take an oath.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you.

MS MOUKHAIBER: On the Bible, please.

THE COMMISSIONER: Just take a seat there. There's probably no risk that anything that you say today will cause you any problem in relation to civil or criminal matters, but I'll make an order to protect you just to make it more comfortable for you.---Thank you.

10 So pursuant to section 38 of the Independent Commission Against Corruption Act, I declare that all answers given by this witness and all documents and things produced by this witness during the course of the witness's evidence at this public inquiry are to be regarded as having been given or produced on objection and there is no need for the witness to make objection in respect of any particular answer given or document or thing produced.

20 **PURSUANT TO SECTION 38 OF THE INDEPENDENT COMMISSION AGAINST CORRUPTION ACT, I DECLARE THAT ALL ANSWERS GIVEN BY THIS WITNESS AND ALL DOCUMENTS AND THINGS PRODUCED BY THIS WITNESS DURING THE COURSE OF THE WITNESS'S EVIDENCE AT THIS PUBLIC INQUIRY ARE TO BE REGARDED AS HAVING BEEN GIVEN OR PRODUCED ON OBJECTION AND THERE IS NO NEED FOR THE WITNESS TO MAKE OBJECTION IN RESPECT OF ANY PARTICULAR ANSWER GIVEN OR DOCUMENT OR THING PRODUCED.**

30 THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you. Yes, Mr Rajalingam.

MR RAJALINGAM: Thank you, Commissioner. May you state your full name for the record?---Houda Moukhaiber.

And how do you spell your full name?---First name H-o-u-d-a. Surname is M-o-u-k-h-a-i-b-e-r.

Are you currently the director of a child care centre?---That's right.

40 Have you been in that position since 2016?---Since July 2016, beginning of July, yes.

And what were you doing before that?---I, I was no, like, I, I had worked before. I wasn't working but, yeah, I didn't have any paid work, if you want to say that.

Do you have a diploma in children's service?---That's right, yes, I do.

Where did you get that diploma?---I got it from, through TAFE because, yeah, I got it through TAFE.

Okay. Do you know Ms Sharobeem?---Yes, I do.

And how long have you known her?---I believe more than 10 years. Maybe more as well, but - - -

10 How did you meet her?---She was introduced to me by one of our friends.

Where were you when you met her? Do you know?---I think at Hungry Jack's.

All right. Would you see her often after you met?---At that time, no, no.

Did you become friends with Ms Sharobeem?---Yes, we did become friends.

20 And how often would you see her?---I can say once a week sometime and sometime once a month. It depends on when she comes to church.

Would you usually meet her at church?---Yeah, usually.

And when did you go to church? On Sundays?---Yeah. But she, yeah.

Do you know if you met her before 2013, for example?---Yeah, I - - -

I think you said 10 years ago.---No, I, I did 10 years ago, yeah.

30 Okay.---Maybe more than 10 years.

Yes, you said more than 10 years ago.---Yeah.

Somewhere between 2013 and 2016 - - -?---Yes.

- - - did Ms Sharobeem offer you work with NESH?---Not work. She offered me to be a member of the committee, board committee for NESH but wasn't a paid.

40 How did that conversation with Ms Sharobeem come about that you were offered - - -?---By phone.

Do you know what she said to you on the phone?---She did mention that she needed somebody in the committee because first she – like she – because I do have communication skills and things like that so she wants that, that person to have these communication skills plus that she couldn't be in the committee anymore because of IWHS something like that so she needed somebody, an extra person to be on, on the board as a member.

Were you elected to become a board member or did Ms Sharobeem simply ask you to attend one of the meetings?---I can't remember to be honest. I – all what I remember that she asked me over the phone and I said to her I don't know anything about this so - - -

How soon after that phone conversation did you attend a board meeting?
---I'm not exactly sure about dates, I'm so sorry.

10 You said – that's all right. You said you had some communication skills. Did you have any training to be a board member specifically?---No. When she asked me, no, but I did have training after.

Yeah. I'll just – we'll talk about that time first.---Yeah.

And I'll ask you questions about later. Did Ms Sharobeem at that time when she offered you to be a board member offer you any training?---No.

20 When you – when Ms Sharobeem talked to you about being a board member did you – were you someone that had a knowledge of money matters, finances?---No.

Were you – did you have any financial background?---No, I didn't but I was a director of another childcare before three years so - - -

And how long were you a director of that childcare centre?---I had – I was from around 2002-2013 and - - -

30 Did you have any other experience apart from that?---I work before in Centrelink.

And how long did you work at Centrelink?---Around 18 years.

Did you – when you were asked to become a board member did you have any idea what sort of skills you would need to become a board member?
---No.

Or to be a board member?---No.

40 Did you tell Ms Sharobeem when she asked you about being a board member that you didn't have much experience in housing - - -?---Yes, I did.

- - - for NESH?---Yes, I did.

Did you tell her about your lack of inexperience of being a board member when you had a conversation with Ms Sharobeem?---I don't think I put it as a board member but I did mention that I don't have any experience in that field in the - - -

And - - -?---Like I don't know, I don't know what do to. Like she asked me but I don't know what to do.

Was it your understanding that you would attend the board meetings with a view to try and help the organisation?---That's right.

10 And did you have anything in your own mind in terms of how you would help NESH when you first went?---When I first went I didn't have any idea so – but after I, I sat in the first meeting this is when I started to see that we need some sort of help in policy and things like that.

Do you know when you attended your first meeting?---I don't, I don't, I'm sorry, I can't remember dates so - - -

20 Do you know where the meetings were held?---The meetings were held in, in NESH in Guildford. There might be a meeting in, in Fairfield. I, like I really – I can't remember properly but might be maybe one in Fairfield but the rest they were in NESH.

Do you remember what they were talking about at your first meeting?
---Exactly, no.

Roughly do you know the topics they were talking about?---There were some, there were some discussion about the, the financial, the financial year papers. They were talking some numbers but - - -

30 Do you think this might have been towards the end of 2014 when you first went to a board meeting?---It might be, no, it might be '15 I can't remember but because, I can't remember properly, exactly dates.

How many meetings do you think you attended at Guildford?---May be three to four, I'm not really - - -

What about at Fairfield?---Fairfield may be, I think it's only one.

Did Ms Sharobeem attend the meetings that you went to?---I think there was only one, the one in Fairfield.

40 Do you know when that meeting in Fairfield was, was it - - -?---It was afternoon.

- - - the beginning or towards the end of your time as a board member?
---No, I believe at the beginning.

Just generally speaking, at the board meetings, were minutes taken?---Yes.

And who took the minutes?---I think the secretary Nada, Nada.

Did you ever take minutes?---I did take only once.

Was that at the beginning of your time as a board member or towards the end?---I think beginning as well because I was like, I didn't know what to do, what sort of information to take for the - - -

So you started writing. Were you asked to write down what was happening at the meeting?---That's right.

10

Who asked you to right down what was happening at the meeting?---Nada.

And what did you do with what you had written down at the end of the meeting?---I send it to them, I typed it and I sent it to them.

And who did you send it to in particular?---I send it to, I believe to Nada and to the chair at that time was Audrey may be Eman, I'm not really sure if Eman was in the, I don't know.

20

Were the minutes later, after you sent them to board members, were they then distributed again to all of the board members?---I think I printed them, yes, to be honest I'm not even sure if I sent it by email sorry, maybe I printed them and I gave it to them by hand, yes.

Did you understand that Ms Sharobeem was the chief executive officer of NESH?---Yes, I knew that she had something to do with NESH yes, that she was the manager, like, yes.

30

I'll show you some minutes of a meeting dated 12 December, 2014.---Yes.

Volume 19 NESH Allegation page 232. These minutes indicate Ms Moukhaiber that you were present at the meeting in December 2014.---Okay.

What I'll ask you to do is to read through the minutes, the main parts of the minutes to see if you can recall being at the meeting.---Yes.

40

Do you recall being at this meeting where Ms Sharobeem resigned from her position as the chairperson?---Yes, yes.

Without looking at the document, do you actually remember the meeting? ---Just vaguely yes, I remember.

So you recall Ms Sharobeem saying that she was worn out and she didn't want to do it anymore or words to that effect?---Yes.

Do you at any stage at your time with NESH recall being presented or seeing a Memorandum of Understanding?---Understanding what, sorry - - -

I'll show you a document ask if you've seen this one before. Volume 19 page 187. Just look at that document, have you seen that before?---I can't -
- -

Have you seen it before?---I can't remember.

Okay. All right. We'll take it off. Even after the meeting in December 2014, when Ms Sharobeem resigned as the chairperson, did you still know
10 that later in that year she was still acting as the boss, so to speak?---For NESH, no, she was adviser. That's what I – adviser for the facilitator, the person who was in NESH.

But she was the adviser to the coordinator, wasn't she?---To coordinator, yes.

So she was on top of the coordinator in terms of hierarchy, wasn't she?
---Yeah.

20 So you understood her, even in March 2015, to be involved with NESH, didn't you?---Um - - -

So in March 2015, my question is she was still involved with NESH, wasn't she?---Not, not as, not as any part on, like a member of committee or anything. But she was – yeah, she was an adviser to the coordinator at that time, yes.

And you're saying this based on your understanding - - -?---Yeah.

30 - - - of the situation?---Yes.

And I understand that you only attended meetings how often in 2015, do you think? How many times did you attend board meetings in 2015?---As I said, I'm not sure if it's three, four. It might be more. I, I, I really can't remember.

Pardon me, Commissioner. I'm just bringing another document up for you to look at. That's volume 19, page 254. Ms Moukhaiber, you recognise those as minutes of a NESH meeting dated 23 March, do you agree?
40 ---Yeah.

By looking at that document, can you say – first of all you agree that your name appears on the minutes?---Yes.

Can you have a look at the actual minutes and see if you remember the meeting? Have you had a look at that?---Yes.

Do you know if you were at the meeting?---I was at the meeting.

You were?---Yeah.

Do you remember on this day Ms Sharobeem doing a lot of the talking?
---Yes, as what it says here.

10 On that particular afternoon, on 23 March, Ms Sharobeem was still someone who appeared to be in control of the organisation didn't she?---As far as I understood that she was just handling a few things, especially in regard of the expenditures and things like that.

The minutes indicate don't they that Ms Sharobeem was responsible for speaking about a letter from Family and Community Services?---Yeah.

And you understood that to be the funding body of NESH didn't you?
---That's right, yes.

And she's talking about a fairly serious topic. Would you agree?---Yes.

20 It also refers to Ms Sharobeem sending the financial reports for the NESH. Would you agree with that?---Yes.

And it's a fairly serious document. Would you agree?---Yes.

Especially in the context of the funding body asking questions about expenses.---Yes.

And Ms Sharobeem is doing the talking about that isn't she?---Yeah.

30 No one else is doing the talking about those issues were they?---That's right.

Now, in this particular document Ms Sharobeem refers to an MOU in existence between NESH and IWHS. Would you agree that that's contained in the document?---Yes.

Would you agree then by looking at point 5 that as of 23 March, 2015 you as a board member had no idea what that document looked like?---Yes.

40 So you had never seen the Memorandum of Understanding as of March, 2105?---No.

Do you know if any of the other board members had seen the Memorandum of Understanding that's referred to in these minutes?---Really I don't know but definitely they should know about it because they were before me and they had more experience so - - -

But was there anything that they said in that meeting that led you to believe that they were aware of the Memorandum of Understanding?---Nothing

specifically but when, when I was in that meeting and in every meeting most of the information or mainly most of the words as well they were – I didn't understand them properly. I, I had to ask for them – like for the MOU or all of this, like it's something new for me so - - -

Around about this time in late 2014 and also early 2015 - - -?---Yes.

10 So over those months did you understand that Ms Sharobeem was the one who was in control of the finances of the organisation?---No. My understanding was that she was only the advisor and she was helping and providing all the information just to, to organise what's happening, to provide all information to, to the chair to organise things. That was my understanding.

Was there anyone else at this meeting who was talking about financial matters?---Well, I can't remember specifically but definitely they spoke but I can't, I can't remember. I mean based on this there is no one but I can't remember specifically what was said, what was said.

20 The main person talking about finances was Ms Sharobeem wasn't it?
---Yes.

Okay. Do you recall in your time at NESH Ms Sharobeem's son being an employee of the organisation?---Yes.

When he started employment with NESH were you aware that he was going under the name Richard Shawky?---No. I only knew Richard, like we were only talking Richard.

30 I'll show you a document, volume 21, page 170. Do you recognise that as a letter of employment – offer of employment to Mr Richard Shawky dated 19 January, 2015?---Yes.

Do you recognise that as the letter of employment sent to Mr Richard Sharobeem?---I recognise it's a letter for him but I'm not – I wasn't sure if it was given by hand or sent to him.

40 You knew in January, 2015 did you that Richard Shawky was Richard Sharobeem?---No, I didn't know about Shawky.

Did you understand in January, 2015 that his employment was on a part-time basis?---Yes.

It later changed to a full-time basis didn't it?---Yes.

And were you included as a referee on his CV?---Yes, I believe so.

Did he ask you?---Yes.

Did he tell you that he was putting you as a referee under his CV in the name of Richard Shawky?---No.

So you weren't aware that he was doing that?---No, no, I was aware that he put my name on the CV but I wasn't aware about the name, what name he's using, sorry.

10 When did he ask you if you could be a referee for him?---He asked me by phone one time, sorry.

Was it in 2015, after he became employed by NESH or before?---It might be before, it might be before.

Would you attend the NESH office as a board member during the week?
---During the week may be I attended once or twice to get a few papers from Nevine.

20 When you attended on those occasions, did you see Mr Sharobeem at the office?---Yes, I did.

Did you see, do you know if he was using a Honda work vehicle?---I um - - -

A Honda vehicle?---Yes, I knew that he was using it, yes.

Did you know that that vehicle belonged to NESH when he was using it?
---No.

30 How did you know that he was using the Honda vehicle?---It was in one of the meetings we were sitting and we were talking about the using the cars and I knew that the Honda is for the, um, for NESH and then at that time I heard that there was another car.

Do you remember what type of car that was?---Might be Ford or Toyota, I'm not sure.

Was the issue of him driving the car discussed at a board meeting?---Yes.

40 Who was present at that board meeting?---Nevine, the co-ordinator, the chair person and the secretary and myself.

Was Ms Sharobeem present?---I don't think so.

Are you aware of Ms Lai meeting an officer from Family and Community Services in relation to what was going on with the NESH funds?---Sorry, I'm aware - - -

Were you aware that Ms Lai attended, meet a person from Family and Community Services about the funding issue?---Yes.

Do you recall receiving an email from her in relation to that meeting?---Um
- - -

I'll show you a document it's a statement Volume 4 Page 278. Were you aware that Family and Community Services had raised a number of issues in relation to the financial report, financial year report for 2013 to 2014?---
10 Yes, I was aware.

That was certainly discussed at a board meeting, wasn't it?---Yes, yes.

And do you also accept that the letter from FACS was discussed at the board meeting?---That's right, yes.

Were you aware of the various issues that were raised by FACS?---Yes, I was a bit concerned, yes.

20 What, if anything, did you do about your concerns, did you do anything about it is what I'm asking?---Um, well, I was always asking questions because I didn't understand properly how things happening but I, the only thing that I was doing that I was trying to help by trying to get the policies for the office just organised for the staff and this is what, because this is my, this is all what I wanted to do, like I - - -

Did you have any interest in the financial side of things?---To be honest no, because I wasn't there from the beginning, I didn't understand the whole thing so.
30

Do you think the other board members did a good job of explaining the financial side of things to you?---May be and may be because I wasn't that interested in that I didn't really grasp all information so.

I'll show you that email. Sorry, I confirm that you're, you're not included in this email, are you?---No, I can't, no, I can't see my name there, no. No.

You were a board member in May 2015, weren't you?---I believe so, yeah.

40 Yeah. Did any of the other board members ever raise this issue with you, what's contained in this email? You have to say yes or no as well, just in case. So are you aware of the contents of this email?---No.

You never received it?---I don't think so, no.

You were aware that Ms Lai met with Ms Gallagher, weren't you?---Well, yeah, because she did meet with them most, like, more than once, so - - -

But what's being – the dot points from 1 to 6 in this email, are you aware of any of those details?---I'm aware about number 1 because there was some talk about rent at Guildford.

What about the other issues?---No. No.

Were you involved in any way in preparing written responses to Family and Community Services in relation to what was going on with the funds?---No.

10 Did you attend a meeting at a Thai restaurant in late 2015?---No.

Okay. I think your answer was no? Can you - - -?---Yes. No. No, no.

Okay.---I didn't attend, no.

Pardon me, Commissioner. That's the evidence, Commissioner.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you. Mr Chhabra, any questions?

20 MR CHHABRA: No questions, Commissioner.

THE COMMISSIONER: Any questions from FACS? Thank you. Thank you. You can be excused if you'd like to leave. Thank you for coming. ---Thank you.

THE WITNESS EXCUSED

[12.18pm]

30 THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, Mr Rajalingam.

MR RAJALINGAM: Those are all the witnesses I can call today. The intention is to call Ms Sharobeem tomorrow morning, and that's – we're on course for that. And I indicated to Mr Chhabra that we would start with her evidence on Tuesday morning as opposed to this afternoon if we finished the evidence early. So I'm happy to stick by that.

THE COMMISSIONER: Okay. On that basis we'll adjourn till tomorrow.

40

AT 12.18PM, THE MATTER WAS ADJOURNED ACCORDINGLY
[12.18pm]