

TARLOPUB00098  
02/05/2017

TARLO  
pp 00098-00159

PUBLIC  
HEARING

COPYRIGHT

INDEPENDENT COMMISSION AGAINST CORRUPTION

THE HONOURABLE REGINALD BLANCH AM QC

PUBLIC HEARING

OPERATION TARLO

Reference: Operation E15/1982

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

AT SYDNEY

ON TUESDAY 2 MAY, 2017

AT 10.00AM

Any person who publishes any part of this transcript in any way and to any person contrary to a Commission direction against publication commits an offence against section 112(2) of the Independent Commission Against Corruption Act 1988.

This transcript has been prepared in accordance with conventions used in the Supreme Court.

THE COMMISSIONER: Just come forward, Ms Peredo, would you.

MR RAJALINGAM: I call Ms Dalila Peredo, Commissioner.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, she's coming. Just go into the witness box, would you. Ms Peredo, will you take an oath or an affirmation?

MS PEREDO: Hmm?

10 THE COMMISSIONER: Will you take an oath or an affirmation? An oath on the Bible or an affirmation to tell the truth?

MS PEREDO: Yeah, it doesn't matter. The Bible (not transcribable) yeah.

THE COMMISSIONER: Okay. Thank you.

THE COMMISSIONER: Just take a seat there would you. Now, because you've got no legal representative, can I just explain to you that I can make an order protecting you from any consequences from the evidence you give today, either civil or criminal, so I will make an order that will give you that protection.

10 So pursuant to section 38 of the Independent Commission Against Corruption Act, I declare that all answers given by this witness and all documents and things produced by this witness during the course of the witness's evidence at this public inquiry are to be regarded as having been given or produced on objection and there is no need for the witness to make objection in respect of any particular answer given or document or thing produced.

20 **SO PURSUANT TO SECTION 38 OF THE INDEPENDENT COMMISSION AGAINST CORRUPTION ACT, I DECLARE THAT ALL ANSWERS GIVEN BY THIS WITNESS AND ALL DOCUMENTS AND THINGS PRODUCED BY THIS WITNESS DURING THE COURSE OF THE WITNESS'S EVIDENCE AT THIS PUBLIC INQUIRY ARE TO BE REGARDED AS HAVING BEEN GIVEN OR PRODUCED ON OBJECTION AND THERE IS NO NEED FOR THE WITNESS TO MAKE OBJECTION IN RESPECT OF ANY PARTICULAR ANSWER GIVEN OR DOCUMENT OR THING PRODUCED.**

30 THE COMMISSIONER: So that gives you the protection. Thank you.  
---Thank you.

Yes, Mr Rajalingam.

MR RAJALINGAM: Thank you, Commissioner. Is your name Dalila Peredo?---Yes.

40 Can you spell your last name.---P for Peter-e-r-e-d-o.

And where is your name from, what country?---A Spanish name.

Spanish name.---Spanish, yeah.

Are you currently working?---No, I lost my job. Yesterday was my last day.

Oh, when was your last day?---Yesterday was.

I'm sorry to hear that.---It's all right.

Are you looking for work now?---I need to.

And what were you doing?---Community development worker.

With which service?---I was in Outer Liverpool Community Service.

10 What was that sorry, can you repeat it?---Outer Liverpool Community Service.

Sorry, the first word was?---Outer, O-u-t-e-r, Outer.

Outer Liverpool - - -?---Community Service.

And how long were you there for?---I working 10 years in there.

20 All right. Ms Peredo, were you a board member of the Immigrant Women's Health Service at some stage?---Yeah, I was.

I think it was some time ago wasn't it?---I was – I'm not sure which year but it was 2004 or 2005. I can't remember exactly.

Do you remember how you became to be on the board, did anyone ask you?---I not 100 per cent sure but I think a man invite me but I not 100 per cent sure.

30 Do you know if it was in the early part of the year or the late part of the year that you started, so was it summer/spring or winter/autumn?---I can't remember.

Was Ms Sharobeem the boss at the time you started?---She was the co-ordinator of the centre.

Co-ordinator?---Yeah.

Did she become the manager later, the manager of the centre?---Yeah, I suppose, yeah, but it was no – we know that she was manager.

40 Do you remember her being referred to as the CEO of the IWHS?---No.

When did you first meet Ms Sharobeem?---I think it was in – when she – because she working before in Immigrant Women Health Service, so I don't know, as a worker, I think. And we – in the – in one day of International Women Day in that year but I don't know which year it was.

You said just then in your answer that you met Ms Sharobeem - - -?  
---In - - -

- - - while she was working at the IWHS but before you started. Is that right?---Yeah, before. But, you know, in International Women Day a lot of organisation going together to celebrate the day and, and that day I, I know her.

And do you know if that was before Ms Sharobeem went on a long trip to Egypt or was it after?---No.

10 Did you meet her before the trip?---I think it was before.

So do you think this was somewhere in the nineties, mid-nineties that you first met her, mid to late nineties?---I don't know. No really, I don't know.

Do you know for how long Ms Sharobeem had left the country, how long was she overseas?---I don't know either, because I met her in the International Women's Day as another worker, but I no have much connection later with, with the, her, with her.

20 And is it the case that the next time you had some contact with Ms Sharobeem was when you became a board member in 2004 or so?---Yeah.

Were you given any training before - - -?---No.

- - - you became a board member?---No, not really.

Did anyone - - -?---And it was my first time in one of the board committee.

30 What sort of work had you done prior to becoming a board member at the IWHS, what sort of work experience did you have?---Work, in my work?

Yes, your, your work, yeah?---My work. I was working in the Fairfield Migrant Resource Centre.

The Fairfield?---Migrant - - -

Migrant?--- - - - Resource Centre.

40 And what did you do there?---I was community settlement worker. (not transcribable) I was grant-in-aid worker.

A what, sorry?---Grant-in-aid worker. That is the name. Grant-in-aid worker. Later changed the name - - -

Do you know how to - sorry, you said grant - - -?---In-aid worker.

What's the second word?---Aid, aid. Help, like that. Grant - - -

Yeah?--- - - - in-aid worker. I can't - - -

So you were doing some work in the grants division or the grants section of this organisation?---No, no, no, no.

No?---No.

No. What were you doing?---No, I was in my, it was, I don't know, maybe I, I confuse your question.

10

I'm asking - - -?---This is part of my work?

Yes, your work at the Fairfield Migrant Resource Centre?---In Fairfield Migrant Resource Centre, yeah. I start as a grant-in-aid worker and later it was community settlement worker.

And how long were you there at the Fairfield Migrant Resource Centre?  
---I work 16 years in there.

20 Right?---It was for the Spanish community.

In your job with the Fairfield Migrant Resource Centre, did you have much to do with the funding of that organisation, the money side of things?---No, no.

When you started on the board at Immigrant Women's Health Service - - -?  
---Yeah.

30 - - - did you have a conversation with Ms Sharobeem about what you would be doing?---(No Audible Reply)

So did you talk to her about what you would be doing on the board?---Not, not really.

Did she ask you to be a treasurer?---Yeah, she say if you can be a treasurer, and I ask, I never be in, in, in that position anything, no, no need to doing anything, just sign the cheque when, when is required.

40 You said - - -?---That was my - - -

I'll just stop you there. You just said that someone said, no, you don't need to know anything or do anything, you just need to sign cheques?---Cheque, yeah.

Who said that? Who said that?---(not transcribable) said that.

Did Ms Sharobeem say that to you?---Yeah, she, she say me, sign the cheque, because she put my name in the bank to sign the cheque for doing the payment, salary, any expenditure from the service.

Would she ask you to do transactions on the internet?---No, no, no, no, no.

Was it the case that she only asked you to sign cheques?---Yeah.

10 What else did she ask you to do while you were a board member at IWHS?  
---Nothing.

Where did you work when you were a board member, were you working at the - - -?---I working in Fairfield Migrant Resource Centre.

Okay. Did you have a copy of a chequebook for the IWHS?---No.

Did you have the chequebook?---No.

20 Do you know if Ms Sharobeem had the chequebook?---Yeah, when she just came to my office with the papers, for example bills, I check the bills and, and she have them, the cheque, and I sign the cheque with the papers to prove is the amount of the cheque.

And was this all in 2004?---About, about. In 2004 or 2005, I can't remember exactly.

Was it when you first started with the service?---Yeah.

30 And I think you said you worked there for about one year or as a board member?---It was about one year as a treasurer, and she came a couple of time to my office because it was, from Fairfield to Cabramatta it was hard for her to, to going to travel all the time when I need a cheque. And she say me I will be put another person to sign the cheque.

How many cheques do you think you signed as the treasurer?---I don't know. Six or seven. I can't remember, really.

40 No, but, I mean - - -?---But not many. It was not many. But it wasn't the first (not transcribable) the first time when I start in the board.

When you signed these cheques, did Ms Sharobeem show you documents to support the amount?---Yeah, yeah, yeah, of course.

What were those documents usually in relation to? What sort of documents did you see in support?---It was in relation to some expenditure from the centre.

Sorry?---Expenditure of the centre. Some invoice, invoice from material or something for the centre. The salary for the, to pay the workers. That's it.

Did you go through the invoices and check to make sure that they were invoices that were spent at IWHS?---Yeah, yeah.

Did you - - -?---Yeah, I saw all of the thing she bought it, and, and I check with the amount of the cheque, and that's it.

- 10 What part of those documents did you check? Did you only check the amount or did you check what was actually being paid for? Do you know what I'm asking you?---I can't remember, really.

Ms Peredo, is it the case that you only checked the amounts?---Ah hmm.

Did you also check other things in the documents? For example, what the amounts were for?---Probably I will be check the thing she spend in that time.

- 20 Are you sure about that?---I'm not sure, really. I'm not sure because I can't remember. I saw the, all of them, the, the dockets or bill or whatever or invoice and the cheque, and look the amount.

Did you have a short conversation with Ms Sharobeem about the payment or a long conversation with her?---About?

What the payment was for.---Just couple of minute. She came and sign it and she go back to the centre.

- 30 How long would that take, that process where she came and left?---I don't know. Twenty minutes.

Okay.---No more than that, I think.

Were you ever asked to sign any blank cheques?---No.

Would you ever have signed a blank cheque?---No, no.

- 40 When you started at the service, did you attend board meetings?---When I start in the board meeting?

As a board member.---Yeah. I, I attended them more frequently in last time, about one year or year and a half. I, I attend them more frequently.

And how many times per year do you think you might have went to the board meeting?---Three time in the different year. About three time. And after that – and after that it was more spaces in the meeting.



So you went less frequently?---Less frequently, yeah.

Were the meetings arranged via email?---Yeah. The meeting (not transcribable).

And who would send those emails?---She sent an email.

Eman Sharobeem?---Yeah, to send an email to organise the, the board committee.

10

When you did attend the board meetings, what did they usually discuss the other board members, what did you talk about?---She talk about - - -

When you say she, are you talking about Eman Sharobeem?---Yeah, she talk about, she talk - - -

Can you just, yeah, just use her name just so that we're clear about who's talking. So you said she, Eman?---Yeah.

20

Yes. What did she say?---Eman person, like a report, all of the activities all of group was in – running in the centre, all of the event will be running in the future, the partnership with another organisation.

And what sort of organisations were there partnerships with when you were on the board?---I remember some, it was one like, like LASA, it's Spanish - - -

L-a - - -?---Uh?

30

L, is it L?---Is LASA is Spanish Latino American Association or something. I no, no have exactly the name.

That's okay.---Yeah. But they doing like, they run one event and have different partners to develop the event.

So you've talked – you've told, you've told us that Eman Sharobeem would talk at these meetings and talk about the programs and the activities - - -. ---Yeah.

40

- - - and the partnerships.---Or some other partnership or some funding application.

And what funding applications were you – did you know about when you were at the board?---Some for health, health service from health service but I can't remember much because I didn't have any - - -

We're just trying our best to discover as much information as possible. ---Yeah.

So whatever you know about the meetings just tell us. Did you – were financial documents presented at the board meetings?---No, no, I can't remember if she, she present any, any financial statement to us.

Did you see any bank records?---No.

Did you see any financial reports of the organisation?---No, just in the, in the financial year report.

10

The - - -?---In the financial year report.

So you would see that?---We can see in, you know, when doing the AGM.

Yes.---They, they give a report worker's report or service report, and in the service report is included the financial report.

20

Pardon my back, Commissioner. Ms Peredo, I'm going to show you a document. If you have a look at that. That is a copy of the 2004-2005 IWHS annual report.---Mmm.

Is that the report you're talking about?---Yeah, that's the report I talking about.

There's not a financial report included in that, in that report.---In the back of the report need to be the financial report.

30

But do you recall that that was the type of document you would be shown at the board meeting?---I can't remember if it were attached to this report or - -

So you think a financial report might have been attached to the annual report?---Attached to this.

Okay.---Yeah.

If I could have that document returned. It probably doesn't need to be tendered.---Yeah, that is the annual report.

40

What happened after the time you were a board member after about one year, did you – when you said you stopped going frequently to the board, the board meetings?---I no stop going because I didn't know if they not doing much meeting or, or I didn't have the invitation or something.

Did you continue to receive emails through 2005 and 2006 about board meetings?---Sometime, sometime, no, no often.

How often in those years would you receive an email about a board meeting?---I think it, two or three time a year.

Do you recall going to the AGM still after you resigned as a board member?  
---Sorry?

After you stopped going to board meetings, did you also continue to go to the AGM a couple of times?---Yeah, I went to a couple of time.

10 And where were those meetings held?---In Palace.

Stars Palace?---Stars Palace.

Was that in Fairfield?---Yeah, because she organise a big event in conjunction with other organisation.

So it was like a function to go to?---Like a community event in relation to one topics. Usually topic related to women, domestic violence or in one I went to is was a women's symposium, and after that they're doing the AGM little time.  
20

Did you attend any other board meetings after say 2007/2008?---2007/2008? Yeah, probably, yeah.

How many?---Three or four meeting after.

And was there a time - - -?---But it was about one, one a year, like that.

And was there a time when you stopped going to the meetings?---When is the time when I stopped going to the meeting?  
30

How long ago, how many years ago was it?---About, I can't, I can't exactly remember because the, the, the meeting was very no - - -

Not regular?---Not frequently.

Okay. Not frequently?---Just one a year or two a year.

All right?---Yeah.  
40

Do you remember being contacted by a Ms Audrey Lai in late 2015?  
---Yeah, yeah. She contact me, an emergency meeting.

And how did you react when Ms Lai contacted you about - - -?---I say, oh, I still in, in a board member? That's what I thinking. If I, for a long time I be, I don't be in, in the committee.

For how long?---About two years or three years before 2015 and when, when she call me and I thought, oh, it surprise me, oh, you're still in the management committee, I'm going to see what happen, but I never expect that this, that happen.

And what happened, did you go to a meeting?---I went to the meeting.

Was the meeting at the restaurant?---In a restaurant in Fairfield.

10 Was it a Thai restaurant?---Thai restaurant, yeah.

And who attended that meeting, who was there?---It was Audrey, Nada, Julie, Svetlana and me. Svetlana.

Svetlana?---Svetlana.

And yourself. Okay?---And me. Five.

20 Did you know all the people at the meeting?---Just (not transcribable) Julie, I didn't know Julie was part of the committee because I not be invited for a long time to the meeting, yeah.

Was there anyone else that you didn't know?---I think Nada as well, but Audrey, Audrey was more long, long time.

And when was the last time you'd seen Audrey?---In that meeting.

30 But before that, when was the last time you saw Audrey, prior to the meeting?---Before that?

Yes?---Probably one year or two years.

What did they talk about at the meeting?---She say that is some problem with the financial money of the service because it was like mix or mixed docket from personal thing, from Eman's dockets mix with the service.

40 So was there anything else spoken about apart from receipts being wrongly reimbursed essentially? Is that what you're saying, that receipts were - - -? ---Yeah.

- - - reimbursed for the wrong reasons?---For, yeah, I don't know if reimbursed. That, they not talking about that. It was talking about, it was mixes the personal invoices with the service invoices together and that was the - we think in - personal I thinking it was, it was a mistake probably, that's it.

Who was doing most of the talking at that meeting?---Audrey.

And was she the one talking about the receipts being mixed up?---She, she say that because I think it was surprise for, for all of us, I don't know. And I, I say, oh, after so long not being the meetings and now I (not transcribable) problem and I want to resign.

Did you have - - -?---And they no let me to resign.

Did you have any more involvement with IWHS after that meeting?---After that meeting, no.

10

Did you want to get involved with IWHS?---No.

Just returning to that meeting again, did Ms Lai or anyone else present any documents at the meeting?---No, just talk.

Just talk?---Talk.

20

Did they - - -?---And she say something about the house where the centre functioning. It was, Eman was owner because she want, she was, because an emergency thing she, to no lost the centre place.

Did you think that Ms Sharobeem was a psychologist when you started working at the IWHS?---I don't know, really.

Did you know she was a doctor in psychology?---No, I don't know.

30

But did you see that on her emails, that she would refer to herself as a doctor?---Yeah, yeah, she signed as a doctor but I think it probably was but I didn't know, really.

When you say you didn't know, are you saying that you didn't see any of her qualifications?---No, any, any paper, no.

Did you ever have a conversation with her about being a psychologist?  
---No.

40

In 2004 when you joined as a board member, did you want to be a board member at that time?---Yeah. I say something new experience to, but I doing in my, in my own time. I was not, I was not authorised by my work centre. I doing in my own time. And that's - in 2007 I changed the job and my (not transcribable) was no longer to going to any, any management committee. And I doing after, after my work in my own time, as a volunteer, on my own time.

And I take it you weren't paid for your work as a board member?---Eh?

You were not paid any money as a board member?---No.

No.---No. I doing as a volunteer in my, volunteer in my own time. That's what I tried to explain.

Yeah. So, I mean, you were interested in the work? You wanted to help the Immigrant Women's Health Service? You wanted to help them?---Yeah, I think it was be support, because that was my idea. The, the management committee was a support for the workers.

Ms - - -?---Nothing involved in any other thing.

10

Ms Peredo, if you were given training prior to becoming a board member, would you have accepted that training?---Yes, if, if they doing a training, I would be accept doing. But after the, the 2015, they doing the governance training. I said what for now? I didn't ask, I didn't take the, the, I did not attend that there. I didn't attend at anything after the, the emergency meeting in later 2015. I didn't, I take my everything out of my mind. I try, I try.

Just one moment, Ms Peredo.---Yeah.

20

Commissioner, that's the evidence.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, thank you. Mr Chhabra, do you have any questions?

MR CHHABRA: No, Your Honour. No, Commissioner.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you. No-one else with questions? There's no reason that Ms Peredo can't be excused, is there?

30

MR RAJALINGAM: No.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes. Thank you for coming, Ms Peredo. You're excused if you'd like to leave.---Okay. Thank you.

Thank you.

**THE WITNESS EXCUSED**

**[10.30am]**

40

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, Mr Rajalingam.

MR RAJALINGAM: Commissioner, I call Ms Marie Abboud, Marie Abboud, apologies.

THE COMMISSIONER: Ms Abboud, will you take an oath or an affirmation?

MS ABBOUD: An oath will do, yeah.

THE COMMISSIONER: Okay.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you. Just take a seat there.

Now, I can make an order to protect you from any consequences of the evidence that you give today, so I will make that order now.

10 Pursuant to section 38 of the Independent Commission Against Corruption Act, I declare that all answers given by this witness and all documents and things produced by this witness during the course of the witness's evidence at this public inquiry are to be regarded as having been given or produced on objection and there is no need for the witness to make objection in respect of any particular answer given or document or thing produced.

20 **PURSUANT TO SECTION 38 OF THE INDEPENDENT COMMISSION AGAINST CORRUPTION ACT, I DECLARE THAT ALL ANSWERS GIVEN BY THIS WITNESS AND ALL DOCUMENTS AND THINGS PRODUCED BY THIS WITNESS DURING THE COURSE OF THE WITNESS'S EVIDENCE AT THIS PUBLIC INQUIRY ARE TO BE REGARDED AS HAVING BEEN GIVEN OR PRODUCED ON OBJECTION AND THERE IS NO NEED FOR THE WITNESS TO MAKE OBJECTION IN RESPECT OF ANY PARTICULAR ANSWER GIVEN OR DOCUMENT OR THING PRODUCED.**

30 THE COMMISSIONER: Now, that provides you with protection. It's probably not necessary but for more abundant caution.

Yes.

MR RAJALINGAM: Thank you, Commissioner.

May you state your full name for the record?---Marie Abboud.

And how do you spell your last name?---A-b-b-o-u-d.

40 Are you currently working?---No.

Are you retired?---Yes.

Were you a paid employee of the Immigrant Women's Health Service?  
---Yes, I was.

And were you a paid employee from about 2001 to June 2016?---That's correct.



Were you being paid a wage as an employee or as a facilitator?---Both.

And when were you working as a paid employee, on what days?---Monday, Wednesday, no, sorry, Monday, Thursday and Friday.

And were you working as an administrator for the service on those days?  
---That's correct.

- 10 What did your job as an administrator consist of?---Opening the centre in the morning, make sure there is everything for the groups when they attend for their meetings, like beverages and, you know, answer the phone, answer messages left on the phone from the day before or the afternoon before, organise the groups, yeah.

Did you also do work as a facilitator?---Yes, I did.

When did you do work as a facilitator?---From 2002 until I finished.

- 20 And what - - -?---2016.

And on what days would you do facilitator work?---Tuesdays.

Tuesdays. And what group were you facilitating?---Arabic-speaking.

And was it always that, the Arabic-speaking group - - -?---Yes.

- - - that you facilitated?---Yes.

- 30 Where was the group held?---At the Immigrant Women's Health Service at Fairfield.

Fairfield office. Were there, was it always conducted on a Tuesday?---Yes.

From 2001 to 2016?---Yes.

What time?---Between 10.00 and 12.00 the group was there, but I worked three hours from 9.30 to 12.30.

- 40 And for working the three hours, 9.30 to 12.30, how much would you be paid, would you be paid for three hours or more?---Three hours.

Three hours. And were you paid a wage, an hourly rate?---Yes.

And what was that?---Started at \$18 up to - - -

And where did that go to?---It went up to 22.

Were there any other facilitators that conducted that Tuesday - - -?---No.

- - - morning group with you?---No.

Just yourself?---Yes.

Was there anyone else over the years that assisted you in that group as a facilitator?---No, not as a facilitator. I had guest speakers but not facilitator.

10 Were the guest speakers ever paid for?---No.

Do you have volunteers to help you?---With the group, no.

And over those years 2001-2016, can you describe how many people would attend that morning group?---Oh, yeah, there were – it was very big and in the beginning when I first started there was up to 35 people.

20 35.---But then they, they, they split up. They had – when I had the Arabic group I had the Iraqi group, Iraqi-speaking people and Jordanian, Assyrian. Then they had their own groups then it became smaller. It became up to maybe 15.

So from the big Arabic-speaking group a number of smaller groups emerged - - -?---That's right.

- - - and those various participants did they go to those groups?---That's right.

30 What happened to the Arabic-speaking group?---It kept going.

And so - - -?---But got smaller.

But got smaller. Did you teach Arabic in the group?---I didn't teach Arabic. We spoke Arabic.

Yeah. You spoke Arabic?---Yes, yes.

What, what happened with the group?---We did activities.

40 Like what?---We made jewellery. We made things. I showed them how to make some, to make potpourri to put in the cupboard. We made cards. We made hot packs.

All right.---We made jewellery.

Just talking about the jewellery for a moment.---Yeah.

What type of material would you use in the programs, what material - - -?

---For the jewellery?

- - - for the jewellery?---All fake stuff like, cheap stuff.

Where would you get it from?---Well, when we started we didn't buy it because it was provided by the, by TAFE.

Which TAFE was it, the Wetherill Park TAFE?---Yes.

10 And when you say when you started, when did that particular jewellery program start do you know?---Maybe 2013. '13 or '14, I'm not sure, 2013 or '14. That went the whole year.

Was there a teacher from TAFE that - - -?---Yes.

- - - assisted with that program?---Yes, yes.

Was that program specific to the Arabic-speaking group or was it - - -?  
---Yes, for the Arabic group only.

20

Only?---Yeah.

Was there any other jewellery-making programs at any of the other groups?  
---No.

- - - being held?---No.

Did you have the assistance of a TAFE teacher - - -?---Yes, of course.

30 - - - for the jewellery-making - - -?---Yes.

- - - program?---Yes.

And what was his or her name?---Her name was Zena.

And who paid for her to teach?---TAFE.

40 Would she take some of the participants to over near Leichhardt Street where there's a bead shop to purchase beads?---Oh, I took them, I took them there.

You took them there?---Yeah.

How often would you take participants – was this of the Arabic-speaking group?---Only, yes. Only once a term.

Once a term.---Oh, actually twice. We only went twice. I can't remember it was or three times.

And how much on each occasion did you spend – would you spend your money at the bead shop?---No. Everyone, everyone spend their own money. They bought their own beads.

And did they seek any reimbursement for - - -?---No.

10 - - - the money they spent?---No. I think, I think there was one – sorry, I didn't think of that one. There was another group who did jewellery but not with TAFE and I think they, they got reimbursed for their money to buy beads and make their own jewellery.

And where was that program conducted?---I can't remember where.

Was it at the Fairfield or the - - -?---I think it was the seniors group. I think it was for the seniors group.

20 Was it at the Fairfield office or the Cabramatta office?---No, none of them. At Bossley Park the seniors group.

And who – how was it being run at the Bossley Park – at Bossley Park where was it?---In partnership with HomeCare.

Do you know who was funding that program?---HomeCare.

So was it a - - -?---In, in – they combine, IWHS and HomeCare.

30 Do you know if IWHS was providing any funds for that jewellery-making program?---I don't know, I don't know.

Do you know what type of program was being conducted at Bossley Park in relation to the jewellery-making program?---No.

Do you know of any of the details of that program?---I don't know.

Are you able to say what was purchased, what type of material was purchased?---No, I don't know.

40 Who would know about that?---I don't know.

Was it a program being - - -?---You mean about the jewellery?

At Bossley Park, the jewellery-making program at Bossley Park?  
---Yeah.

Do you know what type of material was being used?---It was the same, same stuff - - -

How do you know that?--- - - - the others bought in Leichhardt. Because the facilitator or the leader who was working with the seniors group brought them to the centre.

I see. And who was the leader of the seniors group?---Suham Talal.

I see. Pardon me, Commissioner.

10 Do you recall when Ms Talal came to the Fairfield centre?---She worked there as well.

Sorry, in relation to the jewellery-making course?---Oh.

I think you said that she came to the Fairfield centre with the seniors group? ---No, no. When she bought them, she bought them for the group in Bossley Park but they didn't use it, she brought them to the centre.

I see. And when was that?---Probably early 2016 I think, yeah.

20 Was there any other occasion where jewellery was, you saw the jewellery being purchased or - - -?---No.

You were administrator and you worked at the Fairfield office?---Ah hmm.

Did you have much contact with the other facilitators that were working at IWHS?---No.

30 Did you see them conduct groups?---Ah, there was one, the Spanish, which on my day off, I didn't have any contact with her because I was off, on Wednesday I didn't work - - -

Sorry, I think I've put the question poorly?---Mmm.

Did you, when you were at the service - - -?---Mmm.

- - - were there programs being conducted while you were at work as an administrator?---Ah hmm.

40 And did you see those programs being conducted?---Ah, yeah, some of them. Some of them stopped.

I see?---There were, yeah, all the programs were running but some of them stopped along the way when I was working.

All right. In terms of the programs being conducted by IWHS, were they all conducted at Fairfield office and the Cabramatta centre or were there other places where they were conducted?---No, only there, Cabramatta and Fairfield.

So you've referred to this Bossley Park partnership with HomeCare?---Ah  
hmm.

Was that a one-off partnership in relation to the jewellery-making program?  
---What do you mean, sorry, I don't get that?

So you said, you've given evidence that these programs were always  
conducted - - -?---Yeah.

10

- - - at Fairfield - - -?---Yes.

- - - or Cabramatta?---Yes.

But then you've also referred to a jewellery-making program at Bossley  
Park?---Yes.

Do you know if that was because it was a partnership with HomeCare or  
was that - - -?---Yes, because it was partnership with IWHS and HomeCare.

20

And were there other programs conducted outside those centres where there  
were partnerships with other organisations?---Not as far as I know, no.

Okay. When were the – apart from this Bossley Park jewellery-making  
program, when were the programs conducted at Fairfield and Cabramatta?  
---When?

What times during the week?---It's always between 10.00 and 2.00.

30

Would they be conducted throughout the year, every week?---Except during  
school holidays.

Was that the case at Cabramatta as well, do you know?---Yes.

Do you know that if in Cabramatta there were some programs conducted on  
the weekend as one-off programs?---I'm not sure, I don't know.

I'm going to show you a document, NESH brief, volume 11, page 174,  
which is a reference to a document in the brief?---Ah hmm.

40

Now, do you recognise that document?---Yes, I do.

What is it?---It's an advertisement for the jewellery course.

And is this the jewellery course that was being conducted by you?  
---Yes.

So it's not the course in relation to the Bossley Park - - -?---No.

- - - program?---No.

Would you have known if there were any other jewellery programs being conducted?---No.

Is your answer, no, there were not programs or you would not have known?  
---I don't know about any. No, I don't know about any other programs in jewellery except those.

10

And could you be sure that there were no other programs in relation to jewellery making?---If there was, I would have known because I'm the administrator and I have to advertise it.

And why do you say you would have known? You said you had to have advertised it. What else would you have to do with a program as an administrator?---And recruit people to attend the course.

20

Just on this topic of the jewellery program, did you ever – were you ever aware that it was being – that there were funds being directed to IWHS from the Smith Family in relation to an employment program? Did you know about that?---No.

Did you know about a STEPS to Employment program?---Heard. Didn't happen but I heard about it, yeah.

And what did you hear about it?---That this program is going to be run.

30

Was it ever run?---No.

Did the service ever develop a flyer for it?---Yes, we did.

And what did that flyer look like?---Can't remember.

Is it a flyer with the Barringtons College logo as well?---No, it wouldn't be that.

Okay.---That's a different one.

40

Okay. You said that you had to record details of programs in your evidence. Where would you record the details of the programs?---Into the database.

And was it the database on a computer?---Yes.

And was that your computer that you used in the service?---It's everybody, like, the administration people use it, yeah.

How many computers were there in the service at the Fairfield office?

---Two, four.

And did all computers have access to the database?---I think only three had.

Could you access the database online using the internet? Could you make changes to the database - - -?---Yes.

- - - by getting online remotely?---No, no, no.

10 You had to be there in the office?---That's right.

And what did the database contain details of?---The programs.

Yeah.---Details of clients.

When you say clients, are you talking about the names of people?---Yes.

All right, continue. So programs and the names of people who attended, is that right?---Yes.

20

What else?---Programs. Like, details of the programs. What else? Can't think of anything else.

Were the names of facilitators also included?---Yeah, yeah. Yes, yes, everyone. Everyone who attended.

What about volunteers?---Everyone who attended the centre had to go in the database. All their details go in the database.

30 You talked about the Arabic speaking group. Do you know – and you talked about how many people attended that group. Are you able to tell the Commission how many people attended some of the other groups that were being conducted at Fairfield?---Yeah, roughly.

I want you to think about Monday to Friday.---Okay.

And if you can just give a description of the groups that were being conducted - - -?---Yeah.

40 - - - regularly, I'm talking about regular groups, and the number of people that attended, starting on Monday.---Okay. Women Unity. Women Unity Group. There were about 12 people, 10 to 12. English class.

Was that on Monday?---Yeah, it was on Monday. Can't remember, yeah, it was. Yes, it was. The Assyrian group.

How many people?---The Assyrian, probably 15 to 20. I think that's it on Monday.



Yeah.---Can't think of anyone else. Tuesday we had two English classes.  
The Arabic - - -

And how many people attended those classes?---Around the 20 mark.

Each?---Yeah.

10 So 40 people all up?---No, one was smaller, I would say about 15, and the  
other one was about 20.

All right.---The Arabic group.

Yeah, and you've talked about that so what's next?---Yeah, yeah. That's it  
on Tuesday.

All right. What about Wednesday?---Wednesday we had as well two  
English classes, three English classes on Wednesday.

20 And so were the English classes popular?---Very, yeah, they were. We had  
the Turkish group on Wednesday. A yoga class first thing in the morning  
and the Turkish group in the afternoon.

And I think we're up to - - ----Wednesday.

I don't think you've told us how many people attended the Turkish group or  
the yoga classes?---The Turkish, it's hard to tell the numbers but - - -

30 If they would change I mean don't offer an approximate - - -?---They do  
vary, you know. Some days we'd have 10, some days we'd have 20, you  
know.

And what about the yoga class - - -?---The same.

- - - is that popular?---The same.

The same?---Yeah.

40 What about Friday?---Friday we had the Mandaean group.

The?---Mandaean, yeah, Mandaean.

How many people attended that group?---About 12 to 15. And we had the  
seniors group. That's the one with partnership with HomeCare. There were  
in the 25/26. That would be the biggest group.

Were all of those groups, and I think you've said the senior group was  
funded by HomeCare, but were all of those other groups funded by IWHS?

---Yes.

There was a reception at the Fairfield office wasn't there?---That's right.

Were there two offices and two group rooms?---(No Audible Reply)

How many rooms in the office?---One room was, was one people, the administrator.

10 Yeah.---Whether myself or my colleague who worked days I'm not there and there was another desk but it was for volunteers to use it if they needed or the English teachers who were volunteers and there was Eman's room and the other room where we had the bookkeeper.

How far away was the bookkeeper from Eman's room?---Next door.

Were there rooms where the programs were conducted?---Yes, at the back of the office.

20 At the back, and how many rooms were there that programs would be conducted in?---Two large rooms and a small area where the kitchen is.

Just pardon my back.---That's okay.

Pardon me, Commissioner. How big were those rooms?---By size I don't know. I can't tell. Big.

30 Can you approximate using this courtroom or this Commission room rather?---Yeah, about a third of this room. One is about a third, one is a bit less.

So up to the pillar?---Yeah, one was like that, one a little bit more.

Okay. All right. About 10 by 15 perhaps. Is that right, about 10 metres by 15 metres?---Yeah, probably, yeah.

40 How many people could be fit in those rooms to conduct programs reasonably?---Well, we had 26 the seniors group in one of the rooms. They were a bit squashed but they, they managed and the other one is a bit smaller, maybe about 20, 20/22.

All right. But 26 was a bit of a squeeze, 30 would have been pretty full? ---30, yeah, impossible.

Too much.---They won't have room to sit.

All right. Do you remember all the facilitators at woodwork at the IWHS, do you know them – do you remember them is the question?---All I know is

Ilma, the Spanish facilitator, the Spanish group facilitator and others were not facilitators, they were volunteers.

And was there a list of these facilitators for each year in the database?  
---Yes.

And did you from time to time have to update that list and - - -?---Yes, yes.

- - - keep that list up-to-date?---Yes.

10

Did you ever see in that list the following names as facilitators, Emmy Adel?---No.

Eman West?---No.

Emma Adly?---No.

Rachel Kamol?---No.

20 Rachie Kakel, with a K?---No.

Andrew Toma?---No.

Charlie G?---No.

Charl Gamal?---No.

Basha Paulis?---No.

30 Rose Soriel?---Rose Soriel used to be a childcare worker but only for a very very short time, she was a childcare worker, not a facilitator.

What about – so not a facilitator?---Not a facilitator.

What about Houda Moukhaiber?---Who is it, sorry?

Houda Moukhaiber?---Oh, she was a leader, only for a short time. She was teaching English.

40 Victor Baseley?---No.

Reda Shahata?---No.

Suham Talal? I think you've mentioned her?---She's a leader for the Mandaean group, a leader, not facilitator.

What's, what about Adyan Rezag?---She was never a facilitator.

All right. What do you mean by leader?---Leader ah, leader doesn't get paid as a facilitator, she gets volunteer money, volunteer, which was \$20 when they attended for the day, doesn't matter how many hours they get \$20 'cause they're volunteers. It's called travelling money.

So was Suham Talal ever a facilitator?---Ah, she was with the seniors group.

The seniors group?---Yeah.

10

All right. You've talked about the database where the names of people are kept, facilitators. You agree with that?---Yeah.

Were kept on the database, attendees of the program were kept on the database?---Ah hmm.

For how long was this database being kept by the IWHS?---Forever.

When you say forever, since you worked there?---No, no. It's since Eman came to the service. Well, yeah, or a bit later.

20

What was the name of the database, do you remember, the program?  
---No.

Ms Abboud, was there a time when Ms Sharobeem asked you to alter figures in the database?---Yes.

All right. And how did that come about, was it a conversation you had with Ms Sharobeem on the phone, in person or via email first?---First it was in person and - - -

30

Where were you when you had this conversation?---I was at my desk at the reception.

Yeah?---And she asked me to add them, then I said - - -

Well, what did she -- do you remember what she said?---I can't remember exactly what she said but I just understand that she said, she asked me to add this program that are going to be run soon. I don't know where.

40

Did you - - -?---I can't remember where.

Did you understand her to be asking you to add programs that were going to be conducted in the future?---Mmm.

What else did you think she was asking you to do?---To add these programs to the database, enter them into the database.

Did she speak about the participants?---Yes, she did.

What did she say?---She gave me numbers, not names. She told me - - -

And how did she give you numbers?---She started telling me but then I was pushed for the time, I had to answer the phone and was nearly time to go home. I said to her, "Send them to me in an email and I will work with them in my spare time, I'll enter them slowly in my spare time while I'm here."

10

Did you think that what you were being asked to do was improper in any way?---I wasn't sure, I wasn't sure if it's truly are going to run or not, I wasn't sure, I said just I'll do it, she's the boss, she's telling me to do it, I'll do it, but I don't know what they were.

Did she at some stage in that conversation ask you to enter details about facilitators being, conducting programs?---Yes, that's when I became unsure of what's happening, these names, I didn't think they were facilitators.

20

Yeah. And do you remember that conversation about facilitators with Ms Sharobeem?---I didn't speak to her about it. It was within myself. I thought why would she give me these names? They're not facilitators. They're not - - -

Okay. And what were the names that she gave you?---Can't remember really.

You provided a statement to the Commission some time ago?---Yeah.

30

And I think you mentioned in your statement that Ms Sharobeem asked you to add the names Luong and Ghaly?---Luong.

Luong.---Luong. And Nevine Ghaly, yes, yes.

Nevine Ghaly. Do you remember that?---Yes.

And can you tell the Commission about what you thought about them being facilitators?---I didn't think they were facilitators because Luong wasn't working with us as a - I mean, she had her own work at Cabramatta.

40

What about Nevine Ghaly?---And Nevine - - -

Did you have a conversation with her about being a facilitator?---I, yeah, I did ask Nevine at one stage and she said, "What? No, I'm not, I'm not going to be facilitator for any group." This is when I got - I became suspicious about these groups.

As a result of that, did you ask Ms Sharobeem to email you details?---That's right.

I'll show you a document, brief volume 1, page 25. Is the bottom half of the page the email that you are referring to?---Yes. Yeah.

First of all, in June 2015 did all of these programs exist?---No.

10 Which programs were not running?---All of them.

So none of them were running in June 2015?---No.

Did any of them run subsequently after June 2015?---No. Not as far as I know anyway. Not in the centre. Not at IWHS, definitely.

You'll notice that the women's network - - -?---Yes. Are based in Fairfield, no.

20 Yeah. Did that ever happen?---Never.

Do you know if it happened at any other Fairfield location?---I don't know.

Were there any other Fairfield locations being used for facilitator programs?---No.

Is your answer no?---No, yeah.

30 The end of the email refers to "plus the other two you registered earlier". Do you know what Ms Sharobeem was referring to?---I can't remember what was that, no.

Had you amended the details in relation to two other programs before even receiving this email?---I could have once she started to tell me, and then I said, "It's going to be too much. Send me an email, then I'll do them on my spare time."

Did you send this email to Ms El-Baf as well?---To who?

40 To Ms El-Baf, Watfa.---Which email?

The email that Ms Sharobeem sent, did you forward that to Ms El-Baf?---I think I did, yeah.

After you received this email, was there any other occasion when Ms Sharobeem asked you to amend the details on the database?---Can't remember.

Were you reluctant to amend the details on the database?---What do you mean?

Did you not want to do it?---No, I didn't really.

Do you know if Ms El-Baf continued to assist Ms Sharobeem in altering the details on the database?---No, she didn't.

10 Do you know that for a fact or are you - - -?---I do, yeah. We speak between us. We spoke between us and she said no.

I'm going to show you some of the IWHS annual reports and I want you to look at some of the figures that are contained in those reports, if you could. The first is the report for 2008-2009, brief volume 11, page 1. So, Ms Abboud, do you agree that that's the report for 2008-2009, the first page? ---To be honest, I can't remember. It looks like.

But it appears to be that, doesn't it?---Sorry?

20 It appears to be the report?---Yeah.

The annual report of the service?---Yeah.

Can I take you to page 3 of that, of the brief. Page 3. Can you have a look at what's contained there? Sorry, page 3. The next, next page. Oh, right, okay. Just taking some time to load, Commissioner.---That's all right.

So just have a look at that page under the section at a glance.---At a glance.

30 Can you comment on each of those figures?---(No Audible Reply)

That's for the entire year.---Oh, 9,000 for the entire year. I don't know.

Did – can I ask you this question, did the IWHS have a register of clients as opposed to the number of people attending?---That's right. Yeah, we did.

So you did have a register of clients?---Yes.

40 So names of people?---Yes.

Do you think the total number of people in that register of clients would have come up to 9,000?---I don't know.

What type of number are we talking about in terms of a register of all of the clients of IWHS?---Like the, the groups who attended every day were on a list which they use regularly. Every day they tick their attendance, how many people attended. I can take the time to add them if I want to add them but I can't just think like this and say it. And clients who came to see Eman

as a psychologist had a separate folder for herself for her client. People who came to see, to seek legal, legal advice which we had on a Thursday have a separate folder as well. They were different folders.

It says in that section that 2,000 children received childminding services.  
---No, that's can't, no.

Where were the childminding services being conducted?---At the, at the centre.

10

At the centre?---In a back room. We had a back room for them.

And how many children would be there on a given day?---Look, some days we had no more than six. The maximum would have been six and some days we had none. Some days we had two or three.

20

Now, you might know about the third dot point. I says there that 23 parenting programs for the Arabic-speaking and Assyrian communities were conducted attended by 2,875 participants.---This parenting program we had no record of ourselves. I forget. Can't remember.

Did you ever know – so this is not referring to the Arabic-speaking program?---The parenting program was not run at the service, it was run outside the service.

Where was the parenting program run?---I'm not sure. I'm not sure where but there was, there was two people I think who ran it but not at the service which I, I haven't met much. I haven't like seen them regularly.

30

Who were those people that were running the parenting program?---Was Ashraf Sedrak.

Ashraf.---Ashraf Sedrak and Ban Khoshaba. Ban, B-a-n, Khoshaba.

Were they facilitators?---Yes.

Would there have been 23 parenting programs?---I don't know.

40

23 is a high number.---Yeah. You mean the whole year 23? The whole year is possible.

Ah hmm.---Between the two of them possible.

Can I ask you to turn to page 5. These figures relate to women participation in groups and, Ms Abboud, I'm not sure if they refer to occasions of services or the number of people attending the groups, it's unclear from the report, but can you say, the Assyrian women's group there's a number 800 that appears next to it.---800.



Do you know what that number could be a reference to?---I would say people, number of people.

Is that accurate?---No.

How many people do you think attended the Assyrian women's group?---I don't know what they mean by 800. Is it like - - -

10 But how many actual people would have attended there?---To the group?

A list of clients?---No more than 22.

Do you know anything about the other groups listed in that page?---The Arabic group would be, as I said earlier, about no more than 20. Mandaean about 12, 15. Middle Eastern seniors' group was about 30, 26, 27. Do you want me to say them all?

20 Yes, if you could. Just for that, just for the - - -?---I'm talking about daily.

Yes, yes.---Spanish - - -

Ms Abboud, what I want you to think about is the number of clients that would have been registered in relation to those groups.---Yes.

So not under – they might have missed a particular day - - -?---Yes.

- - - but they might have been regulars?---That's right, yeah.

30 You're providing an approximate - - -?---According to the participant list - - -

Yeah.--- - - - the attendance, the people who registered to attend.

Yes.---Yeah.

Yes. So the next - - -?---(not transcribable) what I gave you already.

40 Yeah.---And the Spanish, probably about 18, 20. Between 18 or 20. Serbian, yes, Serbian. I forgot to tell you about the Serbian before, actually. That was on Monday.

Monday, okay.---And I didn't mention that.

That's all right.---There was, there were about, yeah, about 18.

Swahili Women's Group?---Swahili, that didn't last long with us at all.

How long was it being conducted?---It was, like, on and off for about a year. But very rare they attended.

And how many people would attend when they did?---Five, six.

Five, six. Okay. The Turkish Women's Group?---Turkish was mid-20s, maybe at times, yeah. Or registered about mid-20s.

10 Yeah. Now, the Cambodian Women's Group. Was that something that took place - - -?---That was in Cabramatta. I don't know.

Okay. What about Spanish Healthy Awareness Group?---Yeah, that was in Cabramatta as well. The rest of them are all in Cabramatta and I don't know the number.

20 I see. Okay. All right. If I can take you to page 17 of volume 11, which will be the 2009-2010 annual report. And it's the second page. Firstly I want to take you to the child-minding part of that table.---I have all of the (not transcribable).

It says 1,800 children. Are you surprised by that number?---Very.

In the last report it referred to 23 parenting programs, but here it refers to 45. Arabic-speaking and Assyrian communities would conduct parenting programs for the Arabic-speaking and Assyrian communities. Does that make any sense?---I wouldn't know because they weren't at, they weren't - - -

30 Not at the service? Okay.--- - - - functioned at the centre, they were out the centre.

If you turn the page, you get to the same type of table with respect to attendees of groups. Which ones were run at Cabramatta from that group? The Cambodian Women's Group?---I haven't got, oh, here. Yeah, Cambodian, yes.

Spanish Healthy Awareness?---That's right.

40 Chinese Older Women's Group.---Yeah.

Vietnamese Women's Health Group.---Yes.

Vietnamese Working Women's Support Group?---Yes.

Anything else?---The English classes, five groups. That's Fairfield, I think

Okay.---Mmm. Yoga is Fairfield. Computer.

Now, just on yoga.---Ah hmm.

The amount of numbers registered there is 1,960 people doing yoga.---No.

Is that – the yoga, the number next to yoga classes for two groups.---Yeah, these people attended, 1,900.

Well, I'm not sure.---No, no.

10 But can you tell me how many people were registered as participants of the yoga class in that particular year?---Registered? Registered? Not, not even 20.

Not even 20. And I do want you to turn your mind to the actual year, and it's 2009-2010.---Mmm.

So if things change later, we'll get to that in the other reports.---I don't think that changed.

20 But around about that time.---There were always, like - - -

About - - ?---Merge, you know, like, sometimes they'll all turn up. But according to the list it wouldn't be more than 20.

All right. I'll just take you to a couple of other of these entries. The Arabic Women's Support Group.---Yeah.

30 Again, and the Assyrian Women's Group. Do you consider those figures high for the number of people registered with those groups?---Well, these people, I'm not, I mean, this number is never in our participant list. We don't have – we don't go over 30 in the participant list. 30 names. 35, maybe. But they're not always full. The list is not always full.

All right. What I might do is, I'll take you to the 2014-2015 report. If you go to page, it's 172 of the brief of volume 12. Firstly look at the yoga classes, two groups, it refers to 2,512 attendees?---Yoga?

Yoga classes at the bottom?---Oh, yeah, we did have two groups actually in two thousand and - - -

40

Yeah, but did you have 2,512 people?---No.

Is your answer no way?---No, it can't be that much because we had, like, two classes, each one if it's 30 it'll be 60 people, and it's not even 30.

Okay. Do the numbers relating to the Arabic and the Assyrian Women's Group at the top, they, would you agree that they would not reflect the number of registered participants?---No, not, not - - -

I'm not talking about occasional services?---That's what I'm saying about the registered participant, they can't be that much because we don't have these big lists at all, unless they mean for the whole term.

All right. Pardon me, Commissioner.

Ms Abboud, when did you first meet Ms Sharobeem?---I think just, just before she started working with us, I think it was 2004.

10

Were you there prior to Ms Sharobeem starting?---Yes, I was, I was a facilitator.

And do you know who was running the service when Ms Sharobeem started?---The previous manager.

And who was that?---Sophie Vatis.

Do you know how Ms Sharobeem became the manager of the service?

20

---No, I don't know how. I think it was advertised and she applied.

Do you know that?---I don't know that, I think. I heard that. I don't know.

Did you come to know Ms Sharobeem as Dr Sharobeem a little later?

---Later on, yes.

When did you come to know her as Dr Sharobeem?---Can't remember exactly when. Probably three years.

30

I think you told the investigators it was about seven or eight years ago?

---How many?

I think you told the investigators it was about seven or eight years ago?

---Mmm.

Is that - - -?---Yeah, probably a couple of years, three years after she started or two years, something like that.

And did you have a conversation with her about her title as a doctor?

40

---Just not a conversation, I just asked her if she can hang her degrees up on the wall like some, some confirmation about her psychology because people have been asking us when did she become a psychologist and how and where, questions, you know, they come to the front desk and they ask questions and I would say I don't know. So one day I said to her, "Why don't you just advertise it, then we can answer the people."

And - - -?---And she said, "Oh, I don't like publicity."

Did she ever hang up any qualifications in her room, office?---No, no.

I'll show you a document. Brief volume 1, page 27. Have you ever seen that business card before? It's the back and the front of, the front and the back of a business card?---Yeah, I have.

And where have you seen that business card?---At the centre.

10 And it's a business card with Dr Eman Sharobeem's name on it?---Mmm.

Do you ever recall her giving those cards to anyone?---Yeah, I'm sure they all have her cards, yeah.

Had you given those cards to anyone who was looking for a psychologist?  
---Yes.

20 How many times had you given that card to people who were looking for psychologists, a psychologist?---I can't remember how many times because you know, people who used to come and see her, Eman, see Eman, she used to ask me to write them, to give her card, write an appointment next time or something like, you know, to use it as a reminder for the next appointment.

And do you know when that practice started, which year that started?---I can't remember the year.

But for how long do you recall writing on business cards to remind - - -?  
---At least about five years.

30 About five years. Did you actually see Ms Sharobeem counselling clients as a psychologist or was -?---Yeah, I did.

And when you say that, do you know that the people that were coming to the service were looking for psychologists?---Yeah, most of them, yeah.

And did they have appointments to see Ms Sharobeem - - -?---Yes.

- - - as a psychologist?---I even booked them appointments.

40 Were they – and when you booked them for these counselling sessions was it clearly said to them that Ms Sharobeem was a psychologist, would they know that Ms Sharobeem was a psychologist?---Yes, yes.

How would they know that Ms Sharobeem was a psychologist, how will the come to know that?---I don't know whether they had referral from other doctor or from church, people who attended to church, or they heard it on the radio.

Do you know the names of any doctors that were referring clients to Ms Sharobeem?---One I remember [REDACTED] or something. [REDACTED].

Anyone else?---No, I can't think of anyone else.

Do you recall any hospitals or other mental – medical centres referring clients to the IWHS, the names rather?---No, I don't.

10 But did that happen, doctors' referrals of people to Ms Sharobeem?---Yeah.  
Not many, a few, but only I can remember this name. I can't remember other names.

I'll show you a document brief volume 1, page 29. Commissioner, I was wondering if the witness could somehow be provided an un-redacted version of this document without it being displayed. Well, if the Commission is happy for the – it's a client list, it's a patient list so it potentially has many names on it that would need to be redacted. I'm not sure if there's a course the Commission had in mind.

20 THE COMMISSIONER: What's on the document?

MR RAJALINGAM: Patient details.

THE COMMISSIONER: Right. And what do you want to show the witness the document for?

30 MR RAJALINGAM: Handwriting, marks, notations on the document and there are – I will ask her to consider if she recognises any of the names. I'm not sure if it's necessary, Commissioner, to probe that far but I wouldn't mind the witness having a look at some of the names.

THE COMMISSIONER: Well, have you got a hard copy of the document?

MR RAJALINGAM: Yes.

THE COMMISSIONER: Perhaps you could show that to the witness.

MR RAJALINGAM: Yes, I can. It's volume 1, page 29. I've got a copy.

40 THE COMMISSIONER: While you're organising that, could I ask you this, Ms Abboud.---Ah hmm.

The Mandaean women, where do they come from?---Iraq.

Iraq.---Iraq and Iran.

Okay. It's a particular area of Iraq and Iran is it?---Yes.

Okay. Thank you.

MR RAJALINGAM: Ms Abboud, do you recognise that document?---Yes, I do.

Can you have a look at some of the names that appear on that document. ---Yeah.

10 Firstly, on the first page of the names that you see, do you recognise any of those names?---Yes.

Do you recognise whether any of those people actually saw Ms Sharobeem as a psychologist?---Yes.

Do you agree that the document refers to appointment times but it doesn't confirm in any way that they actually saw Ms Sharobeem, does it?---No.

20 Do some of the people on the first page appear to be regular patients or clients of Ms Sharobeem?---Yeah.

How many people on the first page do you think were regulars?---On the first page? About four.

Okay. So about four of the people - - -?---Four were regulars, yeah.

- - - were regulars, all right. I wonder if the redacted version could be shown to the witness as well.

30 THE COMMISSIONER: Does Mr Chhabra need to see the document itself? Do you want to see it, Mr Chhabra?

MR CHHABRA: Would have thought so, yes, Commissioner.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, thank you. Could you just show the document to Mr Chhabra.

40 MR RAJALINGAM: I think that's the Commission's copy of that document. We don't have a redacted version to display on the screen. I'm just wondering in terms of procedural fairness whether that needs to be done. The other parties don't have a copy of this. It is 11.30. Are we able to get that done, redacted? I can continue on with some other questions for the minute or take the break.

THE COMMISSIONER: Do you want to take the morning tea adjournment? So, come back at about 10 to 12.00.

MR RAJALINGAM: Thank you, Commissioner.

**SHORT ADJOURNMENT**

**[11.28am]**

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, Mr Rajalingam.

MR RAJALINGAM: Thank you, Commissioner.

10 Ms Abboud, you had in front of you a client list prior to the morning tea adjournment. I'm going to ask that it be shown on the screen. As you can see, the names have been blacked out and the mobile contact details have been blacked out. Was that the first page that you looked at earlier today, before the morning tea break, the same page but it's been blacked out, hasn't it?---No, this is different page. The one that are blacked out, they used to be for the legal advice clients.

All right?---So we blocked the names for their own privacy, we don't send them.

20 Sorry, Ms Abboud, prior to the morning tea adjournment I showed you a document?---Yes.

This is the same document but with the names blacked out?---Oh.

We've blacked them out - - -?---Oh.

- - - so they can't be shown to the public. Do you understand?---Okay.

30 So it's the exact same document?---Yeah.

And what I will do is, I might show you that document. It's the hard copy version and it has the names there for you to see?---Okay.

All right. So you agree that they're the same document essentially but one has been redacted?---Okay.

Okay?---Ah hmm.

40 On the left-hand side of the column names, there's a writing, confirmation, then underneath that, yes?---Yes.

Whose writing is that?---Whether myself or my colleague that shared the position with me.

Do you, do you, can you, do you recognise the handwriting or are you assuming who that, who wrote that?---No, I recognise the writing.

And whose writing is it?---Which one, all of them?



Confirmation and yes on the left-hand side?---Not all of them, some are mine, some are hers.

So you're saying some of the yesses are yours?---No. The yesses are all my colleague's writing.

Yes?---But when it was cancelled here - -

10 All right?--- - - - that's me, so must, they must have said yes they are coming and then they cancelled later, so I put cancelled next to it.

All right. Do you know if Ms Sharobeem's handwriting is on this page?  
---No.

All right. I'll just ask you to turn to page 30 of the brief. It will be - right, you're on the next page. Pardon me. Ms Abboud, the ticks, do you know who placed those ticks there on the, on that page?---No, I don't remember who put the ticks.

20

All right. That's fine. Turn to the next page and the page after that?---Ah  
hmm.

And the page after that. Do you see at the bottom it says, the very last sentence in handwriting, "Eman can't see her until August as she is fully booked." Do you see that?---Yes.

Okay. Do you know whose handwriting that is?---I think it's my colleague, Watfa, as in Ms El-Baf.

30

And do you agree that that writing appears next to an entry for the 16<sup>th</sup>, a booking for 16 June, 2015 at 9.00am?---Sorry, what was that, the last - - -

Do you agree that that, the writing - - -?---Yeah.

- - - appears next to an appointment - - -?---Yes.

- - - for 19 June, 2015?---Yes.

40 Do you know what happened to that particular appointment, whether they came back or - - -?---No, I can't remember if they did or not.

Okay. That's fine.---Sorry.

Do you know if Ms Sharobeem actually spoke about herself in front of her clients as a psychologist?---I don't know.

Did you think when you were at IWHS that Ms Sharobeem was a psychologist?---Yeah.

And I think earlier you said that you had referred people to her for psychological counselling?---Yes. I didn't refer them. They asked to see the psychologist and I booked them their appointment.

And you put them on to her?---Yes.

10 You booked an appointment for them?---Yes.

Okay. Do you know if Ms Sharobeem was charging a fee for her services?--Not as far as I know, no.

Did you ever have a conversation with Ms Sharobeem about whether or not a fee should be imposed?---There was a very small conversation one day. Like, I mentioned that. She said they weren't turning up and she said maybe we should start charging them money, then they will turn up for their appointment.

20

Did that ever happen?---No.

Apart from Ms Sharobeem, was there any other mental health worker at IWHS?---There was counsellors.

Do you know if they were psychologists?---No. Counsellors, as far as I know, they are.

30 And where were the – were the counsellors employed by IWHS or by another organisation?---Another organisation.

And where did they come from?---Transcultural Mental Health.

And, yes, is that all?---STARTTS. STARTTS.

Can you remember what STARTTS stands for?---Services and Rehabilitation for Trauma and Torture Survivors.

40 Okay. How many counsellors did you see come from those services to assist at IWHS?---We see a few different. They don't come every day. They had a day where we booked their clients for them.

How often would they be at the service?---Once a week.

On a particular - - ?---Once a fortnight was on a Thursday. Then it was on a Tuesday. It changed. It changed from year to another.

Was it always on one day of the week or fortnight as opposed to - - -?

---Yeah.

- - - two days per week?---No, one day.

So it was never more than one day a week?---No.

And how, for how long would they be at the service?---The whole day from 9.00 - - -

10 During that - - -?---From 9.00 till 2.00 or 3 o'clock. No more than 3.00, actually, because we finished administration at 2.30, so no more appointments after 3 o'clock.

So from 9.00 to 3 o'clock they would see people?---Yeah.

And these are the other counsellors?---Till 2 o'clock.

20 2 o'clock. How many clients would they see approximately when they turned up at the service?---Can't remember. Four, maybe. About four.

Four clients for the entire day? How long would the sessions go for for each client?---There wasn't a set time. Some clients took longer than others.

Okay.---Some took shorter time than others.

Ms Abboud, was there a reimbursement policy for staff at IWHS? A reimbursement policy?---Yeah, myself for the petty cash, I used to use the petty cash for the office.

30 You said yourself, myself.---Reimbursement. You mean reimbursement - - -

Was there a policy - - -?---Mmm.

- - - for reimbursement to staff members? Was there a written document about reimbursement?---No.

40 Was there a spoken rule about reimbursement in the office?---I don't know what you mean by spoken rule.

Was there an understanding amongst all the people at the office as to how much they could claim for work-related expenses?---Yes.

And what was that understanding?---\$150 as a petty cash.

And were you in charge of the petty cash?---Yes.

Okay. What were people allowed to spend their money on to be reimbursed?---It wasn't really for people. It was for the participants usage. Like, like beverages, coffee, tea, biscuits. Or if we had any meetings we would buy a bit of fruit or, like, small, small amount, small expenditure on morning tea and stuff like that.

10 How would you - - -?---But if we needed paper on an urgent time, well, we don't need copy paper, I mean, we need copy paper, we didn't have the delivery from Officeworks, I used to buy it from this money. Like things, small things for the office.

Was there ever an occasion where receipts would be submitted to the bookkeeper for reimbursement by the bookkeeper?---Yes.

And who would submit those receipts, would facilitators submit those receipts?---Some of them do, yeah. Not, not, that hasn't got any relation with petty cash, that's different.

20 Yes, that's - - -?---The facilitators, yes, they spend morning tea money on their groups and they get reimbursed for that.

And how would they get reimbursed, who would they give their invoices to?---The bookkeeper. We usually put them in the bookkeeper's drawer, there is a drawer especially for the bookkeeper to reimburse people.

Would the facilitator first give you the invoice or would it go straight to the bookkeeper?---Sometimes they gave it to me and I put it, sometimes they put it themselves.

30 And if you use the Middle Eastern seniors group as an example - - -?  
---Mmm.

40 - - - can you describe what sort of fees or expenses a facilitator could incur in that program to be reimbursed for? So what type of things in that program could a facilitator claim reimbursement for in the Middle Eastern seniors group?---As far as I remember they have, two different people get reimbursed, one buys morning tea, she gets reimbursed for that, the other one used to take them out to lunch out of the centre and she used to pay for lunch, like in a restaurant or a club or whatever, and she gets reimbursed for that.

How many participants were in the Middle Eastern seniors group roughly? I think you said 20 to 26?---About 26, 27, yeah, something like that.

20, 27. Was food ever prepared for them as opposed to being taken out for lunch?---Yes, it was prepared for them, yes.

What sort of things were prepared, what sort of food was prepared?---A hot meal, a hot cooked meal.

And was it Middle Eastern food?---Yes.

What type of Middle Eastern food?---Like casseroles with rice or chicken with potato or - - -

10 And would that all be cooked at the service?---At the service.

And so there was a kitchen?---Yes.

And there was a stove?---Yes.

What else was in the kitchen in terms of facilities?---A table, chairs, microwave, fridge.

20 How much, do you know how much facilitators would usually submit in relation, submit invoices for in relation to the Middle Eastern seniors group, what amounts?---I don't really know, they varied, depends what they buy for morning tea or for lunch.

If they went to a restaurant how much would you expect them to submit an invoice for, for what amount?---I don't remember.

What about if they prepared some food, what type of, what amount of money would they be reimbursed for usually for preparing a Middle Eastern meal for say 26 people?---Honestly, I can't remember. I can't remember.

30 All right?---Morning tea would be a small like amount.

What's small?---Like no more than \$40 for morning tea.

And would lunch be significantly more than that?---More, definitely, yeah.

Okay. Would it be in the thousands?---No, no.

Would it be in the hundreds?---I think below 200.

40 Below 200?---Yeah.

But around about that mark, around about \$200?---Yeah.

Were you yourself monitoring - - -?---I can't remember.

Sorry, what was that?---I can't remember really.

Okay. All right. Were you yourself monitoring what receipts were being submitted to the bookkeeper for payment?---No, not always, no, only sometimes when they, some of them if they asked me to add the amount before they give it to double-check it, like they add it and double-check it for me if it's correct, so I did that sometimes.

So you double-checked what the bookkeeper - - -?---Yeah.

10 - - - had processed?---No, what the facilitator submitted to get reimbursed for.

So did you check their facilitator timesheet sometimes?---Not the timesheet.

Oh, sorry?---The - - -

The invoices?---The invoices.

The invoices that were submitted?---I just add the totals.

20 Yes. Did you ever put receipts in the drawer for the bookkeeper to process?---Myself, for myself?

Yes, for yourself?---Yes.

Did you ever put receipts for other facilitators in the drawer for the bookkeeper to process?---When they gave it to me, yes.

30 Was there ever an occasion when you saw something in that drawer where receipts were being kept that was unusual?---What do you mean by unusual? I don't know.

Well, something that you saw was strange in the drawer.---Oh, you mean names?

Yes.---Yeah, I did see some names I didn't know who they were.

Okay. What were these names on?---Oh, I can't remember that.

40 Were they on facilitator forms?---I don't know whether invoice or, or timesheet I don't know. I don't remember.

Did you at any stage see a large claim for facilitator fees in the drawer?---I think I did but I can't remember what and how much.

What type of money – do you remember roughly how much money was being claimed in that particular form?---A couple of thousand I think, thousands, a couple of thousand.

Do you remember what name was on - - -?---No.

Did you recognise the name that you saw on the form?---No.

When you're – you're shaking your head. Are you saying you did not recognise the name - - -?---No.

- - - or you don't remember the name?---I don't, I don't recognise, recognise the name.

10

Okay. So did you ever see Ms Sharobeem doing work as a facilitator in a program?---No, I didn't.

During the week during the day what would – would Ms Sharobeem attend the programs and help with the programs?---No.

What would she be doing during the day usually?---If not in her office she'd be out in meetings or, I don't know.

20

Did you ever know her to assist with programs as a facilitator?---Not as facilitator, no.

Did you ever know her to assist with programs as the CEO of the organisation?---Yeah, she used to tell us that I've, I've been to a conference, not, not conference - - -

No, I'm talking about programs.---Forum, speaking in a forum. Speaking.

30

But that's not a program is it?---No.

That's, that's a, that's an external event isn't it - - -?---That's right, yeah.

- - - you're talking about?---External event.

I'm talking about IWHS programs - - -.---No.

- - - that were being conducted. She was never assisting those programs. Is that what you're saying?---No.

40

The document that you've referred to that you saw in the drawer which you can't really recall, do you remember having a discussion with Ms El-Baf about that?---I asked her if she knows who is that. She said no.

Do you remember if Ms – you and Ms El-Baf did something with that document?---No.

Did you provide it to – I withdraw that. Did you make a written, written complaint or did you complain to an officer of the New South Wales Health Department?---Yes.

Do you remember that?---(No Audible Reply)

Can you describe what happened?---Um - - -

10 Do you remember speaking to someone from Liverpool Health?---I, I didn't speak personally but, yeah.

Well, I'm not sure what happened. Can you just describe what took place in terms of the meeting with this person from Health?---I didn't meet with her. We didn't meet with her.

What did happen then?---Can't remember now.

20 Do you remember – I think her name would have been Christine Polocini. ---Oh.

Do you remember that?---Yeah. Yeah, we sent an email.

Okay. What, and what did you write – what was written in the email that was sent?---That we were concerned about what's happening at the service, these different names and how we were - - -

Sorry?---These different names that we don't recognise that have been working with us. We don't know who they are.

30 Was that contained in the email?---Ah - - -

Who wrote the email do you remember?---Watfa wrote the email.

Watfa. Okay. Do you know from which account the email was sent, was it sent from the IWHS account?---No.

Was it sent from a personal email account?---Yeah, personal.

40 Did Ms Polocini tell you to do anything?---No. She said she will look into it.

Did you hear from her again?---(No Audible Reply)

You're shaking your head?---I can't remember. I'm just trying to think if we heard from her again. I think she replied to Watfa's email.



Ms Abboud, were you aware that Ms Sharobeem was submitting invoices for reimbursement at IWHS? Did you know that Ms Sharobeem was submitting invoices when you were there?---Yeah.

Did you know for what amount she was seeking reimbursement?---No, I don't.

I'll show you a document, volume 1, pages 47 and 49. 47 first. And you'll see that there are a number of receipts on the screen.---Ah hmm.

10

I just want you to work from the left-hand, top left-hand side to the right-hand side of the screen. And the first receipt there is for an amount of \$450.---Yeah.

Do you see that?---Yes.

Can you, do you recognise the writing at the top of that receipt which says "hall hire"?---Yeah.

20

Whose writing is that?---Looks, looks to me like Eman's writing.

And would you agree that the rest of the handwriting on that page is similar to that handwriting on the other receipts?---Yes. Yes.

Do you know whose handwriting is on the other receipts?---Is it the same person or a different person?---Same.

And who is that?---Eman.

30

If you go to page 49. I don't think 47 was finished. Sorry. And that's the bottom half of page 47, I apologise. Would you agree that the handwriting on those two receipts at the bottom of the page appear to be Ms Sharobeem's writing?---Yes.

And if you go to page 49. The words "beauty" written at the top of each receipt.---Mmm.

Do you recognise that handwriting?---No. I'm not sure of that one.

40

Okay. You said – I might just ask you again. Sorry?---No, nothing. I didn't say anything.

Were there any programs that were conducted related to employment?  
---What do you mean employment?

Were there any programs conducted at IWHS - - -?---Yes?

- - - that were about finding a job?---Oh, we did a couple of courses with Barrington.

Yeah.---Barrington. Something Barrington. Can't remember the name properly.

Is that the only - - -?---Only Barrington. I think that's the name.

10 Is that the only course that was run in relation to employment?---That's right.

Sorry, in relation to finding a job?---Yes.

And when was that course?---2015 or '16. '15 and '16.

Well, did - - -?---It was two courses.

How long did they last?---10 weeks each.

20 Who were they funded by?---Barrington.

Did IWHS contribute any money towards the course?---No.

How do you know that?---I was told by the facilitator who did the course that Barrington's paying all the expenses. All we need is a room.

And where was the course held?---At the centre.

30 Did you ever see Ms Sharobeem provide gifts of clothing to group participants - - -?---Never.

- - - in relation to assisting them in finding a job?---No.

Did you ever see Ms Sharobeem give a gift to a staff member at the service?---No.

Did you ever see Ms Sharobeem give a gift at the office to a facilitator?---No.

40 What about gifts to attendees of programs? Food, that sort of thing. Small items.---No.

You would have obviously known Miss Sharobeem from when you started, sorry, when you she started because you started after - - -?---When she started, I started - - -

Sorry, before her. Did you notice any - over the years I mean you were there until 2016.---That's right.

Over the years did you notice any change in Miss Sharobeem's appearance?---Yes, I did.

Can you describe that.---Eman started to look after herself more and she lost weight, she was dressed nicer than before, her hair was done nicer - - -

10 Go from the top to the bottom if you want, if it's easier for you, just describe her hair, face and clothing.---Her hair was better, make up, um, she had her teeth fixed she was dressed nicely with good clothing.

What sort of clothes are we talking about, designer brands or did you know? ---Yes, some are designer labels.

What sort of brands?---I don't know, I don't - - -

20 Do you know if Miss Sharobeem was regularly going to the hair salon?--- Oh she did go, yeah, often, I mean I used to notice she's coming back nice with nice hair and I always commented nice hair today, you know.

How often would that take place, do you know?---No, I don't know really. I mean the time I see her is when I am in the office, I see her with the hair done and then I complimented on it.

Was there a credit card issued to the Immigrant Women's Health Service? ---I think so.

Who had possession of the credit card?---Eman.

30 Did anyone else have possession of the credit card?---No, not as far as I know anybody.

Do you know if anyone else had access to the credit card?---No, I don't.

What colour was that credit card, do you know?---No.

Have you ever seen it?---(No audible reply)

40 Do you know if it needed a PIN or did you have to sign for the card?---I don't know.

Do you know if it was Miss Sharobeem's name on the card or IWHS on the card?---I don't know.

So you've never seen the card?---No.

Had you ever used the credit card in any way?---Never, never.

What about using it online using the account, the credit card account?---I never used to pay, I used to, if I ordered something which was Officework mainly, they would have 30 day credit, they used to send us the invoice and I would pay within 30 days. The bookkeeper pay it, I don't pay it.

10 I'm want to talk to you about, ask you some questions about renovations to The Fairfield Centre and repairs. Early on when you were working at the Immigrants Woman's Health Service when Eman started there, Miss Sharobeem started there, do you recall being asked to contact the real estate agent in order to conduct repairs - - -?---Yes.

What type of repairs would you contact the real estate agent about?---Any, any if the tap was leaking or anything, anything we had.

I'll show you a document, Volume 10 Renovations page five. Do you recall this, these two emails being sent, you sent the one at the top?---Yes.

And the bottom, sorry, you sent the one on the bottom.---Which one?

20 Your email is the table at the bottom of the screen.---Yes.

And then there's a reply from Miss Sharobeem at the top?---Okay.

I'm simply asking you if you recall these emails?---Yes.

Do you agree that in your email at the bottom in the table, you refer to calling Marando Real Estate?---Yes.

30 And you complained about the ceiling corner?---Yes.

You also complained about the toilet.---Yeah.

And next to each issue is an action that was taken. Is that fair?---That's right, yeah.

Do you know who asked you to contact the real estate agent?---Eman did.

40 How often did she ask you to contact the real estate agent?---Any time we had any problem or something to be fixed.

How often would that be in a year?---Not often, really. Maybe twice.

A little later, when you were at the IWHS, after 2011, did you notice that a number of repairs and renovations were being conducted at the centre?  
---Yeah, of course.

Did you know who was paying for the renovations and the repairs?---I didn't know who was paying, no.

Do you recall any electrician in 2012 by the name of Patrick Scarf doing some work?---Yes.

Do you recall a handyman by the name of John Bazzi in 2013 doing some work?---Yes.

Do you recall some painting work done by R & R Painting in 2014?---By who?

10

R & R Painting.---Yes, yes.

What about security shutters? Were they installed in 2015?---2015? No.

Were security shutters installed?---Yeah, but not in 2015.

When were they installed?---Oh, very early 2004. Oh, my God. '05. I can't remember. But not '15 definitely, because we've had them for years.

20

Do you recall the switches and the plugs being replaced in 2014-2015?  
---Switches. No, I don't remember that.

Was there a handyman by the name of Nenad Kelecevic?---Yes, Ned, yes.

And that would have been in 2015, wouldn't it?---Yes.

What about Robert Saloum?---Yes.

30

Do you recall him attending in March 2015 to do some handyman work?  
---No, not handyman.

What was it? Pardon me.---He installed a camera.

A what, sorry?---A camera. A camera.

A security camera?---Security camera.

40

Okay. Do you know if anyone else attended after about 2011 to do renovation or repair work apart from the people that I have mentioned?  
---We had painting.

Yeah. And I referred to R & R Painting.---No, I think it's another one. No, there's another painter. I don't know the surname. I know his first name, Emad.

E-m-a-d?---E-m-a-d, yes.

Okay.---He did the painting for us.

What other types of renovation? We've heard about general handyman stuff, electrician, painting.---We put the railing at the front.

Who did that? Do you know?---No, can't remember the name. We also put concrete in the front of the centre. It was all concreted instead of grass.

When was that done?---Maybe '13, '14.

10 Did Ms Sharobeem purchase a couch for the IWHS at some stage?---Yes.

What type of couch was it?---One couch, you mean? No. Just after she started she bought two lounges, two couches. Blue colour sofa bed and another normal two-seater.

And what fabric or leather were they?---Fabric.

Fabric.---Blue fabric.

20 And the sofa bed? What was that?---That was the same.

Fabric?---Yeah.

That's the blue sofa bed, is it?---Yeah, there were two two-seaters. One is sofa bed, one is normal two-seaters.

So it's four seats?---Yes.

30 But two lounges?---Two lounges.

Okay.---Or maybe five seats.

Yeah. Did you see any other couches be delivered to the service?---No.

Those were the only couches that you saw delivered to the service?---Yeah. Not long, not long ago we changed these lounges. She gave them to Cabramatta centre and she bought black little lounges for the centre (not transcribable).

40 And what were they made of?---Vinyl.

Vinyl.---Vinyl black.

Do you know how much that cost, the vinyl black sofa?---I think it was \$100 each.

How many sofas were there?---Five or six, I think six.

And were they new or did they appear second-hand?---No, new.

New. How did you know they were \$100 each?---I think I asked her that time and she said they were cheap, \$100 each. I remember I did ask her.

Over the years do you know who cleaned the office?---Ah - - -

Do you know if a man by the name of Dave cleaned the office?---Yes, David, yes.

10

Was he a regular?---Yes.

How often, for how long did he clean the service, the centre rather?---He used to come twice a week for how many years.

20

Since you started at the service?---No, no, we had different cleaners. We had different cleaners when Eman started, not long after she started she told them that she would change, she changed to, can't remember who, I can't remember who came after, but we've had, we've had cleaners, I don't know who they were, they came after, after work, after we've gone and I never met them, never seen them, a girl, Rachel I think her name was, she said Rachel her name is but we have never met her.

How do you know she was cleaning the office?---Eman told us.

When did Eman tell you that Rachel was cleaning the office?---One time I complained.

30

About what?---About the bathroom were not clean and the cleaner's not doing a good job and she said to me, "I will have a talk to her."

Did Richard Sharobeem ever clean the office?---I don't know.

Did you ever come to know that he had cleaned the office somehow?  
---No.

Had you had any conversations with him about him having cleaned the office?---No.

40

Did you ever complain to him about cleaning, not cleaning the office and - - -?---No.

Have you ever seen facilitator invoices in relation to cleaning work?  
---David, yeah. Oh, not invoice, no not invoice.

I'm talking about facilitator invoices?---Oh, no, no. Ah - - -

How would David, how is David paid?---He puts his own invoice in.

All right. Ms Abboud, do you recall a massage chair being delivered to the service in 2015?---I was told it's there but I've never seen it before I was told.

Had you ever – so you never saw the massage chair?---Not before I was told that it's there, but I didn't see it beforehand.

But at some stage did you actually see it?---Yeah, I did see it.

10

Yeah. I'll just show you a picture, page 40 of volume 1. Does that look like the massage chair that was delivered to the service?---Is that black? I can't see.

It looks like - - -?---It was a creamy colour but this one looks black to me.

Yes. So what colour was it?---I think it was cream colour, beigey colour.

20

So you've never seen a black massage chair?---Oh my God, I can't even think whether it was black or not anymore. I can't remember.

All right?---Oh my God, that's terrible like.

Do you remember receiving an email from Ms Sharobeem about the massage chair?---Yes, I do.

I'll show you that, page 38?---Ah hmm. Yes, I remember this email.

30

And what did you think that Ms Sharobeem was telling you in that email? ---That we have the massage chair and the place in the childcare room and to develop a flyer for it to charge people \$5 for 15 minutes.

Does she say in the email that – and I'm going to read it – “We got a massage chair placed on childcare room some weeks ago.”?---Where is that, is it here?

Yes, it's just the first line?---Oh, yeah, yeah, “We got a massage chair placed,” yes.

40

Some weeks ago. Do you agree with that?---Yes. I can't read that.

And do you recall prior to 19 September whether or not there was a massage chair?---No, I am sure there wasn't.

Okay?---That's why my mind went crazy and I said it wasn't there. She said yeah, yeah, it was, but she didn't realise, she didn't, didn't notice, but I was sure because I locked the door on Friday before I left home, I locked the childcare room door.



So you specifically recall receiving this email?---I received this email on the Saturday when I was at home, I wasn't at work but when I went to work on Monday morning, I went to the child care room immediately to check the chair and it was there.

So you're sure in the weeks leading up to this email there wasn't a massage chair in the child care room?---No there wasn't.

10 What was in the child care room?---Little chairs and tables, toys, a desk um, that's it, stuff for the kids and a lounge, an old lounge suite.

What colour was that lounge suite?---A navy blue colour.

What fabric?---Leather.

Leather. Old or new?---Old.

20 Did you create a flyer in relation to the chair?---My colleague Watfa did.

I'll show you page 43 of Volume 1. Is that the flyer that Ms El-Baf created?---Yes.

Was it kept anywhere, was it given out to anyone?---It was hang everywhere in the centre, in each room we hang one for the participant to look at to, you know.

Did anyone use the chair?---No.

30 What sort of computers were in the service, at the service at Fairfield, were they desktops or laptops?---Desktops.

How many did you say?---There were four.

Four.---There was one laptop that we used occasionally.

And what type of laptop was it, was it an Apple laptop or an IBM or - - -?  
---I don't know.

40 Do you know if the staff or the facilitators had access to an iPad?---No.

Or a smart pad, not an Apple product or another smart pad?---No.

What about a smaller version of an iPad?---No.

Any of that type of equipment at the service?---No.

iPods?---No.

What about was there a camera at the service?---Yes, there was a camera.

What type of camera was at the service?---Just a normal small red colour camera.

Was it an Olympus brand camera?---I don't think so.

10 Okay. But it was a small digital camera?---Digital camera, yes, digital.

Did you ever see 12 leather chairs at the centre?---Sorry.

Twelve leather chairs?---No, no.

Was there a television at the service?---Yes.

How many televisions sets?---One, two, three.

20 And do you know what brand they were?---No, I can't remember the brand.

Did they look old or new?---No, brand new.

How big were they?---Big um, as big as this screen, I can't remember the size, just about that size.

What about a treadmill?---We had a treadmill for a short time but nobody used it.

30 When did the service have a treadmill?---I can't remember the year but a long time ago.

Was there an electric gate installed at Fairfield?---No.

Was there a barbecue set?---No.

Pardon me Commissioner. Miss Abboud is there anything else you can tell The Commission about working at the Immigrant Women's Health Service between 2001 and 2016?---What kind of - - -

40 About Miss Sharobeem that you think we need to know?---Not really.

Okay. Commissioner, those are the questions.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you. Mr Chhabra?

MR CHHABRA: Thank you. Ma'am, are you married?---yes.

Do you, have you disclosed your marital status to Centrelink?---Yes.

Tell me this, my correct understanding that you worked on a part time basis?---That's right.

Three days a week.--Yes.

And you would finish your work at 2.30pm.---That's right.

10 But the centre would stay open past 2.30pm, correct?---Only if Eman was there.

And if groups or sessions were held after 2.00pm you would not be there? ---Except when we had the lawyer that was once a fortnight, I used to stay till 4 o'clock until she leaves or if she leaves earlier, I leave earlier.

But on a day that didn't include a lawyer - - -?---No.

- - - you wouldn't know?---No.

20 You gave some evidence regarding cleaning and this fellow by the name of David.---Yes.

Were there times to the best of your knowledge David would not attend? ---No.

Were you ever made aware that David would not attend or would not be able to?---Yeah, if – it happened very – maybe once or twice he didn't attend.

30 So you agree it did happen?---Only once when his wife had the baby or something. Yeah, there was a reason that he didn't attend.

And would any – there were times that cleaning would need to be done before a group event or program was run?---Yes.

And that group event or program may happen at a time when David would not be coming?---It might happen twice – once, yeah, for the, for the other group the next morning because they come – they have to have the floor cleaned to use the floor.

40 And that would be done by someone other than David?---Not – no. Not necessary. In the morning whether myself or my colleague came and it was dirty we vacuumed it quickly.

So again there was cleaning done by somebody other than David?---No.

Well, you just said yourself that you would clean. You're not David are you?---But it's not like regularly, it happened maybe once that we cleaned the floor before the other class. It's not like I do it permanently.

Now, you said yourself that – I want to ask you a few questions regarding programs and classes. Certain events you'd have somewhere between 20 to 25 participants?---Yes.

10 And certain programs they were run every week were they?---What programs? It depends what you're talking about.

Well, let me ask you about the Assyrian - - -.---The regular programs we had, like - - -

Sure.--- - - - the regular ones, yes, every day of the week.

Let me ask you about the Assyrian Women's Group.---Yes.

20 You said there were about 22 women registered for that group.---Yes.

And how often would that group convene?---Once a week.

Throughout the year?---Yes, except during the school holidays.

So if I understand correctly, approximately 40 weeks a year?---Yeah, probably.

Across four terms?---I don't know. You work it out.

30 22 participants about 40 weeks of the year. Correct?---Yeah.

Give or take, about 800 participants throughout the year?---Yeah.

Not 800 people but 800 participants throughout the year Correct?---But they are the same people. They're not new participants.

Certainly. But 800 participants throughout the 40 weeks?---Yeah.

40 You've given some evidence regarding a database.---Yeah.

Is it the case that that database was accessible from the computer at the reception?---Yes.

And that was the only computer that had access to the database?---That's right.

And that's the computer - - -?---No, excuse me. What do you mean access? Other computers have access to the database.

The same database?---Yes.

And it's the case that yourself and, if I pronounce the name incorrectly I do apologise, Wafta - - -?---Watfa.

- - - had access to that database?---That's right.

From the front desk at the reception?---Yes.

10

Is it also the case that groups or programs or events were run either in the children's room, the kitchen and the bookkeeper room from time to time?  
---Yeah, from time to time.

You mentioned in your evidence an organisation by the name of the Transcultural Mental Health Service.---That's right.

Am I correct that that service was in partnership or a partnership arrangement with IWHS?---Yes.

20

And it's the case that at times clients of IWHS were referred to the Transcultural Mental Health Service?---That's right.

And the Transcultural Mental Health Service provided psychologists?  
---Counsellors.

But they also had psychologists?---I don't recall any psychologists.

Indeed, certain clients were referred to a psychologist by the name of Ranya Yakow?---I'm not sure if she was a psychologist or a counsellor.

30

And at times after Miss Sharobeem had spent time with the clients she would come out and either direct you or Watfa or refer clients to that service?---Yes.

Ma'am, it's also the case that you have taken furniture that was to be replaced from a centre to your own home?---Me? Never.

Are you sure about that?---Of course I'm sure.

40

It's the case that when furniture needs to be replaced it's removed from the centre?---Excuse me, furniture to my own house - - -

Listen to my question. Is it correct, that when furniture needs to be replaced it is removed from the centre?---Only the blue lounges that were taken to Cabramatta Centre.

And has any furniture ever been taken home by you to your home?---No. Oh, there was a fridge that I bought, I didn't take it, an old fridge that she didn't want, she said sell it for anything, just get rid of it. I said, "How much do you want for it?" She said, "\$50." I said, "I'll take it." That was it, nothing else.

And did Watfa ever take home computer screens and chairs?---Never, not as far as I know.

10 You're not saying she didn't, you just don't know?---No, I would have known if she did.

Did you ever make online payments with the IWHS credit card?---Never.

Are you sure about that?---Yeah, I never paid anything, I never bought anything online.

Nothing further.

20 THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you. Anything else, anything arising?

MR RAJALINGAM: No, Commissioner.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes. Thank you Mrs Abboud, you're excused if you like.

**THE WITNESS EXCUSED**

**[12.48PM]**

30

MR RAJALINGAM: Commissioner, I wonder if we can have a lunch break a little earlier today. We've got one further witness Miss El-Baf and I think it would be quicker, I think, if I just spent some time getting through the documents to make it.

THE COMMISSIONER: We'll adjourn now and resume at 2.00.

MR RAJALINGAM: Thank you Commissioner, yes.

40

**LUNCHEON ADJOURNMENT**

**[12.48PM]**