

TARLOPUB00160
02/05/2017

TARLO
pp 00160-00199

PUBLIC
HEARING

COPYRIGHT

INDEPENDENT COMMISSION AGAINST CORRUPTION

THE HONOURABLE REGINALD BLANCH AM QC

PUBLIC HEARING

OPERATION TARLO

Reference: Operation E15/1982

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

AT SYDNEY

ON TUESDAY 2 MAY, 2017

AT 2.00PM

Any person who publishes any part of this transcript in any way and to any person contrary to a Commission direction against publication commits an offence against section 112(2) of the Independent Commission Against Corruption Act 1988.

This transcript has been prepared in accordance with conventions used in the Supreme Court.

THE COMMISSIONER: Could Ms El-Baf come forward, please. Thank you.

Thank you. Will you take an oath or an affirmation?

MS EL-BAF: Ah, oath.

THE COMMISSIONER: An oath.

10

<WATFA EL-BAF, sworn

[2.09pm]

THE COMMISSIONER: Now, you're not represented, but I can make an order protecting you against any criminal or civil consequences of anything that you might say here today. It's probably not necessary but just for abundant caution I'll make the order.---Thank you.

20 So pursuant to section 38 of the Independent Commission Against Corruption Act, I declare that all answers given by this witness and all documents and things produced by the witness during the course of the witness's evidence at this public inquiry are to be regarded as having been given or produced on objection and there is no need for the witness to make objection in respect of any particular answer given or document or thing produced.

30 **PURSUANT TO SECTION 38 OF THE INDEPENDENT COMMISSION AGAINST CORRUPTION ACT, I DECLARE THAT ALL ANSWERS GIVEN BY THIS WITNESS AND ALL DOCUMENTS AND THINGS PRODUCED BY THE WITNESS DURING THE COURSE OF THE WITNESS'S EVIDENCE AT THIS PUBLIC INQUIRY ARE TO BE REGARDED AS HAVING BEEN GIVEN OR PRODUCED ON OBJECTION AND THERE IS NO NEED FOR THE WITNESS TO MAKE OBJECTION IN RESPECT OF ANY PARTICULAR ANSWER GIVEN OR DOCUMENT OR THING PRODUCED.**

40 THE COMMISSIONER: And that gives you the protection.

MR RAJALINGAM: Thank you.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, Mr Rajalingam.

MR RAJALINGAM: May you state your full name for the record?---Watfa El-Baf.

How do you spell your last name? E-l - B-a-f.

Are you current working?---No.

Were you employed at the Immigrant Women's Health Service?---That's right.

Was that between September 2005 and June 2016?---That's right.

10 Were you employed as an administrator?---That's right.

And you just have to give an oral response so it can be recorded as well, and just speak up if you could, please?---Yeah, okay, yeah.

Thank you. So you were employed on a regular basis. Is that right?---Yes, each Tuesdays and Wednesdays.

THE COMMISSIONER: Tuesdays and - - -?---Wednesdays.

20 Thank you.

MR RAJALINGAM: Are you sure about the days you worked?---It's specifically in September 2005, yes, but I'm not sure about the specific day, each day, what (not transcribable).

So in 2005 what days of the week were you working?---Tuesday and Wednesday.

30 Did that change?---At the beginning because I was not permanent, I was casual, sometimes if my colleague is not there, so I replace her for one, one day or so, a few hours, whatever, yeah.

What was your role as an administrator?---It's opening the office in the morning, prepare stuff for the group, prepare the rooms, opening the computers, answering the phone, I reply to the messages from the day before or whatever messages on the answer machine, entering stuff into database when that happen, sometimes calling customer, clients to confirm their appointments with Eman or the legal advisor.

40 When you said calling to confirm appointments with Eman - - -?---Yeah, to see Eman, yes.

Do you know what those people were seeing Eman for?---As long as I know she told us that she's a psychologist and they called, asked to make an appointment, even sometimes people who refer this client to Eman, they ask for to see Eman as a psychologist.

Just stepping back from that period of time, when you started at the service was she the manager, Ms Sharobeem?---Yes, she was the service manager.

You started in 2005 and she was already there?---Yes.

Did you come to know her as a CEO at some stage?---Ah, yes, lately I think it's in 2015 she, we, we realised that when she signed the email with CEO and it was beside the other titles on the emails.

10 When did you notice that her title had changed to doctor?---To be honest I'm not sure but maybe after I start working, maybe two or three years, could be 2007/2008.

Ms El-Baf, I've been asked to ask you to speak a little louder?---Maybe I'm too far, yeah.

You are a bit soft so just speak up a bit and we can hear you?---Yeah, okay.

20 Thank you. You were saying that it was about 2007 to 2008 that you noticed the change to doctor in Ms Sharobeem's title?---That's right.

Do you know how Ms Sharobeem referred to the people that she was seeing?---Oh, they call her doctor. We never ask them to call her doctor, they call her Doctor Eman and they, they - - -

And do you know what Ms Sharobeem used to call the people that she was seeing?---What do you mean by this question?

30 Did they, did she call them clients or was there another word that - - -?--- Yes, sometimes when she asked me to ring this client, she would say, "Ring this client and confirm with her" such day or such time to, to come to see her.

Would she ever refer to those people as patients?---No.

Was she busy seeing people as a psychologist in your opinion?---Yeah, sometimes, yeah. Sometimes.

40 On what days would she be busy seeing psychologists?---It doesn't matter because I was there only Tuesdays and Wednesdays. Sometimes I confirm the appointment for Wednesday and Thursday so it depends about her meeting sometimes because she said – she would tell us cancel this meeting because I have to go to a meeting with the minister or I have a meeting in Canberra or I have a meeting in, in the Parliament House. Something like that.

How many clients would she see during the day as a psychologist when you were, when you were working at the service?---It, it varied from time to

time. Sometimes one, sometimes no one, sometimes four or five. It depends, yeah, but it's all on database because she was insisting on entering every single client into database.

Did you ever have any conversations with Ms Sharobeem about her qualifications?---Look, we've been asked by the clients who attend sometimes is she a doctor. We would say I don't know, you have to ask her. Myself, I told them many times if you want to ask this question don't ask me, you have to ask me you have to ask her. They said because she has
10 nothing hang on, on the wall. Usually when we got to a doctor we see that there is qualifications on the wall but we don't see any.

Did you - - -?---That's - yeah, I discuss it with her once and she said no, I don't like to show up and don't tell them nothing. I said to her that when they ask me I said to ask you. That's what happen.

And where did the patients come from?---Different backgrounds. For example, there is Iraqi people.

20 Okay.---There is Egyptian. Mostly Arab. Mostly Arabas people, yeah.

Do you know how they were referred to the service?---Myself, I receive some calls from Centrelink sometimes. They refer to see Dr Eman because they have problems with the husband, domestic violence or stuff like that. Sometimes domestic violence it's like counsellors for example psychologist like Dr [REDACTED] I receive so many calls from Father Shenouda.

From the church?---Yeah. He is Father Shenouda. Yeah, his name Father Shenouda. He will tell me I am Father Shenouda. Can you for example let
30 me talk to Eman or I have a client to see Eman.

How do you spell his last name?---S-h-o - no, S-h-n-o-u-d-a. And even though from STARTT from - not STARTT, from - Nada from I think Fairfield Community Health Centre. Nada, she's a counsellor as well. She's, she works with them I think as a clinician or something. I'm not sure about her title at STARTTS.

All right.---And who else. Yeah, for sometimes, yeah, I receive from even the police station. They will tell me we need to refer someone to Dr Eman
40 because this lady has domestic violence issue and she has - she is feeling unwell because she is isolated or she came to the country for a short period of time and she need some help to break the isolation. She needs to, to see Dr Eman.

I'm going to show you a document. Commissioner, I wonder if the unredacted copy of the client list could be shown. Can I just have a look at that quickly. Thanks. That's volume 1 of statements at page 29 and, Ms El-Baf, you'll see that on the screen, on the TV screen in front of you

there's an identical copy of the same document with the names redacted and the details redacted. Can I ask you if you recognise your handwriting on the first page?---Yes.

Which is your writing?---It's the name column, the confirmation, the mobile number then the last two column as well. The middle one it's my colleague Marie.

10 All right. Would you agree that Ms Sharobeem was busy seeing clients as a psychologist at the service?---Not all the time, it depends, it depends.

What about in 2015, was she busy?---Ah, she was there I think from, yeah, the beginning of the year till mid, mid-year, yeah, she was there all the time and sometimes in some meeting outside, but physically she wouldn't attend every day sometimes, but after that in July she has operation I think and - - -

Well, I'll just stop you there?---Yeah.

20 If you go, if you turn to page, five pages forward, and it will be brought up on the screen as well so you can check that you've got the right page, it says there at the end in the handwriting - - -?---Yeah.

- - - "Eman can't see her," and I think that's in reference to a patient, "until August as she's fully booked?"---Yep.

Was she fully booked for months at a time? Because you'll notice that that entry is next - - -?---Well, no.

30 - - - to June?---That what she told me on that day, that you call all the clients and cancel because we can't say that she has an operation, she told me that tell them that I am fully booked or this such period of time. So when I leave such message like that, I leave it to Marie to see it if someone called so this message will be passed to the other people when I'm not there.

I wonder if that document can be returned, Commissioner. The Commission has heard about facilitators?---Yeah.

40 Can you tell the Commission how facilitators were recruited?---There is, there is Marie before I came to the service, she was the Arabic group facilitator.

If you can speak up?---There were some, the only people I met I think only the Spanish lady, Spanish facilitator, she was paid for that, but the other people, I think they were all volunteerly doing this work.

How were they selected, how were they recruited or employed?---I'm not sure. I'm not sure.

Was there a formal process?---Because they were there so I'm not sure, I'm not sure.

10 Do you know if Ms Sharobeem employed people as facilitators?---The only one I know she was paid is Emma, and she was there before me. I mean she's a Spanish lady, Spanish facilitator, she was there, no, sorry, no, she came later because she was doing some, some work with LASA I think. LASA it's a Spanish organisation and she came I think as a guest speaker for the Spanish group and the lady before her, she was voluntarily doing this, this, this job as a leader. Then when she has a problem, I think her husband passed away or she has problem, this leader, so she gave Eman notice and Emma replaced her for this position. But I'm not sure if she advertised it because as long as I know it doesn't pass through me.

Did you ever know or were you ever aware of any advertisements in relation to facilitator jobs?---No. I didn't do any.

Had you seen any?---No.

20 Were you aware of any facilitators by the name of Emmy Adel - - -?---No. - - - that were working at the Fairfield Centre?---No.

What about Eman West?---I've seen only timesheet was payment to Eman, Eman West.

Right. What about Emma Adly?---No.

30 Rachel Kamol?---No.

Rachie Kakal?---No.

Have you ever seen a cleaner, a female cleaner by the name of Rachel at the service?---Never, no.

40 And when did the cleaners usually clean the service?---Monday I think, yeah, Monday and Thursday. Monday because the following day – sorry, Tuesday and Thursday because Tuesday, Monday/Tuesday we have many groups so they make mess in the area, on Wednesday we have yoga class, they lie down on the floor, that's why we ask the cleaner to come on Tuesday so everything would be clean for the people who does yoga, who do yoga.

Did you ever come to know that Ms Sharobeem's son was cleaning the office?---No.

Had you ever seen him clean the office?---No.

Had he ever talked to you about having cleaned the office?---Never, no.

Were you aware of a facilitator by the name of Andrew Toma?---No.

What about Charlie G?---No.

What about Charl Gamal?---No.

Basha Paulis?---No.

10

Rose Soriel?---I don't - - -

Houda - - -?---Nothing at all, no.

Houda Moukhaiber?---She was I think English teacher, volunteer worker, she's not, she's not a facilitator.

What about Victor Baseley?---No.

20

Reda Shahata?---No.

Suham Talal?---Suham was a cleaner for a while then - - -

How long was she a cleaner for?---Not sure, maybe one year or, or maybe less.

What was the name of the regular cleaner?---David ah, David something. I'm not sure about the surname.

30

Do you know why Ms Suham Talal started cleaning the service?
---Could be 2009/10, sometimes between in this period of time because then we employed, the, the service was without a cleaner because we realised that for a period of time the service was always not clean and we complained to Eman about it and she said, "I will ask the cleaner to do it." And I don't know for how long but I do remember this stuff happening, then David came maybe three years ago. He has been with the service for the last three years.

40

So he's been cleaning since about - - -?---That's right.

- - - 2014?---Could be.

Could it be earlier than that or later than that?---To be sure, I'm not sure, really I'm not sure, but yeah, it's maybe two or three years.

Okay. I'm going to show you a document, brief statements volume 2, page 118. Is that a list of staff at the Immigrant Women's Health Service?
---Ah, which year, this year?

Well, I was going to ask you, do you know what year that document relates to, but just by looking at the people who are said to have been working at that time?---Yeah, that's Dr Eman, Marie, myself, Long Chi, Marie, Marie twice, oh, yeah, for the admin and the Arabic, Georgette Hilmi, that should be, could be between 2010/2012 because Georgette were at the time the facilitator of the message group.

10 All right. The next page?---And then Emma, Emma - - -

Sorry, sorry?---Sorry.

No, no, keep going?---Yeah. Following page - - -

Sorry, this is the second page. So you agree that the last document might have referred to - - -?---Yes.

20 - - - 2010 to 2012. What about the volunteers listed?---Yeah, this volunteers, yes.

What year do you think that this refers to?---Could be the same period of time.

And the next document?---(No Audible Reply)

That's clearly for the 2009, if you can just flick through, keep going, right. Just stop. So you saw a bundle of a number of pages that referred to a staff list. Do you agree with that?---Yeah.

30 Do you know where these documents were kept at the service?---Yes.

Where were they kept?---In the drawer behind the front desk.

Okay. And were they updated year to year?---Yes.

By who?---Myself and Marie sometimes.

40 Did Ms Sharobeem have any input into creating those documents?
---No, no, she - - -

I just - - -?---We always do, do what she, we're being told because when I update this stuff, I update it upon her request, then that at the beginning, then she said, "I don't have to tell you all the time what you have to do, just do it immediately when we have new people, new staff or new volunteer, just run the criminal record check and put it on the database."

Just going back to page 118, can you tell if you drafted this document in about - - -?---Yes.

Did you?---Yes.

Does it appear to be accurate to you in terms of listing staff who worked at Fairfield and Cabramatta?---You mean if it - - -

The names? Is it accurate?---It should be because that's what we have of the, the, on that year. Because I'm not sure about the year. That's why it doesn't come to mind, the whole details about it. Because - - -

10

But are there any names on that document you don't recognise?---No, it's all, all, yeah.

They're all workers?---Yes, yes.

All right.---Some of them in Cabramatta and some of them in Fairfield centre.

20 And just to the 2009 document, page 120, do you recognise all those names as people who worked at the service?---Yes. Yes.

And the next page? Have a look at that. Anyone that you don't recognise? ---No, all these.

And the next page? Just take your time with that. There's some handwritten entries.---Yeah, it's, yeah. Same thing, yeah. We do have these people, yes.

30 Okay. So you do remember those people at the service?---Yes. Yes.

Okay. 123, it's a list of volunteers for a period of 2009. Do you recognise those people as volunteers?---Yes.

All right. Next page is one further volunteer.---Yes.

Page 125 relates to 2011. Now, you agree that the heading is group facilitator and staff contacts?---Ah hmm. Yes.

40 I just want you to look at, well, look at the entire document. Look at the group name and the facilitator or the person listed under contact details, and can you tell me if there's anything wrong in this document for 2011? Do you understand what I'm asking you?---Yes, yes.

Yes.---It's right.

It's right?---Yeah.

Okay. And the next page?---Yes. It's right.

Do you know what this document represents? Do you know what it is?
---This database.

Is that the database - - -?---Database, yes.

- - - that the Immigrant Women's Health Service had?---Yes. Yes, it's from database.

10 Is it a printout from the database?---Yes.

Okay. Does it contain the names of facilitators?---Fatima Kourouche. She was a project worker.

Who was that?---The last one, Fatima Kourouche. She's – I think she was outreach from – I'm not sure about.

Do the entries here appear to be accurate?---Yes.

20 Do you know what year this relates to?---I can tell from (not transcribable) because this from Swahili group. I think before 2012, because Swahili group start after that. 2011, 2012, something like that.

There is a reference to – there's a reference to January 2011 at the top of that document.---Yeah. Yeah, before I said before 2012, yeah.

And you said before 2012?---Yeah, yeah, yeah.

30 Thank you. All right. And that goes over for a number of pages, two pages. Is that document printout of the database or another document? Sorry, page 129. And that appears to be for 2012.---Yes, it is database.

That's the database as well?---I think so, yeah.

You think so or do you know?---(No Audible Reply)

Just I, I'd, I'd want to point out to you - - ----Do you know because the - - -

40 - - - that it looks a bit different from the last one.--- - - - the database, the database happen I think sometimes 2009 or 2010.

All right.---Women Health NSW they send us a lady by the name of Elizabeth Bryan. She did some training with us for maybe three hours or maybe one day which is three or four hours then we start doing – before that there is, there is something like that. I developed tables to put the, the, all the staff and, and whatever details I got. Then after that we start doing the database.

I see.---So that's why I'm just confused about the, the time of this because the database is not only about the staff it's about the client. There is many fields. For example on the left-hand side you can tell there is clients. You click on clients. We have some fields like that to fill in the names and phone number and emergency contact, address. Then second there is I think personnel or whatever staff we had. Then the company we deal with or organisation we deal with whoever refer to us or refer to them. Then we have - - -

10 Did you have facilitators?--- - - - groups.

Sorry?---Groups.

Groups.---In the group, in the group field when you open it, it comes to the screen the name of the group on the top, then the venue, then we have the name of the facilitator or leader or whoever facilitate this group. Then we don't put the names because the name it goes to the client. With this - - -

20 Sorry, you said you don't put the names of who?---The clients. It goes to the field of the clients because we already put the clients in the first one. This, this field with the groups we put only the, as I said the name of the group, the venue, the facilitator name then how many people attend this group, from what time to what time, how many hours.

Can I ask you to turn to page 135. Ms El-Baf, do you recognise this document?---I think this comes from the annual report, annual report.

Sorry, I can't - - -?---The annual report.

30 The annual report?---Yeah.

Do you know for what year?---Julie, Svetlana, Nada, Dalila. Probably 2012/13.

In about March, 2013 - - -?---Yeah.

- - - did Ms Sharobeem ask you to print a copy of the number of programs and attendees for the 2012-2013 financial year?---No. The thing is we receive a call from Women Health NSW.

40

From who?---Women Health NSW. The lady ask Eman because I refer her to Eman I think or – but the thing is what happen Eman ask me that there is a call, she called her, I'm not, I'm not sure about what happened that day but she said there is a call from Women Health NSW asking about a report. Do you know how to do it? I said no, we've never been shown how to do the report.

What sort of report?---It's the database report itself. So how many people attended during the year of 2012-2013.

10 So was Ms Sharobeem asking you for a document from the database which indicated the number of people attending the program?---Exactly. Exactly. She said you have to deal with this lady because you are doing the database yourself. So what I did, I rang this lady and I ask her how to do it. So the database computer is not on my own desk. It's on the second desk. And I'm sorry to correct my colleague Marie, because the database computer, it's only one. No-one can get access to it in the office unless for the administrators. And it's – because it is old one so we have problem with it. That's why Eman said, okay, leave this one for database. Don't touch it unless there is database work on it. And she bought another two computers for the front desk and the admin too. We have two table, I mean, two desk. Admin one, which is we sat all the time, all the time and (not transcribable). And the second one there is a computer, it's used by all facilitators. And always I write a note on it, please don't touch it, the other one with the database. So - - -

20 So the computer that had the database had a sign saying “please don't touch”?---That's it. That's it.

And - - -?---Because we have problem with it. We don't want to lose the database from it.

30 All right. What did you do when Ms Sharobeem asked you for the information?---Yeah, I rang this lady and she told me just go do this. So I sat on the other desk and just followed the step she asked me to do it. And then at the end I print it out. She said, “Can you fax it to me?” and I said yes. What I thought at the time that because Eman told me deal with it, that's, I should do whatever she ask me. And so when I deal with it, that's mean, yeah, follow the step and send it to her. And she rang me later at home and she said, “How can you do that? Why you send it to her without me approving it?” I said, “You told me to deal with it.” She said, “But you have to tell me and it should be through me, not through you.” Okay. I'm going to fix this mistake. So I apologise and said, “I didn't mean it. I don't know what you mean when you said just deal with it and do it with her.” That's what I did. That's why I fax it to her.

40 Do you know what that person's name was? The woman from Health? ---Women's Health NSW. Yes. It's in Leichhardt. They work with Danele Crozier, I think. The main office.

Do you remember her name?---Not really.

Pardon me for one moment. I think you just mentioned an office name. What was that?---It's Women's Health NSW.

Yeah.---That's it.

I see.---Yeah.

And so who - - -?---Who the person who called me, I'm not sure. I'm not sure about the name.

Right. Okay. Were they based in – do you know if they were based in Liverpool?---No.

10

Okay.---No. The main office, it's in Leichhardt.

Leichhardt.---Yeah.

So you said the main office - - -?---Yes, main office, yeah.

- - - was in Leichhardt.---Yeah, yeah.

20

Okay. So do you recall - - -?---Because why I remember that because sometimes when we have problem with the database, if we enter something and we're stuck with it, if you put something it's not the right figure or you want to change the figure you put because you did a mistake in the first place when you type it, it won't go through. So I have problem with it, it's stuck. The computer all, all frozen. So I call them maybe two, three times to fix it up from their office.

Okay.---Or they said just restart it again, switch off the computer and restart it again and you do it again.

30

All right. I'll show you a document. Brief statements, volume 2, page 96. All right. Do you know what that document is?---This the report. This the one.

Now, I'm going to take you to another page. Can you go to page 103? Is that what you printed out?---Yes. That's why I put before on the top, if you can see it. Before.

40

And does it relate to a period between 1 July, 2012 and 30 June, 2013?---That's right.

Are the figures under Q1 the number of people attending in the first quarter? --- (No Audible Reply)

Essentially is that what Q - - -?---Well, which - - -

Does Q1 refer to the first quarter of the financial year?---I think so, yes, first quarter, yeah.

The entry for gambling for Q1 is one. Do you see that?---Yes.

And you see all the other entries there?---That's right.

If you can go back to page 96, how did these notations come to appear, come to be on this document, the handwritten notations? Firstly, whose handwriting is that, do you know?---It's Eman's handwriting because I was with her in the office. She asked me to print out the report and bring it to her. It was I think the end of financial year or stuff like that, so - - -

10

And did you give it to her personally, the version without the amendments? ---Yes, yes.

And where did you give it to her?---In her officer.

Right?---Yes, I printed out from the, from database, I went to the printer in, in the bookkeeper room because we have only one printer only, it's connected to all computers, so I got from there and she asked me to come to her and she start, look, these aren't the right number, I receive so many clients you don't know about, even when you leave home, you go to home, I stay in here and I receive so many phone calls, and she start doing this.

20

Did you see her writing on the document?---Yes.

And did you see her writing these notations onto the document?---That's right. And she asked me to do it. I said, "I can't do it on database, it won't be possible because it's many filled, I don't know how to fill it with these numbers, I don't know, really I don't know how to do it." Because only the training was only three or four hours. So what I did, she start doing, you see this, you just put this, add up, add up the column, add up this column, add up this column, then see if it is the whole lot matching the, the, the - so we have to add up like that - - -

30

The rows?---Yeah, yeah.

Sorry, the columns?---Vertical and horizontal.

Yeah?---So that what I did, then I, she send me a message or she left me a message with Marie I think ah, saying, "Please continue, I don't have the time to continue with it, and you can do it on document instead of database."

40

Can I take you to page 99 of the same bundle. See at the top left-hand corner it says, "Dear Watfa?"---Yeah.

Whose handwriting is that?---Ah, it's Marie.

And what do you think she's asking you to do there?---She, as you can see, this for, this is from Eman, she asks you to continue. So to continue because there is I think three or four pages, I'm not sure about the number of the pages, so she asked me to just continue the same way by adding this number to, to the real database.

10 Okay. I'll – if you can just flick through, turn the page through that document, that's the first page and then the second page, third page – sorry, that's – yeah. If you just go back one page, yep, stop. So do you agree that in the middle of that page you've stopped, someone's stopped writing?
---Yeah, because she emailed me as well saying, "Wafra, can you continue the way we discussed it," I don't know, it was such day, Tuesday or Wednesday, I'm not sure.

Right?---Continue.

I'll show you an email - - -?---Yeah.

20 - - - that was sent to you, page, brief statements volume 2, page 111. Ms El-Baf, this email appears to have been sent on 28 March. You said to investigators that it was sent to you in 2013. Is that right?---(No Audible Reply)

28 March, 2013?---It does say in here the date, I'm not sure about the date.

It says in the top right-hand corner 28 March.---Yeah.

Have a read of the email.---Yes.

30 And I think you told the investigators that it was March 2013.---Yeah. It is 28 March. March, yeah.

Yeah.---The report itself, it says 2012-2013.

Yes.---Yeah. So it should be 2013.

Okay. Is this the email where she's asking you to finish that particular table that I've just taken you to?---Yes.

40 What did you take that to mean, to finish the table? What does that mean?
---The table that because she already did a few column, then there is few pages left she didn't do anything with it. She said continue whenever you have time. So - - -

What did you think "continue" meant? To add them?---Continue with the number. Yeah, continue or add the number.

Did you think you were being asked to increase the numbers?---Yeah, that's right. Because if you can see the numbers on there, the real number it was little amount, then she asked me to add it. And this happened not only on that year. I think it happened in 2015, the same thing happened, and I have argument with her and - - -

That's all right.---And - - -

10 We'll get to 2015 slowly.---Yeah, yeah, yeah.

Well, in the middle of 2015 did you exchange some text messages with Ms Sharobeem on the mobile? Do you remember that?---Yes, that's right.

I'll show you - - -?---Yeah.

20 - - - brief miscellaneous, volume 22, page 156. And just before I continue, in relation to, sorry, the entries on the database that I've taken you to, the handwritten amendments, did you enter those amendments into the database?---No. On that year, no.

Not in 2013?---No, no.

Did you do that in - - -?---Because it's, how to do it?

Okay.---How to do it? I don't know how to do it. Even if I want to, I can't do it, otherwise I wouldn't do it on document. She asked me to do it on document because I couldn't do it on the other side, the database.

30 But did you ultimately later on in 2015 enter these numbers into the database?---In 2014, 2014-15, what happened is I have – after the problem happen with the computer, the database computer, I started doing backup for the whole program, whatever I have on both computers, because I have registration for the clients on the other computer and I have the database on different computer. So what I did, always I have backup. Every few month when I have – every single term when we have renewal for the registration of the clients, whoever comes to attend the classes, English classes or the Serbian group, for example, Spanish group or whatever. So we have to renew it with new dates. If there is new clients, we add it up to the clients. I forgot the point. Sorry.

40 Well, what I'll do is I'll show you these text messages that were sent in June 2015.---Yeah.

And they're at page 156, volume 22, miscellaneous allegation brief. Is that a message that you sent to Ms Sharobeem?---Yes. This was after she – on that day. It was Wednesday. So she came to me and she told me, "Can you show me the database?" So I did. She said, "Go to the groups." So I went to the groups and she said, you see in here, as I told you before, there is

numbers of groups of people who attend on that group. For example, the groups of this day, it's coming all together. For example, on Monday. I have, Monday I have English class, English class, English class, Serbian group, Assyrian group. All right? I should put the whole number of each group on this column. All right? She came to me and she said, okay, and in here 10, 10, 10, 10, 10 to each group. So it will be, at the end of the day, more than 50 people attending who is not attending at all.

10 Okay. I just need you to explain that again. You've used some signals with your hands and I don't think I've appreciated everything that you've said.--- Okay.

You've said you had a conversation with Ms Sharobeem during the day prior to sending this text message.---That's right.

Did you have that conversation at the centre at Fairfield?---At the centre.

20 When you had that conversation did you have a document in front of you? ---What document?

The document of a printout of the database.---No, no, it was – the database it was years ago, the report was a year or two years ago.

Yes.---But this one it happened 2015.

30 Yeah.---Which is she ask me to go to the computer itself and show her the database. So I did. She said open the group. With the group there is as I said how many groups a day, how many people attend this group, each group.

The groups are listed on the left-hand side?---The group on the left-hand side.

Ah hmm.---The time they come, they tell the, the – how many hours they attend and how many people attend in each group.

Okay. So there's a group name - - -?---Group name.

40 - - - a time in which the group is being conducted?---That's right.

So a date and a time?---Yes.

And then next to the date and a time is the number of people attending the group?---Exactly.

And what did Ms Sharobeem ask you to do?---She ask me to add to each group 10, 10, 10, 10, which is in each day we, if we have five, five groups that mean we add 50 people to each – to, to this day as a whole.

If for example for one group there was five people attending - - -?---Yeah.
So it will be instead of 5, 15.

I see. So she was asking you to add 10 - - -?---10.

- - - as opposed to - - -?---That's right.

- - - times it by 10?---That's right.

10

Okay. Pardon me, Commissioner. All right. So what essentially are you saying to Ms Sharobeem in this text message?---So I was really, I was really scared of all this because the number is – I know at the end of the day she would say Watfa did this. I didn't ask her. That's why I send her a message look, Eman, if you wanted to do it okay it's like how can I do it in such period of time. She wants me to do it since the beginning of the financial year which is back to July, 2014. So it should be one year, the whole year I should handle this matter. I said - - -

20

Did - - -?---Sorry.

Did you understand by potentially changing the figures from previous years that someone would notice that you did it?---Not only that because when it is financial year that mean July to July all right. So I have to be from 2014/2015. That will happen for, for one year. I said to her if I want to do it it's really hard because changing the figure sometimes the computer stuck by itself. If, if I change it, it will show the time I opened this, this, this file. There is like, this file was opened on such a day. If I do it all for the whole year in one go it will show that I did it in one go so - - -

30

But it's certainly possible to have amended the figures in the database in 2015 wasn't it?---It's 2014/15.

Yes, in that period of time?---Yes, yes.

And by at least 2013 - - -?---Yeah.

- - - you could change the figures in the database?---That's right. That's right. So that's why this conversation happened with the text messages.

40

Did you send the text to Ms Sharobeem as a way of documenting it for yourself?---It's to make sure that I'm not be – will be the person who will be blamed if I did it because if I refuse to do it I know she will be angry with me and the thing happened a few times during my working with (not transcribable) health service for the 11 years. Whenever I don't or refuse to, to do what she ask if she ask me to do something she will be angry with me and she wouldn't talk to me any more for a while. She will address the

email to Marie and I will get the information from Marie if I want to do something at work.

All right. I'm going to take you to some other emails in a moment.---Sure.

I'll just finish with these text messages. The next text message, I think it's the next page. Yeah. Is what is contained in the yellow box the response from Ms Sharobeem?---That's right, yeah.

- 10 She says in that text, "I got the okay from the consultant and the department after I talked with you." Now, just two questions. When she's saying "I talked with you" do you think she was referring to the conversation she had with you earlier that day?---Yes, yes.

Do you know who she was talking about when she's referred to this consultant?---No.

What about the department?---I do not know.

- 20 Do you know who she spoke to from the department?---I have no idea who is the department and who this consultant. That's why if you continue - - -

So the next message is underneath, isn't it? From you?---Yeah, yeah. I ask her if she can let me talk to the consultant so I can get the proper image from her how to do it if I want to change this stuff on the database, how I can do it properly.

And the next. Thank you.---Thanks.

- 30 So, I think after your text message is the text in the yellow box beginning "No, dear." Do you agree?---Yes.

Is that Ms Sharobeem's text?---Sharobeem, yeah, that's right.

What does it say? Can you read that?---"No, dear. Just add the number as I told you before. I'm saying that I got approval to top up the numbers on the database. I will explain further when I see you."

- 40 All right. How did you feel when you received that text?---I'm stuck with it. I don't know what I have to do but because at the time it was on Wednesday, so I have sometimes to think about it, and usually if I have some argument or disapproval for whatever she wants to do or she wants me to do or she wants to do herself, so I would discuss it with Marie sometimes. I told her what I have to do and such (not transcribable) such position or issue like that. What do you, what do you think I have to do?

Did you have a conversation with Ms Abboud after you received this text message from Ms Sharobeem?---I think so, yeah.

Okay. And what did you both discuss?---I told her about this and I said I'm not sure if I can do it. But on Tuesday when I come, I have to discuss it further with her and I have to get the right thing. She has to tell me what I have to do, not to be blamed at the end of the day about doing this stuff, because I know it's not the right amount, right figure.

10 Did you text her back about two hours later, at 8 o'clock that evening, 8.02pm?---I think so, yeah, because I'm travelling by train. I don't have a car at the time.

I think it says on the bottom of the text message, 8.02pm.---Yeah, yeah.

And you say, "Sorry I didn't see your text till now."---Yeah, that's right.

You're apologising for the late reply.---Yeah, yeah.

20 Do you ask for her in that text message a confirmation email?---Yeah, I, yeah. That's why, yeah, I want to see what her reply will be. And it's, at the same time she told us all the time, "Please email me whatever happen." So I told her the same, "Please, whatever you want to do, just email me back."

Ah hmm.---"Tell me what I have to do because I don't know what to do."

Pardon me. Page 117 of volume 2. Have you seen this note before?---Yes.

30 In relation to those text messages being sent in June, firstly, pardon me, I withdraw that. Whose writing is it?---It's Eman writing. Only the top it's mine. Tuesday, 22/9/2015, to add to database. So it was left to add it. She asked me, no, she came to me and - - -

Hold on, hold on?--- - - - and she said - - -

Just - - -?---Sorry.

When you say - what's your writing, which one's your handwriting?---The one on the top.

40 Is it the words, "Tues, 22/9/15"?---Tuesday, yeah.

"To add to database?"---And then, to add to database, because she told me to add some, some, verbally she told me first can you add this group, I said, "Oh, I don't get it, can you just write it down for me?"

Yeah?---And she did. I gave her a paper and she did. I put it, because you have so many things to do at the front desk, so to do it later, so I put what I have to do, that's message from Eman, that's me, that's, I know what I'm

doing at that time, to add to database. I don't add maybe at the same time, maybe later, maybe following day, so I'm not sure.

So you, did you start this document by writing Tuesday 22/9/15?---No. It was, it was - - -

Or was the - - -?---No, no, no.

10 - - - date already there?---After, after she wrote down on the, I gave her the paper, then I put on something to do because I put some paper aside I would say to do this day or such day or I have to do it during this day or maybe the following day, so I put it aside to do it later because I have so many things to do all the time, being when I attend the front desk.

Okay. Let me see if I've understood you correctly?---Sure.

20 Ms Sharobeem gave you a piece of paper?---No. She came to me and she told verbally. She asked me to do this, this group. I said oh, O.K. I'm really busy. Can you write it down?

I see. Yeah?---So she wrote it down, then I put - - -

Stop there. Then did you write Tuesday 22?---That's right, that's right.

Okay. What do you understand the references on the right-hand side to mean?---Ah - - -

So I'm talking about 45pp/CRC?---There's 45 people.

30 Yeah?---And the number of, number of, I mean, sorry, the CRC - - -

40 Is that a reference to the Community Relations Commission?---Exactly, exactly, yeah. Then it's ah, she has a meeting, it's all meeting, this one, it's meeting, she said you have to register the meeting as well on the database. She was insisting on every single, even people who come from outside to ask a question, please, take their name, put on database. Any phone, put it on database. That's why the argument happened because I said to her, "How you want me to do it?" Even she send me an email, put the nationality of people. How can I ask every single people what, what is your nationality?

When she asked you to put it into the database - - -?---Yeah.

- - - for example if someone called the centre, where would you log that in the database?---Just sometimes I put it on the paper then when I have time I put one after one and I run to database to put it, or I put it at the end of the day after finishing with the groups.

But would you record a telephone call in a program or would you record a telephone call in a specific - - -?---Oh, this, what do you call it, message, message paper, we have a book with messages, small, small paper, it's - - -

But when you log the telephone call in the database in the computer - - -?
---Yeah.

- - - how would you record it?---(No Audible Reply)

10 How would you, where would you log it in the database?---Client.

Okay?---Client, yeah. We go to the client and we put the name and the phone number I took from the person and the purpose of the call and if they provide me with a phone number I put the phone number as well, and that's it.

The reference to CRC in this document, do you know whether or not a program was being conducted at the IWHS that related to the Community Relations Commission in some way?---No, she told me it's a meeting, I do
20 remember that.

Yeah?---She said this is a meeting, Macquarie Uni, I was at Macquarie Uni, there is some people, students or whatever, only she met with them and I don't know what, what was the, the purpose and with the CRC the same thing, she said, I have meeting the rest of the day or such day put this, put that.

So these, these notations here may not be referring to programs at all?
---No, it's not programs, no. Even if it is program we don't have room to
30 get 60 people, 68 people. The room is too small to, to observe those kind of people, amount.

I'll take you to page 112 of volume 2, brief statements. I showed you a document from September. That was a note with the – the last document related to September, do you agree?---Yes.

With the CRC notation on it? I'm going to take you back to June, when you were receiving these text messages. This email that you seem to have sent yourself, can you explain this?---Yeah. This one I discuss with Marie, to
40 add the number to the database, add 10 people to each group. So when I discuss it with Marie on, over the phone, I think or on Tuesday when I come back, she said, "Oh, it's been solved. Don't worry about it." She came to me yesterday, I think it was, or maybe, I'm not sure, but it was I come Tuesday, Wednesday. She ask me on Tuesday, on Wednesday. So I didn't come for the last, the next three working days, which is Thursday, Friday and Monday. So one of these days she ask Marie to enter into database these groups. And she never asked me again to do the 10 people to add it to

the database, so I didn't do it. Because this group maybe, I don't know, maybe replaced the other request.

Were you sent this email from Ms Sharobeem?---No.

Was it sent to you by Ms Abboud?---Yes, that's right.

10 Why have you sent it to yourself from the IWHS account to Yahoo, from yahoo.com.au to - - -?---Oh, because this one, it was sent to Christine Pollachini.

So you sent this email to Christine Pollachini?---That's right.

And who is she?---She's the boss of Eman.

Is she from NSW Health?---That's right. In Liverpool, Liverpool Hospital.

20 What else did you send to Ms Pollachini?---Whatever paper it's come across for me and Marie and - - -

Can you try and be a little bit more specific? You sent this email?---Many emails, not only this. Email relate to database, to prove that what is the allegation of adding number.

So when you - - -?---What you ask me.

Are you saying that you sent the printed database?---Yeah, I sent it to her as well.

30 And that's the one we've seen?---Yes. And - - -

With the handwritten amendments?---That's right.

You sent that to Ms Pollachini?---That's right.

40 Okay. What else did you send?---The bookkeeper, she come every Tuesday, so so many times she came to me and asked me, "Do you know who people is this, are this?" For example, the people you ask me about, Rachel and - - -

Yes?---All these people. And she told me it was, I think in 2015, and she said, "Look, there is many paper, many tax invoices." Because as a permanent staff we have timesheet, and the facilitator they are not permanent. They are only, they fill in tax invoices. So it's all with this numbers and it is from Monday till some of them till Saturday.

You're talking about the times that were being claimed?---Yes.

Yeah?---It was a claim in one go, maybe for two, three months ahead. I mean, for example, if it is March 2015, it goes till maybe January 2015.

So you're saying that there were payments for timesheets that were much older, three months older?---Yeah.

Okay.---Then when she finished from 2015, she came to me again, Neith her name, the bookkeeper.

10 Neith?---She said, look, there is another. It goes from December 2014 and back, step by step, every few days or every few payment she would ask her to fill in till 2014 July.

So you've mentioned three sets of documents. Firstly, this email - - -. ---Yeah.

- - - that appears on the screen.---That's right.

20 And then secondly, also the database printout which was amended that you've been shown.---That's right.

And now you've referred to a number of time – facilitator time sheets. Is that correct?---That's right.

Was there anything – and those three sets of documents were provided to Ms Pollachini?---Yes.

How did you give them to her?---I emailed it to her.

30 Did you scan them and email them?---That's right.

Do you have that email?---Yes.

Where?---What do you mean where?

Is it in your computer?---I don't have computer at the time but, yeah, it was in the – my email address. Yeah, I can, I can - - -

40 So you can get it?---Yes.

I see. Okay. It's in your email account inbox essentially?---That's right. Email account, yeah.

Sent items?---That's right.

How many times do you think Ms Sharobeem asked you to amend details on the database in your time at the Immigrant Women's Health Service?

---This, this (not transcribable), I mean twice time. The one with the report then 2015 when she asked me to do the – to add the number of the, the, the groups and she insisted especially in, in May/June because it was the time before we go to school holiday and she left for to do the operation. Please do it (not transcribable) whatever come across you, any phone calls, any number and then you can do that I have a meeting on weekly basis in such places put always 20, 25 people. So that what I start doing even when the ministers they come attend our service, like Minister John Ajakar, Minister Marise Payne I think, the - - -

10

I'm not sure but continue, yeah.---Marise Payne, the Defence Minister. She's right now the Defence Minister. She came to the office as well. We have meeting and we have some workers from different organisation around the area, in the Fairfield area. So we have maybe 50 people attending the place. Maybe less, between 30-40 people. So always she ask me did you enter it into database? I said – I would say yes, I did, I did, I did. So even if there is no meeting in the, in the, the centre in Fairfield centre she would ask me like yesterday I was in, in a meeting for example like this Macquarie, whatever so you have to do it. I said to her in the email please send me the, the meeting name and what it's about, what is the purpose of it, how many people. So that was the latest conversation of 2015 between us.

20

All right. I think in October, 2015 you may have exchanged a couple more emails with Ms Sharobeem about this particular issue. I'll show you that. Page 113, volume 2 of the brief statements. Page 113. I'll actually take you to page 115 because – 116. We have to work backwards, Ms El-Baf. Sorry, 115. Yeah. Okay. So at the bottom of that page do you see an email from Immigrant Women's Health Service CEO, Dr Eman Sharobeem. She refers do you agree to a meeting she had with Health and if you go to the next page do you remember receiving this email?---Yes.

30

And is this what you're talking about when you say that Ms Sharobeem was asking you to log everything?---Yes.

Okay. You're reply to Ms Sharobeem the next day, do you ask Ms Sharobeem for specific details at the end of your email about the programs?---Yes. What are the meetings. Is that what you mean?

40

Yes.---What are the meeting names, how many people are attending, and the venue or any other (not transcribable), because I can't, I can't just create my own. That's why I'm telling her, "Please can you send me whatever you want so I can put it on database." I can't re-create anything I don't know.

Did you feel like Ms Sharobeem was asking you to come up with figures in the email prior on the 6th?---I'm not sure if she told me verbally or through the email. I'm not sure, really.

If you go to page 114, Ms Sharobeem writes to you that day after your email. Do you see that at the bottom of the page?---Yes.

Can you read that aloud?---“No, we did not agree that I will email you every week. We agreed that I will email you the names of the meetings I attend and the nationalities of the attendees, and then you add 20 people per day accordingly.”

10 What did you think Ms Sharobeem was asking you to do?---If you read the first bit, she ask me to do the meeting and whoever call. Then specifically now she ask me to do the meeting as well, whatever meeting she has. That’s why I’m asking her what kind of meeting or what is the name of the meeting, what is the organisation, what the purpose. That’s what I meant with her. Only sometimes because I don’t understand what she wants me to do with the database if something happen like that. So why I should put nationalities of the people who attend the meeting.

When she’s asking you to add 20 people - - -?---Yeah.

20 - - - did you know who those people were?---No, no.

Did you think they were real people?---I don't know. Really, I don't know.

30 Is your reply to her above that email?---Yeah, I told her, yes, we did agree to send me the names of the meetings and the number of attendees, but really can’t, cannot find any field or section to enter nationality of each attendees because we don’t have on the database any nationality to enter. Then how do you want me to know the name of people and their nationalities? Eman, all I work in here only 10 hours (not transcribable) per week.

Were you essentially saying to her that - - -?---Yeah, it’s no time - - -

40 - - - you were finding the job difficult, essentially?---It’s not difficult. It’s the time she gave me, it’s five hours. That’s why sometimes I spend more hour, maybe one hour extra, to finish what I ever started. Or sometimes if she come late. For example, she come 12.00, 12 o'clock to the centre, or 1 o'clock, and by the time she arrive she want to ask me to do this, this, this, this. So what I do, I follow up what she ask me to do. All right? With the database, because I'm responsible for database in Fairfield and in Cabramatta at the same times. So we discuss it with Luong, she is the coordinator over there, that she can send me - - -

Ms Chan?---Yes.

Luong, yeah.---Luong, yeah. To send me the database report from her centre fortnightly if she can so I can enter it as quick as possible, because if she doesn't it will be accumulated. I wouldn't have the time. So that’s why

what I'm asking Eman at the time, there is no time to do whatever ask me to do with this, because already we have so many works to do in the centre itself, attending to people in the centre, whatever they need, any phone calls. So it's all take times. Sometimes developing, for example, the flyers or updating registration or entering the people who come today, for example, into database. So it takes some time. That's why I'm asking her how do you want me to go back all the way to add all this number plus nationalities and ask people whatever she ask me to do? So that's what I said. That's what I meant. There is no time to do all this stuff in 10 hours per week. But
10 I was handling very well. Even I never ask her for the hours or whatever (not transcribable) I spent in the centre, extra hours.

For how long do you think you were adding these numbers into the database on Ms Sharobeem's instructions?---Mostly it's since – it's happened only twice. When she asked me for the report, then in 2015 when she asked me to do – add the number 10 to each, each group, and this one after she came back from her operation.

All right.---Yeah.
20

Did you essentially say to Ms Sharobeem that you didn't want to do that anymore, altering the database?---No, I never said that.

Did you stop doing it?---No, no. The thing is, with the meeting I couldn't say no because I never attend the meeting. She ask me to do the meeting so I start doing it. That's it.

Okay.---With the group numbers, I never, even with I have a hard disk, it's like USB, big USB, what I did, whatever, whatever I save, back up as a
30 backup before the alteration to the database. So I put it in one file and I put "before". Then whatever happen after, I put "after". And it was all given to Danele Crozier when she replaced Eman as a CEO or when Eman resigned from her position.

So there was a USB stick where you had - - -?---It's, yeah, it's not stick. It's, I don't know, it's like a drive, hard drive. It's given to – and I told Danele at the time when she came, I said, look, Danele, if you find any differences in the number in the last year, so you will know that I'm telling you Eman asked me to do this and this and this.
40

All right.---And it is all "before" and "after". You can find it on the hard disc.

Do you have a copy of that information?---It's with her. I gave it to her because it's a big hard disc, I mean, USB.

Just to take you back to those emails at the top of that page, is there Ms Sharobeem's response to you later in the day on 7 October.---Ah hmm.

And does she say that if you can't – does she say there that if you can't do it, please let me know and I'll do it myself?---Yeah.

Did Ms Sharobeem have access to the database?---Yeah.

How? Using the same computer that you were using?---The same computer, yes.

10 Could she access it from her computer in her office?---No, no.

I'll just ask you to go to page 113. Just perhaps have a look at those emails. They relate to the same topic but would you agree that they were sent and received by you? Do you remember receiving – sending the email at the bottom?---That's right.

And do you remember receiving the email at the top of the page?---That's right.

20 All right. Ms El-Baf, were you aware of a multicultural parenting program being conducted at the Fairfield office?---Yeah, it was for a while, maybe two years or three years.

And when was it conducted?---I can't tell you the exact year but I do remember it was for two people who facilitate this, this, it wasn't facilitated inside the office, Fairfield centre. It was in some school around the area in Fairfield. It was Ashraf Sedrak and Ban Khoshaba. These two are – I do remember these two were the facilitator of this group. But I don't know what they do, and usually she ask me to enter into database every single
30 group. But with this group I never put any names or any clients or any phone numbers. So I don't know if – who is who or what is this group, I don't know.

Where was – you said there was some sort of multicultural parenting program with Ashraf - - ?---Ashraf Sedrak, yes.

Sedrak?---Yeah.

40 He was the facilitator?---I don't know if there is any people for this to be facilitating at the time, because he was attending the office and sitting on the computer all the time. If he leaves, he said I will go to the, some school or something like that. What for, I'm not sure, what is this program by itself. When we ask Eman, she said it's to – for the new generation to be in good relation with their parents. So who was attending this group, really, I'm not sure.

Pardon me Ms El-Baf.---It's okay.

Pardon me Commissioner. Ms El-Baf, when you were spoken to by investigators, I think Investigator Thomas and you provided a statement to him, you were asked about the Multicultural Parenting Program and I think you said in your statement in February this year that it, it hadn't run since 2012, it hadn't been conducted since 2012. Does that sound right to you? ---Is it this year, the investigation this year or last year?

Sorry, what I said to you was that you provided a statement to the investigator in February this year.---Yes, that's right.

10

In your statement, I'm having a look at it, you said that the Multicultural Parenting Program wasn't conducted since 2012.---I think so yes.

Is that fair?---I'm not sure about the exact year, but yes, it's a few years back they stopped this one.

20

After they stopped the Multicultural Parenting Program, was it still referred to in the newsletter of IWHS?---Yes, not only this group that was referred to in the newsletter there is a Spanish Group that finish I think three years, was still advertised one or two years later, even the Swahili Group, the Sudanese Group so they didn't last for a few months or one year, they left but we still advertise it because Eman said whoever ring and say, yeah, take names and number and we, tell them we contact them when we have the amount of people to form a group.

30

All right. I'm going to show you some newsletters very quickly, I'll take you to Term 3 of 2012 it's at Volume 11 of the Allegation Brief page 91 but in that newsletter I'll take you to page 92, the second page of the newsletter. Do you agree that at the bottom of that page on the left hand side you can see at the top of that page it's for July 2012, do you agree with that? Miss El-Baf?---I'm reading sorry.

Oh sorry.---I'm reading it. Yes, usually whatever I did with the newsletter it will be approved by Eman and - - -

But you agree that this newsletter is for July 2012?---Yes.

40

And it refers to the service conducting a Multicultural Parenting Program in partnership with the Smith Family and it was being conducted at Fairfield, Carramar, Old Guildford and Yennora. Is that true for 2012?---I'm not sure, I'm not sure because it's not in the office. I know about what happened in the office, what happened outside I don't know.

Was there a Multicultural Parenting Program at Fairfield in July 2012?--- I'm not sure about the dates, really, I'm not sure but if you look at the - - -

What about in 2015, do you know if there was a Multicultural Parenting Program then?---No.

Is that you don't know or you're saying - - -?---It was advertised but if it is in the newspaper that doesn't mean it exists because that what happened with the Spanish group as I told you before only it was no Spanish group attending the centre but we still advertise it. The same with the Sudanese. We still advertise it maybe one or two years after and we take name to make – to form a group but no one attend and if they attend maybe at the time when we formed this group it was maybe a few people, maybe a handful.

- 10 Is that the same case in relation to STEPS to Employment program, did you ever see it being conducted at Fairfield?---No, no.

Do you know that it was all – it was still advertised in the newsletter?---(No Audible Reply)

I'll show you - - ----No, I don't think so it was advertised. I'm not sure. Really I'm not sure.

- 20 I'll show you a document from volume 12 of the program allegation, page 164 and that's – the newsletter is for term 2 of 2015. While that's happening, Ms El-Baf, do you – can you remember what would take place on a Monday morning at Fairfield in 2015, Monday morning?---Because I don't attend but I – because I put stuff on the database and from the newsletter I do remember that there is English classes, Serbian group and Assyrian group.

Okay. Have a look at the newsletter for term 2, 2015 which is in front of you. Do you see there the first entry for Monday in Fairfield is a STEPS to Employment program?---Yes.

- 30 You've said that you were not there at the office on Monday but do you think that that program took place having regard to the fact that you were logging these programs for the database?---I don't think so because I don't have any data to enter it into database for this group. Usually we do registration for all people who attend this group and we make like, it's a roll. When they attend we tick the name who attends. I mean the facilitator would tick the name and give it to us at the end of the day so we can register it into database. So we don't, we don't have the register.

- 40 All right. Can I take you to page 2 of that document we just – I'll just, for the record it's page 165 of the volume 12 allegation brief. Do you see there on the right-hand side there's a reference to a Multicultural Parenting Program starting at 10 o'clock?---Which day, sorry?

The second entry on the right-hand side.---Is it Wednesday or Thursday?

Wednesday.---Wednesday. Yeah, Multicultural Program (not transcribable)

Were you at the office on a Wednesday?---Yes, but I never, I never, I never seen this group.

You've never seen that group?---We don't, no. We don't have anything - - -

Would it be possible to run the yoga class, Multicultural Parenting Program and the English class at the same, roughly the same time?---No, we don't have group, we don't have, we don't have meeting room for these people.

10 There's - - -?---The only, the only group we have a yoga class in the morning.

Where would the yoga take place?---The first meeting room from 9.15 because the mothers would drop off their kids and come so they stay for one hour then at 10.15 or 10.30 the English classes will be starting with – in, in the three rooms so we don't, we don't have any room for the other one. Then when they leave the Turkish group will, will attend – when the English class leave the Turkish group will attend.

20 I think you said that you helped draft some of these newsletters and that Ms Sharobeem would settle them. Is that right?---The thing is, well, even this one, she is the person who design that way and whatever inside in there, if there is any change with this one I will change the time, change the top from for example it's April, that's been the term 2, all right, so I will change the term 2 from the beginning I change that term 2, then I sent it, email it to her for her approval, so if she said go ahead I will print out a few copies so whoever comes to the centre to ask what groups we have, we can provide them with this newsletter.

30 Would you input some of the details in relation to the programs?---No.

Would you list, type some of the program names into the draft?---No, no, no.

Apart from changing the date was - - -?---Even when I ask her sometimes do you want me to remove this one because it's not, no longer running in the centre, she would say, "No, leave it and continue."

And - - -?---That's it.

40 When you say this one, which programs did you bring to Ms Sharobeem's attention that were not being conducted?---Whatever program at the time, for example the Sudanese, I told her many times there is no Sudanese anymore, the Spanish, we don't have any Spanish anymore.

When you said these things to Ms Sharobeem, what was her response? ---Leave it, leave it, it's good, maybe we can bring some, the group will be starting again and stuff like that.

Did you know that the service was receiving funds from the Smith Family to conduct the multicultural parenting program and STEPS to Employment?
---I have no idea about financial stuff, I have really no idea.

Ms El-Baf, I'm going to change topics and ask you some questions about renovations to the Fairfield office. Do you know that Ms Sharobeem purchased the property in 2011?---No, till, till, till the, the renovation happened, because usually whatever happen in the office, any renovation or
10 any fixing stuff, repairment or whatever, we have to contact the real estate agent or send an email.

Sorry, Ms El-Baf, when did you first find out that Ms Sharobeem had purchased 92 Smart Street, Fairfield?---When she never asked for any, never asked us to call the real estate agent.

So did you suspect that she was the owner?---Yeah, because usually we call them but now we, when we ask her she would say, "Call the handyman to come and fix it up." And - - -
20

Did you ask her if she'd purchased the - - -?---No, no.

So you just thought this?---Yeah. We thought that ourself, like we never talk about it, we never ask her, we never, yeah.

I'll show you volume 10 of the allegations, page 3. Do you recall writing letters to the real estate agent before Ms Sharobeem had purchased the property?---Yeah, a few times, yeah.

30 And would that have been prior to 2010?---Oh, yeah.

And this is an email that you're cc'd into it, but do you recall Ms Abboud contacting the real estate agent about the ceiling?---(No Audible Reply)

So I withdraw that. Do you recall Ms Abboud contacting the real estate agent about - - -?---Yeah.

- - - a bent pipe?---Yeah.

40 Is this an example of times when Ms Sharobeem would ask you or Ms Abboud - - -?---Yeah.

- - - to contact the - - -?---Yeah.

- - - real estate agent and get repairs done?---Yeah, yeah.

Following page is page 4 of volume 10 allegations. Do you recall writing this letter about the broken gas pipe?---Yeah, this maybe one of the letter.

Sorry, I think - - -?---Yeah.

- - - this is one year later, it's not in relation to the same thing but it's in relation to a broken gas pipe?---Yeah, yeah.

10 And you're contacting Matilda?---Yeah, I contacted her first, then Eman asked me always do it in writing so it's legally more liable for the person who is going to do, maybe they would tell us, oh, sorry, we didn't receive any call or we forgot about it, so just send them email to confirm that they received the call and they will attend to the, this matter.

Did anyone else in the office ask you to contact the real estate agent apart from Ms Sharobeem?---No.

20 All right. And you agree that you put Ms Sharobeem as the point of contact at the end of that letter?---Yes, I usually would have a template letter, whenever we want, just we change something in it and we leave it as it is. If it should be sent by mail, email, it's okay, if not email we can send, we can ask her to sign her name on it.

You didn't sign this letter?---No, this one, it's because email I think.

Okay. So you scanned it and sent it by email?---Yes, or could be fax, I'm not sure, it's faxed, you see at the top, fax number.

So you faxed it to the real estate agent?---Yes, that's right.

30 I'm going to ask you some questions about things that were in the office at Fairfield. Do you recall there being a treadmill?---Oh yes.

For how long was a treadmill at the centre?---No more than, less than one year.

When was this?---To be honest, I don't know before 2010 I think, something like that.

40 Do you recall there being twelve chairs, leather chairs at the Immigrant Women's Health Service?---We don't have leather chairs only the fabric one.

Sorry, what was your response?---We have fabric one, we don't have any leather.

I'm going to show you another document Volume 2 of Brief page 326, 326 Volume 2 of the Brief Statement. Sorry you'll have to go to 327 to start sorry. Do you recall receiving an email from Ms Ghaly about whether or not the Immigrant Women's Health Service had twelve chairs for NESH?

---Ah hmm.

What happened when you received that email, did you go looking for chairs?---It was my working days so I rang Marie I think and I ask her do you have, because Eman wasn't in, she was overseas in the Holy Land.

When you Holy Land you - - -?---Yes, Jerusalem.

10 Jerusalem.---So I can't contact her so I rang Marie, have you heard about these chairs because Nevine just called or emailed me something asking me about this, she said no. So, that's what happened.

20 The page 326 is Ms Sharobeem's response, she suggests at the top of that page, second line of the email, the chairs were located in the second meeting room behind stacked chairs. Were there twelve leather chairs in the second meeting room at around about September, 2015?---It's all there for ages, may be three/four years ago she bought, because we have, we don't have enough chairs and some of the old chairs were broken so she bought, I think, two dozen, not only twelve it was the same thing, even the same pattern, the same colour, blue colour I think and it was all fabrics, it was their stock, whenever we want it we can move from one place to another, one meeting room to another so it was there for years.

I'm asking you if there were twelve leather chairs.---Not leather chairs at all.

And they were certainly not stacked behind, sorry. They were not behind the chairs that you were talking about?---No, no.

30 Volume 2 page 142 of the Statement Brief. This is an email about a massage chair, do you remember receiving this email?---Yes.

Was there a massage chair in the child care room in September, 2015 prior to this email?---No.

40 Ms Sharobeem seems to be suggesting that the massage chair had been there for some weeks prior.---It wasn't there. It wasn't there because every day when I came I go to the child care room, to each room to open the shutters and make sure that everything is fine inside these rooms. And it's big. If it was there, I would have seen it. No, I never seen it prior to this date.

Were automatic gates ever installed at the Fairfield office?---No, we don't have automatic gates.

Was there a washing machine at the Fairfield office?---Yeah, there was.

And then what - - -?---Washing machine, yeah.

What happened to it?---Oh, it disappeared. It comes for the office maybe for one year, then it disappeared.

Was there a dishwasher?---No.

There was a large second-hand fridge at some point?---Yes.

10 Did you have a conversation with Suham Talal about that fridge?---Yeah, she came to me and she said, oh, this Eman's one. I saw because she was cleaning her house as well, when she was cleaning our office she was cleaning at her house. And she came to me and she said, oh, I clean it so many times. This is the fridge of Eman. And I said but there is many fridges the same. How do you know? She said because I know it's hers. So I said, I don't know, we come to the office and we find it in the office one day.

20 All right. Pardon me, Commissioner. I'm nearly done. All right. It's brief statements, volume 2, page 149. You were shown some bank documents by the investigator. Do you remember that?---Yes.

I'm going to show you those documents. This is a transfer for \$312. Do you agree with that?---Yeah.

Do you recognise any of the handwriting on this document?---The bottom one, I don't know, but the top one, yes, I think it's Eman's.

Okay. So you think that's Eman?---Yeah.

30 All right. Page 151 of the same folder. Had you seen these reimbursement forms before?---No.

Do you know whose writing appears at the bottom of the table, under the table?---No.

The following page, 152, those words Steps to Employment, do you recognise that writing?---Yeah, it's Eman's ones.

40 Page 165 and 166 in succession possibly. So that's the transfer for 5,000, you agree? And the following document is a transfer for \$609. The next page, 167, that's a reimbursement form, Ms El-Baf. Do you recognise the handwriting underneath the table?---Yeah, just Eman's writing.

Which is Eman's writing?---The one on the right-hand side.

Do you know what it says?---Paid then the 8th of the 8th is it?

Okay. So it's that writing that you're referring to?---Yeah.

All right. At page 168, again this is another reimbursement form and some figures at the bottom. Do you recognise the handwriting there, the – in particular the numbers and the amounts?---I'm not sure about this but it looks like the – I'm not sure. To be honest I'm not sure.

Okay. And you're saying you're not sure in relation to all of that writing?---The numbers it look like Eman's writing but I'm not sure about the others. I'm not sure.

10 The next page 169 they're a bundle of receipts.---Yeah, this Eman's writing.

And sorry, when you say Eman's writing, you're referring to?---The numbers and the conference, the word conference on the top.

Okay. So the number, the numbers written at the top of the receipts?---Yes.

And the writing saying conference?---Yeah.

20 Now, page 179.---Yeah, it looks like hers. That's her writing as well.

Okay. And just flick through those facilitator invoices very slowly. You agree that that's Ms Sharobeem's writing as well?---Yes.

That one as well?---Yes.

That one, the next one?---Yes.

30 They are – would you agree that they were invoices for Emma Adly the first one?---(No Audible Reply)

Emmy Adol the second one?---Ah hmm.

Charlie Gamal the second one – the third one?---Yes.

The fourth one is in relation to a Rachie Kakel?---Yes.

Had you seen these facilitator invoices before?---Yes.

40 Where, where did you see them?---The bookkeeper she asked me do you know these people.

Yeah.---And I told her no, I never heard of and I've never seen them. What do they do? I said I don't know.

Did you give these documents to anyone, these ones?---To?

Did you give these documents to anyone?---To anyone. I think she – when, when she gave me some of this especially the one with Eman Adol or, yeah, I think and - - -

Emmy Adol?---Yeah, yeah, and - - -

If you can just turn to that.---Yeah, it was, it was - - -

10 It's the second one.---Yeah, we photocopy it and it was for the claim to – you see in here there is two writings.

Yeah.---The Emmy Adol it was her writing – Eman's writing and the top one I'm not sure about. It's different writing on the top. I'm not sure who, who gave it, who wrote this on the top side, top right-hand side.

And this invoice relates to \$1,225. Do you agree with that?---Yeah.

20 Could this have been the invoice you provided to the Department of Health – NSW Health?---I have no idea.

Okay. You're not sure?---No.

All right.---No.

Pardon me, Commissioner. That's the evidence, Commissioner.

THE COMMISSIONER: How long are you going to be, Mr Chhabra?

30 MR CHHABRA: I imagine about three or four minutes.

THE COMMISSIONER: Go ahead.

MR CHHABRA: May it please. Could the witness please be shown the documents at volume 2 of statements, page 117. Ma'am, you recognise that document from earlier?---Yes.

Do you see the words there "Macquarie Uni"?---(No Audible Reply)

40 Are you able to tell the Commissioner whether there were any dealings between IWHS and Macquarie University?---I have no idea. She said it's a meeting and put into database because when she ask for database even the internal and external meeting she said you have to put it into database.

If I could stop you there. Putting aside the notation itself and databases, I'm simply asking whether you are aware whether there were or were not dealings between IWHS and Macquarie University?---I have no idea.

MR CHHABRA: If the witness could please be shown the same volume, page 103. Do you recognise this document from earlier when you were being asked questions?---Yes.

With respect to the numbers there, from where did you obtain those numbers?---This, it comes from the database itself.

10 And - - -?---You press some, some buttons and it goes, then you (not transcribable) report and print, so it comes with this.

And are you able to say whether those numbers were accurate?---This the accurate one, yes, this what, what happened during the whole year when you put it day after day after day. This is the whole number.

Let me be clear. Are you able to say whether what was contained in the database - - -?---Yes.

20 - - - as of the time of printing this, was accurate?---Yeah, because that's what I did, that, whatever number it in here, it comes from the number I put during the whole year or so this report when it comes up, it comes from the computer, I can't do nothing with it because it was accurate at the time.

And are you able to say whether everything in terms of inputting was actually recorded throughout the year?---Yeah, that's right. Whatever she asked me to record at the time during the year, that's what I did. When she asked for the report it comes with this.

30 One last question. You gave some evidence earlier regarding cleaners?
---Yeah.

Are you able to say what time the cleaning took place?---Usually when the, the group left, whenever, for example, when he comes on Wednesday, because it's the day of my working, he comes usually after the Turkish group leaving. They leave usually at 2.00, 2.30, so he would come at that time.

40 And are you aware whether or not cleaners would come after hours?
---The day I'm talking about because I was at work, but other days I'm not sure this the day, yeah, the only thing I can say.

Nothing further.

THE COMMISSIONER: Is there anything arising, Mr Rajalingam?

MR RAJALINGAM: (No Audible Response)

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you. Any reason that Ms El-Baf can't be excused?

MR RAJALINGAM: No.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you for coming in. You're excused if you'd like to leave?---Thank you sir, thank you, sir, thank you.

10 And we'll adjourn.

THE WITNESS EXCUSED

[4.02pm]

MR CHHABRA: Commissioner, my apologies, there was one matter I had to raise after the witness was excused.

20 THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, certainly.

MR CHHABRA: Should have telegraphed that.

THE COMMISSIONER: You can go, Ms El-Baf?---Yeah?

Yes, thank you.

MR CHHABRA: My apologies for the inconvenience.

30 Volume 22, pages 156, 157, 158, that concerned the SMS conversation between that witness and Ms Sharobeem. I observed that the phone number was recorded still and not been redacted.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, well, that should be redacted. Thank you.

MR RAJALINGAM: I thank my friend for that.

MR CHHABRA: Actually my friend alerted me to it.

40 **AT 4.03PM THE MATTER WAS ADJOURNED ACCORDINGLY**
[4.03pm]