

TARLOPUB00047
01/05/2017

TARLO
pp 00047-00097

PUBLIC
HEARING

COPYRIGHT

INDEPENDENT COMMISSION AGAINST CORRUPTION

THE HONOURABLE REGINALD BLANCH AM QC

PUBLIC HEARING

OPERATION TARLO

Reference: Operation E15/1982

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

AT SYDNEY

ON MONDAY 1 MAY, 2017

AT 2.00PM

Any person who publishes any part of this transcript in any way and to any person contrary to a Commission direction against publication commits an offence against section 112(2) of the Independent Commission Against Corruption Act 1988.

This transcript has been prepared in accordance with conventions used in the Supreme Court.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes. Is Ms Watton still here? You're still on the same oath to tell the truth, Ms Watton, thank you.

THE WITNESS: Yes.

<JULIE CHRISTINE WATTON, on former oath [2.05pm]

10 THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you.

Yes, Mr Rajalingam.

MR RAJALINGAM: Thank you, Commissioner.

Ms Watton, you agree that Ms Sharobeem told the board that she was overwhelmed with her duties and resigned in late 2014?---Yes, something like that, yes.

20 And then in March 2015 there were some queries by Family and Community Services of NESH?---Yes.

And those queries related to various expenses?---Ah hmm.

You then gave some evidence about a \$3,000 payment and you said that you had a meeting with Ms Sharobeem - - -?---Ah hmm.

- - - and a number of receipts were on her table and the meeting was between a number of different people?---Ah hmm.

30

Ms Sharobeem, yourself, you were there, I think you said Ms Lai was there? ---I imagine Ms Lai and - - -

But were there others present?---Yes, there were others present.

Can you just tell the Commission - - -?---Ah hmm.

- - - how many receipts you think might have been on the table?---I don't really know. Maybe I may have signed a pile of maybe about 20 and the others may have signed like similar piles.

40

And was there a general instruction given by Ms Sharobeem in relation to the receipts?---Just to initial them.

Do you remember the exact words she used?---Not really, but just to initial them because I saw that on what I initialled there wasn't even a date or anything like that, so I'm quite sure that would be all the instructions because normally if I would be to sign something I would date it as well.

I'm going to take you to a transfer document?---Ah hmm.

Volume 21, page 1. I think I might have put the question to you in terms of receipts, but were there also transfer documents on the table during this meeting with Ms Sharobeem?---What do you mean, transfer documents?

10 Documents like that in front of you?---I believe they were all like – I, yeah, I – I just really remember this one because of the fact that it was shown to me when I needed to do my statement, so, and also, or maybe that wasn't shown to me, I think there's a, the auditor had provided us with things to follow up on and that could have been there.

Ms Watton - - -?---Ah hmm.

- - - if you look at the bottom right-hand corner of that page - - -?---Yeah.

- - - there's a box, a stamp box - - -?---Ah hmm.

20 - - - and it has, "authorised by."?---Yes.

Is that your initial?---It is.

Is that the document you recall authorising, as you've said, at this meeting with Ms Sharobeem?---It's one of them.

And on these other documents - - -?---Ah hmm.

30 - - - that you say you authorised, did you do a similar thing - - -?---Yes.

- - - by simply putting your initial in the stamp box?---Yes.

And does that – did that transfer stick out in your mind? It was \$3,000?
---It didn't really stick out in my mind but, as I said, it was brought up in my statement and also when I went over items that the auditor had given to us when we had a meeting in his office, that was when I found a copy of that.

Okay. To the best of your recollection - - -?---Ah hmm.

40 - - - do you know what other documents you initialled on that afternoon?
---Not really, no.

Do you know what amounts those documents may have referred to?---Not really, no.

Do you know anything else about what Ms Sharobeem might have said at that meeting?---Not really, no.

Did she at any stage give to any of the other people present at that meeting an indication of what the expenses were for?---I don't recall her doing so but like I suppose if we looked at all of them, some of them may have had more supporting documents than just the little credit card receipt, but I can't really recall.

Would you agree that at that meeting the bulk of documents did not contain much detail with respect to - - - ?---I believe that they probably didn't contain much detail.

10

Did many of the documents that you looked at have receipts that were cut or appeared to have been cut?---I don't really recall.

Were many of the documents credit card receipts?---I don't really call I'm sorry. What I really recall is that they had all been – the payments had all been made so I imagine something like the Commonwealth Bank would have been there.

20

Well, just take this for an example.---Ah hmm.

The transfer you said to have occurred on 16 March at 11.00am in – sorry, 16 March, 2015 - - -.---Ah hmm.

- - - at 11.00am. Now, I think you said earlier in your evidence that this meeting you had with Ms Sharobeem took place at around about the time of the audit.---Yeah, I don't believe that it was in March.

30

Yes. Do you – would you agree that it was later that year in about August or September?---I do believe that it was later in the year, yes.

I'll show you another document. Statements volume 4, page 276. Ms Watton, if I take you to the email - - -.---Ah hmm.

- - - bottom half of the page, would you agree that it's an email from  to others?---Yes.

And those others are people that were on the board or - - -?---Ah hmm.

40

- - - employed by NESH, would you agree?---Yes.

In that email, firstly, do you agree that the email is signed – there's a signature block on the email referring to Dr Eman Sharobeem?---Yes.

And do you agree that in that email is written that \$3,000, \$3,000 transfer – a \$3,000 transfer to Westmead Hospital was made by mistake?---Yes.

Do you recall receiving that email?---I may of.

If you go to the email at the top half of the page, the first email, do you agree that it's for the same day - - -?---Sorry, I read it around the other way. I read the top one first.

Well, the bottom email - - -.---Yes.

- - - refers to a mistake having been made. Do you agree?---That's what the email says, yes.

10 And the top email refers to Ms Sharobeem suggesting that the payment was for a contribution to the – a conference at Westmead Hospital.---Ah hmm.

Do you recall receiving that email?---I don't recall receiving the email but I recall seeing that top part of the email because it was actually with the information from the auditor.

20 Sorry, what do you recall seeing, the - - -?---You know, the top part, the first part – well, I'll call it the top part at 12.21 the time was. So I recall seeing a copy of that email with information that was given by the auditor which also had like a copy of the Commonwealth Bank and the little credit card receipt.

Okay.---But I may have received that email. My name is on it. There is no reason to say that I wouldn't have received it.

When you had this meeting with Ms Sharobeem, did you know at that time that a payment had been made to Westmead Hospital for \$3,000?---I'm not sure.

30 Is it your evidence that on the day you initialled a number of documents - - - ?---Ah hmm.

- - - you weren't really looking at them?---Probably not because there wasn't much to see. There wasn't much supporting evidence to see except a tiny little credit card receipt and perhaps I didn't look at – it says I think on it Westmead Private Hospital but perhaps I didn't look at that.

How did that meeting come about?---I don't really recall.

40 Do you know if Ms Sharobeem asked a number of people to attend her office?---She may of, I'm not, or we could have been there working on the information that the auditor had sent out. I'm not quite sure.

Were you, did you ever think that Ms Sharobeem had presented a paper at Westmead Hospital?---Well, she may of.

Did you ever know that?---I didn't know myself personally but it was likely that she may have presented a paper there.

Did you know whether or not NESH had made a contribution to Westmead Hospital?---No, I didn't know NESH had made a contribution but I think in that paperwork it said that it was paid from the NESH account.

Did you think that IWHS had made, was involve in making contribution to the Westmead Hospital?---It may have been, I didn't really know.

I just – did you, did you know about any contribution made by IWHS?
---I didn't know, no.

10

Did any of, did you have any other conversation with board members about a contribution being made to the hospital?---I don't recall so.

In later, or during this audit there was another issue with the purchase of a vehicle, wasn't there?---Yes.

And it was in relation to the purchase of a vehicle being used by Richard Sharobeem. Is that correct?---Yes, I, well, I know that there was – I was asked about issues with the, how many cars that were with the NESH service.

20

I'll take you to another email, volume 21, page 134?---Ah hmm.

Firstly how did you become aware or were you aware that a Honda City sedan had been purchased for NESH?---I knew that there was a car purchased but I didn't know a great deal about it.

30

Did you know the type of vehicle purchased?---I may have heard mention of it being a Honda or I can recall something about Nevine didn't like driving one particular model because it was too big, so I imagine that that was that vehicle.

Just if you could read that email?---Ah hmm.

Second paragraph?---I, I don't even recall actually even seeing this email before, although my name is on it so - - -

You agree that you're recorded as having been sent the email?---Yes, yeah.

40

Is that your email address?---It is.

C-a-b-r-a-c-c dot org dog au?---Yes, it is, yes. But I, I really don't, I don't really recall seeing that.

And without any disrespect to you, Ms Watton - - -?---Ah hmm.

- - - but did you pay much attention to the emails from NESH or IWHS?

---Well, in hindsight perhaps I didn't pay as much attention as what I should of, of paid.

So you don't recall receiving that email?---I don't recall.

Do you recall Ms Ghaly expressing some frustration at the fact that she hadn't been told that there was a Honda City sedan?---I don't really recall that.

10 Were you aware at around about this time of NESH funds being used to purchase a vehicle for Ms Sharobeem's partner, Haiman Hammo?---No.

In your time as a board member for either NESH or IWHS, from 2012 to I think June 2016 - - -?---I'm still actually on the board of IWHS now.

I see. In your time as a board member for both of those organisations - - -?
---Ah hmm.

20 - - - and your involvement with Ms Sharobeem, do you ever recall her seeking the board's permission to spend money, spend funds from the organisation?---I don't recall.

Do you recall her ever seeking the board's permission to conduct work, do work as a facilitator?---I don't recall that ever happening.

30 Do you recall Ms Sharobeem ever talking about 92 Smart Street, Fairfield, being a property that she owned?---No. I became aware of that when we went to a meeting with South Area Health Service. That must have been after, maybe in November or December of 2015.

When you first met Ms Sharobeem did you think she was a doctor?---Not when I first met her, no.

When did you first meet her?---It would have been like when I first joined the network, the monthly meeting network which was probably about 10 years ago. So at that time she was known as Eman. I do recall some conversation about her completing a degree but no mention of what degree it was.

40 Where did this conversation occur?---It probably would have taken place like somewhere at IWHS. So either in a board meeting or at a catch up after one of our network meetings but nothing specific and then I do recall that her email address changed from Eman to Dr Eman. So for me I presumed that she must have finished – got her degree and that she was now Dr Eman because of the email.

Did you think the title meant she was a doctor of medicine or a doctor of something else?---No, for psychology.

Why did you think it was for psychology?---Because that must have been something I may have heard like about the degree that she had been doing some sort of studying.

In 2014 and 2015 was there ever any authorisation to transfer funds from NESH to IWHS by the board?---Not that I recall but maybe there had been some instances.

- 10 Did the board ever authorise payment of money for Richard Sharobeem's liposuction procedure at Westmead Hospital?---Definitely not. I believe that was that receipt was for.

And did the board – when I say the board I'm talking about the joint board. ---Yes.

Ever – did the joint board ever authorise the payment of \$18,000 to finalise the purchase of a Mercedes-Benz vehicle?---Definitely not.

- 20 You said earlier that you received some training.---Ah hmm.

What was that training in relation to?---That was governance training.

And who gave you that training?---Well, the board members attended that training.

- 30 The board members of who?---Of, of well, what was left of the board, the – and it was also open to the staff too from IWHS who at that time I believed it was Audrey, myself, Nada. I think that was all. I think one of the workers, Luong, attended one night, and somebody else I think attended for one session.

Who, who organised the training?---That – I believe it was like either Audrey or the new chairperson, Denele.

And who conducted the training?---It was by Elizabeth Perez, I think it's Byrons Chartered Accountants.

- 40 And I think your solicitor has an email from Byrons' solicitors - - -?---Yes. - - - indicating that that did take place.---Yes.

Do you know what month it took place in?---I believe it was in January, 2016.

Pardon my back, Commissioner. I'll show you a document. Can you describe what that document is?---This was an email from Elizabeth Perez who conducted the training just saying that it was – so that must have been

all the people that were involved on the top of the email and to find attached a letter that can be used as evidence of completion of the training.

How long did the training go for?---It went over two nights.

Do you know how much it cost to run the training?---I'm not sure how much. I, I, I probably would know if I went through old emails and things like that but I'm not sure.

10 I tender that document, Commissioner.---Do you want that - - -

THE COMMISSIONER: Exhibit 17.

#EXHIBIT 17 - EMAIL FROM ELIZABETH PEREZ TO JULIE WATTON & OTHERS DATED 2 FEBRUARY 2016

20 MR RAJALINGAM: I wonder if that could be handed back, Commissioner.---Thank you.

And what did you learn at the training?---Well, I think we learned the legal responsibilities of the board. We learnt that the practices that we were doing – there was a lot more to being on the board than what we assumed that there was and our obligations to like the, to the service, to the funding body, to like accountability for the whole of the services.

30 What do you think are the skills you need to be a board member of a non-government organisation such as the Immigrant Women's Health Service? ---Well, now I believe that there should be a diverse range of skills. So I believe that there should be, like, a mix of community members. There should be a mix of people, like, with financial backgrounds. There should be a mix of – if it's the Health Department, people that may work for the Health Department. Community members, community workers as well. Like, yeah, a very diverse mix of people all with specialised skills that can go towards governing the organisation.

40 And what do you think a manager or a chief executive officer should report to a board?---Well, I think that the manager should look after the day-to-day running of the service, but I think that all financial things should go to the board. So I believe that, like, we did – we now have, like, a financial document which says that, you know, how much money can be spent that otherwise needs approval from the board. To my knowledge, we didn't have anything like that before. That the manager – any conflict of interest from staff would need to go to the board. That any – yeah, like, a whole lot more needed to go to the board than what actually did.

And finally, in hindsight, what do you think could have increased the transparency with respect to expenditure at a charity or a not-for-profit organisation such as the Immigrant Women's Health Service?---Well, I think they needed to have more than one person who authorised and approved the payments. And I think that things needed to go through the board. So it's a very small organisation, like, with only – I believe that Eman was the only full-time worker. But the board could have approved the payments and we should have also been able to have access to, like, the
10 ledgers, like, monthly ledgers, which we didn't see. But then perhaps the capacity of the bookkeeper needed to be – have more experience in those sort of matters so that they could be able to provide that to the committee each meeting. More formalised approach of meetings. Agendas sent out well in advance with all the supporting evidence.

That's the evidence.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you. Cross-examination. Mr Chhabra.

20 MR CHHABRA: Commissioner, yes, I'd seek leave to cross-examine this witness very briefly.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you.

MR CHHABRA: Could the witness be shown documents volume 19, page 232. Ma'am, are you able to see that document in front of you?---Ah hmm.

You appreciate that's a document you were taken to earlier from 12 December, 2014 concerning the board minutes of a NESH meeting?---Ah
30 hmm.

Could you please take a moment to read item 9? 232, I thank my friend. Volume 19. That's the one. Just take a moment to read item 9, please. ---Yes.

Do you agree at least as of that date Ms Sharobeem had made you and others aware that certain NESH expenses were being covered either by her personal card, bankcard, or an IWHS card?---Yes.

40 Do you agree as at that time there was no prohibition against her conducting such expenses and then being reimbursed?---I'm not sure.

To the best of your knowledge, was there any such prohibition?---I recall that it had been said in the past that Eman shouldn't use her own private credit card and that they needed to increase the limit on the IWHS, and the same like that she, the NESH shouldn't be using the IWHS card, but as to when or where, I'm not sure.

But certainly you, Ms Sharobeem had made people aware at the organisation that she was resorting to covering expenses personally?
---Yes.

And then seeing reimbursements?---Well, I don't know whether she used the word seeking reimbursements, but yes, we knew that she had used her credit card in the past and we had also said that we should, that shouldn't be done.

10 In addition to that you mentioned a moment ago increasing the limit - - -?
---Ah hmm.

- - - of the IWHS credit card?---Ah hmm.

If you can recall, what was the limit?---I think it was only a small limit.

And is it the case that Ms Sharobeem had previously identified to you and others that that limit was small to an extent that it required her, for bigger purchases, to use her personal card?---She may of, but I think we would also
20 have said that, that you still aren't allowed to use your own credit card.

To the best of your knowledge - - -?---Ah hmm.

- - - was there any formal direction prohibiting her from doing just that?
---Well, like if we had said that you're not to use your credit card, that is like a formal directive.

You would appreciate that looking at the document in front of you - - -?
---Ah hmm.

30 - - - she volunteered - - -?---Yes.

- - - to the board - - -?---Yes.

- - - and to yourself - - -?---Ah hmm.

- - - the situation regarding - - -?---Yes.

- - - that system of payments?---Yes.
40

No further questions on that document. Ma'am, did Ms Nevine Ghaly have any – I withdraw that. Do you know who Ms Nevine Ghaly is?---I do.

And who is she?---Well, she was the team leader in NESH, I'm not sure whether NESH is still, whether she's still there, whether NESH has still continued on, that I'm not sure of.

To the best of your knowledge, did she play any role in recruiting people?

---I imagine she would of.

Are you aware by a person by the name of Amy Saffron?---I know the name and I recall of seeing an email of when she resigned and I had met Amy.

Who is Amy Saffron?---I believe she's a daughter of one of another woman that works within the community and is, used to be a member of our IRWN Network.

10 Did she have a role at NESH?---She did.

And are you aware how she came to obtain her employment at NESH?
---No, I'm not. We weren't advised about that either.

Are you aware – I withdraw that. You were asked questions earlier regarding a NESH vehicle?---Ah hmm.

A Honda City. Do you recall that?---Yes.

20 Are you aware whether Ms Saffron had use of that car?---Not really.

Not really meaning you're just not aware?---Not really, I don't know anything about, like, who used the cars or how often or anything like that.

Earlier when Counsel Assisting asked you questions regarding jewellery and jewellery classes - - -?---Ah hmm.

- - - you gave some evidence that you had seen jewellery presented at certain public events?---Ah hmm.

30

Jewellery that had been made by attendees at IWHS. After some number of questions you gave an estimate maybe the jewellery was worth between five and \$20. Do you recall that?---Yes.

Is it safe to say you were just making a guess?---I was making a guess.

40 Is it safe to say you made that guess absent knowing what the jewellery was made of?---Yes, because I didn't really look at it or the price of it but I just knew that the jewellery was there and I knew that some people that were attending were purchasing it and I couldn't imagine that they would have been purchasing it if it was very, very expensive but once again, I am - - -

Just a guess?---I'm not really – yeah, it was a, it was a guess. I don't know.

Earlier you were asked some questions regarding facilitators.---Ah hmm.

You were also asked – you also made – gave some evidence rather regarding volunteers - - -.---Ah hmm.

- - - at IWHS. Visually was there any way of being able to distinguish between a facilitator and a volunteer?---Well, I only ever went there really once a month so I wouldn't really know who were the volunteers and who were the facilitators.

And when you attended the premises of IWHS - - -?---Ah hmm.

10 - - - you did have occasion to see some programs - - -?---Yes.

- - - being performed?---Ah hmm.

Classes and activities and the rest. During those times were you able to distinguish between who was a volunteer and who was a facilitator?---No.

No?---No.

Nothing further.

20

THE COMMISSIONER: Mr Eurell, do you want to ask any questions?

MR EURELL: Just very briefly, thank you, Commissioner. Ms Watton, what are your formal qualifications?---I have a Certificate 4 in Community Services.

From?---Well, it was actually like a trainee program that I did while doing on-the-job training and studying.

30 That's the extent of your training?---That's it, yes.

No governance training other than - - -?---Oh, my governance training that I've done for – did for the two days.

Which you undertook after the problems that you've given evidence about came to light?---That's correct.

40 So at the time that you took up a position as a member of the executive committee or the board as it's been variously described, you're only qualifications were the aforementioned Certificate 4?---That's correct, yes.

Thank you.

THE COMMISSIONER: Did anyone else want to ask any questions of the witness? Anything arising?

MR RAJALINGAM: I don't have any further questions.

THE COMMISSIONER: Is there any reason that the witness can't be excused?

MR RAJALINGAM: No, Commissioner.

THE COMMISSIONER: Okay. Thank you. Well, thank you for coming. ---Thank you.

And you're excused.

10

THE WITNESS EXCUSED

[2.38pm]

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, Mr Rajalingam.

MR RAJALINGAM: I call Ms Svetlana Maric.

20 THE COMMISSIONER: Ms Maric, will you take an oath or an affirmation?

MS MARIC: Oath.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you. Just take a seat there. Yes, Mr Rajalingam.

MR RAJALINGAM: May you state your full name for the record.
---Svetlana Maric.

10 And is it – it’s pronounced Maric or Marich?---It’s Marich.

Marich.---Yeah.

Are you currently working?---No.

Do you know Ms Eman Sharobeem?---Yes.

20 How do you know her?---I used to work for the Serbian Orthodox Welfare Association since 2001 and we used to have a Serbian women – women’s group. Serbian women’s group used to meet at IWHS at Fairfield and I met Ms Eman Sharobeem over there.

THE COMMISSIONER: Just before you go any further. Mr Ekstein, do you want her protected from - - -

MR EKSTEIN: Yes. I apologise, Commissioner. If you could give her the section - - -

30 THE COMMISSIONER: So pursuant to section 38 of the Act, I declare that all answers given by this witness and all documents and things produced by this witness during the course of the witness’s evidence at this public inquiry are to be regarded as having been given or produced on objection and there is no need for the witness to make objection in respect of any particular answers given or document or thing produced.

40 **SO PURSUANT TO SECTION 38 OF THE ACT, I DECLARE THAT ALL ANSWERS GIVEN BY THIS WITNESS AND ALL DOCUMENTS AND THINGS PRODUCED BY THIS WITNESS DURING THE COURSE OF THE WITNESS’S EVIDENCE AT THIS PUBLIC INQUIRY ARE TO BE REGARDED AS HAVING BEEN GIVEN OR PRODUCED ON OBJECTION AND THERE IS NO NEED FOR THE WITNESS TO MAKE OBJECTION IN RESPECT OF ANY PARTICULAR ANSWERS GIVEN OR DOCUMENT OR THING PRODUCED**

THE COMMISSIONER: That gives you protection.---Thank you.

MR EKSTEIN: Thank you, Commissioner.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes.

MR RAJALINGAM: When did the Serbian Women's Group meet at IWHS? What day of the week?---Long time ago, while I was working in Serbian Orthodox Welfare Association, they used to meet every Thursday.

10 And at what time do you remember?---Used to be from 10.00 till 12.00.

10.00am till 12.00pm?---Yes.

Were you a member of the board of the Immigrant Women's Health Service from 2005?---Between 2005 and '06.

And how did you become a member of the board of IWHS?---Mrs Eman Sharobeem approached me and she asked me whether I would like to become a committee member. I did say that I didn't have any experience about that, to become a committee member. I didn't have any experience. But she did say that that was okay.

20

Did you tell her if you had any qualifications at that point in time?---I cannot remember right now. I might have told her.

And what qualifications did you have at around about that time when you became a board member of IWHS?---At that time I still haven't completed my bachelor degree of community services/welfare. I completed around 2008 or '09. So at that time I just had diploma in community services/welfare, family and community in general.

30

And where did you obtain that diploma from?---From Macarthur TAFE, yes.

And where were you completing the other bachelor degree? Was that a - - - ?---At University of Western Sydney, at Bankstown campus.

And what was that degree?---Bachelor degree of community services/welfare.

40

When you started on the board of IWHS, did you have a specific role?---No, I was just a committee member.

Were you the secretary of the board?---Not straightaway.

When did you become the secretary of the board?---I cannot remember exactly the year. I just remember that once I was appointed as a secretary, I

didn't have any roles or responsibilities. It was just for the committee meeting purposes.

And from 2005, 2006 onwards, when you were on the board, how often would you attend board meetings?---Maybe a few times a year.

I get the impression that you didn't attend all board meetings, is that right?
---No. That's right, yes.

10 Were board meetings notified to you some way?---Yes.

How would that be done?---Most of the time they would email.

And would the emails say where and when the meeting would take place?
---Exactly, the meeting would take place, exactly.

Why didn't you attend all the board meetings?---I was really busy with my other work and my family responsibilities.

20 Was an agenda set for each meeting?---I cannot remember if it was set for every meeting.

If an agenda was set - - -?---Ah hmm.

- - - who prepared the agendas?---I don't know.

Were they sent via email?---No. I would – I remember seeing it at the meeting.

30 Where would they be at the meeting?---Normally at IWHS.

Sorry, the agendas. Would they just simply be in the room where the meeting was taking place? Or would they be given to you by somebody?
---They would be given to us by somebody.

And who would give them to you?---It will depend. Always different person, yes.

40 I'm going to ask you about the board meetings that you did attend.---Ah
hmm.

I want you to think about your answers slowly and take your time. Roughly how many people do you think attended these board meetings, the ones that you went to?---Four to five people.

And can you list some names of the people that you recall attending these meetings?---Yes. Mrs Eman Sharobeem. Mrs Audrey Lai. Mrs Dalila

from time to time. Not all the time as well, because she was very busy. Myself. Yeah, it would be.

Who did – was there someone at the meetings that did most of the talking?
---Yes.

Who was that?---Mostly Eman Sharobeem would talk and sometimes a person that would be chairing our meeting would talk more than others.

10 What would – I withdraw that?---Ah hmm.

Do you remember the board voting on various things when you attended the meetings?---A little bit.

And what type of things did they vote on?---They would vote on, they would appoint a person to be as a secretary or treasurer or, yeah, or chair or, yeah.

20 Did you ever recall the board talking about expenses or spending money?
---I cannot remember exactly because it was long time ago.

Do you ever recall Ms Sharobeem asking permission to spend money?
---It is possible but I cannot remember exactly.

Do you ever recall the board authorising the reimbursement of expenses to staff members?---No.

30 Did you, when you were attending these meetings, have any idea as to what the finances of the organisation was?---We would have a few papers in front of us and we would go through the papers but it is very hard to tell because it was a long time ago.

Do you know what these papers looked like you were provided?---It would be just a normal agenda for that day.

Were you ever provided with receipts?---No.

Were you ever provided with transfer, bank transfer documents?---No.

40 Were you ever provided for quotes?---I cannot – maybe, I cannot exactly remember about the quotes, yeah. It's possible.

When you were attending these meetings did you have, did you know how much money the organisation had?---I don't think so.

Did you know what bank accounts the organisation held?---I think I knew about St George account because I was signatory for St George.

I think in 2009 you gave birth?---That's right, yes.

Your first child?---Exactly.

Did you keep working as a board member after that time?---Well, I thought that I stopped because I haven't been going to the meetings for three years after I gave birth to my son, yeah. I thought that my, I thought actually I wasn't committee member any longer.

- 10 Did you tell anyone that you didn't, or did you resign from being a board member?---I don't think so. I cannot remember whether I, whether I resign or I signed any paper, I really cannot remember.

Did you have any conversation with anyone about wanting, not wanting to be a board member?---I did mention of few occasions to Eman that I was really busy and maybe because I didn't have enough experience in, you know, doing that role as a committee member, maybe would be better to appoint somebody else to do something like that, but - - -

- 20 When did you have that conversation with Eman, relative to giving birth, was it before, after, around about that time or completely different?
---I cannot remember exactly, sir.

Could it have been after you gave birth that you had a conversation with Ms Sharobeem?---It is possible, it is possible.

- 30 After you gave birth, sometime later did you do work as a volunteer for the Immigrant Women's Health Service?---Yes. I was approached by Mrs Eman Sharobeem in 2012 and she asked me whether I could help volunteer and facilitate Serbian Woman's Group that was still meeting at that premises at IWHS. As I was really busy at that time as well, I did accept it and I said I will, I will volunteer and I will try to help as much as I could at the time.

Were you only volunteering for the Woman's Serbian Group?---Yes.

Anything else?---No.

- 40 And was that group still meeting on a Thursday morning?---No.

When was it meeting?---They were meeting on Mondays.

What time?---From 10.00am to 12.00am, yeah.

How often?---They were meeting on a weekly basis but I was able only to go to the group every two weeks, once every fortnight, yeah.

What happened at the groups, what took place?---The group was just socialising, sometimes we would organise guest speakers for them to talk on different health issues as most of them were elderly ladies and they wanted to know about let's say for example cholesterol, diabetes or something like that, so we would organise guest speakers who would come into the centre and talk to them about issues like that. Sometimes they would do craft work or light exercises and listen to the music, general just socialising, interacting with each other.

10 You talked about guest speakers.---Ah hmm.

Do you know if those guest speakers were ever paid for attending the Immigrant Women's Health Service to do talks?---Most of these guest speakers would do information sessions for free. However, I think there were a few occasions where, actually, they wanted to be paid for that day.

Okay.---Yeah.

20 And I think you referred to some craft exercises.---Ah hmm.

Arts and craft.---Yes.

Is that what you mean?---Ah hmm.

30 What did they involve?---Oh, that was a long time ago while I was still working with Serbian Orthodox Welfare Association. I remember they used to do a lot of painting on the materials or colouring and stuff like that, knitting and all these things, like cultural things. And then they would put it all around centre so that everybody can see it, yeah.

And where did the service obtain materials from in relation to these craft programs?---The material for the craftwork, you mean?

Yes.---Most of the material, I think, woman would bring on their own or the centre would supply them as well, I believe. I cannot remember exactly because it was long time ago, yeah.

40 In the Serbian group that you're talking about, were facilitators used?
---Sorry?

Do you know what facilitators are?---Yes.

Were they used at the Serbian group that you were involved in?---Which facilitators you're talking about, sorry?

Well, you've talked about a group.---Yes.

And you've talked about activities being conducted at the group.---Yes, yes.

Were there people referred to as facilitators, workers - - -?---Yeah.

- - - helping with that group?---No.

10 Apart from you, were there any other volunteers assisting with that program?---There was another lady from STARTTS, Borka. She was helping a lot with that group even before I came to volunteer. She was there occasionally as well. I cannot exactly remember how often she would go to the group, but she would help them a lot with outings, organising outings or excursions for the group. And most of the time she would go with them as well, when she could.

Would you go on these outings and excursions as well?---No. Most of the time I wasn't able to go to the outings.

And had you been on an excursion with them?---Long time ago, yes, when I was working for the Serbian Orthodox Welfare Association.

20 From time to time would the attendees of the program be transported in the bus?---Yes.

How would the bus be paid for, do you know?---Women would collect the money and we would ask how much would the bus cost through the council. So they used to use mostly council buses. And we would get a cost from the council and then woman, they would collect the money.

30 Who would collect the money?---Well, women would collect the money and then they would give it to the receptionist.

So are you suggesting that money would be collected from the people attending the program?---Sometimes, yes.

Okay. Did the Immigrant Women's Health Service ever pay for the bus itself?---I think they did.

And how much did the bus cost?---I cannot exactly remember now how much.

40 Approximately, do you know?---It will be maybe \$30 to \$40 petrol, but this is not exact amount because I'm really not sure.

So there was only a fee required for the petrol?---Exactly, for the petrol, yes.

Did you have to pay for the actual bus?---I don't think so.

This might be a very obvious answer to my question, but were you ever paid as a volunteer?---No. I just only – Mrs Eman told me that she needed to pay

me for petrol on monthly basis, and I think that was by law I needed to accept that. I was willing to just help the women without any, any payments whatsoever. But she said by law she needed to pay me for petrol for coming to the group and helping them, so that is the only - - -

And how much would she pay you?---I think it was around \$20 per month approximately.

10 After your time as a volunteer with Immigrant Women's Health Service did you have any further involvement with them?---After?

After volunteering?---No, because after that I actually got a position as a caseworker in NESH. It was a part-time position. I started working in January, I think it was on 9 January, 2013 and then I didn't do any committee member.

Right. Were you on the board of NESH as well?---No.

20 I see.---No.

Any involvement with the board at NESH?---No.

And your work at NESH was from 2013 onwards?---'13, yes, and until I think 7 February, 2014 when I had to leave due to pregnancy complications with my second son.

In that - - -?---And - - -

30 Sorry, continue.---Sorry. And then I left and I gave birth in March next – a month after that to my youngest, second son.

In that time at NESH between January, 2013 and - - -?---Ah hmm.

- - - February, 2014 where were you working?---I was just working in NESH as a caseworker from - - -

Which - - -?--- - - - from 9 January, 2013 until February, 2014.

40 Which office?---Fairfield office NESH. It was 1/1 The Crescent, yeah.

Who else did you work with at 1/1 - - -?---I worked with a team leader Liljana and another caseworker Rukia Toi.

How often would you work at NESH?---I was working only two days per week.

Can you just describe what you were doing there?---Yes. I was doing casework. I was seeing clients from different cultural backgrounds and

helping them with things like accommodation and utilities and filling out the forms for them and stuff like that.

But you were paid for that role weren't you?---Yes.

Okay. In about 2015 were you contacted by Ms Lai and Ms Damcevska?
---Yes.

And did they ask you to attend an urgent board meeting?---Yes.

10

How did you feel when you first received this call about attending a board meeting?---Well, I felt really confused because I didn't even know that I was still considered committee member so I asked them why you contacting me to attend a meeting, am I still a member, considered a member? Because I wasn't sure whether I was still considered a committee member. In my opinion I wasn't, and they said well, we think you are so it would be good to come to the meeting because it was an urgent meeting so - - -

20

Between 2009 and receiving this phone call from Ms – was it a phone call that you received from Ms Lai?---Yes, I think it was a phone call.

Between 2009 and receiving this phone call in I think 2015 had you received any emails from Immigrant Women's Health Service inviting you to a board meeting?---I probably did, yes.

Did you continue to receive them?---I was - - -

30

Over the years.---Probably I did. I didn't – haven't been checking a lot especially when I, when I gave birth to my son and I was away for three years I wasn't checking a lot these emails and I was thinking if, you know, I just couldn't commit to this much and I wasn't checking as much.

Are you aware if you were actually receiving these emails or are you simply assuming this?---I think I received some emails. I've seen them, yeah.

Do you – did Ms Lai and Ms Damcevska ask you to attend a meeting?
---Yes.

40

Did they describe it as an urgent meeting?---It was something like that, yes.

Did you ultimately meet with the other board members?---Well, they just told me to meet them and, yes, I met with, with Mrs Audrey and Nada and Julie that day, yeah.

And did you all meet at a restaurant in Fairfield Westfield?---Yes. No, it was a restaurant at Fairfield. I cannot remember the street name but it was not in Westfield.

So was it a Thai restaurant?---It was a Thai restaurant, yes.

And did that – do you think that meeting took place in about October or November, 2015?---Yes.

Do you know why it did not take place at the Immigrant Women’s Health Service?---They did tell me that it was supposed to take place at IWHS, IWHS but I cannot remember the reason.

10 When you say they, who?---Nada and Audrey, because I asked them why are we meeting here, so they said it was supposed to be at IWHS, but I really cannot remember the reason for not meeting there.

Was Ms – sorry. Was Ms Sharobeem at the meeting?---No.

Do you know where Ms Sharobeem was?---No, but she did send message to Nada to inform her that she will not be able to attend the meeting due to illness, being sick.

20 Do you know at the meeting what was discussed from your recollection?
---It is very hard to remember everything because I haven’t been attending the meetings for a long time and I was just shocked at the meeting, I just had all these pieces of papers in front of me.

And what were they about?---And I just remember a few things such as misuse of IWHS card, credit card and something about name I believe Emma Yu, who was a facilitator of the group and stuff like that, that I really didn’t know much of and I didn’t know actually what was happening, it was all new to me.

30 And do you recall the other members talking about allegations that the auditor had made?---I think they did mention something, yeah.

Did they mention something about Ms Sharobeem having repaid money for a car that she’d purchased?---Yes, I remember that they mentioned something like that, that she had to repay certain amount of money back for the car.

40 Do you know anything more about that conversation?---No.

Were you aware that at that time at the meeting the board were talking about potentially up to \$100,000 being misspent?---I’m not really sure, I cannot remember.

But do you remember that it was a large amount of money they were talking about?---I remember it was but I cannot remember exactly how much money, yeah.

Were you aware of any of these problems?---No.

Were you aware that the Immigrant Women's Health Service and NESH had come together in late 2013?---I think just somebody mentioned that to me I think at that meeting around in 2015 I think.

When did you first come to know that?---I think at that meeting in 2015.

10 You said that you worked at NESH between 2013 and 2015?---No, 2014.

'14. In that time when you were working at NESH did you have much involvement with Ms Sharobeem?---No.

Do you know what her position at NESH was in 2013/2014?---I really wasn't sure. I used to think she was, because she was managing the NESH as well so I used, I used to call her manager or manager of NESH as well, yeah.

20 Why did you think that she was the manager?---Well, she was, she accepted kindly to manage NESH as well as they didn't have a manager at that time.

But did someone tell you that she was the manager of NESH?---I think the ladies, caseworker and team leader, they told me that she was the manager of NESH, yes, and - - -

Who are they? Sorry?---Caseworker and the team leader that were working in NESH and I - - -

30 That's Liljana?---Yes, that's right.

And who was the other lady?---Liljana and Rukia, and I knew from Ms Sharobeem as well that she was managing NESH, but I didn't know what was exactly her position called.

I'm just going to – sorry, I'm going to take you back to that meeting at the Thai restaurant?---Yes.

Were you shown any documents at that meeting?---It was just an agenda.

40 An agenda. Were you shown a letter from the auditor?---I cannot remember, sir.

Do you ever recall Ms Sharobeem seeking the board's approval when you were a board member to have items reimbursed to her?---No.

Would you as a board member ever have authorised any staff member to purchase personal jewellery using IWHS funds?---No.

What about clothing or groceries?---No.

Were some food items purchased for programs?---Well, specifically group, Serbian Women's Group, they would bring their own food all the time, but they were able to make a cup of coffee, a cup of tea, or have biscuits from the kitchen at IWHS as well.

10 Were you, in your capacity as a volunteer, ever given any petty cash to help with purchasing food for the Serbian group that you were helping with?---I don't think so, no.

Do you ever recall Ms Sharobeem seeking the board's approval when you were a board member - - -?---Ah hmm.

- - - to purchase 12 leather chairs?---No. I - - -

Would you as a board member ever have approved spending that amount of money on 12 leather chairs for the service?---No.

20 Why not?---Because why they have to be leather chairs?

Do you recall Ms Sharobeem ever seeking the board's approval to work as a facilitator?---No.

Did you ever hear Ms Sharobeem talk about the IWHS centre as her own property?---No.

Who did you think - - -?---I just think - - -

30 Sorry?---Sorry. I never heard her talking about it as being her property, but I think something was mentioned on that meeting in 2015 about it.

This is the restaurant meeting?---Exactly, yeah.

You started in 2005 with NESH.---Or 2006. Between 2005 and '06, yeah. Not really sure, yeah.

40 When do you think you thought – withdraw that. When did you come to know that Ms Sharobeem was referring to herself as Dr Sharobeem?---I really don't know.

What did you – did you think she was a psychologist?---She told me she was a psychologist.

When did she tell you that she was a psychologist?---I cannot exactly remember when but I believe would be somewhere around the time when I started with – when I became committee member or maybe even before that.

Do you know if she said anything else about her being a psychologist?---No.
To me, no.

Did the Immigrant Women's Health Service provide psychological counselling to people?---I think they did, yeah.

10 Do you know any other psychologist, do you actually know any other psychologist employed by the IWHS when you were there?---No.

So who was the psychologist at IWHS so far as you were aware?---Eman Sharobeem, yeah.

During your time at NESH, that's 2013 to 2014 - - -?---Yes, yes.

- - - were clients ever referred to IWHS for psychological counselling?
---Sometimes, yes.

20 How many people do you think were referred from NESH to IWHS?---I don't think too many of them would be referred to IWHS, because majority of those clients were actually people from the war-torn countries and most of them would be referred to STARTTS.

Do you recall other people at NESH making referrals to Ms Sharobeem as a psychologist?---It is possible, yeah.

And who were they?---They're probably caseworker that worked in NESH.

30 And who was that? Liljana?---No, Liljana was team leader. (not transcribable) she was caseworker.

Those are the questions, Commissioner.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, thank you. Mr Chhabra, any questions?

MR CHHABRA: Yes, Commissioner. Ma'am, do you know somebody by the name of Mira Mitrovic?---I, yes, yes.

40 Who is she?---I think she used to be a manager of NESH.

Do you have any knowledge as to her performance whilst she was at NESH?---I just knew she was a manager. What she was doing exactly, I don't know.

Earlier you were asked the question by Counsel Assisting whether you would have approved the purchase of 12 leather chairs, and you said no. You recall that?---Yes.

You were then asked would you have approved that amount to have been spent on 12 chairs and you said no.---I didn't even know - - -

Do you recall that?---Yes.

You said no without even knowing the amount. Is that correct?---I was going to ask the question but I didn't. Yes.

Do you recall that?---Yes.

10

Nothing further.

THE COMMISSIONER: Mr Ekstein, anything?

MR EKSTEIN: No thank you, Commissioner.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you. Any reason that Ms Maric can't be excused?

20

MR RAJALINGAM: Commissioner, I'll just – if I could - - -

THE COMMISSIONER: Sorry.

MR RAJALINGAM: - - - ask some questions in clarification of that issue.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes.

30

MR RAJALINGAM: Ms Maric, I think when you were spoken to by the investigators, were you told how much 12 leather chairs had cost, and I think they were purchased from Bay Leather Republic for \$2,811?---I cannot remember exactly if I was told the amount.

But would you have spent that amount on 12 leather chairs for the Immigrant Women's Health Service?---No.

Thank you, Commissioner. There's no reason for this witness to remain.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you. Ms Chhabra, did you want to ask anything arising out of that?

40

MR CHHABRA: No. No, Commissioner. Thank you.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you. Well, thank you, Ms Maric. Thank you for coming. You're excused.---Thank you.

If you'd like to leave.---Thank you very much.

THE WITNESS EXCUSED

[3.11pm]

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you, Mr Ekstein. You can go too. Yes, Mr Rajalingam.

MR RAJALINGAM: Commissioner, I call Ms Sok Luong Chan.

THE COMMISSIONER: Ms Chan, will you take an oath or an affirmation?

MS CHAN: Yes, please.

10 THE COMMISSIONER: An oath?

MS CHAN: An oath.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you. Just take a seat there. You're not represented but I will make an order protecting you against any consequences of what you say today just to make – it's unlikely that you will cause yourself any problem.---Yes, please.

But just in case.---Yes, please.

10

So pursuant to section 38 of the Independent Commission Against Corruption Act, I declare that all answers given by this witness and all documents and things produced by this witness during the course of the witness's evidence at this public inquiry are to be regarded as having been given or produced on objection and there is no need for the witness to make objection in respect of any particular answer given or document or thing produced.

20

SO PURSUANT TO SECTION 38 OF THE INDEPENDENT COMMISSION AGAINST CORRUPTION ACT, I DECLARE THAT ALL ANSWERS GIVEN BY THIS WITNESS AND ALL DOCUMENTS AND THINGS PRODUCED BY THIS WITNESS DURING THE COURSE OF THE WITNESS'S EVIDENCE AT THIS PUBLIC INQUIRY ARE TO BE REGARDED AS HAVING BEEN GIVEN OR PRODUCED ON OBJECTION AND THERE IS NO NEED FOR THE WITNESS TO MAKE OBJECTION IN RESPECT OF ANY PARTICULAR ANSWER GIVEN OR DOCUMENT OR THING PRODUCED

30

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you. Yes, Mr Rajalingam.

MR RAJALINGAM: Thank you, Commissioner. May you state your full name for the record.---Sok Luong Chan.

And is Chan spelt C-h-a-n for Nelly?---Correct.

40

Are you currently employed?---Just got employed, yes.

And where do you work?---I work in a high school.

How long have you been working as a high – at a high school?---Just beginning of this year.

As a teacher?---As a student – school administrator's assistant, support staff.

Ms Chan, were you at one stage employed as a project co-ordinator for the Immigrant Women's Health Service at the Cabramatta centre?---Yes, I did.

Were you employed there between August, 2004 to June, 2016?---Yes, correct.

Did you work at the centre on a regular basis?---On a regular basis five days a week, Monday to Friday.

10 And what were your hours?---9 o'clock to 2.30.

9.00am to 2.30?---Yes.

Were you there until the service closed down?---Yes, correct.

When do you recall it closing down?---30 June, 2016.

When you commenced in 2004 who was the manager of IWHS?---Eman Sharobeem.

20

How did you – did you know her prior to working there?---I get to know her through a partnership meeting because I work for another organisation prior to these organisations and during the meeting because I tried to do the partnership with Immigrant Women's Health Service at the time and that's how I get to know her.

How long had you known her before you started work at the service?
---That's the only meeting we met.

30 When you started at the service did you refer to Ms Sharobeem as your manager?---Yes.

Did she become a CEO at some stage?---Yes, she did.

How – do you know how that happened?---I don't know.

Do you know when that happened?---I don't know.

In 2004, when you started at the Cabramatta centre - - -?---Yeah.

40

- - - who else was working in the office with you apart from the facilitators and volunteers?---There's another admin assistant. Her name Thi Le.

How do you spell her last name?---L-e.

First name?---Thi, T-h-i.

Okay. Who else was working there with you at the Cabramatta centre?

---And I have the facilitators.

How many facilitators were there in 2004?---In 2004 we have five, five facilitators.

Did Ms Sharobeem have much involvement at the Cabramatta centre?---Not much.

10 When you say “not much”, what do you mean?---On a daily day-to-day basis I run the centre and she will be based in Fairfield, so she only has to come when she need to come.

How often do you recall her coming? Would she come every week, every month or every day?---No, regular schedules. She'd come when it's necessary.

20 And would she organise or arrange to meet with you?---Yes, when she need to see me sometimes, she'd come to see me in Cabramatta or sometimes she'd call me over to Fairfield.

How often would you go to Fairfield to visit her?---Quite regularly because I had to bring in the timesheet for the staff and facilitator to get paid. So I would say twice a month I'd go to Fairfield on a regular basis.

And when you went twice a month on a regular basis, you said you took some timesheets and papers with you effectively.---Yeah.

30 Do you remember exactly what you took to the Fairfield centre?---I took the timesheet, invoice and if I need to bring any flyers along with me to get her feedback. You know, it's just like something that I needed to get my job done, I had to bring it with me.

Were the timesheets that you took to Ms Sharobeem relating to facilitators who had performed work?---Yes.

And also yourself?---Yes.

40 Between 2004 to 2016, was there much change to the actual office?---Not really.

Can you describe in – just go back to 2004.---Yeah.

Can you describe what the office looked like in 2004?---It would be very basic. We have two office room and one computer in each room with a printer, and a couple of foldable tables. About 40 old chairs which - - -

Four zero?---Four zero. Old chair which is for facilitators. That's about it, I think.

What kind of computers were they?---Normal computers at the desks. Pretty, pretty basic. And usually I don't remember – there's one look new but I don't know how new they are. The one look new particularly in my office when I come in to serve the role, it looks a bit new but I don't know how new they are.

10 Between 2004 and 2016, did those computers ever change? Were they replaced?---It was replaced bit by bit. Like, either they change the monitors or either they change the PC. So they never change the whole lot, as the whole set.

Did it ever appear to you at any stage between 2004 and 2016 that \$24,000 had been used, or thousands of dollars had been used to upgrade the computer system at the Cabramatta centre at least?---No, never.

Was there a reception room?---No reception room.

20 Was there a toilet?---There is a toilet.

Describe the toilet. Was it a big toilet or small cubicle.---One toilet that only fit one person but won't fit a disability, person with disabilities.

So essentially a toilet bowl and a basin?---Yes.

Was there anything else in the bathroom?---No.

Was there a kitchen?---There's a kitchen.

30 Were there kitchen facilities?---The kitchen facility, what do you mean?

What was there?---Just a cooktop, hot water, sink, oven which come with a cooktop, that's it.

Did you ever receive a leather cream lounge suite at the Cabramatta centre? ---Leather cream? No, never.

40 Were any renovations done to the Cabramatta centre while you were there, any - - -?---Any renovation? No.

What about repairs, simple repairs to the office, were they conducted at the Cabramatta centre?---No.

Was an electric security gate ever installed?---We never have electric security gate at all.

Was there a gate?---No, no gate. Oh, you mean gate for the entrance?

For the entrance?---Yes, we do have one.

But it certainly wasn't electric?---It wasn't.

Do you know between those years you worked at IWHS, what programs took place at the Cabramatta centre?---We run quite a number of programs. Um, Monday to Friday, different day, different programs.

10 I'll just stop - - -?---You want me to name all them?

Yeah, I'll just stop you there. Between those years was it the case that a program would be conducted on the same day generally speaking?---Yes.

All right. So can you describe through the week what programs would be conducted at the Cabramatta centre?---Let's start with Monday.

20 Yeah?---Monday we will have a Cambodian middle-age women groups which start from 9.30 to 12.30 they went into two sessions and sometimes in the afternoon on a Monday we have a program that join partnership with other organisations which is a one-off program. This afternoon on Monday programs is Care Assist program which is from the partnership of Multicultural Health and it's on and off, it's not a regular one. On Tuesday in the morning we have the Cambodian Parenting Support Group. This group run in partnership with the Cambodian/Australian Welfare Councils.

30 Sorry, who would it run in association with?---Australian, Cambodian/Australian Welfare Councils, and the facilitator paid by them. On Wednesday we have the English class which taught by volunteers, in the second half of the Wednesday we have Spanish Women's Speaking Group run by the team leader in the group, because they're quite established group, they don't need a lot of help, which is team leader become volunteer as well.

40 That's a Spanish group?---Spanish group. And on Thursday we have Chinese older women group, we have paid facilitator here. Group start at 9.30 finish at 12.30, and on Friday we have Vietnamese women's health group, again a paid facilitator from 9.30 to 12.30, and on other afternoon, like Wednesday afternoon, Thursday afternoon or Friday afternoon, sometime we have program but one-off program and it's usually run in partnership with other organisations and usually a one-off. Let's say it's a big session to run, a healthy women, a health women program and when it's finished, so only the morning session is the regular one and the afternoon session was a one-off sessions.

All right. You've referred to facilitators being used throughout the week and on the weekend?---No weekend.

Not on the weekend?---No weekend at all.

Facilitators were used on a Thursday and a Friday?---Paid facilitator on Thursday and Friday.

10 And what about the other days, were they paid facilitators?---On Wednesday my program, our program run by volunteer for the English class and with the Spanish leader as a volunteer as well, on Tuesday paid by the partnership organisations, they bring their worker, on Monday facilitator's myself because I speak the language my role is one to assist the group as well.

So when you say there were paid facilitators on Thursday and Friday - - - Yeah.

- - - who are they paid by?---Immigrant Women Health Service.

How many facilitators were there over Thursday and Friday?---One for each day.

20 So two facilitators?---Correct, that get paid.

And roughly speaking how long would they work on Thursday and Friday? ---Three hours.

So three hours for one facilitator on Thursday?---Yeah.

And three hours for another facilitator on Friday?---On Friday.

30 Were there any other facilitators used at the Cabramatta centre in 2004? ---Sorry, I couldn't get the last question.

Were there any other facilitators used in Cabramatta throughout the week in 2004 for any other purpose?---I think that's – used to be paid – I think that's all I remember. The only change is the facilitator change. Sometimes the Chinese group facilitators resigned and they find a new one. That's about it.

You've talked – you've given evidence about a schedule through the week and on the weekends - - -?---Yeah.

40 - - - about programs and facilitators.---Yeah.

Was that what was going on in 2004?---So, 2004, I think 2004 to 2016.

So did it change much over the years?---The program change. The nature of the group doesn't change that much. They have a client, new client change, the program change. But the (not transcribable) and the purpose is there, the same purpose.

So the programs you've referred to kept taking place on those days and at those times?---Yes.

From 2004 to 2016?---Yeah, there's a slight change in the partnership program that we run with other organisation. There's, like, a change in them. Other than that, the main, regular program very much the same.

10 Can I show you a newsletter? And it will be, pardon me, Commissioner, at volume 11, page 91. And this is an Immigrant Women's Health Service newsletter.---Yeah.

Tell me if you recognise that as the newsletter for term 3 of 2012.---I do.

Is the schedule for the Cabramatta centre on the right-hand side of the page?---Yeah.

You referred to – well, it refers to, on Monday morning, a Cambodian women's support group.---Yeah.

20 Then on Tuesday morning a Cambodian parents' support group.---Yeah. (not transcribable)

And then Wednesday, as you've referred to in your evidence, an English class.---Yeah.

Is that right? English For All?---Yeah.

Cabramatta on Thursday, a Chinese older women's group.---Ah hmm.

30 There was also a Laos women's support group later that afternoon.---Yeah. I supplied this information to Fairfield, person who look after the newsletter. I supplied this information.

Did you always supply the information in relation to Cabramatta for the newsletter?---Yes.

Does that – and if you go to Friday and Cabramatta on the second page, it refers to a Vietnamese women's health group in the morning.---Yeah.

40 Is that accurate so far as you're aware, the newsletter for 2012?---Yes. The clash in the time, 12.30 to 2.00, the gentle exercise tai chi group was a little bit smaller one and sometimes they only take place once a month. So the Cabramatta centre a little bit small. There's only one room for the meeting and for the sessions. So the gentle exercise usually take that walk or take a bit extra space outside, where the meeting room is. That's why there's a clash there.

For these programs running from Monday to Friday - - ?---Yeah.

Can you, with respect to each program, how much money, funds did you need to conduct the programs? And if you can refer to each program individually. So starting with Monday, the Cambodian parents' support – sorry, Cambodian women's support group.---The - - -

10 How much funds did you need to run that group?---Look, the program itself, because I think all the program run in Cabramatta, the major cost is the worker cost. And the material or other relevant material that needed to conduct the program usually, what, doesn't come in a big amount. It's only, like, let me explain. It's very hard to say in terms of the cost for each program because I didn't really get any costing for each program. It's just, like, the worker come to do the program and they get paid. And what happened, what you need in the program, you can – whether it's stationery or whether it's food or whether it's fresh food or whatever, you can get it from the petty cash, but I handle it. So what happened is – it's hard to put a cost into it. I don't know how to put a cost into it, only the cost of worker.

20 How much, how much funds would be needed per week to run all of these programs roughly speaking?---The whole week, the whole week, you mean Monday to Friday? I never put a cost to it. Just there's a worker, all you need is a worker and then some tea/coffee money.

30 Can you describe the number of attendees, the people attending these programs, how many people came along?---In Cambodian Group we are having around 25 people coming on Monday. On Tuesday the parent is about 15/17 families which I call family which mean the 15 mother and 15 or 20 kids because some mother come with one kid, some mother come with two kids. On Wednesday the English class has about 25 attendee, Spanish about 10 or 15. Sometime you go – it depends on the weather. You might have eight but on a regulars enrolment form would be around 10 or 15 for the Spanish. On Thursday we have about 45 to 50 attendee and on Fridays we have about 35 or 40 Vietnamese attendee.

What – can you describe what took place at the parenting support group? ---For the Tuesday?

40 Tuesday. Yeah, the Cambodians' parenting support group.---What took place, what took place is early in the morning the worker arrive at 9.00 – I arrive at 9.00 and the other partnership worker arrive just before 9.30 and then we set up the group. That mean we fold away the table, big table and chairs and we set the group with all the children activity with the little table, little chairs and bring all the children activities, all the craftwork, toys, yeah, ready for them to come at around 10 o'clock and when the – when they start to arrive there's a program for them. We say was 10 o'clock we start with free plays and then after free play happen, hour later they will then do the craftwork and after the craftwork they have the morning tea and then they

have story time and after story time they – we sing a song and then go home.

You refer to craftwork.---Yeah.

10 Who supplied the material for the craftwork?---It's a joint partnership. This group is a joint partnership with Immigrant Women's Health Service and another organisation, in this case Cambodian Australian Welfare Council so sometime we pay for the craftwork, sometime they pay for the craftwork, that including play dough, a, a, crayons, colours, Textas and papers, little books for the, for the kids.

Was the Cambodian support, parenting support group linked in any way to the Smith Family Multicultural Parenting Program?---No.

20 How do you know that?---Is two different organisations. The parenting support group was totally working for – they under supervision of Cambodian Australian Welfare Council and their staff paid by Australian Welfare Council.

Are you aware of the – what was referred to as the STEPS to Employment program?---I heard about that.

Do you know if any programs were being conducted at Cabramatta under the STEPS to Employment program?---There might be one go under that category. It called Certificate 2 in Retails which we run with Barrington College.

30 Do you know who funded that program?---I don't know. Just that – I don't know who fund the program. Sorry.

Was there a jewellery-making program at Cabramatta?---No.

Were there any other employment-related programs at Cabramatta apart from the Barringtons College?---Not that I know.

40 All right. And in relation to these programs, was a record kept of the number of people attending the program?---Usually the teacher who came, come tick their own participant whoever come. And they collect, they attending with them all the time.

Was a record kept somewhere in the office?---You mean talking about the Barrington College or all the programs?

No, all programs generally speaking were - - -?---Oh, the, yeah, it's manually kept.

How was it manually kept?---In Cabramatta I have – each group has a list of the attendee, including their name and addresses. So it's like a school class, like a school classroom setting. The facilitator start ticking their name off every day. So we'll divide by 10 column. Each week one column over the period of 10 week for term 1, because we follow the school term, term 1. Week 1 to week 10, and you just tick their name like that, and have manually kept all document in Cabramatta centre.

10 And where in the centre was the records kept? Was it in a folder?---In folders.

Whereabouts in the centre?---In Cabramatta, in my office, in my room.

20 What happened to those records? Were they sent to anyone?---Not until quite recently that I'm asked to provide a weekly, a weekly number to Fairfield for data entry. But they – it doesn't (not transcribable) ticking box of the attendee still continue. But I will sum up, let's say, week 1 and week 2 how many people, and I come up with my spreadsheet with the group's name and how many people, and I send to Fairfield.

Commissioner, pardon my back. I just need to obtain some documents. Ms Chan, I'm going to show you an IWHS annual report.---Yeah.

For 2004 to 2005. Withdraw that. I'll show you an annual report for 2005 to 2006.---Thank you.

So the first page, can you – are you in that picture?---I am. One, two, I'm third from the left.

30 Third from the left. And is Ms Sharobeem in that picture?---Yeah, she's the first on the right.

I'd like you to turn to page 6, and it lists the names of staff members involved with the service.---Yeah.

Is your name the fourth one down?---Yes, that's correct. That's (not transcribable).

40 I want you to go to page 20. Sorry, firstly go to page 12.---Yeah.

Do you see that that's a table - - -?---Yeah.

- - - in relation to the Fairfield centre?---Yeah.

Do you have any knowledge of the number of people attending the programs at the Fairfield centre?---No.

Okay. If you turn to page 20. At section 2, do you see that project activities?---Yeah.

There's a list of programs or groups on that page at page 20. Do you see that?---Yeah.

Do you confirm or do you know if all of those groups were being conducted at the Cabramatta centre in 2005 to 2006?---I confirm. I know, familiar with all this.

10

What about the Multicultural Parenting Support Group?---In 2006, Multicultural Parent Supporting Group was at the time we run with, if I remember well, with (not transcribable), conduct this in partnership with us. And it didn't last long.

How long did it last for?---I think it was about a year and a half later when they find a better venue they move.

Can you go to the second page – sorry, page 21.---Page 21, yeah.

20

There's a description for the Multicultural Parenting Support Group. ---Yeah.

Do you agree with that description of the group?---I think it's – yeah, I agree. I think written by me.

Can I ask you to turn to page 26.---Yeah.

30

Do you see that it records there the number of people enrolled in the group? ---Ah hmm.

So for term 3 which is at the beginning of the financial year - - -.---Yeah.

- - - 2005, 31 people for the Khmer Women's Support Group.---Yeah.

27 for the next term, 37 for the next term, 36 for the last term.---Ah hmm.

And there's a total at the end.---Yeah.

40

You started work in I think you said 2000 and - - -?---4.

4. Do you think that these figures for 2005 are fairly accurate?---Are fairly accurate. I remember I prepare this report as well.

Did you prepare all of this part of the report or the whole report?---The Cabramatta part.

Does that start on page 20?---(No Audible Reply)

The Cabramatta part of the annual report - - -?---Yeah, under the – yeah, under the partnership, the partner for the Healthy Women Projects.

If you turn the page to page 27 it talks about women’s participation for groups. Do you agree with that?---Yeah.

On page 28 is the statistics for the women’s, Vietnamese Women’s Health Group.---Yeah.

10

And it refers to a total of 719 people attending.---You know, you see when I prepare this one I give you pictures of two parts, the first part enrolment, the actual number of attending on each, each day and then the second part was the participation, then I count the number of participation. So what happened is at the end of the term the enrolment number didn't change but the participation change over 10 weeks. Let’s say you have a group of 10 people. If all the 10 turn up, at the end of the term you have 100 attending. That’s how I calculate it.

20

Is that the number of people attending over the year?---Over the term. So I classify by term, three term, four term, one. So what I’m getting in this report is two pictures, one is the actual enrolment where you know how many people registered.

All right. Okay.---And then I said the number of participation mean I count how many time they participated over the term so you see it.

30

Commissioner, I’m happy to tender this report at this stage. There's a number of other additional reports that aren't contained in the brief of evidence that I will tender in due course.

THE COMMISSIONER: Exhibit 18.

#EXHIBIT 18 – IWHS ANNUAL REPORT 2005/2006

40

MR RAJALINGAM: A copy for the Commission. Ms Chan, I’m going to show you another annual report for 2012/2013 at page 93 of volume 12. Firstly, that's – do you agree that’s the annual report for 2012/2013, the first page of it?---It looks like it.

I’ll just ask the next page, if you turn to the next page or page 95 of the brief. Ms Chan, can you have a look at those figures and you appreciate that these figures relate to the entire service.---Yeah.

Do you have anything to say about – did you have anything to do with the preparation of this report?---No.

Why do you say that?---My, my job, you see the report 2002/3, sorry, 2004, 2005, 2006?

2005 to 2006, yes?---My complete report come in as separate sections. At some point when I submit the report it become one format and whatever change, I have no ideas and I don't know how the number comes up here, I don't, I'm not doing this.

10 Is there a Cabramatta section of this report, Ms Chan?---It's probably there but it's not in what I am preparing, it probably putting some there somehow which I can't recognise it.

Before I ask you to answer that question I might show you the entire report first?---Yeah.

20 What I'll do is ask the investigator to go through each page slowly, just one step at a time. That's the first page, second page, just next page, the next page, that's the fifth page, and do you see those figures there on the fifth page?---I see it.

Yeah. Did you have anything to do with including these figures in the annual report?---I have no ideas.

Do you see there that the Vietnamese Women's Health Group had 1,295 reported participants?---I don't know how it comes that big. It's never been, I never put, I never sent any report with this figure.

30 And if you keep turning the page, keep going?---These program, I prepare it.

Sorry, which program?---This one, on the computer now.

Physical Wellbeing?---That's part of my, I prepare this one.

So you prepared - - -?---I prepare my - - -

40 - - - the table?--- - - - my report as normal, at the end of the year, I send it to the manager.

Who's the manager?---Eman.

Yeah? And she will put it together, so she make a choice what to put in, what to not put in, I have no idea, but this is, this part is my work.

And how do you know, do you know if she reviewed the report or drafted the report?---I don't know. Look, I just submit my report to her and what

happened after my submission, who view it, who put it together, who make it become one report for all, I don't have any ideas.

If you just keep turning through that report, next page, next page, next page, to the end, and that's, that's the end of the report, Ms Chan?---Yeah.

You agree that it doesn't have a separate Cabramatta section like there was on the 2005/2006 section?---Yes.

10 But are you saying that you provided page 6 to 9, the table on pages 6 to 9?
---The one that is talking about the information session, that's the one I prepare it, I organise that one, this one.

The table?---The table.

The entire table or only that box?---The Health Information Service, yeah, the entire table.

20 So all of the Health Information Services section, you completed?---Not the first introduction, not the introduction, but what's in the table.

Okay. I'll ask you to now look at - - -?---But the number in the brackets has changed.

Ms Chan, I'll just get you to look at now the annual report for 2015?---Ah
hmm.

And that's page 168?---Can I – before you move?

30 Yes?---I think this page, the table I prepare it but the number of session in the bracket, maybe they add up Fairfield's, I think a number bigger than I would suggest from Cabramatta alone, maybe because we had to combine the session because Fairfield also run similar sessions in some cases, so that could be a combination, a combine of two centre together in the number of session we done for example on stress and anxiety, depression, something like that, that could be a combined session, I'm, I'm, I don't, I'm not sure.

40 Yes. Ms Chan, there's nothing to indicate the page before, that that related only to Cabramatta?---Yeah.

Yeah. All right. If you could be shown the annual report for 2015 at page 168, volume 12. That's the first page of what appears to be that report, isn't it, Ms Chan?---Yes, it looks like it.

Go to the second page, third page, rather.---Mmm.

Do you see there these figures that appear under the section "at a glance"?
---(not transcribable)

Did you have anything to do with including these figures in the annual report for 2015?---No, I have nothing to do with – I don't have nothing to do with this report at all. My job is to provide my report to the manager and then the manager put it all together. I have nothing to do with this.

Can I take you to page 5 of this report. And if you go to the group on Vietnamese Women's Health Group.---Vietnamese Women's Health Group, yeah.

10

1,295 is a figure next to that group. It would appear to be saying that there are 1,295 people attending that group. But was that the case? Were that many people attending the Vietnamese Women's Health Group?---What is your question?

Was 1,295 people attending the Vietnamese Women's Health Group?---For how long and - - -

20

Well, it would appear for that annual, that year.---I don't know how the number come up, that one. But you're looking at 35 Vietnamese women in each week over the period of 40 week. If you count the number of participation, it's possible. I don't know how this number come up, but if I have 35 women in each week and if I don't count, don't count their enrolment, right, you count the number that come. And if all of them come for 10 weeks, 35 times 10 will be 350, and you times four term in a week. It's reasonable. I don't know. How this number come up, I have no ideas, okay? But I can just – if you ask me, I told you. I want you to know – I want to know what number – what you want me to know about or to answer about the number.

30

Would 1,295 reflect the amount of people enrolled in that group?---Not enrol, of course not.

But would it reflect the occasions of service being delivered?---It could affect the occasions of not the service because – participation. If you looking at the service, we only run once a week. So over 40 week we only have 40 occasion.

40

Does the number appear to be a little bit high, Ms Chan. As I said, depends on – it's high but in what way, I don't know. I don't know how the number come up. It just has – what is the formula to come up with number? But if I have to say about this number, I don't know how it come up, how the people count the number. I don't know.

Pardon me, Commissioner. I'm nearly finished.

Do you know how facilitators were recruited?---In Cabramatta, yes, I got some ideas.

And how did you go about recruiting facilitators?---When I have facilitator resign, we don't normally advertise in paper or anything because it's just a one-day job and for three hours. So we tend to use word of mouth. We talk to community member. Example, I have a partnership worker or I have a partnership organisation. It's like if I need someone to facilitate Chinese group, I will looking for my network in the Chinese community, if anyone interested in doing work like this for three hours a week.

10 So it was an informal process, was it?---It's an informal process, yes.

What were they paid?---\$20 per hour for three hours a day.

Do you know how facilitators would use their own money to purchase things for groups?---No.

Did that ever happen at the Cabramatta Centre?---No.

20 Did you ever process - - -?---Using the own money, what you mean, the use your own money and reimburse later, is that what you mean?

Yes.---Oh well, under \$15 they can do that.

And how often did that happen at the Cabramatta Centre?---May be once or twice a term. The only group that use a lot of money is the Spanish Women Group because this group does not have a facilitator but they have their leader which, whom I always relies on to purchase the craft material for the group and then she would bring back the receipt for something under \$20 and she will spend the pocket money first and I pay her back.

30

Was there any written policy in relation to reimbursement at the Cabramatta Centre?---Not that I know.

How many volunteers did you have at the Cabramatta Centre?---How many volunteers I have? Two on Monday, one on Tuesday, two on Wednesday, so five. I have five volunteers.

And obviously they weren't paid anything?---They got paid like petrol money.

40

How much?---Oh to start with they were \$40 per term which is over ten weeks then it move up, not long ago, quite recent, as up to \$100 per term which is ten weeks term.

Did Miss Sharobeem have much to do with the programs conducted at Cabramatta?---Besides she oversee my report and my program that I submitted to her through a newsletter and anything like that, she wouldn't have to be in Cabramatta.

Had you ever seen her perform functions as a facilitators at Cabramatta?---
Facilitator in Cabramatta you mean, as a facilitator? I remember there is
once she came in place of one of the speaker who was absent she came and
talked to the groups.

And which speaker was absent?---Oh, I don't remember, it's very long time.

10 What sort of topic were - - -?---It's her related oh, I'm not quite sure. At
one point, I don't remember, I can't recall.

Would you in your role as project co-ordinator be able to do work as a
facilitator, could you have been able to do that?---Not in my job description
but I can.

What do you mean you can?---Because um, being a facilitator what you
need to do, I think I'm qualified to do that and - - -

20 Would you do that work as well and be paid for it?---Oh I have to - - -

Sorry, the question I'm asking is, would you in your role as a project co-
ordinator also do work as a facilitator and be paid for it?---I didn't get paid
as a facilitator.

So you would you never be paid as a facilitator in your job?---Never, I only
get one pay which is a co-ordinator. I perform more role, my job than just
co-ordinator, I doing facilitating as well but I get one pay.

30 Were you aware of facilitators by the names of Rachie Kakel?---No.

What about Rachel Kamol as a facilitator?---No.

Emma Adly as a facilitator?---No.

Emmy Adel as a facilitator?---No.

Charl Gamal?---No.

40 Did you ever seen Miss Sharobeem - - -?---Not in Cabramatta. All the name
listed I don't know them from Cabramatta Centre.

Did you ever see Miss Sharobeem purchase any gifts for staff members at
the Cabramatta Centre?---Gift? There are some gift giving at the AGM for
recognition of the volunteers sometime it come like a pots with a little plant
on it, that's all I remember.

How big were these gifts?---I guess, if you look at the gift, a little pot with a
little bit of a plants on it about this big I don't know but not - - -

Fifteen centimetres by fifteen centimetres?---Smaller, oh well fifteen centimetre, yeah about this much I'd say.

And was this gift given during the annual general meeting to volunteers, is that what you're saying?---Yes, to volunteer to recognise their time, their contribution.

10 Did you see her give gifts to staff members at the centre?---No.

Did you see her give gifts to attendees of programs?---No.

Did you see her bring anything of any value to the service, monetary value to the service as a gift?---No.

When you started at the Immigrant Women's Health Service, did you think Ms Sharobeem was a doctor?---No.

20 What did you think her qualifications were?---Well, I never asked a manager qualification and I never know what her qualification is.

And what did she go by, by name?---Just Eman, Ms Eman Sharobeem when I started.

And did that change?---It changed.

30 When did that change?---I don't remember the year but if I remember was around 2011, 2012, if I remember, around that time that I start to see in her sign-off email. There's a word like doctor or something like that. Not long.

Did you ask any questions about that title?---I don't ask but I did press her that "I saw you have a doctor title." Then she's, and then she said, yeah, she just got some degree and explained that she just been getting some of her qualification completed. And then she a doctor of philosophy. That's why she called her names like that.

Did she tell you what degree she'd completed? Did you say philosophy?
---She said, yeah, doctor of philosophy. And she said she a psychologist.

40 So, sorry, did you say that she said that she was a psychologist?---Yeah, she said she'd been doing psychologist. That – through verbal informal chat. I'm not asking this in a meeting or anything. It's just through verbal, informal chat.

Did you know anyone that had been referred to Ms Sharobeem for psychology services or counselling?---I receive phone call a couple of times in Cabramatta, asking to make appointment to see the psychologist or counsellor and I call to Fairfield office to see if they taking appointment,

and I ask who the psychology or counsellor. They told me they take appointment in Fairfield and Eman is the psychologist or the counsellors there.

Pardon me, Commissioner. Did the Cabramatta centre ever conduct any evaluation of how effective the programs were being conducted?---You mean - - -

10 Did they ever do a review of how well the programs were going?---By me?

By you first, yeah.---I evaluate my program at term by term and year by year. What we does is we have – at the end of the term, each facilitator will give out evaluation sheet, which then goes through what has been provided in the term, what is the level of satisfactions. We ask the client why you not happy with that, what you're happy, and then what you want for the next term. So that was the – a regular evaluation form we use to assess what coming next.

20 How often did that process take place?---In Cabramatta, every term at the end of each term.

Where were – were they evaluation forms that you received at the end of it?---Yeah, and I collect the evaluation form from each group and then I talk with facilitator to plan what is the next program for that particular group.

Did you give those forms, the evaluation forms to anyone else? Like the board or Ms Sharobeem?---No. I keep it in the folder in Cabramatta.

30 Okay. Thank you, Commissioner.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, Mr Chhabra.

MR CHHABRA: Very brief, Commissioner. Ms Chan, on any given week or in any given week, how many facilitators would work at the Cabramatta centre?---On any given week paid facilitator?

Yes.---Two.

40 How many in a year?---How many in a year?

How many different facilitators would work at the Cabramatta centre in any given year?---In Cabramatta, only two facilitator get pay, so you times 40 weeks in – well, only two throughout the whole year unless they resign. I don't understand your question, sorry.

Well, were there ever ad hoc programs?---Ad hoc programs. Usually with partnership that doesn't involve Immigrant Women Health money.

And how many different people between 2004 and 2016 did you encounter who were paid facilitators?---Only two facilitator get paid each time, just a different person depending on who they are working at the time.

Perhaps I'm being unclear. There'd be two facilitators a week. Correct?
---Yeah, to get pay.

10 Would they be the same two people every week of the year?---If they don't resign it going to be every week of the year.

And how about over the 12 years that you worked there, how many different people were facilitators?---For the Chinese group I encounter three changes to three facilitator (not transcribable) or four, the later one is four. So four changes in Chinese group. In Vietnamese group I encounter one, two, three.

And is it the case that at the Cabramatta centre there used to be a sofa bed?
---No.

20 Has there ever been a sofa bed at the Cabramatta centre?---There is a couch that can function as a sofa bed but we never use it as a sofa bed, just that it's given to us that use it as a couch.

Have you ever taken an item of furniture from the centre to your home?
---The thing is, the manager said that any items – because she keep giving new item – bringing the new items (not transcribable) old items and give it to anyone that they want it because – and then at one point that couch has a sofa and I said if you give it to anyone is it possible I need that couch for visitors for a week who coming to visit me and I get that couch but
30 otherwise we chuck it anyway. It's an old couch.

So to be clear, if furniture – I withdraw that. If new furniture was to be put in place the old furniture would be removed?---Yes.

And that old furniture would either be thrown away or could be taken home?---Usually you can't take it home as she prefer to throw away. Yeah, she prefer to throw away. I get the council to get – chuck it in front of me usually unless - - -

40 And it is the case that you did take some furniture home?---Yeah, because Eman say that you give – chuck it away. The choice is chuck it away. Yeah, chuck it away mean she says like rubbish now.

But you had the option of taking it home?---No, because I just try to be polite, they only chuck it away, I take it, you know, I got a visitor coming a week, I use it anyway, and at the end I chuck it away too because it's old furniture.

So is it fair to say, ma'am, that at least one time you did take furniture home?---Well, I take the rubbish home, put it this way.

Old furniture - - -?---I did not take anything that is consider furniture, it's thrown away stuff.

10 If you could listen to my question carefully. Furniture that was no longer required at the centre, you took home at least on one occasion?---I don't take home purposely. I have to throw it and I decide to throw it the way that a little bit useful, that's all. And I have stated earlier that I have three changes or four changes in the furniture. If I decide to take every home I have no place to put it and it's all. You know how many people sitting on a couch? Hundred each week. It's not enough to take home. It is not that benefit (not transcribable). I'm not going to take it, throw it away, the council truck come in and chuck it, it's better than take home. The cost of asking people to take that couch to my house is more, more than I pay (not transcribable) but because rubbish.

20 Nothing further.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you. Anything arising?

MR RAJALINGAM: Just very briefly, Commissioner. Ms Chan, what did you take home?---The blue couch that was sitting there for so long and then Eman's bring in a new couch and say that, oh, you throw it away, the new one coming in, and I said, oh, if you throw it away, I just try to be polite, that couch, can I borrow, I can use that for my visitors. In the end I throw it away anyway, it's not going to be useful, but because she decided to give me the throw away I call the council truck to usually, not just that one, a couple of thing will be chuck in front of me in the, in the council truck.

30 And what was that chair replaced with?---Replaced with a – I don't remember. Two or three time replacement, one replacement was a black ripped leather couch.

40 Did you say ripped?---Ripped. I see there is a rip on the arms, arm rest and the corner, it's just ripped, yeah, and another time was a cream colour fake brick dirty old look couch. And what is number one?

Any other occasions when you received a couch at the service?---And another one was the blue, the blue flowery very very old I think, very very old.

Thank you, Commissioner.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you. We'll adjourn till 10 o'clock. Ms Chan can be excused?

MR RAJALINGAM: Yes, she can.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes. You're excused. Thank you for coming in, Ms Chan.

THE WITNESS: Thank you.

THE COMMISSIONER: We'll adjourn.

10

THE WITNESS EXCUSED

[4.11pm]

AT 4.11PM THE MATTER WAS ADJOURNED ACCORDINGLY

[4.11pm]