

TARLOPUB00200
03/05/2017

TARLO
pp 00200-00250

PUBLIC
HEARING

COPYRIGHT

INDEPENDENT COMMISSION AGAINST CORRUPTION

THE HONOURABLE REGINALD BLANCH AM QC

PUBLIC HEARING

OPERATION TARLO

Reference: Operation E15/1982

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

AT SYDNEY

ON WEDNESDAY 3 MAY, 2017

AT 10.00AM

Any person who publishes any part of this transcript in any way and to any person contrary to a Commission direction against publication commits an offence against section 112(2) of the Independent Commission Against Corruption Act 1988.

This transcript has been prepared in accordance with conventions used in the Supreme Court.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, Mr Rajalingam.

MR RAJALINGAM: I understand Mr Chhabra has a short application to make.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, Mr Chhabra.

10 MR CHHABRA: Commissioner, it's an application for a late start if possible on Monday, 15 May. That's the overflow day to accommodate the witness Audrey Lai who I understand is overseas so could not be here for the allocated days. The reason I bring the application is I am part heard in a matter before His Honour Acting Judge Williams at the District Court. There's a lot of history to the matter and I'm quite heavily involved. In short, an ICO assessment was made that can no longer go ahead so it's an application for a further such assessment on that day or instead asking His Honour to perhaps consider a suspended sentence. Given the history, I'd be asking to be – or appear at that matter and perhaps if the Commission could start at midday on that day.

20 THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, that won't be a problem, Mr Chhabra.

MR CHHABRA: I'm indebted.

THE COMMISSIONER: Where's the hearing at, is it - - -

MR CHHABRA: Parramatta District Court.

THE COMMISSIONER: Parramatta.

30 MR CHHABRA: I estimate it will be somewhere between 10 to 45 minutes. In the event I am to arrive at a time after midday I will have my instructing solicitor here in any event.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes. All right. Thank you.

MR CHHABRA: I'm grateful.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, Mr Rajalingam.

40 MR RAJALINGAM: Commissioner, I seek leave to tender three statements that haven't been included in the electronic brief. Can they be done as a bundle or separately?

THE COMMISSIONER: What's the most convenient do you think?

MR RAJALINGAM: I think separately.

THE COMMISSIONER: Okay.

MR RAJALINGAM: A statement of Audrey Lai dated 14 March, 2017.

THE COMMISSIONER: Exhibit 19.

#EXHIBIT 19 - STATEMENT OF AUDREY LAI DATED 14 MARCH 2017

10

MR RAJALINGAM: Statement of Jihan Hana, H-a-n-a, dated 5 December, 2016 and a statement of Lachlan Murdoch.

THE COMMISSIONER: Exhibit 20 and - - -

#EXHIBIT 20 - STATEMENT OF JIHAN HANA DATED 5 DECEMBER 2016

20

MR RAJALINGAM: Pardon me.

THE COMMISSIONER: - - - Murdoch is 21.

#EXHIBIT 21 - STATEMENT OF LACHLAN MURDOCH DATED 24 APRIL 2017

30 MR RAJALINGAM: 21. I've got a copy of those. There's one copy of each statement there.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you.

MR RAJALINGAM: Commissioner, I call Ms Xiao Chen.

THE COMMISSIONER: Mr Stewart, you're - - -

MR STEWART: Yes, I seek - - -

40

THE COMMISSIONER: - - - assisting are you?

MR STEWART: I am assisting. Thank you, Commissioner.

THE COMMISSIONER: Then I grant leave for you to assist.

MR STEWART: In relation to Ms Chen, I can indicate I've explained the provisions of section 38 to her. She would seek a declaration and she will take an affirmation.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you. Just come forward please, Ms Chen. Yes, could you affirm the witness please.

THE COMMISSIONER: Just take a seat there, Ms Chen.

10 Pursuant to section 38 of the Independent Commission Against Corruption Act, I declare that all answers given by this witness and all documents and things produced by this witness during the course of the witness's evidence at the public inquiry are to be regarded as having been given or produced on objection and there is no need for the witness to make objection in respect of any particular answer given or document or thing produced.

20 **PURSUANT TO SECTION 38 OF THE INDEPENDENT COMMISSION AGAINST CORRUPTION ACT, I DECLARE THAT ALL ANSWERS GIVEN BY THIS WITNESS AND ALL DOCUMENTS AND THINGS PRODUCED BY THIS WITNESS DURING THE COURSE OF THE WITNESS'S EVIDENCE AT THE PUBLIC INQUIRY ARE TO BE REGARDED AS HAVING BEEN GIVEN OR PRODUCED ON OBJECTION AND THERE IS NO NEED FOR THE WITNESS TO MAKE OBJECTION IN RESPECT OF ANY PARTICULAR ANSWER GIVEN OR DOCUMENT OR THING PRODUCED.**

THE COMMISSIONER: So that gives you the protection that Mr Stewart has explained to you. Thank you. Yes, Mr Rajalingam.

30 MR RAJALINGAM: Thank you, Commissioner. Is your name Selina Chen?---Yes.

You spell it C-h-e-n?---S-e-l-i-n-a, oh, C-h-e-n.

Yes.---Sorry.

That's all right. Is your first name Xiao?---Yeah.

X-i-a-o, but do you go by the name Selina?---(No Audible Reply)

40 You have to say yes or no?---Yes.

Thank you. Were you a bookkeeper at Immigrant Women's Health Service?---Yes.

Did you start there about seven or eight years ago?---Not clear. Maybe.

But some time ago, many years ago?---A long time ago, yeah.

Approximately seven to eight years?---Maybe. I'm not sure.

How long did you work at the Immigrant Women's Health Service roughly?---I couldn't remember.

Did you receive any training to be a bookkeeper prior to starting at - - -?
---No.

- - - the Immigrant Women's Health Service?---No.

10

Had you done bookkeeping work before the Immigrant Women's Health Service?---Yes. Oh, for – can you repeat.

Had you done any bookkeeping work before you started bookkeeping work at the Immigrant Women's Health Service?---Yes.

Where did you do that work?---Some other place.

Was it just one other place?---Some other place.

20

How many other places did you do bookkeeping?---I couldn't remember.

Was it two or three or many, many places?---One or two.

One or two other places you did bookkeeping work?---Yeah.

And did you work at the Immigrant Women's Health Service on one day per week?---Yeah, once a week.

30

Do you know what day of the week that was?---I couldn't remember.

When you were working as a bookkeeper was there any other bookkeeper working as well?---No.

Were you working at the Fairfield office of Immigrant Women's Health Service?---I think, yeah.

At Fairfield?---I think.

40

Was it near the station?---Not far.

Was your boss Ms Eman Sharobeem?---Yeah, Eman.

Did you know her as Dr Sharobeem?---I'm not 100 per cent sure.

Did you know Watfa and Marie, the other staff at the service, Watfa, do you remember her?---I couldn't remember.

Watfa El-Baf?---I don't know the name.

Do you remember Marie Abboud?---Maybe, her.

During your time working at Immigrant Women's Health Service did Ms Sharobeem ask you to process reimbursements for her?---I think maybe.

Did, do you recall using the St George online banking website to conduct or process transactions?---Yes.

10

Did Ms Sharobeem give you the password to access that website?---Yes.

Who else did, who else had a password apart from yourself and Ms Sharobeem?---I don't know.

Do you know if anyone else had the password or you just don't know?
---I don't know and I don't think so.

20

Would Ms Sharobeem ask you to process reimbursements to her by leaving receipts in your in tray?---Hmm, I think that's, yeah.

And sometimes would there be instructions on the top of the receipts?
---Maybe.

Sometimes would she just tell you orally, would she tell you to pay the receipts?---Yes.

30

Do you know if Ms Sharobeem had an IWHS credit card when you were there?---I think then maybe, yeah.

Was there an IWHS chequebook?---Yeah.

And do you know if Ms Sharobeem and Ms Lai were both signatories to that chequebook?---I don't know the other, other signatory but she was one.

Do you, when you were a bookkeeper at the IWHS do you remember processing any Sydney Water bills?---I don't remember. I suffered memory loss so lots of things I forgot.

40

THE COMMISSIONER: Can I just ask you about the system for paying. Was there a tray where the bills were put?---Yeah.

What colour was the tray?---Oh, couldn't remember the tray.

You can't remember, but - - -?---Just a tray.

A tray?---Yeah.

And were the bills put in the tray?---Yeah.

And you just got the bills out of the tray and paid them?---And processed them.

So that anything that was put in that tray, you paid?---Yeah.

Okay. Thank you.

10 MR RAJALINGAM: No further questions, Commissioner, for me. No further questions.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, Mr Chhabra?

MR CHHABRA: No questions.

MR STEWART: I have none either.

20 THE COMMISSIONER: Is there any reason the witness can't be excused?

MR RAJALINGAM: No.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you for coming in, Ms Chen. You are excused now, you can go. Thank you very much?---Thank you, thank you very much. Thanks.

THE WITNESS EXCUSED

[10.13am]

30

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes.

MR RAJALINGAM: Commissioner, I call Chanthaneth Chanthalangsy.

THE COMMISSIONER: Ms Chanthalangsy, will you take an oath or an affirmation?

MS CHANTHALANGSY: Affirmation.

40 THE COMMISSIONER: Affirmation.

THE COMMISSIONER: Ms Chanthalangsy, I can make an order protecting you against any repercussions for any evidence you give today. It's probably not necessary but just for safety's sake and to help you I will do it.

10 So pursuant to section 38 of the Independent Commission Against Corruption Act, I declare that all answers given by this witness and all documents and things produced by this witness during the course of the witness's evidence at this public inquiry are to be regarded as having been given or produced on objection and there is no need for the witness to make objection in respect of any particular answer given or document or thing produced.

20 **SO PURSUANT TO SECTION 38 OF THE INDEPENDENT COMMISSION AGAINST CORRUPTION ACT, I DECLARE THAT ALL ANSWERS GIVEN BY THIS WITNESS AND ALL DOCUMENTS AND THINGS PRODUCED BY THIS WITNESS DURING THE COURSE OF THE WITNESS'S EVIDENCE AT THIS PUBLIC INQUIRY ARE TO BE REGARDED AS HAVING BEEN GIVEN OR PRODUCED ON OBJECTION AND THERE IS NO NEED FOR THE WITNESS TO MAKE OBJECTION IN RESPECT OF ANY PARTICULAR ANSWER GIVEN OR DOCUMENT OR THING PRODUCED.**

30 THE COMMISSIONER: So that gives you the protection?---Yes.

Yes, Mr Rajalingam.

MR RAJALINGAM: Thank you, Commissioner.

May you state your full name for the record?---Chanthaneth Chanthalangsy.

Can you spell your last name?---C-h-a-n-t-h-a-l-a-n-g-s-y.

40 And that's pronounced Chanthalangsy?---Chanthalangsy.

How do you spell your first name?---Chanthaneth.

C-h-a-n - - -?---t-h-a - - -

- - - t-h-a-n-e-t-h?---Yes, correct.

Were you the bookkeeper for Immigrant Women's Health Service between 2013 and 2015?---Yes, correct.

Do you know what month you started?---2012-13 financial year.

But did you start in 2013?---June. Financial year 2012-13 financial year, June.

10 Do you know what month you started, what month?---June.

June of 2013?---Yeah.

And do you know what month you finished in 2015?---Financial year, end of financial year.

So June 2015?---Yeah.

20 How did you get the job at Immigrant Women's Health Service?---By Nathan Boyd just recommend.

Did you know him from before?---Yes, I know him before, I work at Lao Community, he used to be audit of my work there.

And prior to starting at the IWHS, had you done any bookkeeping work? ---Yes, I do.

For how long had you done bookkeeping work?---Once a week every Tuesday.

30 Oh, no, no, sorry. Prior to starting at the Immigrant Women's Health Service had you done any bookkeeping work?---Yes, at Lao Community.

And for how long were you a bookkeeper there?---Seven years.

I think you said you worked at the Immigrant Women's Health Service once a week?---Once a week.

Which day was that?---Tuesday.

40 Did you also work for NESH on the Wednesday of each week?---Yes, correct.

How did it come about that you were also working for NESH?---Ah, Dr Eman just gave me extra work for the NESH.

Was that soon after you started in June 2013?---No, just recently, a year, that's all, for the NESH.

So did you work for NESH from the middle of 2014 to 2015 in June?
---Yeah, something like that, yeah.

What were your hours on the Tuesday, generally speaking?---Five hour,
9.30 to 2.30.

And what about Wednesday?---Wednesday the same thing, 9.30 to 2.30.

10 Ms Chanthalangsy, I'm going to show you some documents. They are your
time sheets from the Immigrant Women's Health Service?---Mmm.

Ms Chanthalangsy, I'm going to provide you with a table?---Thank you.

And they start – it's a table reflecting dates and times that you worked?
---Mmm.

At some stage today I will give you the actual time sheets and we can check
them off, but you can take it from me that these are accurate?---Okay.

20 There's another copy for you, Commissioner.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you.

MR RAJALINGAM: If you look at that document, Ms Chanthalangsy,
would you agree that they appear to be the days on which you worked at the
Immigrant Women's Health Service?---(No Audible Reply)

Do the times appear right, dates and times?---Not the Sunday.

30 The Sunday?---Saturday only sometime.

Okay?---Very rarely.

In a moment I'll show you some time sheets and we might go through this
document?---Okay.

But you can put that aside?---Okay.

40 I'll tender it for the moment, Your Honour.

THE COMMISSIONER: As Exhibit 22.

**#EXHIBIT 22 - TABLE OF WORK DAYS FOR CHANTHANETH
CHANTHALANGSY DURING 2013-2014 & 2014-2015**

MR RAJALINGAM: Ms Chanthalangsy, who did you report to in the office? Who was your boss?---Dr Eman Sharobeem.

During your time working at the Immigrant Women's Health Service, did you know her as Dr Sharobeem?---That's what I told. Dr Sharobeem.

Who were the other staff members, not facilitators, who were the other staff members who were working with you in the office?---I knew only Watfa El-Baf and Marie Abboud. Just only talking sometimes only.

10

Did they job-share through the week?---Not with me.

Yes, sorry. Did they, Ms Abboud and Ms El-Baf together, job-share, do you know?---I don't know about their work.

Okay. Did you do any other work other than bookkeeping at the Immigrant Women's Health Service?---No.

20

Did you ever work as a facilitator?---No.

Would I be correct in saying that your work at the Immigrant Women's Health Service would have been mostly at your desk?---Yes.

You would come to work at 9.30. Would you usually take a break for morning tea at 11 o'clock or 11.30?---No.

Or go straight to lunch?---Go straight to 2.30.

30

Oh, straight to 2.30?---Yeah.

Without a break?---If eating and work.

I see.---Because a lot of work.

Okay.---No break.

Did you complete your work in the time that was allotted to you?
---Sometimes finish, sometimes not finish. Had to continue the follow week.

40

Would you stay overtime, past the time, past 4.30 or 5 o'clock?---No, because she's very strict with the hours given.

And were you meant to be working five hours - - -?---Five hours.

- - - a day?---A day.

Did you ever do work on the weekend?---Only some Saturday, only financial year and that, when a lot to be prepared for audit.

When you did work on the weekend, would you work from home?---Never.

Did you ever work from home?---Never.

Would you come in to the service on the weekend if necessary?---Yeah.

10 Can you describe what your job as bookkeeper at the Immigrant Women's Health Service entailed?---Mainly data entry. Put all whatever (not transcribable) in the computer for MYOB software.

Would you refer to that as recording financial transactions on MYOB?
---Yes.

Were you also processing payments?---Yes.

20 And in that respect would you be paying wages first?---Yes.

Would you pay invoices to third parties?---Yes.

And would you reimburse staff for work-related expenses?---Yes.

How would you determine what was a work-related expense?---For petty cash?

30 No, for reimbursement.---For reimbursement, we have two. One, that's for Marie Abboud for the general reimburse. They have all the docket, all the detail. Just put it in like that, like shopping list and that. We have two part. One for reimbursement of Dr Sharobeem. That's different to reimburse.

Did you ever determine yourself what was a work-related expense or not?
---I'm not quite understand what the question. Can you repeat?

When you looked at the invoice or receipt that you were reimbursing, did you yourself decide whether or not you should pay it?---When I got approve from - - -

40 And how did you get these receipts approved?---Sometimes by verbal. Sometimes by email. Sometimes (not transcribable) wrote, wrote down approval to be paid.

And who was it that gave you the approval?---Dr Eman Sharobeem only.

Would anyone else ask you to process a reimbursement in the office?
---Under approval of Dr Eman Sharobeem. That's another one, that's Marie Abboud. But approval from Dr Eman Sharobeem only.

What was Marie Abboud's involvement in the process?---Just reimburse for her expense.

Oh, so you're saying that you would also reimburse expenses for Ms Abboud?---Yes, for, for shopping for anything in the office.

I see.---So we do two reimburse, one for Marie and one for Dr Sharobeem.

10 How would Ms Sharobeem give you these receipts for you to reimburse?---
Big bundle. She keep for long, I don't know how long. When she got a lot
one whole bunch of receipt and give it and mostly for the reimbursement for
her she normally leave on my table and on Tuesday when I'm coming to
work Tuesday and she leave on the table for me written note reimburse.

20 You indicated with your hands how big the pile of receipts would be. Can
you indicate again. Would it be about a 10 centimetre thick pile of receipts,
is that what you're indicating?---She will divide it for me that this lot that's
for this grant, this lot for this grant, this lot for that to be in data entry of me
pay.

How would – so would she provide those instructions in relation to which
program or grant - - -?---Yes.

- - - an invoice was to be reimbursed against in writing or orally?
---Sometime in writing, sometime verbal, sometime email.

30 What did you do after you for example finished paying an invoice,
reimbursing, what did you do with the documents?---Oh, that one have to
filing for auditor at the end financial year.

Okay. If you weren't sure in relation to your instructions what would you
do?---I did ask Dr Eman sometime because the detail not proper, like
normally credit card only the amount no detail was spend so when we going
to put in the computer we don't know where to put. Sometime ask her. She
say do what I tell. I haven't got anything. That's all I got. Then just put in
whatever she say.

40 All right. Ms Chanthalangsy, I will take you to some actual transfers later
and we'll talk about some of the notes that were on those transfers and the
receipts.---Okay.

Firstly I'm going to ask you about the accounts. Did IWHS have a St
George Bank account?---Yes.

And did you have access to the online website?---Yes.

Did you need a password to access the account?---Yes, I need a password.

Who knew the passwords?---Dr Eman Sharobeem and me. The same password.

What about NESH, who did NESH bank with?---I did it. I do the NESH.

And which bank was NESH?---The NESH one Commonwealth.

10 Was the – did you need a password for the NESH account?---They have two token.

And how did the tokens work?---Each one got one token. I do the first token and second that's the, the boss do.

What – did the first token process - - -?---Just - - -

- - - the payment?---Just process everything there but not release the payment. The second token that's release the payment.

20 Okay. Can you describe how you actually use the token on – you use the token on the website somehow?---Yes.

How would it work?---You just put the token in there and just type in the password and they open. The detail you just put in, put in how to pay people and they will save in there and the second token will be pay between a week or something. Then after that week if second token not pay it will delete for the first one.

30 You've mentioned two tokens. You had the first token.---Yes.

Did – and you said Ms Sharobeem had the second token.---No, this one for the NESH.

Yes, for the NESH, for the NESH account.---For the NESH.

There were two tokens?---Yes.

40 Did Ms Sharobeem give you her token at some stage?---From the first start no.

When did, when did she give you her token?---Probably I work there for a while then after that she say that's your job. You have to do both I have no time.

Did she show you how to use her token?---Yes, because I don't know how to release the second one. She's the one teach me how to do.

Were you able to access funds in the bank account at the branch?---No.

Did you have authority to sign any cheques on behalf of - - -?---No.

- - - IWHS?---No.

What about NESH?---No.

Did you have access to the IWHS credit card?---No.

10 Who had possession of the credit card?---I have no idea. All my job's just only bookkeeping, data entry.

Did you make transfers on the bank, the online banking site to repay the credit card ever?---Yes, for Dr Eman Sharobeem, yeah.

So you were able to access the credit card online account?---No, we used the normal account for IWHS to pay her credit card.

20 Could you access her account online, sorry, could you access the Immigrant Women's Health Service credit card account online?---No.

Do you know if Mr Sharobeem could access that account online?---I have no idea.

Had you ever seen the details of that account online?---No.

You said earlier in your evidence that you would have conversations with Ms Sharobeem on a Tuesday. Is that right, on the Tuesday morning?---For what?

30 I think you said earlier - - -?---Mmm.

- - - that you would have, you would have a chat with Ms Sharobeem about reimbursements on Tuesdays?---If she's in the office. Most of the time she's not in, she only leave on the table for me to deal with it.

40 You said earlier that you received from her credit card receipts. Can you explain firstly the difference between a credit card receipt and a tax invoice, do you know what the difference is?---Just small pieces, no detail, just amount of the money, the transaction.

Was it the case that most of the time she gave you credit card receipts?
---Ah hmm.

And only some of the time there would be actual tax invoices?---(No Audible Reply)

Did you ever see any tax invoices?---From the credit card?

No, no, from the vendor?---Ah, like receipt from the shopping and that, yes.

From the shopping, yes?---Yes, they have that.

You said you recorded transactions in MYOB. That's a computer program on a computer, is it?---Yes.

10 And was that only on one computer in the service?---One computer.

Was that your computer that you used to use?---One computer, my computer.

Did any of, could any of the other computers access the MYOB program? ---Not that I know of.

Okay. I want to ask you about just the process of entering an invoice onto MYOB?---Mmm.

20 Is this right, firstly you pick up the invoice or the receipt, you have that in your hand?---Yes, yes.

You access the MYOB program?---Yes.

And you go to the accounts payable section of the program?---Yes.

30 Do you then enter the vendor's name, for example?---Before we haven't got expense code then I had to mention to Nathan Boyd to create one for Dr Eman Sharobeem to put in exactly the code so it will be easily when I have to data entry.

And what did the codes refer to?---Code refer to whatever expense of Dr Eman, only her know when she spend the money, then put in the code of the grant, the money of the grant individual, which grant going to claim for. That's what that for.

Did the code sometimes refer to programs that were being conducted? ---Yes.

40 And was it the case that when you entered the details into MYOB you would use a code relating to a specific program - - -?---Yes.

- - - in relation to a reimbursement?---Yes.

Before you had the codes, what would you do in order to allocate the payment on MYOB?---We have to follow instruction Dr Eman provide for me.

Okay. And would she provide you with a description or something?---Yes. Sometimes writing the piece of paper. This lot, that's belong to this. This lot belong to that. That's why I know how to put it.

And were those instructions usually – I withdraw that. Would you also enter into MYOB the invoice number if you had it?---If we have it.

And would you also enter details of a purchase if you had it?---Yes, yes.

10 And also you of course enter the amount?---Yes.

And is that essentially recording a transaction in MYOB, those steps?---Yes.

After you were finished with the invoice or the receipt, what did you do?
---Filing.

Ms Chanthalangsy, I'm going to show you some documents on the screen. The first one is at brief statements volume 3, page 238. Pardon me, I think volume 2. Brief statements volume 2, page 238. Pardon me,
20 Commissioner. It's volume 1 of the statements, page 238. Should be onscreen. Ms Chanthalangsy, can you see that transfer receipt?---Yes.

Do you agree that it's for a transfer from a cheque account to Eman West for \$1,041.60?---Yes.

And that it was on 14 September, is that right?---Yes.

That was a Saturday. Ms Chanthalangsy, what I might do is I might give you this calendar. It might help you along this process.---Okay. Yes.
30

I have marked on it, but just disregard the highlighting and the circles.
---Thank you.

And I think I've opened it up to 2013 calendar. Do you see that 14 September, 2013 was a Saturday?---Ah hmm.

Do you agree, Ms Chanthalangsy? 14 September, Saturday?---Yes.

And you agree from the table that we've provided you that you weren't
40 working on 14 September?---14 September.

2013.---Haven't got in here.

Yes. So does that mean you weren't working on that Saturday?---And also if Saturday, never work PM. 9.30 (not transcribable) PM.

Okay.---Saturday only the latest 2.30, that's it. This one PM, night-time.

I'll take you to page – sorry, do you recognise the handwriting on page 238 “program translation”?---That’s Dr Eman Sharobeem writing.

Did you – if you just go to maybe the next page, 239. Do you see that document?---Yes.

MESG. What does it stand for, do you know?---Multicultural something. That’s another grant. Multicultural - - -

10 Was it the Middle Eastern seniors group?---Yes, yes.

MESG?---Yeah.

Do you know whose handwriting that is?---Dr Eman Sharobeem.

What did you – what would you make of that, the writing, what does that mean?---That mean those amount have to be entered in account of MES, MESG.

20 And that’s what you would input into MYOB, is that right?---Yes, yes, correct.

I wonder if you could turn to page 240. The document on the right-hand side, is that, that’s an old credit card receipt, isn’t it?---Mmm.

Do you recall that document, do you recall seeing that when you were at the Immigrant Women’s Health Service?---Yes.

30 So do you recall entering this transaction into MYOB?---I saw them, there’s quite a lot of like this, no detail, just only receipt of MasterCard and that, yes, I see.

Page 241. Again there’s an example of the receipts being cut. Would you agree?---Yes.

I’ll show you another bundle of document, page 243, volume 1, page 243. That’s a transfer on 16 October, 2013. Do you agree?---Yes.

For \$463.84?---Yes.

40

Now, that, 16 October, if you look at the calendar, was a Wednesday? ---16, 16/10, 16/10, oh, calendar.

And if you look at your time sheet table, would you agree that you were not working on 16 October?---Yes, not working. And also 5.06pm.

And 16 October was a Wednesday. I think you said you did do some work on a Wednesday?---Yes, from 9.30 to 2.30.

All right. The handwriting on the top right-hand side of the page, whose handwriting is that?---That one is what, me, my one.

That is your writing, top right-hand corner?---Yes. When counting something, the total of something, I must write out it, this one my writing.

Total 829.79?---289, 499, something, not really clear.

10 Page 244, that's a transfer one minute before the transfer I just showed you, for \$365.95. Do you agree?---Yes.

Did you ever recall making successive transfers when you did reimbursements, one after the other, do you remember doing one transfer then doing another transfer the minute later then another transfer two or three minutes later to Eman Sharobeem?---Let me explain that. Sometime I did that but not in one minute each other, because a day we allowed to transfer 10,000 and her reimbursement, 5,000 each time became that, then you have to do another one for the gap, so sometime we used to transact after each other, but not one minute.

Can I just clarify that. So you're saying was it the transfer limit \$5,000 online?---Ah, 10,000 a day.

10,000 a day?---Yes. But her claim, we divide sometime 8,000, sometimes 7,000 and normally first one we pay 5,000 and the rest for another.

For the remainder?---Yeah, the remainder.

30 Why would you split it up that way?---For that's, she claim for the each account, okay, so like MES, MEG, 300, so (not transcribable) 300 so it's easy when you put data entry in there, it's okay, so I know that code is belong to that one, so sometime I have to do that.

So it was just a way of trying to keep things neat for accounting purposes - - -?---Yes, correct.

- - - so far as you were concerned?---Yes. If it was my pay. If her pay, I don't know.

40

Of course. Page 245. Is this what you would refer to as another instruction?---Yes, that's Dr Eman Sharobeem writing.

I see. Pages 246 to 248. I'm going to ask the investigator to go slowly through those. They're all receipts, so have a look at them. Maybe spend some time on each page. Just tell me when you're ready to turn the page. So this is a page of receipts.---Mmm.

And do you accept that they were cut? They appear cut?---yes.

Do you remember receiving receipts like this?---Yes.

Next page.

THE COMMISSIONER: When you're say they're cut, what's cut off them?---Maybe the top part or something.

10 And what does the top part show normally?---Customer copy receipt. It could be the detail of that one.

The detail of what was bought?---Yeah, I think.

Yes, thank you.

MR RAJALINGAM: Thank you, Commissioner. Sometimes would it also include the details of where it came from, the shop as well?---Yes, yes. It could be that too.

20

Next page, 245. Perhaps the next one. That's the last, page 248. Do you see the notation on the top receipt? It's, that - -?---Blurry. Yeah, can't read it.

Do you see, it looks like writing on the top of the receipt? Do you see the squiggle on the receipt?---Mmm. Not really clear.

THE COMMISSIONER: A circle.---The circle, number 2?

30 Yes.---Oh.

MR RAJALINGAM: Yes. Do you see that?---Yes.

Do you know what that is referring to?---Probably it mean that the first – the first receipt and this one second receipt. That is what it mean.

I'll ask the investigator to go back a couple of documents. Is it a reference to the number 2 on the instruction that you were given? Is the 2 on the receipt a reference to the instruction number 2?---No, what I understand that, receive 1, receive 2.

40

Okay.---If she wrote like that. If got the receipt, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, she put 1 receipt, 2 receipt, 3 receipt, 4 receipt. The total of receipt that she had.

All right. Would sometimes those numbers refer to the bundle of receipts? So, for example, the 2 would include a number of receipts. Would that be right? Did the – sorry, I'll withdraw the question. Did the numbers refer to bundles of receipts?---Yes.

So the number 2 and \$463.84 relates to the total of a number of receipts. Is that what you're saying?---Yes.

I'll show you page 250 of volume 1. Now, on 7 January, that's a transfer for 7 January, isn't it, Ms Chanthalangsy?---Yes.

10 On 7 January, you were working, it seems, looking at the table. So you can just pull that. Hold on. Maybe not.---Yes, it was Tuesday, yeah.

Yeah, it's a Tuesday.---Yes.

But the transfer is at 8.27pm.---Yes, definitely not mine. I'm finished work 2.30.

Page 251. So you see that that is a transfer one minute after the transfer I just showed you and this particular transfer is at 8.28pm on the Tuesday evening. Was that you that did that transaction?---No.

20 Do you know – page 252. Again is this instructions in relation to what you should put into MYOB?---Yes, correct. Correct, yes.

Are the references on the right-hand side of the slash - - -?---That's, that's the code to put in MYOB code.

So 6-1-0-6-6 was a code on MYOB?---Yes.

And it related to some sort of - - -?---Relate to some, some expense.

30 Page 257. That's for 17 April at 1.06pm. Do you agree?---Yes.

For \$1,259.---Ah hmm.

I understand that that was a Thursday. You can check that, 17 April, 2014. ---Yes (not transcribable)

So you weren't working that day were you?---No.

40 Do you know whose handwriting is on that page?---That's Dr Eman Sharobeem.

And the next page 258. Had you ever seen that receipt attached to the transfer before?---(No Audible Reply)

Do you remember this document?---Yes.

And do you remember inputting it into MYOB?---Yes, for office furniture, (not transcribable). This one I did ask her what's the (not transcribable) for.

Sorry, what did you say?---This one I did ask Dr Eman what's this money for.

And what did she say?---She say (not transcribable) you don't know, just do it. Said that's the (not transcribable). She said that's (not transcribable) work. This one I remember I did ask her.

10 And why do you remember about this one?---Because I asked her for this one because office furniture (not transcribable), what's that one for?

And had you seen any new furniture at Fairfield - - -?---Never see.

- - - at the time - - -?---Never see. Just concerned that's all.

You agreed the receipt refers to a phone, a single phone order. You see the receipt.---Yes.

20 Under the total amount 1,259 it reads "single phone order".---Oh, single phone order.

Did you make a transaction on the phone for the furniture?---Never.

Ever at - - -?---Never.

Never. All right. Page 260. That's a transfer for 14 August. Do you agree?---Yes.

30 2014?---Yes.

And my understanding is that that is a Thursday. You can check that on the calendar and - - -?---Yes, Thursday.

Your table indicates that you weren't working.---Yes.

If you turn to page 261, so look at the screen. What is that, the template first of all, what is this document?---That's Mr Boyd, Nathan Boyd create especially for reimburse for Dr Eman Sharobeem.

40 How did it come about, was there a – do you know if he had a conversation with Ms Sharobeem about what was going on?---Yes.

Was that in front of you or - - -?---No. Next-door office but Nathan let me know too that he speak to Dr Eman Sharobeem because last financial year the – is not clear. That's why he have to create this to put in so it will be exactly what to put.

When he, when he gave these reimbursement templates to Ms Sharobeem, and you said he had this conversation with her then he told you as well, do you remember what he actually said to you about what he had talked to Ms Sharobeem about?---He just said, okay, he create this template for Dr Eman Sharobeem for easy divide what she used the money for, so it more clear. Because even haven't got receipt, only her know. Nobody know because she's the one who spend the money. So this one will be easy for her to put in. Then for first start, she did it, put in, put in. But later on she haven't got no time and she give it to me to put in. Then no detail because I don't know.

10

I will get to some of those forms in a moment.---Mmm, mmm.

The handwriting on this document, do you know whose handwriting that is?---It was me.

That was you? The numbers?---Yes.

And what does it – what are you doing on this document?---We write on the receipt that she give me authority for the (not transcribable). Certain amount to be in (not transcribable).

20

Have you listed all the receipts? And I'll ask the investigator to go through the next few documents.---Mmm.

And if you go back to the reimbursement form, is what you're doing essentially pulling together receipts that relate to the same program?---Yes.

And do you do that by reference to the notations on the receipts?
---Sometimes she wrote on the receipt. Sometimes just verbal tell.

30

Sometimes by email.

Okay. Just have a look - -?---This thing, could be anything.

- - - at the next page of receipts - - -?---Yeah.

- - - and see what we see. Here there's only numbers. Do you see that? There's nothing, there's no – there aren't any words. There's simply the numbers.---Yeah. This one, that's the number of how many receipts she got it.

40

I see. The bundle number?---Yeah. The bundle number.

Pardon me, Commissioner. I'll show you a document. Volume 2 of the allegations, page 232. Ms Chanthalangsy, I'm going to show you some transfer receipts of transfers that seem to have occurred on days that you worked, and I'm going to ask you to comment on those transfers.---Okay.

Do you agree that this is a transfer for 7 January, 2014?---Yes.

At 8.24pm?---Yes.

Turn to the next page. Do you agree that that is a transfer for the same day one minute later?---Yes.

At 8.25pm?---Yes.

10 The next page, 7 January, 2014 at 8.21pm, some minutes prior?---Yes.

Page 241. 7 January, 2014, 8.26pm.---Yes.

Next page, 7 January, 8.27pm.---Yes.

Page 246, 7 January, 2014, 8.27pm again.---Yes.

But, sorry, can you go back to page 242? We're talking about a transaction at 8.27pm. There's one here for \$798.59. Do you agree with that?---Yes.

20 At page 242?---Yes.

Then at page 246, recorded at the same minute was another transaction for \$1,206.75.---Yes.

And a minute later at 8.28pm on the same evening, another transaction at page 247. 8.28pm, do you see that one?---Yes.

30 Ms Chanthalangsy, do you want to have a look at that calendar, 7 January, 2014, and your time sheets, and I believe you were working on that day?
---7/1/14, 7, yes, I did work on that day.

Between what hours were you working?---9.30 to 2.30.

Were you, did you process these transactions in the evening about half past 8.00 - - -?---No.

- - - on 7 January?---No.

40 I'll take you to page 296. That's for a transfer for 10 June, 2014. Do you agree?---Yes.

And in the next page, 297, was a minute later on the same day?---Yes.

And were you working on 10 June, 2014?---10 June?

Just by looking at those calendar and your time sheets?---10, 10 June. Yes, on Tuesday, 10 June, but from 9.30 to 2.30 only.

Were you working in the evening at 7.50pm - - -?---Never.

- - - approximately?---No.

I'm going to ask the investigator to slowly go through these documents.
Page 298. Now, is that again some form of an instruction to you?---Yes.

10 Do you remember this particular instruction?---Yes, that's the detail on the
right-hand side, that's the code that I have to put in MYOB. First it's the
amount and then next to it, that's the code to put in MYOB.

And whose handwriting is that?---Dr Eman Sharobeem.

The next page, 299, can you – what is this document?---Oh, this one, that's
Nathan Boyd.

But what does it mean, do you know?---He just counting and summarise
something, yeah.

20 The total figure - - -?---Total figure.

- - - equals the total transfers?---You have to ask Nathan Boyd.

Okay. I'll ask for you just to turn to page 300. Are these the type of
receipts that you would receive to reimburse?---Yes.

For example, the top right-hand receipt, Dolly Fashion Accessory?---Yes, I
see that.

30 Did you ever question how that type of receipt could relate to Immigrant
Women's Health Service?---I do what the boss tell.

Did you just say I do what the boss tells?---Yeah. The boss tell to claim
this, I just did it, no question asked.

And the next page, that middle receipt at the top, Speedway Woodpark?
---Yes.

40 Sorry, I withdraw that. Page 303, there are two receipts there, top right-
hand corner, bottom right-hand corner, for \$500 each. Do you agree?
---Yes.

Yeah?---I see that, mmm.

And they look like they've come from the same machine so to speak don't
they?---Oh.

And they appear to be in the same form, the receipts. Do you agree with that?---(not transcribable) you mean.

But they relate to \$500 receipts don't they, they're \$500 receipts?---Yes, 500, yeah.

Would you have questioned receipts for that type for that amount with Ms Sharobeem or would you have just processed the transaction?---Just processed.

10

Page 305 on the right-hand side in the middle there's a receipt that relates to a patient. Do you see the word "patient" on the receipt, top left-hand corner where the mouse is pointing?---Yes.

Would you have queried that with Ms Sharobeem for any reason before reimbursing her?---Sometime she reimbursed herself.

Yes, yeah.---Yeah, sometime I did but never ask. She say do just what I told.

20

But had you seen receipts like that?---I did see sometime from – I remember once that's for 3,000 from hospital. That's the one that I remember.

I'll take you to that one soon.---Yeah. Only that one remember for.

All right.---100 per cent that one.

That was 2013. I won't take you to any more. Sorry, 2014. I'm going to take you to some transfers in 2015.---Okay.

30

6 January, 2015 is volume 3 of the allegation brief, page 24. That's dated 6 January, 2015. It's an online transfer at 9.59am. Do you agree?---Yes.

I understand that you were working on that day. Do you agree with that, 6 January, 2015 at that time?---That's on Tuesday, yes.

And the time is right?---Yes, time is right.

It's a fairly large transfer \$4,529.25. Do you agree?---Yes.

40

All right. The next page 25 is that a reimbursement form?---Yes.

Whose writing is at the bottom?---My writing.

Who completed the form?---This one will be mine.

Did you write the details – did you type the details into this form?---Yes, follow instruction by her order.

And the next page 26 is that what you refer to as instructions?---Yes.

And the next page, the next page do you see – sorry, go back one page. On that page the Woolworths receipt?---Yes.

Top right-hand corner is the word “food”.---Yes.

And similarly on the other receipt food.---Yes.

10

Whose handwriting is that?---My one.

Why did you write food there?---Because Woolworths that’s food.

Did you know whether it was to be allocated to a particular program?---This one food so normally go MESG.

Why would it normally go to MESG?---MSG for food for the group. That's what she told me.

20

Who told you?---Dr Eman Sharobeem.

So whenever you had a food receipt it would go to MESG?---Yes. Go to MESG. Yeah.

Page 28. Do you see on the top left-hand receipt it says S+S Hair.Beauty SAL, which I understand to mean hair and beauty salon.---Mmm.

30

And the receipt underneath that was also S+S Hair.Beauty salon.---Ah hmm.

Do you remember receiving receipts like that from Ms Sharobeem?---To claim?

To claim.---Yes.

Did you ever ask her why she was claiming hair and beauty services at the Immigrant Women’s Health Service?---Never ask. Just do what the boss tell.

40

And in the middle of the page at the top, you can see that it’s a – some sort of nail and beauty treatment, a receipt for nail and beauty treatment. ---Mmm, yes.

Would you have asked her any questions about that?---I didn't ask.

Did you ever ask her questions about - - -?---I did ask a lot of times. She said do what I told.

Do you remember you asked her about the nail and beauty receipts? Did you raise that with her specifically?---Not this one.

What about the hair and beauty?---Not that one.

Okay. But which ones did you raise?---I raise about the 3,000 one and I raise sometimes that buy clothes, and she say just do what I told.

10 Ah hmm. For example, page 29. U-Turn Recycled Fashion, Rozelle. Did you ever raise those type of receipts with her?---No.

Do you know if people, other staff members at the service, purchased clothes for some of the participants of programs?---Never.

Page 30. Le Soft Fashion. Bottom left-hand corner. Did you ever remember raising concerns with Ms Sharobeem about Le Soft receipts? ---No.

20 Next page, 31. Flower Power on the right-hand side. Did you ever raise any issues with Ms Sharobeem about receipts relating to Flower Power? ---No.

Page 33. What about David Jones receipts that were being claimed?---No.

Did you ever speak to her about that?---No.

Did you think it was a bit strange?---A lot of strange. I did report to Nathan Boyd.

30 Page 34.---Yeah.

Do you recognise that as receipts for a motorcycle shop? Well, it says Action Motor Group.---Mmm.

Do you see that?---Yes.

Do you recall seeing receipts from Action Motor Group when you were a bookkeeper?---I see that but no question asked.

40 Did you know it was in relation to a motorcycle shop?---Yes, I know that, yeah.

And did you raise it with Ms Sharobeem?---No.

Why not?---Just do what I told. If you want the job done, just do it.

And the next page is another receipt from Action Motor Group. Do you agree with that?---Yes.

I'll show you another transfer. Page 37. Pardon me, Commissioner. That's a transfer for 12 January, 2015, isn't it?---Yes.

At 10.29am?---Yes.

For \$619, do you agree?---Yes. Yes.

10 Were you working on that day? I understand that you were?---12, 12.

Have a look at the calendar?---12 January.

2015?---2015, which is Monday.

Is it?---Not working.

You weren't working on that day?---12 January, '15?

20 2015, no?---Yeah.

You might be right, Ms Chanthalangsy?---Yes, not working Monday.

And on, on your time sheets it says that you were working on the Monday.

THE COMMISSIONER: The second-last page of the time sheets?
---Second-last page. 12/1, 12/1.

30 It shows you working from 9.30 to 14.30 on a Monday. Do you see that?
---Yes, I see that. It was working (not transcribable) only special that we
need to be done complete, that's all, otherwise never work.

MR RAJALINGAM: Ms Chanthalangsy, just to be sure I'll show you a
time sheet for 12 January, 2015, just so that you can be sure about that?
---Yes.

Commissioner, I should probably tender the bundle of documents that relate
to the spreadsheet - - -?---Yes, correct.

40 - - - the Commission has?---That's my writing.

It's the primary material essentially.

THE COMMISSIONER: Are you talking about the time sheets?

MR RAJALINGAM: I'm talking about the actual time sheets.

THE COMMISSIONER: Oh, okay.

MR RAJALINGAM: So I can tender that, but Commissioner, you can simply rely on the table.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes. Well, the actual time sheets can be Exhibit 23.

10 **#EXHIBIT 23 - TIME SHEETS & WAGE PAYMENT DETAILS FOR CHANTHANETH CHANTHALANGSY DURING 2013-2014 & 2014-2015**

MR RAJALINGAM: And the table I think was Exhibit 22.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, I think so.

20 MR RAJALINGAM: It can't be shown on the screen, Commissioner, because there are some details relating to Ms Chanthalangsy that haven't been redacted, so I think Mr Chhabra has been provided a copy of the time sheets.

All right. So Ms Chanthalangsy, you agree that you were working at 10.30am on 12 January?---Yes.

All right. Pardon me. The handwriting on the time sheets is yours, isn't it? ---Yes.

30 Okay. Can you just have a look through all the time sheets very quickly and just confirm that that's your handwriting?---So all of it?

Just have a quick look, I mean satisfy yourself?---Yes.

So do you agree that - - -?---Yeah.

- - - the time sheets are written by you?---Yes, that's my writing.

All right. Okay. So just turning to this document, you agree it's the 12 January, 2015, 10.29am?---Yes.

40 And do you agree that it's for an amount of \$619.85?---Yes.

If we turn the page 38. Would you have completed this form, the reimbursement form?---Very hard to see. MPP. Yes.

And the next page. What about – is the writing yours at the bottom?---Yes.

And are you working out a calculation for a total amount for each allocation on MYOB?---Yes.

The next page. You agree – these are receipts that were provided in support of that transfer, that claim of reimbursement. The first page has some receipts from S+S Hair.Beauty and I’ve asked you about those receipts before generally. I’ll ask the investigator to turn the page. There is a receipt on that page 41 for United Car Rentals at Surfers Paradise.---Mmm.

10 Do you remember that receipt?---Yes. I did ask her. She say she go to conference.

Okay. Did you know whether or not three was actually a conference at Surfers Paradise?---I have no idea. That’s what her job. I don't know.

Page 43. There's first of all a Myer receipt. I’m just going to try and get some more clarity on the left-hand side. You see one of the last entries refers to a Ben Sherman casual two-belt gift. Do you see that where the mouse is pointing?---Yeah, I see that. I see that.

20 And above that there are some products, Natio products, N-a-t-i-o?---Yes.

Do you know that to be a male grooming product?---I don't know. Never ask her.

Did you ever – you see the notation at the top “staff amenities”.---Mmm.

Whose writing is that?---I did writing that.

30 Why did you write staff amenities there?---She is the one who order me to – whatever the code to put in.

And the Ikea receipt also staff amenities.---Ah hmm.

Did you ever raise your concerns with Ms Sharobeem about these receipts? ---No.

Do you recall these ones, do you actually remember these ones?---Yes, I remember these.

40 Do you remember her giving you instructions to reimburse her?---Yes. By verbal this one.

What did she say about the allocations?---She say just put in staff amenity this one.

The next page 44 is also staff amenities on the top of the receipt.---Yes.

For both of them.---Yes.

One relates to Myer, do you agree?---Yes.

And the other relates to Kmart?---Yes.

Page 45 Target and Ikea receipts, again staff amenities?---Mmm.

Is that your writing?---Yes.

10 Who told you to put that there?---Dr Eman Sharobeem.

And page 46 is not here, page 47. See the note at the top right-hand side?
---Yes.

Whose handwriting is that?---MPP, that's Dr Eman Sharobeem wrote that.

And what about the rest of the writing?---The (not transcribable), that's my writing.

20 Yeah. And what about 4475?---440.75?

440, sorry?---Yeah, that's my writing, what she say MPP, to go with MPP.

So what is, what are you being instructed to do here, do you remember, what were you being instructed to do in relation to these receipts?---To put in the code of MPP. Grant, to pay from MPP grant, this amount.

The next page, 48, now, I just showed you a transfer for 12 January, 2015
- - -?---Yes.

30 - - - at 10.29am, this one would you agree is at 10.31am?---Yes.

So it's two minutes later?---Yes.

Did you do this transfer? Actually I'll show the receipts first, I'll show you the documents first?---Mmm.

The next page, 49, that's the reimbursement form. Whose writing is that on that form?---My writing.

40 What does it say, do you know?---STEP Employment.

Does it say STEPS, STEP to Employment?---Yes. That's the code that she advised me to put on.

How did she advise you to put that there?---Either write out in the piece paper yellow one or verbal or something, that's all she did instruction.

Turn to page 51. Can you describe what this is?---This one my writing, noted down that bank receive from this number this amount or something to check up.

Was this a reminder for you to pay that amount?---Not to pay that amount, to chase up this number that, this amount that, to filing. So either she's the one who pay, that's why I write out this, so I will see this, this number receipt of the bank receipt belong to what, what, what.

10 And I'll just turn back to page 48. Do you see that the receipt number there is I31058164?---Mmm.

And then go back to page 51?---6184, 8164.

It's the same number, isn't it?---Yes.

Where did you get the resealable bag from, the bag, the plastic bag, do you see how there's a resealable plastic bag?---Yes.

20 Where did that come from?---I'm the one who make that to put everything for audit, because all the receipt, there's a bundle, there's a lot, so each one I do I have to separate the date and I put in envelope for auditor.

And so the receipts found in that bag, resealable bag - - ?---Mmm.

- - - relate to the transfer which is written there?---Yeah.

It's labelled, and the amount as well?---Yes.

30 And that's all your handwriting?---Yes, my handwriting.

You would have put the receipts in the bag?---Must be, yeah.

Page 57, do you see at the bottom of that page there are some receipts from Bing Lee Casula?---Yes, I see that.

They're for approximately \$1,000 each, some are for \$1,200 approximately. Quite large sums of money. Do you agree with that?---Yes.

40 Do you remember raising any concerns with Ms Sharobeem about receipts from Bing Lee Casula?---Not this one.

Just, just bear in mind that these transfers, Ms Chanthalangsy, relate to about 10.30 in the morning on 12 January, okay.---Ah hmm.

I'm going to show you another transfer for 12 January at 10.27 that morning and perhaps, Commissioner, I might do this and then we can take a break. Volume 22 of the allegation, page 41. Page 41. Firstly, as a bookkeeper did

you sometimes – I think you’ve already agreed you paid invoices directly to third parties. I’m not talking about Ms Sharobeem but did you ever make direct payments from the IWHS account to pay invoices?---(No Audible Reply)

So if a handyman came and did some work and gave the service an invoice would you pay that invoice?---Yes, I pay invoice. That’s – but under approval of Dr Eman Sharobeem.

10 But do you remember making those, what I refer to as direct payments to other people for the service, so it’s not a reimbursement it’s directly paying someone else?---To their account?

To their account.---Yes.

So you remember doing that as well?---Yes.

All right.---Yes.

20 This transfer relates to a direct payment to another person, another company. You agree it’s for 12 January, 2015?---Yes.

At about 10.27am?---Yes.

For \$3,400?---Mmm.

And if you turn the page to 42 some three minutes later another transfer for \$5,000 and they relate to Minda Australia Pty Ltd.---Mmm.

30 Do you agree with that?---Yes.

Do you remember making this particular transfer?---It shouldn’t be the (not transcribable). That’s 9,000 something. That’s why we have two separate, two - - -

Yeah.--- - - - two time. Yeah.

But do you remember receiving a receipt or invoice from Minda Australia? I’ll show you that. Page 43. Do you remember this document?---No, can’t remember this one.
40

Next.---Minda.

Just turn over to the next page.---No, not this one.

Do you recall that document?---Pay tomorrow (not transcribable) Minda Security Shutter unpaid. Mmm, that’s her writing.

Do you - - -?---Not for pay.

Do you recall making a payment of about \$8,400 in your time as a bookkeeper at IWHS?---Yes. If you got the note like this, yes.

And my question is did you – do you recall making large payments, direct payments?---Yes.

Yeah. Perhaps that's a convenient time, Commissioner.

10

THE COMMISSIONER: All right. We'll adjourn till 12.00.

SHORT ADJOURNMENT

[11.33am]

THE COMMISSIONER: Now, you're still under the same affirmation to tell the truth, Ms Chanthalangsy?---Yes.

20 Thank you.

Yes, Mr Rajalingam?

MR RAJALINGAM: Ms Chanthalangsy, I was showing you some transfer receipts before the break?---Okay.

I'll show you another one at page, volume, allegation volume 3, page 71. I just took you to some transfers before the break for 12 January?---Yes.

30 This one will be for the 13th, the next day?---Okay.

Right. 13 January, page 71. Can you see if you were working on 13 January, 2015? The program's crashed. I might just continue asking some questions, Commissioner. Ms Chanthalangsy, for 13 January - - -?---Yes.

- - - 2015 - - -?---It was Tuesday, yes, I'm working then.

So you were working?---Yes.

40 Do you know what time you were working?---9.30 to 2.30.

Do you see that document, Ms Chanthalangsy?---Yes.

It's for \$5,000?---Yes.

Now, on the next page there is a transfer for 21 January for \$1,649.70? ---Yes.

But can you confirm that you were not working on 21 January?---21
January, 21 January, yes, not working.

Okay. So the next page, 73, is a reimbursement form. Is the total
reimbursement on the bottom left-hand side of the table, the total
reimbursement?---Yes.

It's 6,549.70 potentially?---Yes.

10 Is that the total of the two transfers that I just showed you?---6,649.70, yeah.

Yeah. And that's the total of the \$5,000 transfer on the 13th - - -?---Yes.

And a transfer on 21 January for \$1,649.70?---Yes.

Now, if you look – is that right?---Yes.

If you look at the reimbursement form, is the handwriting on the bottom
right-hand corner yours or Ms Sharobeem's?---My one.
20

Are you sure about that?---Yes.

What about the squiggle next to the writing?---Oh, that's her approval.

Okay. What is this document telling you to do?---(No Audible Reply)

I withdraw that. Do you know if in relation to these receipts you received
an oral or a written instruction?---Yes, I have approval to separate this.

30 Just turn the page. I should have shown you this as well, Ms
Chanthalangsy, there's a note at the top right-hand corner. It says, "Office
outreach establishment?"---Yes.

Do you agree with that?---Yes.

And there's a number 9. Do you know what the number 9 relates to?
---Probably the number of receipt, the total number receipt, one, two, three,
four, five, six, seven, eight, nine, like that.

40 And what did you – whose writing is that?---Dr Eman Sharobeem.

So what did you understand by that note?---Just tell me this amount that's
belong to office outreach establishment.

If you go to, sorry, page 73 on the reimbursement form, do you actually
refer to the outreach establish program in the table?---Yes.

Where does it talk about the outreach program in the table?---Mmm.

Do you understand what I'm asking?---Yes, yes, yes. Still looking.

Does that form – does the form, the table of itself relate to various programs that were conducted or types of expenses?---Expense.

So the form doesn't talk about the actual programs that were being conducted. Do you agree with that?---Yes.

10 But you have written under the form “office outreach establishment”. Do you agree with that?---Yes.

Why did you write that on this form?---That’s what her note say, “office outreach establishment”.

And so did you, for the sake of clarity, note that on this form as well?---Yes.

20 Just going back to page 74. You see in the middle, the top middle receipt is a credit card receipt. Do you agree with that?---Yeah, in third one, yes.

Yeah. For \$4,000?---That’s the card, yeah.

Do you agree?---Yes.

Do you remember asking Ms Sharobeem any questions about a Bing Lee receipt for \$4,000?---I would get the same answer when I ask. Just do what I told, nothing else.

30 What did you think would happen if you didn't make the payment?---I would get sacked.

Why did you think that?---Just do what I told otherwise no job.

Is that what she said to you?---Didn't say the word. Just do what I told you to do.

How would she say that to you?---Mmm?

40 How did she say it to you?---When I ask question, she just say, “Just do what I told.”

Can you describe how she would say it? Would she say it in a loud voice, soft voice?---“Just do what I told.” Like that.

So would you agree that she would tell you abruptly to do what you were told?---Yes.

Quickly?---That’s like when people ask question too much.

Do you think she would get frustrated when you asked her questions about the reimbursements?---Angry.

She would get angry?---Yes, when you ask.

I'll take you to page 75 of allegation volume 3. That's a transfer for 27 January, 2015. Do you agree?---Yes.

10 Do you also agree that it takes place at 10.20am?---Yes.

And, Ms Chanthalangsy, I think you were working on that day. Would you confirm that?---I will see. 27 January. Yes, Tuesday, yeah.

So you were working that day at that time?---Yes.

And do you agree that the transfer relates to \$4,568?---Yes.

20 Whose writing appears – sorry. So you agree with the amount? \$4,568?
---Yes.

Whose writing appears in the red colour?---My writing.

Your writing. And what does it mean?---Just note down what I have to do.

What about the writing underneath that says plus 3,000 - - -?---That's Dr Eman Sharobeem.

30 Do you know what that means?---3,000 was paid on 2 of 12 January, '15
like that. Yeah, not really clear.

And turn the page to page 76. I'm just going to show you that writing. Is that your handwriting or Ms Sharobeem's handwriting?---My handwriting.

Does it refer to the STEPS to Employment program?---Yes.

And also Smith Family?---Yes.

40 All right. Do you know why you would have written those things down on the reimbursement form?---Each time I wrote down I have to approve with her, tell me what to do then I know how to write it.

Each time you wrote something on the reimbursement form would you seek or would you have Ms Sharobeem's approval to make payment?---Yes, correct.

Are you writing on this reimbursement form simply to make it clearer?
---Yes.

The next page 77. That's another resealable bag isn't it?---Yes.

Is that your writing in red?---Yes.

Whose writing in black?---My writing.

Your writing as well?---Yeah.

10 Page 80, top right-hand corner refers to \$904.60 STEPS to Employment Smith Family. Do you agree with that?---Yes.

What is that telling you to do?---This one from Dr Eman Sharobeem. She put in for the grant STEP to Employment Smith Family.

How much?---904.60.

20 The next page 81 there's a Post-it note at the top right-hand corner. Whose writing is that?---Staff amenity. My writing.

Why was – why would you have written that there?---Just to know which one go to staff amenity.

You see on the bottom right-hand corner and the middle right-hand side receipt there's staff amenity written on the top as well.---Yes.

Is that your writing?---Yes.

30 How would you know to put that there, to write staff amenity?---I've been, yeah, I've been told by her.

Page 83. Is that writing "food \$644.55" yours?---Yes, my writing.

Why did you write that there?---That's what I, I've been told to put under food 644.55.

And is it the similar case in relation to receipts on page 85?---Yes.

40 86?---Yes.

You wrote staff there - - -?---Yes.

- - - on that Myer receipt?---Yes.

Does it relate to staff amenities?---Yes, correct.

But you – did you know when you wrote it – wrote staff amenities there that it related to what appears to be perfume being purchased from Myer?---I understand that but that's what I've been told to do so - - -

Page 89. That refers to STEPS to Employment top right-hand corner.
---Yes.

Is that Eman Sharobeem's handwriting?---Yes, correct.

10 It relates to \$1,735.65.---Yes. Yes.

If you turn back to page 76, there's a reference at the top in your handwriting, STEPS to Employment, 173.65. Do you agree?
---Yes.

And have you written that there because you were given this Post-it note on page 89 - - -?---Yes.

- - - about that?---Yes.

20

And that's that, that Post-it note?---Yeah.

Pardon me, Commissioner.

Commissioner, I'm going to tender another document that's not in the brief, another transfer document. I'll show you a document, Ms Chanthalangsy?
---Yes.

30

Do you see that that is a transfer on 28 January, 2015?---Yes.

Do you know if you were working that day?---28 January. 28 January. No, oh, yes, in here, yes, 28 January, which is Tuesday, yes. Oh, no, '15, sorry, sorry.

Yes, 2015?---Wrong one, wrong one, sorry.

28 January, 2015?---'15, '15, 28 January. No.

40

You were not working that day?---No.

Okay. You agree that it's for a transfer of \$568.75?---Yes.

All right. If we turn the page, do you agree that that is a printout of a bank account?---Yes, that's the bank account.

Do you see, do you recognise that as a printout of the IWHS bank account?
---Yes.

Do you see the third entry on 2 January, 2015, it refers to Eman West repay, \$5,000?---Yes.

Do you remember in January 2015, whether that was around about the time Ms Sharobeem had purchased the Mercedes vehicle?---(No Audible Reply)

In January 2015?---I remember that she bought the car, that's on Christmas, we on holiday.

10 So around about that time - - -?---Yeah.

- - - you knew that she was purchasing a car?---Yes, but we're not working. She's, she's still on Christmastime. When I come back, then she tell.

Oh, I see. And did you know that it was a personal car that she purchased? ---I have no idea what she did.

You see next to the word, "repay" on that document, the second page, it says, "car deposit?"---Yes, I see that.

20

If you turn the page again, can I ask you if you recall that document being given to you by Ms Sharobeem?---Yes. When, when I come back and she give me the detail to put in the MYOB, yes, she did.

Do you know what the – from reading this document, do you know what the \$5,000 reimbursement was in relation to?---It mean that she put her money 2,000 deposit first, then also the 3,000 for reimburse something somehow. That's why 2,000 and 3,000, that's mean 5,000 (not transcribable).

30 Was she asking you to enter these details into MYOB?---Yes.

Whose writing appears underneath the typed writing, where it begins "repaid"?---That's my writing, yeah.

Why are you writing that there?---Writing to confirm that we pay 3,000 for reimburse and 2,000 for car deposit, just for me to remember when I refund for her.

40 The next page. I'll show you the page after that, actually, first. Do you remember receiving this document?---Yes.

What does this say? Whose writing is this?---My one.

What does this mean?---This one, that's the note to put in so I know what's the total, what's the detail when after I finish work I note down. It could be I put on the plastic bag just to know.

So this is after the transaction had been processed?---Yes, correct.

You don't know if – you weren't working when the transaction was processed, is that right?---Ah hmm.

Is this after the MYOB process has been conducted?---Yes, after.

Entering it into MYOB.---After.

10 If you go back a page to the reimbursement form. Why have you written “MPP”?---Oh, that’s been told by this amount go to the MPP.

Who told you?---Dr Eman Sharobeem.

The first page of receipts. On those receipts is written “conference”. Is that your writing?---Yes.

And what about the writing on the Post-it note?---This one, I'm not sure whose writing that one. But conference, 1,861.05, that’s my writing.

20 And why would you have written that there?---I've been told that the amount is spent just for conference (not transcribable) meeting.

If you go to the next page and the page after that, the writing on the top right-hand corner?---That’s my writing, “total”.

And the page after that? Top right-hand corner?---That’s her writing, “MPP”.

30 If you go back a page, are you sure that that is your writing?---“MPP”, that’s her writing. The total 3,568, that’s my writing.

I see. Okay. Was it the case that Ms Sharobeem would give you these Post-it notes with simply the name of a program?---Yes.

And was your process to then write a total - - -?---Yes.

- - - figure for all the receipts relating to that program - - -?---Yes correct.

40 - - - on the Post-it note?---Yes.

And was that for your purposes in relation to entering the transaction on MYOB?---Yes. And for the record for audit later.

Sorry, I missed that.---Then for record everything for auditor later too.

I'm not sure if I tendered this bundle.

THE COMMISSIONER: No, you said you were going to. And it can be Exhibit 24.

#EXHIBIT 24 - DOCUMENTS RELATING TO FUNDS TRANSFER ON 28 JANUARY 2015

10 MR RAJALINGAM: On the same day Ms Sharobeem – page 92, volume 3 allegation brief. 92, page 92, volume 3. First of all, while that’s being brought up on the screen, were you working on 28 January, 2015?---28th.

You may not have been.---28 January. ’15?

28 January, 2015.---28 January.

I think you agreed previously - - -.---No.

20 - - - that you weren’t working on that day. You see that this is a transfer for \$4,171.95?---Yes.

I just want to confirm with you that – if you flick through the document that that’s the reimbursement form and – sorry, go back. That writing on the reimbursement form is yours isn’t it?---Yes.

But it couldn’t have been written on 28 January, 2015. Is that right?
---Couldn’t be.

30 You may have received the – I withdraw that. Is your evidence that you sometimes received the transfer receipts after they’ve been completed?
---Yes.

Sometimes days after they’ve been completed?---Yes, correct.

And you would process them when you received the receipts?---Yes.

40 If we turn the page. Again is that your writing or Ms Sharobeem’s writing?
---On the top bank receipt that’s my writing. STEP to Employment that’s Dr Eman Sharobeem’s writing.

When you say your writing, are you including bank receipts, the I reference number and the \$4,171.95?---Yes. Yes.

Does there appear to be another Post-it note on top of that with STEPS to Employment written?---Yes.

Do you know if the number 4-1-7-1-9 – 4171.95 is your handwriting or Ms Sharobeem’s?---That’s Dr Eman Sharobeem.

I'll take you to a document page, volume 3 of the allegation brief, page 98. 9 February, 2015. Ms Chanthalangsy, were you working on that day?---Yes.

You agree the transfer is for \$5,000 at 1.55pm?---Yes.

There's another transfer the following day 10 February at 10.48am. Do you know if you were working on that day?---Yes.

10 You were working?---Yes.

Okay.---10 February.

And the next page is the reimbursement form. Does that reimbursement form reflect the total of the transfers that you've just looked at?---Yes.

Yes. Just turn, turn back a page. The receipt before was for \$1,304.18 and the, and the other – the transfer on 9 December was 5,000.---Mmm.

20 So would you agree the reimbursement form reflects the total?---Yes, yes.

All right. And is that writing on the reimbursement form your writing? ---Yes.

Did you complete the reimbursement form?---Yes.

Turn the page to page 101. That document, the Post-it, the red Post-it note whose handwriting is that?---My writing.

30 Now, if you go through these receipts, page 102, there's a number on the top left-hand corner of the first receipt 6-1-0-6-6. Do you see that?---Yes.

And that number appears on all of those receipts. Do you agree with that? ---Yes.

The next page 6-1-1-0-6 appears on each receipt - - -.---Yes.

- - - except the – actually all of those receipts.---Yes.

40 Do you agree with that?---Yes.

Page 104. All of those receipts have written on them a number 6-1-1-0. ---Yes.

Do you agree?---Yes.

And the following page 105 all of those receipts relate to – have a notation 6-1-1-0?---Yes.

What is 6-1-1-0, Ms Chanthalangsy? Are you able to tell from the reimbursement form?

THE COMMISSIONER: Is it 6-1-1-0 or 6-1-1-1-0?

MR RAJALINGAM: Oh, it is 6-1-1-1-0. Thank you, Commissioner.---Just the code, the expense code, something.

10 Yeah, and is the expense code there on the reimbursement form 6-1-1-1-0? I don't think it is.---6-1-1-1-0.

Oh, it is - - -?---That's, that's in there.

So 6-1-1-1-0 relates to staff training conference, is that right?---Yes.

Okay. And 6-1-0-6-6, what does that relate to?---6-1-1-0-6. Staff amenity.

Relates to staff amenity, doesn't it?---Staff amenity.

20

Who told you to right those two codes on these receipts?---Dr Eman Sharobeem.

And 6-1-1-1-0 is an allocation to staff training conferences. If you go to page 104. 104. Yeah, you're right. All of those receipts have 6-1-1-1-0 noted on them, don't they, Ms Chanthalangsy?---Yes.

Now, if you were aware that all of these receipts related to the purchase of jewellery, would you have recorded them in the reimbursement form for conferences?---That's what I've been told.

30

You agree, first of all, the receipts don't indicate what they relate to? ---Yeah. They're (not transcribable).

So when you look at the receipts, you don't know what shop they've come from?---No.

Do you agree?---Yeah.

40 Do you agree that you don't know what's been purchased?---I don't know.

If you had a list of jewellery on those receipts, would that have caused you some concern in allocating it as a conference?---I still have to do anyway, the boss tell.

So even if you have those receipts, you would process them?---But I let everything for Nathan know. I say, Nathan, please check. I can't say much.

I've been told not to say – I've been told to do my work, then I just did it.
But Nathan know everything anyway.

But do you agree that none of these receipts show what's been purchased?
---Yes.

I'll show you another document, page 106. That's for the same day, which I
think you said you were working. I'll just show you for 10 February a
transfer for \$1,304 at 10.48am. Do you agree that this is a transfer at
10 10.49am on the same day?---Yes.

For \$3,192.43.---Yes.

If you turn the page, that's the reimbursement form, isn't it, in relation to the
transfer?---Yes.

Is that your writing at the bottom right-hand corner?---Yes.

And everywhere else on the document is your writing, isn't it?---Initial
20 approval, that's Dr Eman Sharobeem.

On the bottom right-hand corner, the - - -?---Yes.

- - - the initial?---Yes.

Okay.---That's her approval.

Do you know when she would have put that on the document?---Sorry?

30 When would she have noted the reimbursement form with her initial? After
you had created it, the form? Or before?---Before we pay, she have to
approval.

The next page, whose writing in the top left-hand side? Oh, that's – sorry.
The middle of the page, a Post-it note, that's your writing, isn't it?---Yes.

And you're referring to the transfer?---Yes.

40 Do you know what that says, Ms Chanthalangsy, do you recall that
document in any way?---Hardly to read that, yeah.

No?---It's too hard to read.

The next page, the top right-hand corner there's another Post-it note 14.9
and then a figure, firstly, do you know whose handwriting that is?
---1-4-7-5, that's Dr Eman Sharobeem.

What does this mean?---Not quite sure this one, 1-4-7-5.

If you turn the page - - -?---14 of the 9.

- - - there's another one, 14.C?---Yeah, not sure.

Do you know what that's referring to?---Not sure, yeah, that's her writing but not sure that one.

Page 112?---Upside down.

10

Do you see your handwriting on this document?---Yes, on the top and the bottom bank receipt, that's my writing, STEP to Employment, that's Dr Eman Sharobeem.

What about the figure underneath STEPS to Employment?---Hard to tell. This one hard to tell, no, it's scribble.

20

Do you know what that's essentially saying, Ms Chanthalangsy? You've got a lot of information there, you said you wrote it, can you explain what that means, the writing? Just go from the top down. First of all, 6-1-0-6-0, what's that?---Oh, that's the code to put in.

Okay. What about Pro Events?---Must be that code, 6-1-0-6-0, that means Pro Event. The total 995.47.

30

And then under that, 4,568?---That's the bank receive, that's the number of the transaction receive, I-2-1-0-8-3-8-7-4, that's the total of 568 and somehow been fixed 25 March, then STEP Employment, that's Dr Eman Sharobeem, something at the bottom, can't see clear, not clear.

If you go back to page 106, 106, the receipt number there ends with 4-0-1-5, and if you go back to page 112, so the receipt number is 4-0-1-5 for 10 February, 2015. Does that mean that the receipt number that you've written here - - -?---Mmm.

- - - is different to the transfer - - -?---Yes, but been, been fixed 25 March, '15, so somehow it's been fixed.

40

What does been fixed mean?---This mean fix the total amount whatever needs to be. So it's been fixed on 25 March. To balance them.

So 25 March, 2015 is ahead of 10 February. Is that a notation by you to pay that amount in the future or are you unsure?---This one unsure but I wrote in there been fixed. That's – somehow that's been fixed already that amount that need to be fixed or to be paid.

The next page has some more handwritten notations. Are they your – is that your writing?---Yes.

What about the final Post-it note with MPP on it?---Dr Eman Sharobeem.

What about the figure 5,619.84?---That's my writing.

I'll take you to another transfer. Ms Chanthalangsy, I've got about five more transfer to take you through just so that you know.---Okay.

10 Is for 17 February on page 123 of volume 3 of the allegation brief. Is that a transfer for 17 February at 10.35am?---Yes.

Were you working on that day?---17 of February. Yes.

The next page is a reimbursement form. Again is that your writing on the reimbursement form?---Yes.

And is it Ms Sharobeem's initial on the bottom right-hand corner?---Yes.

20 The next page, is that your handwriting or Ms Sharobeem's handwriting?
---My handwriting.

I'll show you on pages 126-131 a number of receipts and there's a – the first receipt there's a reference to 6-1-0-7-2. Again is that a reference to a code?
---Yes.

On MYOB?---Yes.

The next page, again do you recognise some code 6-1-1-0-6?---Yes.

30 The next page, are there also codes on all of those documents 6-1-1-1-0?
---Yes.

And I think you said earlier that 6-1-1-1-0 related to conferences?---Yes.

Do you see – just back to page 128. Do you see the top right-hand corner 16.D. Do you know anything about that Post-it note?---Which one, sorry?

Top right-hand corner.---Oh, 16-1. No, I don't.

40 Do you see the invoice underneath that Post-it note has \$3,505.88.---Yes.

Do you know what that represents, just looking at those receipts?---It could be the total of this page.

If I take you to the reimbursement form, 124.---124.

Would you agree – you see there that under “self-training conferences” there's an amount of \$3,505.88?---Yes, I see that.

The figure that was written on the receipt.---Yeah.

So go back to page 128. So is it your evidence that you added up all the receipts with the code 6-1-1-1-0?---Must be.

You came up with that figure.---Must be that.

10 And did you then enter it into the reimbursement form?---Yes.

And then what happened to the reimbursement form after you printed it out?---Print it out to get approve everything okay, then process the money.

Okay. You said print it out. You take it and approve.---Mmm.

And who approves it?---Dr Eman Sharobeem.

20 And does she approve it by initialling the reimbursement form?
---Sometimes she approve with that. Sometimes she sign on the small note that (not transcribable). Sometimes approve that to pay.

Page 132 is a transfer on 16 March, 2015. Were you working that day?---16 March, '15. Yes.

And you see that it's a transfer for \$3,721.85.---Yes, correct.

Turn the page. Is that another reimbursement form?---Yes.

30 And whose handwriting "under the table"?---My handwriting.

If you turn the page. That's your handwriting again, is it?---Yes.

If you go to page 135. Can you see at the top right-hand corner there's a number, \$2,402.90?---Yes.

And there's also a handwritten activity?---"Activity even".

Yeah. "Activity events", is it?---I think.

40 Now, is that your handwriting?---My handwriting, this one.

Does the figure represent a total of receipts relating to activities and events?---Ah hmm.

If you go through those receipts to the next page, if that could be turned. There's no reference to activities or events on those receipts, is there?
---Yeah, haven't got it, this one.

And the next page, there aren't any codes on those receipts. Do you agree with that?---Maybe, yeah. (not transcribable)

Can I take you back to page – those are all the receipts. Can I take you back to page 135. How would you have worked out that total, Ms Chanthalangsy?---Must be the receipt that before that we counting. That's why put the note there. That's (not transcribable) even the total of 2,402.90 and plus whatever left, yeah.

10 I might return to those receipts a little later. Is that an appropriate time?

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, if that suits what you're doing.

MR SULLIVAN: Commissioner?

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes?

MR SULLIVAN: Could I just raise, my client clearly has an interest in these proceedings, but some aspects of the evidence affect it less directly.
20 My client is the Department of Family and Community Services and Ms Eleri Morgan-Thomas. As a courtesy, can I just raise that there may be some parts of the further evidence which I may not be in attendance at court for, Commissioner.

THE COMMISSIONER: All right. Are you able to say when you will or won't be here or - - -

MR SULLIVAN: I could, by looking at the witnesses and their likely evidence, give an indication to Ms Cassie Lee as to those parts at which I
30 would not be attending.

THE COMMISSIONER: Okay. All right. Thank you. Well, that's no problem if you coordinate with Counsel Assisting.

MR SULLIVAN: Thank you, Commissioner.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you. And I'll adjourn till 2 o'clock.

40 **LUNCHEON ADJOURNMENT**

[12.56pm]