

RICCOPUB00125  
01/03/2016

RICCO  
pp 00125-00193

PUBLIC  
HEARING

COPYRIGHT

INDEPENDENT COMMISSION AGAINST CORRUPTION

THE HONOURABLE MEGAN LATHAM

PUBLIC HEARING

OPERATION RICCO

Reference: Operation E14/2586

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

AT SYDNEY

ON TUESDAY 1 MARCH 2016

AT 10.05AM

Any person who publishes any part of this transcript in any way and to any person contrary to a Commission direction against publication commits an offence against section 112(2) of the Independent Commission Against Corruption Act 1988.

This transcript has been prepared in accordance with conventions used in the Supreme Court.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, Mr Overall.

MR OVERALL: Commissioner, my instructing solicitor has forwarded to the Commission a medical report by a Dr Mark Yang, a vascular registrar at Liverpool Hospital. Commissioner, the letter is not on a letterhead and it's not specifically dated and I'm instructed that that is being attended to and will be provided as soon as it does go on a letterhead. It would seem to me from this letter from Dr Yang that Mr Goodman will need to remain in hospital probably for the next 10 or 12 days, then there will be some time before he would be able to give evidence. I suspect that he would be on a – and although it doesn't mention it in, in the letter from Dr Yang, he would be on painkilling medication, probably Endone, which is a fairly serious painkilling drug.

THE COMMISSIONER: Well, let's just wait and see what medication he is on.

MR OVERALL: Yes.

20 THE COMMISSIONER: But at this stage what you're telling the Commission is that he's unavailable for at least 10 days.

MR OVERALL: That's my impression.

THE COMMISSIONER: From today's date or from last Friday?

MR OVERALL: From today's date, Your Honour.

30 THE COMMISSIONER: Well, he's just going to have to be called at the end of that process and if necessary we're just doing to have to adjourn to a further date when he is available.

MR OVERALL: Yes, Your Honour, Commissioner.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes. I take it, Mr Overall, that you have sufficient instructions to continue to appear and to cross-examine witnesses as they're called?

MR OVERALL: That's correct, Commissioner.

40

THE COMMISSIONER: Right.

MR OVERALL: Commissioner, do you want me to tender a copy of this letter?

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, you may as well, thank you. It can be supplemented or replaced with the letterhead copy when we receive it.

So that will be Exhibit R8.

**#EXHIBIT R8 - LETTER FROM GARY GOODMAN'S DOCTOR  
AND INSTRUCTING SOLICITOR**

10 MR OVERALL: And attached to Exhibit R8, Commissioner, is a letter  
from my instructing solicitor in relation to the letter.

THE COMMISSIONER: Right. Thank you.

Yes, thank you. Yes, Mr Thangaraj.

MR THANGARAJ: Keith Maton, Commissioner.

MR DUNNE: Commissioner - - -

20 MR THANGARAJ: Oh, sorry.

MR DUNNE: Excuse me, Commissioner.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes.

MR DUNNE: My name's Dunne.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, Mr Dunne.

30 MR DUNNE: I appear for Mr Goodman, Mark Goodman. I've obtained  
instructions and I - - -

THE COMMISSIONER: Oh, yes.

MR DUNNE: - - - don't require Mr Seng to be recalled.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you. Well, Mr Seng can be excused.  
Thank you, Mr Harris.

40 MR HARRIS: I'm indebted, thank you, Commissioner.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you.

Yes, can Mr Maton come forward, please. Just take a seat Mr Maton. Mr  
Stewart.

MR STEWART: Yes, good morning, your Honour. Yes. In relation to Mr  
Maton, I've explained the provisions of section 38 to him. He'll seek a  
declaration and is to be affirmed.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you. Mr Maton, can I just make sure that you appreciate that the order under section 38 protects you from the use of your answers against you in any future civil or criminal proceedings. But it doesn't protect you if it should find that you have given false or misleading evidence to the Commission. Do you understand that?

MR MATON: I understand.

10 THE COMMISSIONER: Yes. Pursuant to section 38 of the Independent Commission Against Corruption Act, I declare that all answers given by this witness and all documents and things produced by this witness during the course of the witness's evidence at this public inquiry are to be regarded as having been given or produced on objection and there is no need for the witness to make objection in respect of any particular answer given or document or thing produced.

20 **PURSUANT TO SECTION 38 OF THE INDEPENDENT COMMISSION AGAINST CORRUPTION ACT, I DECLARE THAT ALL ANSWERS GIVEN BY THIS WITNESS AND ALL DOCUMENTS AND THINGS PRODUCED BY THIS WITNESS DURING THE COURSE OF THE WITNESS'S EVIDENCE AT THIS PUBLIC INQUIRY ARE TO BE REGARDED AS HAVING BEEN GIVEN OR PRODUCED ON OBJECTION AND THERE IS NO NEED FOR THE WITNESS TO MAKE OBJECTION IN RESPECT OF ANY PARTICULAR ANSWER GIVEN OR DOCUMENT OR THING PRODUCED**

30 THE COMMISSIONER: Can we have the witness affirmed, please.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes.

MR THANGARAJ: Mr Maton, could you give the Commission your full name, please?---Kevin James Maton.

Maton, M-a-t-o-n?---That's it.

10

Right. Can you give us a brief work background, please?---Owned a business, director of a business from 1991 until 2007 called Emu Alarms. From there due to restraint of trade I couldn't be in the game for a while so I did a part time work for CND Computers and a hobby store. And after that worked for a company as a sales rep until June, 2014, I started my own business back up again.

20

All right. And what did Emu Alarms do specifically?---Sales service installation of anything along the electronic side of security, cameras, alarms, intercoms.

All right. Do you know Mr Gary Goodman?---I do.

And how did you know him?--- By doing work at Botany Council and Gas Motorsport.

30

Did you start doing work at Gas Motorsport first or the Council first?---I actually did a job at Gary's house first that's how I came to start doing the work at the Council chambers.

All right. So he asked you to come and do a job at his house?---Yes, his wife rang me one night, the alarm was playing up so I fixed it. And I went there the next morning and fixed it and then from there he contacted me after and said come in and do some work at – some quotes for Botany Council.

40

All right. And did you put in quotes to start work for Botany Council?---Yes.

All right. And was that per job or was it just as a starting - - -?---Per job.

All right. Did you then start doing work at Gas Motorsports or Botany Bay Council first?---Botany Council first.

Okay. And what sort of work did you end up doing for the Council?--- Anywhere from there admin office to maintenance depots, garbage depots, swimming pool, cameras or an alarm repairs, yeah.

And what about at Gas Motorsports?---Gas Motorsport, repair to alarm and camera system also.

Right. When were you doing this work for the Council?---I'm trying to think when I actually starting doing work for Gary, I can't remember. But it was - - -

Do you remember when you finished?---The last job was most probably 2006.

10

Okay. And what about the last job at Gas Motorsports?---Same time.

All right. Did you get paid for your Gas Motorsports work?---I did.

And how did you get paid?---It was normally direct deposit into bank account.

Okay. By who?---If it was Gas Motorsport it was by Gary or Gas Motorsport and Botany Council's from Council.

20

All right. Can I show you this document, volume 8, page 3?---Oh, okay.

The numbers are in the bottom right-hand corner?---Yeah.

All right. That's – you see the claimant says Emu Alarms?---Yeah.

That's your company name?---Yes, that was my company name.

And the PO Box was that your Post Office Box?---It was.

30

And do you see the date 30 April, 2009?---I do.

For work done in March of the same year?---Yes.

All right. And if you go to page 5?---Yeah.

Do you recognise this document?---I recognise the top part of it. Anything else underneath, any of the writing I don't recognise.

40

All right. Did you send your invoices through by – that were written or that were typed?---Typed. Computer generated.

Now you've told us that you stopped work in about 2006/2007 for Council. Did you do this work in 2009?---I didn't.

Did you send this invoice to Council?---No.

Did you know anything about the invoices – the invoice?---No.

Now I want you to assume that the – if you go back to page 3. I want you to assume that the account number details that are there belong to Mr Goodman. Did you have any arrangement with Mr Goodman whereby you did work for Council and the money went into his account?---No.

10 Did you ever have an arrangement with Mr Goodman where you put in an invoice where whether or not the work was done the money went into his account?---No.

Do you know anything – apart from when you were first shown these a couple of weeks ago had you seen these documents before?---No.

And do you know anything about them?---Not at all.

20 Now when you – when I first asked you a question you said that there was a restraint of trade, you had a – when you – you sold Emu Alarms did you? ---That's correct.

And part of the contract – I can show you the contract if you need to but part of the contract involved a restraint of trade clause?---That's correct.

Can you just explain how that worked?---The company that bought me I wasn't allowed to pretty much work in the industry or go and see any of my old existing customers for a period of three years.

Okay?---Yeah.

30 And the period of – the 2009 invoice that we talked about that I've just taken you through fell within that period?---That's correct.

All right. Nothing further.

THE COMMISSIONER: Sorry. Yes, Mr - - -

MR MOSES: Commissioner, if I may seek to ask the witness some questions.

40 THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, certainly.

MR MOSES: Yes, thank you. Mr Maton, I appear for the Council. I just want to ask you some questions. In relation to your relationship with Mr Goodman I think you have said that you came into contact with him first, is this right, but correct me if I'm wrong, because you undertook some work for him. Is that right?---Yeah, at his house.

At his home, yeah, and where was that, what suburb?---Hoxton Park way. I don't know the exact - - -

Hoxton Park?---Out, out, out that way.

Yeah, okay?---Yeah, sorry.

Out towards Liverpool somewhere?---Yeah, that's right, yeah.

10 Okay. And I think as you've confirm to Counsel Assisting the document that was shown to you at volume 8 of the ICAC Brief, page 5 is not a document that you created. Correct?---That's correct.

And the handwriting that appears on that document is not known to you in terms of anybody within your company. Correct?---That's correct.

And the way in which your company ordinarily issues invoices is typed up. Correct?---That's correct.

20 Okay. Now in relation to people that you had contact with at Botany Bay Council, was it just Mr Goodman?---Sometimes when I went too I also saw Lorraine.

That's the Deputy General Manager, Ms Cullinane?---2IC I think.

Yeah?---Yeah.

You would sometimes see her for what purpose?---If she wasn't there – sorry, if Gary wasn't there I'd see her and - - -

30 For what purpose?---If I was there to do some work- - -

Okay?--- - - - at one of the places.

Yes?---And I also did some work at her residence.

Okay, at her residence?---Yeah.

40 Okay. Thank you. Is that whilst you were doing work for the Council? ---That's correct.

Yeah. In relation to a Ms Mishra, are you familiar with that person? ---No.

So you've had no dealings with Suman Mishra at Botany Bay Council? ---No.

Okay. Thank you.

THE COMMISSIONER: Well, sorry, not that you know a person of that name?---Oh, that name.

All right?---Yeah, the name, yeah, I don't know that name so

MR MOSES: Thank you, Commissioner.

10 Now, I'm just going to ask you some questions and I'm not suggesting that this is the case but I just want to ask you these questions if I could. Did you ever give any payments of money to Mr Goodman as a kickback for undertaking work for Botany Council?---No.

Did you ever provide him with any gifts?---No.

In respect of any work that was performed for him, that is at his home or for his business by your company, did you charge them the commercial rate?  
---(No Audible Reply)

20 So if you undertook work for him did you charge him for the work you undertook?---Oh, yes.

Okay. You didn't do it for free?---No.

No. And in respect of the work that you undertook at the Deputy General Manager's home, did you charge her for that work?---Yes.

Thank you. And you charged her the commercial rate?---Yes.

30 Thank you.

I have no further questions of the witness. Thank you, Commissioner.

THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you, Mr Moses.

40 Just in relation to the work that you undertook at Mr Goodman's home and Ms Cullinane's home, were you paid by them directly as soon as the invoice was issued?---Okay. So originally when I first went to his house that may have been an invoice that I did in an invoice book 'cause it was there to go and change a backup battery that was faulty, so on that instance there it was most probably a handwritten one in one of my books, from there it was normally an invoice generated and then money was – it was either a cheque or money was deposited into the account.

Did that occur reasonably proximate to the completion of the work?  
---Oh, yeah, within, within 14 days normally.

And they would be able to deposit directly into your bank account?

---Yes.

Right. Thank you?---Yeah.

Any other questions of Mr Maton?

Yes, Mr Overall.

10 MR OVERALL: Mr Maton, I appear for Mr Goodman. I only have a couple of questions in relation to this matter. In relation to the work that you did at Mr Goodman's home for which you have just told the Commission that you charged commercial rate, how much did you charge?  
---For the change to the battery?

For the work, for all the work that you did in Mr Goodman's home?

THE COMMISSIONER: I don't know that he would be expected to remember the precise sum, but we're talking an estimate, are we?

20 MR OVERALL: Yes, Commissioner.

THE WITNESS: Yeah, so if it was to change the battery it was most probably around 140 and then the other work I did there, I think I did some work, repair work on his cameras that he already – so maybe 1200.

Did you install any camera at his home?---I, I put in, yeah, I put in some extra cameras and that for him.

30 And where did you purchase the cameras?---The supplier at the time might have been a company called Micro.

And how much did you pay for those cameras each approximately?  
---Back then, \$200 for a camera.

And how much did you sell them to Mr Goodman for?---Oh, back then my mark-up would have been, so it would have been most probably about 320 for a camera.

40 So you marked up approximately 50 per cent?---Yeah, roughly.

And when you installed some cameras at the Deputy General Manager's home, how much did you charge her approximately?---Around that time I'd have to say if it was a complete system, round the 2,000 mark.

And how much did it – so you provided the cameras, \$2,000?---Yes, yeah.

And how much did you purchase the cameras for?---Most probably around the thousand, 1,200 mark.

And you were supplying cameras to the Council generally, weren't you, for a large number of sites?---Oh, for the, the swimming pool - - -

Yes?--- - - - and the depot and the Council Chambers.

And how much did you charge the Council for the cameras approximately?  
---They were the IP cameras, so most probably around the 500 mark.

10 And how much did you buy them for?---Sorry?

How much did you buy them for?---Most probably around the 320 mark, 350 mark.

Okay. No further questions. Sorry. Did you ever work for any other officer of the Council on their own properties in their own home?---No.

You didn't work for Mr Fitzgerald?---Don't know that name.

20 And did you ever involve in installing cameras at the Central Coast Storage area?---No.

No further questions.

THE COMMISSIONER: Mr Maton, when you refer to IP cameras, they were a camera of a different quality were they?---Okay. Back then just it was a standard resolution camera and that's when IP cameras, which is what we use today, a very high resolution, IP is everywhere today. Back then it was just coming out so the cameras were more expensive and it was new to  
30 the market, so - - -

Any other questions of Mr Maton? No. Anything arising Mr Thangaraj, no. Mr Maton, thank you, you can step down. Thank you, Mr Stewart.

MR STEWART: Thank you, your Honour.

**THE WITNESS STOOD DOWN**

**[10.26am]**

40

MR THANGARAJ: Suman Mishra, Commissioner.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, Mr Velcic.

MR VINEY: Viney for (not transcribable) to give me leave yesterday.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, take a seat, please. Has the witness been explained the section 38 procedure, Mr Velcic?

MR VINEY: She has, Viney, your Honour.

THE COMMISSIONER: I'm sorry, Mr Viney, I'm sorry.

MR VINEY: She has and she seeks a declaration.

10 THE COMMISSIONER: Ms Mishra, can I explain something to you. The order protects you from the use of your answers against you in any future civil or criminal proceedings. It doesn't protect you however, if it should be found that you have given false or misleading evidence to the Commission. Do you understand that?

MS MISHRA: Yes.

THE COMMISSIONER: Because in that event your answers could nonetheless be used against you for prosecution under the ICAC Act. You understand that?

20 MS MISHRA: Yes.

THE COMMISSIONER: Pursuant to section 38 of the Independent Commission Against Corruption Act, I declare that all answers given by this witness and all documents and things produced by this witness during the course of the witness's evidence at this public inquiry are to be regarded as having been given or produced on objection and there is no need for the witness to make objection in respect of any particular answer given or document or thing produced.

30 **PURSUANT TO SECTION 38 OF THE INDEPENDENT COMMISSION AGAINST CORRUPTION ACT, I DECLARE THAT ALL ANSWERS GIVEN BY THIS WITNESS AND ALL DOCUMENTS AND THINGS PRODUCED BY THIS WITNESS DURING THE COURSE OF THE WITNESS'S EVIDENCE AT THIS PUBLIC INQUIRY ARE TO BE REGARDED AS HAVING BEEN GIVEN OR PRODUCED ON OBJECTION AND THERE IS NO NEED FOR THE WITNESS TO MAKE OBJECTION IN RESPECT OF ANY PARTICULAR ANSWER GIVEN OR DOCUMENT OR**  
40 **THING PRODUCED**

THE COMMISSIONER: Do you wish to be sworn or affirmed, Ms Mishra?

MS MISHRA: Affirmed.

THE COMMISSIONER: Could we have the witness affirmed, please.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, Mr Thangaraj.

MR THANGARAJ: Ms Mishra, how did you meet Mr Goodman?---I met him at work at Botany Council.

10 Can you just speak a bit closer to the microphone?---I met him at work at Botany Council.

Had you – so you had not worked for him before that?---No.

Did you do some work with him outside Council?---I did help him out, yes.

And was that through a particular business or was it - - -?---Yes.

All right. Were you ever romantically involved with Mr Goodman?---Yes.

20 And was that at a particular time or was it on and off?---On and off.

When did it start?---Around 2009.

Until when?---It went on for a while and then we became good friends but it was on a casual basis.

Yeah. All right. Did you have joint assets or joint interests in property or shares, et cetera?---I have joint shares and I had a bank account.

30 The bank account, was that the Westpac bank account?---Yes.

And did that close recently?---Yes.

And when was that?---Up to the first ICAC inquiry, my solicitor suggested that I close the account.

All right. And you had a small amount in a joint share portfolio?---Yes.

40 Is that still existing?---The amount of \$1,000.

But it's still a joint portfolio, is it?---Yes

Right. Did you have any cars that he had given you?---Yes.

When was the first time he gave you a car?---Around 2012.

And what car was that?---A Mercedes Benz.

And do you still have that car?---Yes.

And how was that bought or financed?---It was financed, Mr Goodman took care of the contract, I don't know, but he was making the repayments.

Right?---And now I have taken over the repayments.

So from when did you take over?---Since the ICAC inquiry.

10 So from 2012 when the car was bought to late last year, he was making the repayments alone, was he?---That's right.

All right. And now you're making them alone?---Yes.

All right. Did he ever buy you or provide you with another car, a BMW?  
---No, that's my car.

All right. So that, the BMW of yours is nothing to do with him?---Yes.

20 All right. And nothing to do with Council. Is that right?---No.

All right. Whose name is the Mercedes in?---My name.

Has it always been in your name?---No.

And when was it in his name?---When he bought it, it was in his name.

And then you took it over when?---I don't remember. It was probably early  
30 2013 maybe, I don't remember.

And why was it in his name and then later in your name?---He transferred it in my name as a gift.

Right. Right. And what about the insurances, did all that transfer at the same time?---Insurance, yes, I, I think so.

All right. Now, were the two of you proposing to buy an apartment together at Green Square?---Yes.

40 And what was the arrangement with respect to funding that, what was the plan?---He was, was going to ah, provide 10 per cent deposit and in later year if we decided to sell it, I was, we were, he was going to get his 10 per cent and the profit we were going to share it.

All right. And what was the, do you remember what the deposit was worth?  
---123,000, and I made, he made 123,000 and I put 10 per cent ah, \$10,000.

All right. And then were there any repayments that had to be made or did the purchase not go ahead?---It's off the plan.

So you bought the property?---Yes.

All right. And so did you take out a loan, did either of you take out a loan?  
---We don't need to take a loan yet because - - -

Only at settlement?---Yeah.

10

All right. And do you still own it, the two of you?---No, it's only in my name.

Okay.

THE COMMISSIONER: Meaning you still have ownership of the unit?  
---At Green Square, yes.

20

And has that been built, has it been completed yet?---No, it's just started.

All right. So you intend to sell it at some point, do you?---Yes.

MR THANGARAJ: Do you know where Mr Goodman raised the \$124,000?---Originally it was coming from his uncle's estate and that cheque got bounced because the funding that, cleared on time.

Right?---Then he gave me a cheque from his super account.

30

Okay?---That's what I believe.

All right. When did you start working at Council?---1994.

And around the time say when the Mercedes was bought, 2012, and going forward, did you have an understanding of Mr Goodman's financial situation?---No, not really.

Did you know whether he owed people money or had credit card debts?  
---No.

40

You don't know that?---He sometimes used to mention about credit card debts, that's all.

Right. Have you ever lent him money?---Yes.

How much have you lent him?---One time I lent him \$8,000 to buy some turbo or something for his racing, that's all.

And did he repay that?---No.

Has he, does he provide you with any or has he provided you with any form of financial support?---Yes.

Apart from the Mercedes, what else has he done?---He's, was giving me \$200 as a pocket money every week to help me out, he was paying my phone bills.

10 Right. And why was he doing this?---Because I was having a relationship with him and he wanted to look after me.

All right. Now, you had a home in Earlwood?---Yes.

And you're still there?---Yes.

All right. And were renovations done at Earlwood over the last few years? ---Yes.

20 When did they start?---Maybe last year or year before I think.

Are they finished?---Ah, one of the work is not finished.

All right. Who are the people that have worked on that property that were sourced by Gary Goodman?---Zoran.

Yeah, so Zoran Gajic did work on your house, did he?---Yeah.

30 And what did he do?---He did some tiling, was fixing the balcony, and some painting work.

All right. So there was a leak in the balcony?---Yes.

So he fixed that, did he?---It's semi-fixed, it's not completed.

All right. So he started doing work on that, did he?---Yeah.

All right. And when was that?---That was last year.

40 And do you know what the value of that work was?---No.

Did he ever send you a bill?---No.

Do you know whether he's been paid for that work?---No.

What was the arrangement with respect to paying for that work? ---Gary was going to pay for it.

All right. Have you ever seen any invoices in relation to that work?

---No.

And are you saying you don't know whether or not the work, any work has been paid for so far?---I don't know. I believe they are paid but I don't know.

And is it proposed that Mr Gajic is coming back to finish that job?  
---I'm not sure.

10 Have you – what happened the last time that he was at the house, was there some discussion about when he would come back and finish it?---Yes, he wanted to come and fix it in December but I said no because of this investigation happening, I didn't want to - - -

All right?--- - - - do any more work.

And did Mr Alex Subeski do any work at your house?---Yes, he did.

20 And what work has he done?---He did some electrical work, he came to check the air condition.

All right. Did he change any lights or do any other work?---Yeah, he changed the lights.

And did he pay for that work? Sorry, did he invoice you for that work?  
---No.

Do you know anything about that work being paid?---No.

30 Is Mr Goodman taking care of that bill or - - -?---Yes.

He is?---Yes.

All right. Was the relationship that you, that I've asked you about with Mr Goodman, has that ended or is that continuing?---I'm still friends with him, we still talk.

All right?---So - - -

40 Is it because the relationship is continuing that he's paying these bills for Mr Gajic or - - -?---Yes.

- - - at least you're not paying the bills for Mr Gajic and Mr Subeski?---Yes.

MR DHANJI: I object.

THE COMMISSIONER: Sorry, where did that come from?

MR DHANJI: I object ma'am, sorry. There's an assumption in that question which I don't think is borne out by the evidence. Her evidence was she didn't know whether, what was happening with the bills.

THE COMMISSIONER: Oh, well, I think we're talking about bills generically, are we, Mr Thangaraj?

MR THANGARAJ: I'll do it again.

10 THE COMMISSIONER: Or another way.

MR THANGARAJ: I thought I'd done it with Mr Gajic but Mr Subeski perhaps not.

Tell us again, how did you understand Mr Gajic was to be paid?---Gary Goodman was going to pay him.

And how did you understand that Mr Subeski would be paid?---Mr Goodman would pay it.

20

All right. Why was it that Mr Goodman had told you that he would take care of those bills as recently as late last year?---Last year when the job started, that's when he said he would pay for it. That was before the inquiry.

Right. And has he said that he won't pay it now?---I haven't spoken about those jobs.

30

All right. Now, the relationship that I asked you about with respect to him, a romantic relationship rather than a friendship relationship. Is the romantic relationship continuing between you as we speak or not?---Um, kind of.

All right. Now, you know someone by the name of Anmol, do you, or you might know him by Adam?---Oh, yeah, Anmol, Anmol?

Anmol, yeah?---Yeah.

You know him?---Yes.

40

Who is he?---He used to work at Gary's workshop as a cleaner or something.

All right. And have you ever asked – has he ever done work at your house? ---He may have cut the grass I think once.

Have you ever asked Mr Goodman for Anmol to do work for you at your house?---No, he didn't do any other work at my place.

I'm sorry, I said did you – have you ever asked him – have you ever asked Mr Goodman to arrange to have Anmol do work at your house?---No, I didn't, I didn't arrange.

I beg your pardon?---I didn't arrange with Gary.

No, no. Have you ever asked Mr Goodman if Anmol can come and do work - - -?---No.

10 - - - at your house?---No.

All right. Did you know how much Anmol charged?---No.

Did Anmol do any work for Mr Goodman?---I don't know. He was working at the workshop so I don't know.

THE COMMISSIONER: What workshop, you mean the workshop at Wetherill Park?---Wetherill Park, yeah.

20 MR THANGARAJ: Do you know whether or not Mr – whether Anmol was being paid by Mr Goodman?---No, I don't know.

Do you know whether or not Mr Goodman was using Council money to pay for Anmol to do private work for Mr Goodman?---No, I don't know.

All right. Now Mr Subeski's work, do you know what the value of that work roughly was?---No.

30 THE COMMISSIONER: Is this work that he carried out on your home?  
---Yeah, he did various jobs and I can't really remember what he does but I do remember he came to check the air-condition and he changed the lights. Maybe approximately – I'm just estimating maybe 10,000. I don't know.

MR THANGARAJ: All right?---I never saw the invoice.

All right. Do you know why, do you know why there is an invoice from one of Mr Subeski's companies addressed to Botany Bay Council with a note saying Earlwood on it?---No.

40 You haven't discussed with Mr Goodman that the work that Mr Subeski did at your place would be paid for by an invoice sent to Council?---No.

Was any other work done at your home apart from what we've discussed by people associated with Council or with Mr Goodman that is?---No.

All right. Would the work that Mr Gajic did for you at your house, do you know what the rough value of that was?---The tiling and the painting Gary was saying that he, he pays, he's going to pay him about 50,000.

How much?---50.

5-0?---Yes.

Right. And did Mr Goodman tell you how he would pay that?---Yes.

And how was that?---He was giving him his, one of his sports car.

10 All right. Did he tell you that Mr Gajic would be sending in invoices to be paid by Council?---No.

Do you know whether that happened?---I don't know.

Did you have any discussions, other discussions with Mr Goodman about transferring property into your name or buying other properties together?  
---He was wanting to add my name to a few properties.

20 A few of his properties?---Yeah.

And why was that?---To give me some kind of security and also if we had something together – we wanted to buy more properties, to borrow more money on it and buy more properties.

All right. All right. I want to ask you some questions about your role at Council. What is your or what was your role at Council?---Senior Accounting Officer.

30 And what qualifications did you have to do that besides what you learnt at work?---Bachelor – I have a Bachelor of Commerce in Accounting.

All right. When did you leave Council, when did you stop working there?  
---I got suspended I think 8 November or something, something around there.

So are you – what's your status now, are you still suspended are you?---No, I'm terminated. I'm not – I don't work there anymore.

40 All right. When did the termination happen?---15 November.

And did they tell you why?---Yes.

And what was that?---Because there was an investigation happening with the Council solicitors.

All right?---And I, I didn't attend it so I was required to attend the - - -

An interview?---Yes.

All right. So in the last say year of your time at Botany Bay Council what was your function?---I was dealing with assets like Council's whole assets, work orders, processing of work orders, working on assets depreciation, purchase orders, costings, creation of like new assets and putting their values and valuations.

All right. Did you have any role with Cabcharge cards or vouchers?---I was ordering the cards for the councillors and management.

10

All right. Can you tell us the difference between cards and vouchers under the Cabcharge system?---Card is like credit card like, and the vouchers are like in the books so, I didn't order the books.

All right. So did you keep a register of the people for whom you had ordered cards?---Yes.

And was that part of Council policy to do that?---Yes.

20

And what about monitoring the amount that was spent on the card?---I was – no one was really monitoring what was spent on it.

All right. And who authorised the payments to Cabcharge for the amounts that had been used on the card?---Gary Goodman.

All right. For all of them?---Yes.

Okay. What was your role with respect to fuel cards?---I just ordered them. If someone needed any card I got emails to order them.

30

And who give you – who would send you the emails to do that?---Gary or Lorraine.

And did you keep a register of the fuel cards?---Yes.

And did anyone monitor the use of those fuel cards?---I don't think so.

And did – who approved the payment of the fuel cards?---Gary Goodman.

40

What did the fuel cards entitle people to use them for?---Petrol and groceries. Like we have option, you can choose what you want to put on the card.

All right. So when you order a fuel card you can confine it to fuel or you can allow it to be used for whatever is available - - -?---Yes.

- - - at that service station or shop?---Yeah. I'll get instruction what they want.

Yeah?---What is required so that's how I order, order it.

And who would you get the instruction from?---Gary and Lorraine.

And did you ask them – or who authorised you – so the – I'll withdraw that. The fuel cards that you issued, did any of them stop people using them for groceries?---No.

10 So who authorised you to allow the fuel cards to physically pay for groceries?---Who will - - -

Who authorised - - -?--- I don't understand, sorry.

Who authorised you to tick the box that meant that the fuel cards could be used to pay for groceries?---Lorraine and Gary.

All right. And was that for each individual time you did it?---Yes.

20 Okay. So if someone asked you for a fuel card you would seek that authority from one or both of them would you?---Yes.

Okay. And who would you go to first for that authority?---Gary Goodman.

And if he was unavailable you would go to Lorraine Cullinane would you? ---I hardly went to her. It was always Gary.

All right?---Lorraine has issued emails – if she wants me to order something she will send, she sent emails.

30 O.K. So if she issued the fuel card she's the one that authorised it, if Mr Goodman asked for the fuel card he authorised it?---Yes.

All right. When Mr Goodman authorised something did you need to go above him to seek confirmation of that authority or not?---No.

Who gave you this authority with respect to Cabcharge cards and fuel cards?---Gary.

40 Was it a normal responsibility for someone – for an accountant or for the role you had at Council for you to have that within your areas of responsibility?---I don't know. I don't know.

All right. Did you think that other people at Council might have been better placed to deal with those responsibilities, such as the engineer?---I don't know.

Okay.

THE COMMISSIONER: Did you yourself ever use a fuel card - - -?---Yes.

- - - that was issued by Council?---Yes. I used it when Gary gave me, you know he authorised me to use it.

You didn't have a fuel card in your name?---No.

10 But you were using his card?---Whenever he gave me his card, yes.

And did that involve giving you some kind of PIN number or something?---Yes.

So that when - - -?---Some cards were with PIN numbers and some I think they were not with PIN number. I'm not a 100 per cent sure.

20 So how often would Mr Goodman give you his fuel card to use?---Not very often. Like last year only when he started using my car in lunchtimes and like maybe once in a while he let me fill the petrol because he used my car.

And when you did use his fuel card did you use it to purchase groceries as well?---I may have done a few times.

MR THANGARAJ: Why did you think it was appropriate to use Council money to buy personal groceries?---Because he gave me the authority to do it and I thought it was okay but now I understand it's not right.

30 Right. But just why at the time did you think that Mr Goodman giving you that authority was sufficient reason to spend the money that way?---Because he was the, he was the CFO and he had the authority, he had the power to give the authority.

Did you understand – did you know of anyone else using fuel cards to buy personal items?---No.

What about Mr Goodman himself?---Yeah. He did. I think he did.

40 You knew who was entitled to a fuel card, didn't you?---I knew who had them, yes. But sometimes it was issued to for example, business unit a lot of people use it so it's not allocated to one person, it's just everybody uses it.

That's for Council purposes?---Yes.

Right. So you knew who held a fuel card and you knew the business unit might've held one for Council work. If you were not on that list why then would you be allowed to use it yourself?---Because Gary Goodman used my car for his use and - - -

I'm talking about groceries, I'm not talking about fuel?---I don't know.

You weren't on the fuel card list, right?---No.

And neither – and you weren't – the groceries were not for Council use, so in those circumstances what right did you understand Mr Goodman had to simply say you could spend it as you wanted to?---I don't know.

10 Was the fact that you were in a relationship with him at that time, a romantic relationship, did you think that it might've meant something wrong or a conflict of interest?---No.

It didn't occur to you or you didn't think there was a conflict?---I didn't think.

THE COMMISSIONER: You didn't think, full stop?---Yes.

20 As I understood it you – when you began at Council in what was it - - -?---'94?

'94, you had no qualifications at that stage?---Yeah. I was still studying.

And then you acquired a Bachelor of Commerce in 2004, is that right?---Yes.

Well, as part of your Bachelor Commerce degree you would have no doubt looked at things like proper accounting methods, questions of governance and ethics, did you not?---Yes.

30 And you didn't think there was anything wrong with using someone else's fuel card to purchase?---It's wrong, I've done the wrong thing.

But you knew at the time it was wrong?---I didn't kind of realise it.

You didn't realise at the time that you were doing it that it was wrong?---Yeah.

40 MR THANGARAJ: I want to ask you about Council cars, Council motor vehicles. Were you entitled to one?---No.

Did you have one that you used?---I used I think one car in one weekend.

Right. Are you sure that that's all you used a Council car for, one weekend?---I don't remember. There was one occasion that I may have used it but I don't remember when it was.

Did you – and how long did you have that, have it for on that occasion?---Sorry, which, which one?

You said you had it one weekend?---Yes.

And you said there was another occasion was there, or was it the same occasion you're talking about?---Different occasion.

So on the other occasion, how long did you have it for?---I don't remember.

10 Well, was it for the afternoon, was it for a couple of days, was it for - - -?---  
Maybe a couple of days or something like that.

And why did you have it on each of those two occasions?---One time Mr Goodman was using my car so he gave me the other car to use. And one time it was the four-wheel drive, he was, it was going for auction and I wanted to test drive it.

20 Right. Why was it that Mr Goodman was using your car if he had his own Council car?---He couldn't get in the four-wheel drive because of his leg operation.

Right?---Yeah.

Did you ever have a discussion or an argument with Mr Goodman about Council cars and your use of them?---Probably.

What were those arguments about?---I don't, I don't remember.

30 Well did you ever have – did you ever want a Council car even though you had your own car?---No, as in a Council car, maybe allowance, Council car allowance.

What do you mean by that?---Like car allowance.

Right?---Yeah.

To buy your own car?---Yes.

Right. Well - - -

40 THE COMMISSIONER: You mean as part of your package?---Package, yeah, as a package. Instead of having a car you get a car allowance.

MR THANGARAJ: Okay. Did you ever have a car allowance as part of your package?---No.

Now did you ever drive a car from Council and tell Mr Goodman you wanted to keep it?---No. I don't remember.

Did you ever have an argument with Mr Goodman whereby you had a car and told him that he couldn't take it back and he said he had to take it back or he was going to take it back?---Probably.

Probably?---Probably, yeah.

Well which car was that?---I think it was a Micra or something or Toyota.

10 THE COMMISSIONER: A what?---Toyota. I think Toyota.

MR THANGARAJ: Was it a new car?---No.

Do you know how much it was worth?---I don't know how much it was worth.

Did you – the cars that you drove on those two separate occasions, the four-wheel drive was that a new car - - -?---No. It was a - - -

20 - - - or a newish car?---Old car.

Old car. Okay. And what about the other car, was it the – the other time you drove a car - - -?---It was an old car.

As well?---Yeah.

So they're the only two times you've told us that you had a Council car?---That's what I remember, yes, that's all.

30 Right. Is it the case that you ever had a brand new or a very new Council car?---No.

All right. Did you ever have an argument with Mr Goodman about wanting to keep that car, a new car?---No.

All right?---No.

THE COMMISSIONER: Was this at the same time that you had both the Mercedes and the BMW?---I think so.

40 Well, why on earth would you want a Council car allowance when you already two cars?---As a package as a salary package, that's what I was asking.

Yes, but the car allowance is to allow you to then, in effect lease a car, isn't it?---Yes.

That's why they call it a car allowance. Well why would you want one when you already had two cars?---Because we were not getting pay reviews.

You were not getting what?---Pay reviews done and that's why.

MR THANGARAJ: Did you know whether or not Mr Goodman had been using Council cars improperly?---There was a few Council cars parked in the workshop but I don't know who was using them.

Right. What cars were they, do you remember?---One of them I remember, it was F250.

10

Right. How long do you know – do you know how long he had that car for?---I don't know.

Do you know if he gave cars to other people to use who were not entitled to them?---No.

Did Ms Kirchner have a car that he had to organise or that he organised?---Yes.

20

And was there anything improper about that arrangement to your knowledge?---No.

Did Ms Cullinane have a car that she shouldn't have had, to your knowledge?---I don't know.

Was she entitled to a car?---Well, as a Deputy GM I assume she was but I don't know, I don't know.

30

Did you have a concern or an understanding that she might have had a second car?---No.

Do you know what colour car she had?---Silver or black, charcoal, charcoal colour, I don't know.

Did you understand that Mr Gajic had use of a Council car?---He was buying one of the cars, used cars.

And how was he buying that?---I don't know how he was going to buy it.

40

No, but was there some legitimate process by which this car would be bought?---Normally it goes through auction.

Right. And what did you understand he was going to do?---He was sending a cheque to Council.

Okay. And who told you all this?---Gary told me.

Did Mr Goodman pay for that car that Mr Gajic – sorry. Do you know whether or not Mr Gajic bought the car?---I don't know.

Do you know whether or not there was a plan for Mr Goodman to pay for that car?---No.

You don't know?---I don't know.

10 Do you know how much that car was worth?---I don't know.

Did you understand there was some relationship or some arrangement between Mr Goodman and Mr Gajic whereby he received \$20,000, was giving it back to Mr Gajic and then got his car back or got that car back? ---No.

You don't know anything about that?---No, I don't know anything about that.

20 All right. Now, was Ms Baccam entitled to drive a car, to your knowledge? ---Not to my knowledge, I don't know.

Was she driving a car, a Council car?---I don't know.

Did you ever make allegations about her to Mr Goodman?---Allegations about?

Did you ever say she was doing things wrong to Mr Goodman about anything?---Yes.

30 Right. And were they truthful allegations as far as you understood or, or not?---I don't know. I don't know if they were truthful or not.

All right. Well, did you ever tell Mr Goodman that she was driving a Council car when she shouldn't have been?---She used to drive from Airport office to main office.

Yeah?---That's all I know.

40 Right. Well, presumably there's nothing wrong with that?---Yes.

But did you ever tell Mr Goodman that she was driving a Council car when she shouldn't have been?---I don't remember.

Right. I'll come back to invoicing, but to your knowledge was Ms Baccam involved with Mr Goodman in false invoicing?---I don't know.

You don't know?---I don't know.

Have you ever told Mr Goodman that she was involved doing that with him?---There were lots of rumours about things she was saying, he was saying, so - - -

Did you believe them?---No.

You did not believe them?---I, I can't prove it so I can't believe it or not.

10 All right. Do you have a Council phone or did you have a Council mobile phone?

I have a Gas Motorsport phone. It was in Gas Motor account.

THE COMMISSIONER: Gas, Gas Motorsports?---Yes.

You mean, you mean the phone account was paid by that business?---Yes.

20 MR THANGARAJ: I'm asking about the handset, sorry. Did Mr Goodman give you an iPhone?---Yes.

And was that Council property?---No.

Where did the phone come from?---It was through Gas Motorsport, complimentary phone he told me, yes.

Didn't he tell you that he got a complimentary phone or phones because he had a big, there was a big account with them?---Yes. His, his Gas Motorsport account.

30 Right. But are you saying that the – and this big account's with Telstra. Is that right?---Yes.

Are you saying that the big account with Telstra was with Gas Motorsports, not the Council?---Yes.

Right. And who was paying those phone bills?---Gary Goodman was.

All right.

40 THE COMMISSIONER: Was that the only mobile phone you had?---Yes.

Is that the only phone account he was paying?---Yes.

MR THANGARAJ: Did you ever suspect or believe that Mr Goodman had been involved with falsely invoicing Council?---There was rumours - - -

Yeah?--- - - - and I confronted him.

And what did you say to him?---That the rumours are that he's doing invoicings and he denied it.

Right. Well, did you have first-hand knowledge of things that were happening?---I heard rumours, rumours.

I know you had rumours, but did you have first-hand knowledge of anything?---No.

10 All right. Did you believe that Mr Subeski and Ms Baccam were receiving financial benefits from false invoicing?---That, that was the rumour in the Council, but I don't know.

And what about Ms Baccam approving invoices, do you know whether or not she approved invoices?---Yeah, she, she was approving invoices, that's what people were talking about.

Right. And did you understand whether or not she was approving invoices for Mr Subeski's companies?---No, I don't know about that.  
20

Did you hear any rumours about that?---Yes.

And did you confront him about that?---Yes.

Didn't you send him a text message saying that, "Marny writes and approves Jovane invoices, wow?"---That's the, yeah, that's what people were talking about, that's what was happening.

Are you saying that was based only on rumour?---Yes.  
30

THE COMMISSIONER: You mean there was a rumour to the effect that he was writing false invoices under the name of that particular company, Jovane?---Jovane, yes.

That was the rumour?---Yes.

Where did you hear that from?---From the department.

Well, who in particular told you that?---Ah, Barry and Mark Thompson.  
40

Barry Byrnes, was it?---Yes.

And Mark Thompson?---Mmm.

Did you, were you aware that, or did you have a belief that Mr Goodman had bought gardening products such as pots, or bought pots improperly?  
---I know he bought, he bought pots but I don't know whether he bought it improperly, I don't know about that.

Well, where did the pots go that you're talking about?---To his place.

His house?---Yes.

Well, weren't they bought with Council money?---I don't know.

Didn't you have a belief that he had prepared invoices and signed for invoices for pots that were going back to his house?---No.

10

Or Dianne's house?---No.

You know who Dianne is, don't you?---Yes.

Who's she?---His ah, de facto.

All right. Did you confront Mr Goodman or have a belief that his father was benefitting from Council paying bills?---I don't remember that.

20

Well, did you have any understanding or had you heard anything that his father had received benefits improperly from Council money?---No, I don't

- - -

You knew that at different times Mr Goodman needed money for various things, right?---Sometimes he used to mention he need money to pay bills and stuff, yeah.

Yeah. Well, you knew that his credit cards were exhausted?---Yes.

30

You knew that he was asking you for money?---Yes.

You knew he was asking other people for money?---I don't know if he was asking other people for money.

All right. And you believed didn't you that when he needed money, he would put in false invoices?---No. He paid off his credit cards when he got his uncle's estate so his, all his accounts were sorted. That's what, I believe that's what he told me.

40

Did you have a belief – did you confront Mr Goodman by saying that when they needed money – when he needed money or when Ms Baccam needed money they would simply put in invoices, false invoices for Alex Subeski's companies?---I don't remember.

THE COMMISSIONER: Just in relation to that last question, are you saying that it may have occurred but you have no memory of hearing that, is that what you're saying, that's something that may have happened but you have now presently no memory of it?---It may have happened. I - - -

It's not something you'd forget is it?---There's so – there were so many rumours going on so I just - - -

You just turned a blind eye to all of this did you?---I believed Gary when he told me he's not part of anything.

Better put the question again, Mr Thangaraj. I think there's some confusion.

10 MR THANGARAJ: Did you report up the chain of command what these rumours were?---I mentioned it – I raised my concerns to Barry Byrnes.

And what did you raise with him?---That maybe invoices are not right and also the Cabcharge invoice was excessive amount.

All right. And what did he say?---He reported to Ms Lorraine Cullinane.

How do you know that?---Because she had a meeting with me.

20 Right. And what did you discuss with Ms Cullinane?---She went through those – there were a few invoices and she went through the invoices and she told me that these – all invoices are genuine and she goes through the invoices herself so there is no need to worry or check on anything.

Which invoices did you discuss with her in that meeting?---One of the invoices was Elias & Sons.

Right?---And the other one I don't remember and also a Cabcharge invoice.

30 All right. And with respect to the discussion about the invoices, did she tell you that she was checking them or that she had been checking them?---She was checking them.

All right. And what was she checking?---I don't know. She said these invoices are genuine.

All right?---That they're all genuine invoices.

40 All right. Did she say whether or not she had checked if the work had actually been done?---No, she didn't say that.

So what did you understand she meant by I've checked these invoices?  
---That the invoices are genuine.

All right. But how did you understand she had come to that conclusion?  
---She's the Deputy GM and she probably knows. I don't know.

And was she telling you that she had looked at other invoices besides the couple that you had discussed with her in that meeting?---That's what I understood.

All right. And did you understand – what did you understand the process was with respect to checking, verifying invoices?---I don't think anyone was – the invoices when to Sharon who was the accounts payable.

10 Yeah?---So she was the one who looked at the invoices and if they are not costed they needed to be costed and then she processed them.

All right. But what was Lorraine Cullinane's role in this process that you understood from this meeting or that you understood anyway?---I thought she was checking them so whether she was checking them or not I don't, like I don't know.

All right. When you say - - -?---Maybe she was, maybe. I, I don't know.

20 All right. When you say checking them what do you mean, checking what, checking whether the work had been done, whether the value of the invoice reflected the work that had been done, what was she checking to your mind?---Probably the work because one of the invoices didn't state the vehicle details and she clarified that it is – it was Council vehicle so she said she checked it and it is Council vehicle.

30 Well, it's a very serious allegation that you've taken to her or a rumour that you've taken to her about the Chief Financial Officer being involved in fraud of the Council. Do you agree with that?---I raised that to Barry Byrnes. I don't know what he raised to her. She was talking to me about the invoices which was Elias & Sons - - -

Yeah?--- - - - and Cabcharge.

No, I understand that but the discussion you had with Mr Byrnes and then later with Ms Cullinane concerned a very serious issue didn't it?---Yes.

The Chief Financial Officer stealing from Council, right?---(No Audible Reply)

40 That's the allegation that you were discussing with her, that was the rumour you were discussing with her. Is that right?---Yes.

Now what steps were taken to check that this wasn't happening outside those two or three invoices?---I left it with Barry Byrnes as I can't check anything. I'm not in the position to check anything.

Well, you already had a belief that they were false invoices didn't you?  
---Yeah, we were – it's rumours, like it - - -

No, but you - - -?---But I can't prove if it's fake or not fake.

Your level of knowledge was more than a rumour wasn't it, Ms Mishra? You were in a relationship with Mr Goodman. You knew his financial circumstances to at least some degree. You knew – you had a belief that he was stealing from Council through false invoices?---No, he never told me that he was stealing money and his lifestyle stated that he, he had – if he stole money he would have lots of money with him but he didn't have  
10 enough money.

Well, it depends how he spent his money doesn't it?---Well, he had his uncle's estate money so - - -

Yeah, but that - - -?---He paid all his bills. That's what I believe. That's what he told me.

All right.

20 THE COMMISSIONER: Ms Mishra, a short time ago you told us that both Barry Byrnes and Mark Thompson told you that Mr Goodman was issuing false invoices in the name of Jovane Pty Ltd. That's what you told us a short time ago?---They didn't tell me. They, they said these invoices looks not real or - - -

Well, you had more than rumours. You had two people who were superior to you at Council telling you there was a problem with some invoices and you were concerned enough to raise it with Mr Byrnes and then have a meeting with Ms Cullinane. That's what you've told us so far?---But it –  
30 no, it wasn't the fake invoice, the Jovane invoice it was Elias & Sons and Cabcharge.

All right. Well, okay, add the Jovane invoices to the Elias & Sons and the Cabcharge. The point is that you had enough information to go to Ms Cullinane and have a meeting with her about it?---She didn't discuss Jovane invoice with me.

What is being put to you by Mr Thangaraj is that you had concrete information that the Chief Financial Officer of the Council was potentially  
40 issuing false invoices and Cabcharge vouchers and thereby stealing from Council. Did you not regard that as serious?---But I can't prove anything. I don't have anything – solid evidence that it is happening so - - -

Did you not regard - - -?--- I can't make the allegations.

Did you not regard that information as serious?---Yes.

MR THANGARAJ: Ms Mishra, Mr Goodman's phone has been intercepted for some time, all right. There are a number of calls involving you and Mr Goodman talking about the detail of what I've just been questioning you about. Now I'm going to start playing those tapes unless you want me to – unless you want to revisit some of your answers. I'm going to give you another opportunity otherwise I'm going to start playing the tapes. Do you understand?---Yes.

10 You knew that Mr Goodman was stealing from Council through false invoicing didn't you?---I made allegations.

You knew that he was doing that didn't you?---No.

All right?---I made allegations.

All right. Session number 8-5-3-3 please.

**AUDIO RECORDING PLAYED**

**[11.18am]**

20

MR THANGARAJ: All right. That transcript can be kept upon the screen. Ms Mishra, let's go through that. What you were saying to him was when he needed money or when Marny Baccam needed money they would just find a false Jovane invoice. That's what you're saying isn't it?---Yes.

All right. Now we've heard the way you said it. It wasn't something that you had heard it was a belief that you had wasn't it?---(No Audible Reply)

30 I can play many more phone calls if needed, Ms Mishra. You believed what you said about the Jovane invoices didn't you?---I, I don't, I don't know. I wanted to believe it then I didn't believe it.

You believed it. Whether you wanted to believe it or not, you believed it, didn't you?---I was angry and yes, maybe I did believe it.

No, not maybe you believed it, you believed it, didn't you?---(No Audible Reply)

40 Do you want to hear the tape again?---No.

You believed it, didn't you?---No.

You did not believe that allegation that you were making?---I threatened him a lot of times.

I know that you threatened him, there are plenty of times when you've threatened him, but you threatened him because you had a belief that he was stealing from Council. That's correct, isn't it?---I assumed, assumed, yes.

No, it wasn't an assumption, you believed it?---Maybe I did.

All right. Now, let's go to the next line. And what you also believed was that he and Marny Baccam were stealing from Council in thousands of dollars. Right?---Ah hmm.

10

That was also a belief that you had. Correct?---That was the rumour, yes.

No, can we – I understand all this, there was rumours about all this. I'm not asking about rumours. I'm asking about your state of mind. You believed when you made this phone call that he, that Mr Goodman and Ms Baccam were stealing from Council. Correct?---Yes.

All right. And what you were saying was at the end, "We'll see how long this goes for," there was a threat in that, wasn't there?---Yes.

20

And the reason that you were able to make a threat was because of your belief as to what they were doing. Right?---Yes.

Right?---Yeah.

Now, I'm going to play some other tapes, but the sense of this is, is reflected by your comment, "And when I want money it's in \$50 notes, or it's in fifties." You were actually – you weren't too worried about what they were doing, you were just complaining you weren't getting enough of it. Is that right?---No.

30

You were – in that one email, in that one phone call you were saying that they're ripping of Council in thousands but you're only getting a 50?  
---But he was already giving me money, like, I didn't need - - -

Yeah, but you wanted more?---No, I didn't want more.

All right. One at a time. I tender 8533 with a transcript.

40 THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, that call and the transcript will be Exhibit R9.

**#EXHIBIT R9 - TRANSCRIPT SESSION 8533**

MR THANGARAJ: All right. 10128, please.

**AUDIO RECORDING PLAYED**

**[11.23am]**

MR THANGARAJ: Now, it didn't sound like you believed what he had to say there, Ms Mishra?---He confirmed with Malcolm Foo that that pots was for Business Unit, that particular invoice.

10 Are you saying that those pots were not for his personal – sorry, for his business are you saying or for Council business?---Business Unit.

Right. So what does that mean, that you were satisfied that the pots did not go to Dianne?---Well, that's what he say, it wasn't for his home.

It didn't sound like you believed him. Did you believe his response?  
---Well, it's very hard to believe sometimes him or not, it's just - - -

20 Well, you told us before that when he denied the allegations you believed him. He denied this allegation and you clearly didn't believe him, did you?  
---Yes.

You believed him or not?---I didn't believe him.

You did not believe him?---No.

30 No. You knew that the pots had been paid for by Council and gone back to his house, didn't you?---He said those, that invoice, those pots were not for his house, it was for Business Unit. That's why Malcolm signed the invoice.

Yeah, I know what he said, but that's not what I asked. You believed that the pots had been stolen effectively. Right?---No.

Sorry?---Sorry?

You believed that, you believed that he had signed the invoice so that the pots would go back to his house?---Yes.

40 And you believed that Council had paid for those pots?---Yes.

Right. And again when I was talking about the previous call where I suggested that you were focussed on not getting enough money, in this case there was an element of jealousy there, wasn't there?---Yes.

Right. When you said, "You're a thief," what did you mean by that?  
---Stealing money.

From?---Council.

Right. And when you said, "When you go to gaol," that's when you're going to rest, what you were saying was, someone will find out and I won't rest until that happens. Is that the threat?---Sorry, can you repeat?

When you said, "When you go to gaol, that's when I'm going to rest," what did you mean by that?---It means he'll go to gaol.

For stealing money from Council?---Mmm.

10

All right. Now, you see before, you see a few lines further down and you said, "Your dad never pays for anything, Council pays those bills." Remember a few minutes ago I asked you about that - - -?---Ah hmm.

- - - and you denied knowing anything about his father receiving improper benefits? That wasn't correct, was it?---Sorry?

20

A few minutes ago I asked you whether or not you believed Mr Goodman's father was improperly receiving benefits from Council. Remember I asked you that question?---Yes.

And you denied knowing or believing that. Remember that?---Yes.

Now, it's pretty obvious isn't it that you believed, as you've said in that call, that his father never pays for anything?---He does, he told me he does pay. I'm just making allegations to him, not - - -

30

Yeah. What was your belief about his father receiving benefits from Council?---I don't think he was getting anything from Council.

Well, what, what, when you said, "Your dad never pays for anything, Council pays your bill and everything, electricity et cetera," what were you talking about?---Um, that was the rumours in the Council that - - -

What was your belief?---I believe he was because he was a pensioner and he paid from his pension money.

Paid what?---The bills.

40

Paid, sorry, the father was using his own money to pay bills?---Yes.

Well, then how can you say, "Your father never pays for anything?" ---Because Gary said he's um, he asked for some money.

Ms Mishra, it's pretty obvious isn't it that what you're saying to Mr Goodman in this phone call was, Council pays your bills, including bills for your father?---Yeah, that's the rumours I heard, that the Council was paying his bills.

All right. I want to play you 5240. Sorry, I tender that.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, that will be Exhibit R10.

**#EXHIBIT R10 - TRANSCRIPT SESSION 10128**

10 MR THANGARAJ: 5240 please. Or we'll go to 9605 first.

**AUDIO RECORDING PLAYED**

**[11.30am]**

MR THANGARAJ: I want to ask you about the beginning of that phone call. This is another example of you seeing a document first hand that you were concerned about, isn't it?---Yes.

20 Now you saw an invoice sitting on his desk for \$7,000 and you believed it was a false invoice, didn't you?---I don't remember what invoice it was.

Well, he signed – Mr Goodman signed hundreds of invoices, didn't he?---Yes.

You'd hardly be asking him about an invoice that was perfectly legitimate, would you?---I don't know.

30 Sorry?---I don't know.

What you were also pointing out was or you were asking him why was it he had anything to do with signing invoices at all?---Yes.

You knew full well that he signed many, many invoices?---I was talking about business unit invoices.

Yeah. That's what I'm talking about?---Yeah.

40 You knew that he signed many business unit invoices, didn't you?---Yes.

And you believed that was inappropriate for him to be signing business unit invoices?---Yes.

And who should've been signing them?---Stuart.

Sorry?---Stuart.

Surname?---Dutton.

Right?---Dutton.

And what do you believe the process should've been?---He was in charge of business unit so should've gone to him.

And why weren't they going to him?---I don't know.

10 Did you ever speak to Mr Dutton about that?---No.

Did you ever speak to Ms Cullinane about that?---No.

Did you speak to anyone and say why is that someone who's not in the business unit is approving invoices for the business unit?---We had a discussion, me, Gary, Barry and Mark Thompson.

What was the discussion?---Why isn't it going to Mr Stuart Dutton.

20 And when was this?---That was last year sometime.

And what was, what did Mr Byrnes and Mr Thompson say?---Nothing. They were asking the same thing and Gary said that his authority wasn't organised yet or something like that.

Beg your pardon?---His authority wasn't organised.

Was not?---Yeah.

30 Well, isn't that – whose, Mr Dutton's?---Yes.

So what steps were taken to give Mr Dutton the delegation?---That's coming from Lara Kirchner, she has to approve his delegations and his authorities.

And were steps taken to give him the delegation?---I don't know.

Well, to your knowledge did Mr Dutton ever get delegation authority?---Not to my knowledge, I don't think so.

40 And was that the first time that had been raised to your knowledge?---Yes.

Did Mr Thompson say that he would do something about it?---No.

Why didn't you raise this aspect with Ms Cullinane when you met with her?---I'm not in the position to do it, I'm just accounting officer I'm not in the hierarchy to talk to her about all this.

Ms Mishra, that can't possibly be correct. Because you've told us already that you did speak to Ms Cullinane about a problem that you had with the

invoicing?---I have to report it first to Barry Byrnes because he's my supervisor.

Well you did report it to Barry Byrnes and did you chase it up after that?---  
No.

Why not?---I didn't do it.

10 Yeah. I know that but you did on the previous occasion – had you met with Ms Cullinane before or after this conversation with Mr Thompson and Mr Byrnes?---I think before.

All right. So you'd already had a meeting with Ms Cullinane about invoicing problems, you then raised a different problem with the same person, Mr Barry Byrnes and this time with Mr Thompson as well. Why didn't you ask them what was happening?---Because there was nothing happening. If you, if you complain anything to Lorraine nothing happens.

20 Why do you say that?---Previously Barry said he's raised his concerns about a few things and nothing happens, it just, she doesn't do nothing about it.

And what concerns did Mr Byrnes raise to your knowledge?---To my knowledge well like maybe invoices, I don't know what other issues he had with, he did raise with her.

And did he tell you that?---Like Cabcharge, he was supposed to pay it back.

Yeah?---Yeah.

30 Well, isn't the protocol that if the Deputy General Manager doesn't address the problems you take them to the General Manager?---In Botany Council we were not allowed to go and speak to Lara.

So if you had a problem, if you had an – if you believed that a senior officer was defrauding the Council, you're not allowed to raise it with the General Manager?---Nobody was doing anything about it.

No, that's not what I asked?---Nobody could go see her, nobody.

40 Why not?---Because you are going over other people's head.

No, but if the person that you've gone to first doesn't do anything about it, surely you're entitled to go over their head?---(No Audible Reply)

THE COMMISSIONER: She had an email address, didn't she?---Yes.

The General Manager?---Yes.

You could've sent her an email?---(No Audible Reply)

MR THANGARAJ: Is it that you did not do it because you did not want to expose Mr Goodman given your relationship with him?---No. I didn't because I was scared I might lose my job.

Scared from who?---From Lorraine.

10 You thought if you complained above her head she would sack you?---If I complained about Gary, yes.

All right. And why would she be concerned if there's was allegation made about Mr Goodman?---Because her and Gary were friends.

So what?---And she protected him.

Why do you say that?---She knew about the Cabcharge and he was supposed to pay it back and she didn't chase it up so - - -

20 Yeah. Did you think that she had thoroughly investigated the false invoicing that had been raised?---I'm not sure.

Now you told us that there were financial delegations not in place for Mr Dutton, what financial delegations were in place? Did you have a delegation authority?---No.

Did Ms Baccam?---I don't know.

30 Did Mr Goodman, Gary Goodman?---I don't know about him.

Well who had financial delegations that you knew of, you're the accountant?---(No Audible Reply)

Sorry?---I don't know.

Well Mr Goodman was signing invoices, wasn't he?---Yes.

Ms Baccam was signing invoices, you knew that?---Yes.

40 Who else did you know was signing invoices, Sharon Dale?---No, she wasn't signing invoices.

All right. So Ms Baccam and Mr Goodman are, who else was?---Oh, there were various people in business unit I think they were signing invoices.

Who?---Malcom and - - -

Malcolm Foo?---Yeah.

Right. Anyone else?---No, I don't remember anyone else.

And how do you know – what process or what person gave them authority to sign invoices?---I don't know.

Was there a document that had a list of people and their respective delegation authorities?---I haven't seen any documents.

10 Did anyone raise that with you?---No.

Do you know what the process would've been to add someone to that list?---No.

Is there any reason why Ms Cullinane could not have added Stuart Dutton to that list to your knowledge?---No, not to my knowledge.

20 All right. Now, further along in that call you said to him, “Because you are a safe haven because you make so much money out of the place.” Now, you're talking about Council, aren't you?---Yes.

And when you say to him, “You're a safe haven,” what did you mean by that?---I don't remember.

Well, you said it. What is it, what did you mean by it?---I don't remember, I don't know.

Well - - -

30 THE COMMISSIONER: I beg your pardon? I can't hear you?---I don't remember, I don't know what I meant.

MR THANGARAJ: Well, forget about your memory of that particular call. You certainly had strong view at the time as to what was happening, didn't you? You've expressed that clearly over a number of calls?---Yes, I tried to get it out of him whether he was, it was true or not.

40 Well, you weren't trying to ask him questions, you were telling him what was happening and you were telling him you knew about it and he would go to gaol. Right?---I thought if I may threaten him he might tell me the truth.

Right. Did you say that he was a “safe haven,” because he was protected or that nothing that was happening to him was going to be exposed?  
---Probably.

Sorry?---I think so.

All right. And who did you think was acting in a way that meant that he was safe to keep doing what he was going?---Well, only person was Lorraine, she, complaints went to her and nothing was done so - - -

All right. And when you said, “Because you’re making so much money out of the place,” what you meant was because you’re stealing so much money from Council?---Yes.

10 All right. And you were saying that he should not have had all his fingers and his toes in the Business Unit because in fact it shouldn’t have had anything to do with him?---Yes.

All right. I tender that call, Commissioner.

THE COMMISSIONER: That call is Exhibit R11.

**#EXHIBIT R11 - TRANSCRIPT SESSION 960**

20

MR THANGARAJ: I want to go back to another topic that I started with, and that’s Anmol. Can we play 5193, please.

**AUDIO RECORDING PLAYED**

**[11.42am]**

30 MR THANGARAJ: Now, you’ve said in other calls that you’re not dumb, and what you mean by that was, don’t try to, you know I know, don’t try to deny it. Right?---Yes.

And similarly here, you didn’t believe him when he was denying what he was saying. Right?---Yeah.

You’ll have to say yes for the transcript?---Yes.

40 All right. All right. So just go back to the top of the – I asked you before whether or not you knew that Anmol was working for Mr Goodman privately and I think you said he wasn’t or you didn’t know. You knew at the time, didn’t you, you knew that he was doing work for Mr Goodman? ---Yes, I said he was, I saw him at the workshop, he was doing stuff.

All right. Sorry?---Yeah.

But you knew that Anmol was being paid by false invoicing going through the Business Unit?---I made that up. Gary was paying Anmol.

THE COMMISSIONER: You made it up?---It was a rumour in the Council that maybe Business Unit is paying and not Gary but it was later rectified that Gary was paying him when he was working at the workshop.

Well, sorry, how was it rectified, how do you know that?---Gary's told me and he paid him in front of - - -

So this person that you don't believe told you that he was paying for Anmol and now you've accepted that, have you?---Yes.

10

MR THANGARAJ: How do you know he paid him, did you, sorry, was it him telling you or him - - -?---Him telling me.

Yeah, right. But you've also said with respect to that that everyone in the -- "Go and ask anybody in the Business Unit," and that he was a liar, because everyone in the Business Unit knew that Mr, that Anmol was being paid through other companies putting in false invoices. And you knew that too, didn't you?---No, he wasn't paid by Business Unit, he was paid by Gary for his personal work.

20

Anmol was being put on invoices for other companies who were being paid through the Business Unit while he was doing work for Mr Goodman and those false invoices paid for Anmol. Do you accept that?---No, I don't know about that.

Well, isn't that what you're saying?---I'm just making an allegation that -- I wouldn't, I wouldn't ask anybody at Business Unit and I didn't ask anybody at the Business Unit, I'm just making an allegation.

30

Well, what you then wanted, what you wanted was, you wanted Anmol to come and do work at your house for free?---He never came. I didn't want him to do that.

I'm not asking whether he came or not. You were saying to Mr Goodman, I know Anmol is doing work at your house being paid by the Business Unit and I want him to do the same at my house. Right?---Yes.

40

Right. And you were expecting, if you pointed out the fact that Anmol was being paid for the Business Unit that you thought Mr Goodman would send him over to your house to do free work at your house, which is what you wanted?---I was only testing him, I didn't want him to do that work.

Oh. So what, that wasn't, that wasn't truthful, was it, when you said, sorry, wasn't genuine was it when you said - - -?---No.

- - - "Can I have him for a day cleaning my tiles, steam mopping?"---No, it wasn't genuine.

Right?---I was, yeah.

Well, it sounded genuine, Ms Mishra. And when he says, “Well, that’s fine, you’ll have to pay him,” you were upset that you would have to pay him. If it wasn’t genuine, why did you care, why did you point out, no, no, what are you talking about, Malcolm Foo’s signing off on these invoices. Why did you say that if it wasn’t genuine?---Because I knew it won’t happen. I wasn’t going to let him come in my house and do those works.

10 What, unlike Mr Subeski and Mr Gajic?---(No Audible Reply)

You wanted Council to do work at your house – sorry, you wanted Council to pay for your work at your house for free?---But Gajic and Subeski got paid by Gary.

You didn’t – well, he told you that he was paying them?---Yes.

I’ve suggested to you that they were paid through false invoicing. You say you didn’t know anything about that, right, but the bottom line is, the house,  
20 the work was done at your house and you didn’t pay for it at all?---I believe Gary Goodman paid for it.

Yeah, with what?---With his – he gave Zoran a car.

Gave him a car?---Yeah, a sports car.

Yeah, yeah?---For the amount of work he did.

Right?---Yeah.

30 How do you know that?---He told me that.

But you’ve had a discussion with him about the \$20,000 going one way and coming back, didn’t you?---Sorry?

All right, well come to that.

40 THE COMMISSIONER: Ms Mishra, the bottom line was that you were having this work done at your house and you weren’t paying for any of it, were you?---No.

MR THANGARAJ: Let’s go back to that, “Can I have him here for a day cleaning my tiles.” You say that was not genuine?---No.

Okay. Have a look at the screen. The next line he says, “Well, he’s \$100 a day?”---Ah hmm.

And then you said, “Yeah, well, who pays for it? You don’t pay, Malcolm pays.” He denies it and you say, “Malcolm pays, Gary, you know that. Don’t lie, Gary, every time you want him, I’m not a fool.” What you were saying was, I know you’re getting it for free, I want it for free?---I assumed that he was getting it for free.

Yeah. Well, forget about whether you assumed, what you were doing was, you were trying to get more free work, more work at your house that was not being paid for by you. Do you agree with that?---Yes.

10

All right. All right. I tender that, Commissioner.

THE COMMISSIONER: Exhibit R12.

**#EXHIBIT R12 - TRANSCRIPT SESSION 5193**

MR THANGARAJ: 5423, please.

20

**AUDIO RECORDING PLAYED**

**[11.50am]**

MR THANGARAJ: All right. Now did you tell the truth when I asked you about having access to a Council car before?---Yes.

You told the truth?---I said two cars.

30 Yeah. And I asked you, they were – you said they were both old cars for two days each?---Yes.

Right. Was that the truth, was that the extent of your use of Council cars? ---Yeah, this, this car it’s an old car.

Well, why – so what, Mr Goodman has just got it wrong has he when he says it’s a brand new car?---No, it’s not a brand new car. It wasn’t a brand new car.

40 Well, did you tell him it wasn’t a brand new car?---Yes.

Where?---I don't know but it’s not – it wasn’t a brand new car.

Okay. Well - - -?---It had mileage on it and it was damaged as well.

There’s a significant difference between – and I said this to you when I asked you the question whether it was a brand new car or a newish car. You confirmed both the other cars were old cars so forget about whether it was

brand new or not as opposed to straight out of the showroom. It was a newish car and he was telling you that and that he said that's part of the reason why you can't have it. Do you agree with that?---That's what he's -- he's saying - - -

All right. Which car was it?--- - - - it's a new car.

Which car was it?---It wasn't a newish car.

10 Which car was it?---I think it's a, it was a Corolla.

Right. So what colour was this Corolla that you're talking about in this car?---White.

And was it worth about \$20,000?---I don't think so.

Is it one of the two cars that you were talking about earlier?---Yes.

20 Which one?---Not -- this is not the four-wheel drive this is the different - - -

The other one?---Yeah, the other one.

The one you described as an old car?---Yes.

Okay. So how long had you been driving that car for?---Um - - -

The one that we're talking about in the phone call?---Um - - -

30 The one you did not want to return?---I had it for a while then it went back to the workshop or something for fixing. There was something wrong with it.

Yeah?---And then it sat there for a while.

And did it come back to you?---It came back and I had to return it back to Council for auction.

40 All right. So when you said you had it for a while how long was that? ---Maybe a few weeks or something.

So it wasn't the two days you told us about before?---The, the other one I had for two days.

No, you told us both of them were for two days. It wasn't for two days was it like you told us before?---I thought I said it was more than -- it was - - -

No, you didn't. So you had this for a few weeks did you?---I think so.

And were you entitled to this Council car?---No.

And yet you wanted him to allow you to keep it?---Yes.

And were you going to pay for it?---Yes.

Where do you say that?---(No Audible Reply)

10 He's saying you can't have it. You're – why don't you say if it's the case well, I'll pay for it, you don't say that do you?---Yeah, but I, I didn't keep the car.

Whether you kept it or not is not the point. You already had free work being done at your house, right. You had free, you had groceries paid by Council, correct, and now you wanted to keep the car, the Council car that you were not entitled to. Is that correct?---I didn't intentionally want to keep the car. I had cars. I didn't want to keep another car.

20 We know you had cars. That makes it all the more remarkable with respect, Ms Mishra, but the point is that it's pretty clear from this phone call that you liked this car and you wanted to keep it. Is that correct or not?---Yes.

And who was going to drive the car, were you going to give it to someone else?---No.

Were you giving your cars to someone else?---I wanted to sell my car.

30 Right. So you wanted to sell your car and have the Council pay for the new one?---No. I was going to buy it myself.

You weren't going to buy it yourself. Where's the suggestion that you were going to buy this car yourself?---(No Audible Reply)

There's no suggestion you were going to buy this car yourself is there? ---Not in this phone call.

40 What you're saying in this phone call before you hung up was I'm keeping this car. You can't take it off me or I don't want you take it off me. Is that right?---Yes.

So you didn't want to return it, right?---Yes.

And nor did you say – give him a reason to justify you keeping it such as I'll pay for it. You didn't say that either?---No, I didn't say in that conversation.

What you – well, you didn't say it at all did you?---Not in this conversation.

Did you say it at another time to Mr Goodman, did you say oh, that car we're talking about I'll pay for it?---No, I didn't want, I didn't want the - - -

Did you ever say to - - -?---I changed my mind then.

All right. Well, it wasn't really your mind to change was it because he'd already said you weren't keeping it hadn't he?---Yeah, did he say that in the phone conversation.

10 So it wasn't, it wasn't a matter of you changing your mind. You're losing the car?---Yes.

What you wanted was more free assets or you wanted to Council to pay for something else for you that you were not entitled to. Do you agree with that?---No.

You don't?---I don't – I didn't want anything Council to pay for it.

All right.

20

THE COMMISSIONER: This is 15 September last year. Is this at the – this coincides with the period of time that Mr Goodman is giving you \$200 a week to help you out?---Yes.

And it's also the same period of time over which Mr Goodman is paying your phone bill?---Yes.

And the same period of time over which you have agreed to invest in a unit together?---Ah hmm.

30

MR THANGARAJ: Of which you paid 10 per cent of the deposit and he paid 120,000 which was the 90 per cent of the deposit, right?---I paid 10,000.

10,000?---Yeah.

And he paid 120,000?---Yeah.

All right. 1-1-0 – I tender that, sorry, Commissioner.

40

THE COMMISSIONER: Exhibit R13.

**#EXHIBIT R13 - TRANSCRIPT SESSION 5423**

MR THANGARAJ: 1-1-0-5-8 please.

**AUDIO RECORDING PLAYED**

**[11.56am]**

MR THANGARAJ: All right. You didn't offer to buy the car then either did you?---No.

This is later - - -?---I said take it back.

10 I beg your pardon?---I said take it, take the car back.

Yeah. And then because you knew at that – this was after the phone call where he said that he was taking it, right. It was – I think it was a week later you still had the car?---I don't know. I don't remember.

All right. Well, this call is on 23 September. The last one was on 15 September so why haven't you returned it already?---I don't know. I just - - -

20 And you hadn't made any arrangements, you said you were going to buy the car on 15 November, 15 September your state of mind you were going to buy the car you said. By 23 you're still driving and you haven't told anyone that you're going to buy the car. Is that right?---Yes, it was just parked on the street.

I didn't ask that. You had possession of that car?---Yes.

30 You had not told anyone in those eight days after 15 that you wanted to buy the car?---No.

You agree?---Yes.

And at one point you said, "You can't touch this car." Which car were you talking about?---May be that one.

The one you were driving?---Yeah.

So, again, you are trying to keep the car?---No, he was going to auction it.

40 Yes. But you said, "You can't touch this car." What did you mean by that?---Like he can't take it or he can't drive.

Why not, why can't he? Because you wanted to keep it.---No.

Well, what other reason is there?---He gives it to business unit.

So what. You told him he can't touch the car because you still wanted to keep it eight days later even though he told you're not keeping it, correct?

---Yes.

Right. You had no intention of buying it yourself that's why you haven't raised it with anyone in those eight days or any other time. Do you agree with that?---Yes.

Right. And what really upset you was he was saying you can't keep his car but he's allowing your romantic rival of Marney Baccam to keep her car, that's what further upset you wasn't it? Do you agree with that?---Yes.

10

Right. Did you have a picture of her driving the car?---No.

But you knew she was driving the car?---I think she drove to Council - - -

No, you knew more than that. You knew that she was driving the car as her personal car, that's what upset you wasn't it?---No, she was driving somewhere and there was a fine or something that's how we - - -

Are you saying that she drove from the business unit to Council for work and that upset you in a jealous sense, you're not saying that are you?---Um - - -

20

You're not saying that are you?---No, I'm not saying that.

Right. What you're upset about was that you couldn't keep the car you wanted to keep but Gary Goodman was allowing someone else that he was seeing, Marney Baccam, to drive a car, a Council car, that's what was happening wasn't it?---Yes.

Right. And you said to him, you return all the Council cars too, you're saying, well if I can't keep a car I'm not entitled to, you should as well, right. What was the Nissan?---Nissan, that was a four wheel drive.

30

Where was that car?---Auction place.

And why was it that Mr Goodman would have to return that, was it your view that he shouldn't have had that car in the first place?---Yes.

And why shouldn't he have had it?---Because that was our car to be sold.

40

And was he delaying selling it was he?---Yes.

So he could keep using it for himself?---At that time he said there was something wrong with the computers in the car and it was for repairs.

Where?---At the auction place.

So why would you have a problem with it if that was the case? Well that couldn't have been the case?---Well, he told me it was at auction place, I didn't believe him.

Okay. You didn't believe him. So where did you believe it was, what did you believe was happening?---I thought he was using it.

Right. Now you said return all the Council cars to, you mean, the cars that he'd improperly given to other people?---I mean the F250 that he had.

10

Yes. As well as the what, how many cars were you talking about?---(No audible reply)

The F250's not a Nissan right.---No.

So how many cars are you talking about?---Um, the rumour was that there was some cars that other people were using - - -

Who?---Um, his brothers.

20

His brothers?---His brother.

Right. Which brother?---Mark Goodman.

Well, he'd be entitled to a car wouldn't he, as acting head of a business unit?---I don't know, I don't know about his entitlement.

Well, you thought the Deputy GM would be entitled to a car?---Yes.

30

What about Mark Goodman, did you think he was entitled to a car?---I don't know.

Well then, that wouldn't be what you're talking about then is it? When you say you return all the Council cars too, you're talking about him having cars he should not have or people that he's given them to who should not have them. Who are you talking about?---He had few cars, Council cars, that's what I'm talking about.

Yes, we know that. But who had them, who was using them?---Gary.

40

Who else?---I don't know Gary was using them and the rumours were that other people, like families and friends were using it too but I don't know.

Who was spreading these rumours?---Just people at work.

Yes, I know. Who?---When they got - - -

Who knew about this mis-use of Council vehicles?---Barry Byrnes knew.

Yes. What did he know?---When he got toll notices that's when he sort of knew people were driving different cars.

Right. And what did he worked out from the toll notices who was driving a car and he knew he could work out then if someone had more cars than ought to have had.---Probably, yeah.

10 Right. And how do you know that he knew that?---He sometimes said.  
To you?---Yes.

Right. And what did you, did you do anything about that apart from confronting Mr Goodman, did you do anything about it?---I confronted Mr Goodman that's all.

Yes, apart from that, did you do anything?---No.

20 Did you complain to Lorraine Cullinane about it?---No.

Did Barry Byrnes say he was going to do something about?---Yes.

What did he say he was going to do?---That he was going to go to Lorraine, that's why I didn't do nothing about it .

All right. Did he come back and tell you that he'd spoken to her or not?---No he didn't.

30 Did you chase it up?---No.

By this stage, you believe that Mr Goodman was a safe haven and he was being protected by Miss Cullinane?---Yes.

So if he was going to tell Miss Cullinane, what effect would that have?---None, I suppose.

Why didn't email Lara Kirchner?---I didn't.

40 Okay. Is that because you were in a relationship with him?---No.

Is it because you were getting benefits from Council because of Mr Goodman's position?---No.

But you were getting benefits at that time by Mr Goodman being in Council, weren't you?---From him, from his money.

Well, the fact that he was in his position meant that you were getting renovations for free, you're getting the odd bit of grocery shopping for free, you had a car for free, had a fuel car for free. Right? Correct?---Yes.

All of which would have gone if Mr Goodman was exposed?---Yes.

Correct?---Ah hmm.

10 So part of the safe haven included you, didn't it?---I believe Gary paid for my renovations, not Council.

Forget about that, part of the safe haven, the only complaint you made you thought would end with Lorraine Cullinane and you never spoke to anyone else apart from Barry Byrnes and Lorraine Cullinane and that one conversation with Mr Thompson, all of which went nowhere, is that right?--  
-We couldn't, that was not the culture at the Council.

20 But was the culture at the Council?---It was, we were supposed to report to Lorraine only.

Why?---That's the way it was.

Yes, but we know that's the way it was and we know what you say Miss Cullinane was doing and not doing, was there any other way that you could have done something about this or not?---I don't think so.

30 All right. Now the fact was that Mr Goodman remaining in his position meant that there was a financial benefit to you, wasn't there?---Apart from giving me money from his account and paying my phone bills.

Paying your phone bills, giving you \$200 every week, meaning that you could keep a Council car that you were not entitled to, the odd grocery, his friends were renovating your house for free, correct?---The renovations wasn't for free.

Well, you weren't paying for it?---Yes.

That's what I mean, do you understand that?---Yes.

40 All of that was at risk if Mr Goodman was exposed, is that right?---I don't, I didn't care whether he was at risk or not.

THE COMMISSIONER: That's actually not an answer to the question. The question was, all of that was at risk not to mention the \$200 a week you were getting and the phone bills were paid if Mr Goodman was going to be exposed for this activity, that's what's being put to you, is that not the case?---Yes.

So you stood to lose a significant benefit if Mr Goodman was exposed, didn't you?---Yes.

And that's why you didn't do anything about it because you had a financial interest in Mr Goodman remaining there, isn't that right?---No, I complained whatever I could.

10 Yes, but nothing else was done and you took no further action because you had a financial interest in Mr Goodman remaining there?---But I was scared to lose my job as well.

With respect Miss Mishra it doesn't sound like you were very scared on those phone calls?---Because at one time Lorraine told Gary for me to calm down, that I should calm down that I shouldn't raise too many questions.

Sorry, who told you to calm down?---Lorraine told Gary to tell me to calm down.

20 MR THANGARAJ: And did you say she told him to tell you not to raise questions?---Yes.

At the end of that call you said "Yeah. You make her do a lot of bodgy invoices". Talking about Marny Baccam?---Yes.

You know the company Ari Landscape Solutions?---No.

Did you know that he and Ms Baccam jointly owned a company that put almost \$200,000 worth of invoices through Council?---No, I didn't know.

30 Well what did you mean by "You make her do a lot of bodgy invoices?---I was just making an allegation.

No. You knew full well that Ms Baccam and Mr Goodman were putting in false invoices. You'd seen invoices that were problematic and you've raised those problems you say with people above you?---Ah hmm.

So you knew that false invoices were going through Mr Goodman, didn't you?---But they were rumours I can't prove if they are - - -

40 Well what's - - -?--- - - - fake or not fake.

I'm not talking about whether they were rumours or not, I'm talking about your belief, your state of mind and what you did or didn't do about it. You believed that he and Marny Baccam were putting through false invoices, didn't you?---I'm not sure.

Well why did you say that in that call at that time?---Just wanted to threaten him.

Well it would be a pretty hollow threat unless there was some substance behind it?---(No Audible Reply)

The substance was you believed and you knew that Mr Goodman was putting through false invoices and at times with Ms Baccam?---I was going with the rumours that I'd heard and that's what I was implying.

10 THE COMMISSIONER: Ms Mishra, with respect, where is it in any of those phone calls that you preface any of these accusations with Gary, I'm hearing rumours about this, are they true? There's nothing in any of those phone calls that asserts these are rumours, is there?---No.

They're statements, aren't they?---Yeah.

They're statements about what you believed at the time, aren't they?---Yeah.

MR THANGARAJ: I tender 11058, Commissioner.

20 THE COMMISSIONER: Exhibit R14.

#### **#EXHIBIT R14 - TRANSCRIPT SESSION 11058**

MR THANGARAJ: Who's Sam Alexander?---He's the phone, he supplies phones.

30 All right. And Joe, Joe Freitas?---Yes.

Is that Joe Freitas?---Yes.

And what does Joe Freitas do?---He's the mechanic.

And you knew, well at the very least believed that false invoices were going through Mr Alexander and Mr Freitas's companies as well, didn't you?---Yes. There was rumours about that too.

40 All right. And where did you hear those rumours?---At work.

All right. I know it was at work, but who did you hear them from?---I think Mark Thompson and Barry Byrnes because there was a lot of invoices coming through for phones.

Right?---Yeah.

Someone had worked out that too much was being paid out in a short period of time for phones?---Yes.

And what happened as a result of speaking to them about that or hearing those rumours?---I think they asked Gary and Gary confirmed that he received those phones so they were - - -

And that was the end of it to your knowledge, was it?---Yes.

10 That's the end of the investigation into that?---Yeah. He confirmed that he received those phones. Well, they were delivered to some, to Fred or IT people or something like that.

And what about Joe Freitas, what did they say about that, what did he do to your knowledge?---He repaired Council cars and, yeah.

Right. And what was the concern about Mr Freitas and invoicing that you heard?---That incorrect vehicles names were put there or something like that.

20 In other words that there was some problem which meant that Council was paying money it shouldn't have, is that right?---Yes.

And we've been through quite a number of different issues that you've heard rumours about from these people, different contractors for different types of work, different hardware being provided, Cabcharges, et cetera, all these rumours or you say they're rumours but in the phone calls it pretty clear that you believe people in the business unit knew. Is the extent of the exposure or the discussion about this just discussions you've had with Barry Byrnes, Mark Thompson and then Lorraine Cullinane and nothing else?---Yes.

30 You said to Mr Goodman, I'll play the call if you need me to but you said to Mr Goodman in a call "You make enough money from Sam, Telstra and Joe", meaning Joe Freitas, I take it, which he denied. What do you, what were you saying when you said that?---I was implying that - - -

Well you weren't implying anything, you said "You make enough money from Sam, Telstra and Joe", what were you saying?---That he's making money out of it.

40 Yeah. Doing what and how?---(No Audible Reply)

You're saying that Sam Alexander and Mr Goodman were complicit in false invoicing and that Mr Goodman was getting a share of it, is that what you were saying?---Yes.

And the same with Joe Freitas?---Yes.

And this was as a result of a discussion you had with Barry Byrnes and Mark Thompson, was it?---Yes.

I tender that, I'll tender just the transcript of that, 23 September.

THE COMMISSIONER: Yes. What was the number, sorry.

MR THANGARAJ: Sorry, 11072.

THE COMMISSIONER: Exhibit R15.

10

**#EXHIBIT R15 - TRANSCRIPT SESSION 11072**

MR THANGARAJ: What did you understand was the problem with the Cabcharges and Mr Goodman?---There were large amounts in some transactions.

Beg your pardon?---There were large amounts.

20 Yeah?---Like \$500, \$250.

For individual trips?---Yes.

Right. And how did you first come to know that?---Barry Byrnes was going through it and he noticed the - - -

The amounts?---Amounts, yeah.

30 What was Barry Byrnes's job?---Financial Accountant.

So as part of his job was to look at expenditure, certain expenditure?  
---Yeah.

He noticed these anomalous amounts?---Ah hmm.

And what happened, he raised them with you, did he?---No, he didn't raise it to me. Because I did some - I was costing them and then - - -

40 When you costed them did you notice the figures yourself?---Yes.

And what did you do about it?---I went back to him and I said - - -

To who?---Barry.

Yes?---And he said "Yes, he's seen them".

Yeah. And what did he say?---And he said he's going to talk to Lorraine about it.

And did you hear back about that?---Yes.

And what did you hear?---That he was supposed to pay that back.

All right. And how did it happen in the first place, do you know?---He's using to go to the hospitals.

What for \$500?---Well, that's what he told us.

10

Well, is this how those Cabcharge can work, you can tell a taxi driver to put a certain amount on say \$500 and the driver might give you some cash, can it work that way?---Yes.

Right. So going to the hospital would hardly – which hospital was it?--- Liverpool Hospital.

Okay. From where?---From Hoxton Park.

20

Right. So it certainly wasn't anything in the vicinity of \$500, was it?---No.

So there was something concerning about it?---Yes.

And you understood that what the powers that be decided was that Mr Goodman would simply pay it back?---Yes.

And that was it?---And Gary then reported the card was stolen.

Right?---Yeah, then we cancelled the card.

30

When did he report the card was stolen?---After a few months I think.

Is it, was there some suggestion that he had not put the \$500 on and the other amounts like that?---Yes.

By saying someone else did it?---Yes.

After it was stolen?---No, before it was stolen.

40

Sorry, so it was stolen, someone else put those anomalous amounts on. Is that what the, is that what the suggestion was?---No, no, before it was - - -

So who did you understand or who did you understand Lorraine Cullinane and Barry Byrnes had decided had spent the 500 and \$400 amounts?

---Barry explained me, he said like how you just explained, the Cabcharge.

Yeah?---That's how he explained me, he said people can - - -

Yeah. Who did it?---Um, ah - - -

Well, put it this way. Mr Goodman wasn't paying back money that someone who'd stolen the card had abused, was he?---He, he, he gave to, to someone he said, one of his friend was using it to pick him up and drop him to hospitals and stuff.

Right?---So whether she used it - - -

10 But that doesn't explain the \$500 amount or the \$400 amount, does it?  
---No.

So he agreed to pay back the use by the friend and the use of the, and the \$500 amount and the \$400 amount, did he? Is that what you understood?  
---I don't understand the question.

All right. There were a couple of times when the Cabcharge was used for \$500 or \$400?---Yes.

20 Right?---Yeah.

Mr Goodman was repaying that money, was he?---He was told to repay it.

Right. So who told him to repay that?---Lorraine.

So Lorraine Cullinane, to your understanding, had spoken to Mr Goodman about this?---Yes.

30 And it had been determined that he had improperly used the Cabcharge?  
---I don't know what was determined but it was decided that he was to pay it back.

Okay. And do you know what the total amount was?---Around 40,000, 50,000 something like that.

How much?---40 to 50,000. I'm not exactly sure.

40 Right. Okay. And so as a result of this use of the Cabcharge, was there any, was there any punishment imposed on Mr Goodman? He had to repay it but he shouldn't have done it in the first place. Was any punishment imposed?  
---I don't remember any punishment he got.

Was it reported to the General Manager?---I, I believe it was.

How do you know that or why do you believe that?---Because when she was on holidays she rang and she was asking if he has paid that amount or not.

Who was asking?---Lara was asking.

Asking who?---I think Gary, I'm not quite sure who, but she did ask - - -

How do you know?--- - - - if he has paid.

How do you know that she asked, who told you that she had asked?---Gary told us in – he told me, Barry and Mark.

And to your knowledge was that amount ever repaid?---I don't know.

10

Was any investigation carried out as to whether the money was stolen and deliberately misused by Mr Goodman?---No, I don't, I don't remember any investigation happened, he was just told to pay it back.

All right. Was Mr Goodman's Cabcharge cancelled because he reported it stolen?---Yes, yeah, he said it was stolen and he sent me an email saying cancel the card.

20

And do you remember when that was?---He sent that email, I don't know when it was.

Was it after he'd been told to repay the money?---Before I think, or around that time.

All right. What role did you have in relation to costing of the invoices?  
---I was putting job numbers on them where it should be costed.

Anything else?---That's it.

30

And who approved the invoices that you knew about with respect to the Business Unit?---I didn't cost Business Unit invoices.

Okay. The invoices that you costed for Council - - -?---Yeah.

- - - who approved those?---Depends which department it belongs to. If it was Finance it's Gary, if it's Development it's the builders, if it's Engineers it's engineer department.

40

All right. Did you create a process for journals?---Ah, yes.

And what was the process that you created? Or firstly before I get to that, was the process that you created put in place?---Yes.

And what was that process?---How to process a journal.

And did, well, what did you say should happen?---I wrote the procedure I think.

Was part of the - - -?---Step by step.

Sorry. And part of that step by step procedure, was that designed to expose potential abuse?---No.

What was it designed to do?---Because Mark Thompson was the only person doing those journals.

10 Right?---There was no backup and Karen wanted someone else or everyone else to know how to do it so if someone's not there we can, someone can process it.

But this was mechanical, was it? I mean it's all just process, it wasn't about risk or corporate governance?---No, it just - - -

Just about data entry effectively, is it?---Yes.

20 All right. Was there – who was – was there any system that would allow a trigger if the same ABN was being used over and over or the same account number was being used over and over across different companies?---I don't know, it's all in creditors so I don't know. I didn't use creditors. I didn't process the invoices.

Right?---Yeah.

Do you know of any system that existed with respect to that?---No.

30 All right. The sort of rumours that you've been telling us about or you – that you say are rumours how do you understand people came to those – form those views or tentative views?---(No Audible Reply)

MR VINEY: I object to that, Commissioner. I think that's a bit outside her scope.

THE WITNESS: I don't know.

THE COMMISSIONER: Well, we don't know.

40 MR THANGARAJ: Well, I don't think so.

THE COMMISSIONER: She may have some information. Perhaps - - -

MR THANGARAJ: I'll put it differently.

THE COMMISSIONER: Put it a different way.

MR THANGARAJ: You've told us Barry Byrnes raising issues, Mr Thompson raising issues, Ms Cullinane raising issues, did you

understand that they raised these issues in part because of the work they were doing themselves, that is, as part of their work they noticed these problems such as the Cabcharge amounts and other problems?---Probably, yeah.

All right. Did you ever see a document prepared by Susan Gannon last year called the Asset Review and Business Improvement Project Report?---I heard she did something like that but I didn't look into it.

10 What did you understand that it was?---Just assets procedure I think.

Was it relevant to your work?---Yes.

And so why didn't you read it?---I wasn't involved at that point.

Well, this was in, this was in June of last year so if she'd written a report to improve areas that included your work why wouldn't you have read it?---I didn't read it. I wasn't involved and I wasn't involved in the year end work as well.

20

I know that but you've agreed that some of what she addressed included work that you did?---Yes.

So did someone give you a summary of the report?---Karen was going to work with me on that.

What do you mean, work with what, recommendations or changes?---Yeah, yes.

30 What did you understand were the problems that had been exposed, if any? ---I don't know any problems. There was problems with I think the lifetime of the assets.

Yeah?---And - - -

Depreciation issues?---Yes.

Yeah. What else?---And I think that some categories were changing for valuation.

40

Yeah. And why didn't, what did Karen Rowe and you plan to do?---We were planning to put a procedure through of what should be done and how should be done.

Okay. Well, the report was in June, you left in September I think you said, or suspended in September, is that right?---October.

October. So in those few months had any progress been made on the report?---No, because they were busy doing end of year stuff.

Until when?--Till - - -

Till you left.---Yeah, they were still doing it.

10 All right. Now, I just want to read out a bit of a phone call and I'll play this to you later if we need to but, it's a call where you were discussing cars and you started off by saying, after you said, "I'm going to do you in." You said, "Where's Lorraine's car, where's the white car?" You told us, when I asked you questions about this before, before I played any tapes, you said her car was charcoal?---No, this is her old car.

Right.---She got a new car, this is a replacement, the charcoal car.

So, why are you asking him where her replacement car is, is that what you're asking him?---Old car, that's the four wheel drive.

20 Okay. You say, "Where's Lorraine's car, where's the white car?" What are you asking?---The same car I'm talking about, the Nissan, the four wheel drive, that was Lorraine's car. Then she got a new car.

And you're asking where the Nissan was?---Yes.

And what, because why, were you concerned that she was driving two cars from Council?---No.

30 Well, what were you concerned about?---I thought Gary had it.

Right. And what did you think he was doing with it?---Just parked in his workshop.

For what, for himself and other people to use?---For himself.

40 Okay. And you said, "Why aren't you going there?" Something's unintelligible, "With Zoran, where's all these cars?" Where were you saying, why aren't you going there, something with Zoran, where's all these cars? What did you mean by that?---Where were you going, sorry?

Why aren't you going, this is the exact going, "Where's Lorraine's car, where's the white car? Why aren't you going there, something, with Zoran, where's all these cars?"---I don't know.

All right. And then you go on and he says it's going to auction on Friday, Mr Goodman says, "It's going to auction on Friday." You say, "Oh really, who organised that?" And he says, "Me." And you say, "You're such a liar, you left the car with him, you got your twenty thousand, now you paid

him twenty thousand and you got your car back.” What were you saying there?---You got your, I - - -

This is the, so the only person that you named and I’m not suggesting this is tied in with what I’ve just read out, it may be, it may not be, that’s why I’m asking you, but you mentioned Zoran and then you said, “You’re such a liar, you left the car with him.” Who’s the him you’re talking about?---Probably Zoran.

10 You got, this is what I’m particularly interested in asking you about, “You got your twenty thousand, now you paid him twenty thousand and you got your car back.” What do you mean by that?---I don't know.

Are you suggesting that Mr Gajic had bought the car at auction and Mr Goodman had bought it off him and that was the car that he was driving before?---May be.

20 But the real sting in what you said is that you got your twenty thousand, are you saying that, were you saying to him that you knew that he got twenty thousand through false invoicing and used that money to buy his old car back from Mr Gajic?---No, I - - -

Well, what were you saying?---I think he was buying was Zoran’s car for twenty thousand.

Yes. Where did Zoran get that car from?---It was his car.

His own car?---Yes.

30 Right. Is that the car that you were telling us before that he’d given to Mr Gajic to pay for some of your renovations?---No, that was a Mazda sports car.

Did you ever invest any money with Mark Thompson?---Yes.

How much?---I think around 15,000.

40 And why were you investing it with him?---He told me about some deal, online investment.

What was that?---He was getting interest for it and I gave him some money to invest for me on behalf of me.

When you say getting a good, what was he – where was he putting the money?---It was some kind of online bank, I think.

It was with a bank, was it?---Yes.

Was it a deposit, a term deposit or a savings account or something was it?---  
Some kind of deposit, yes.

Well, why couldn't you just put the money in yourself?---I didn't know  
much about them. That's when I came out of my divorce and I never had a  
single account in my own name when I was married. And I had not much  
knowledge and he was telling me, I said "Can you do it for me"?

10 Sorry, you said, can you do it for him, can he do it for you?---Yeah.

Right. And you think you gave him 15,000?---Yes.

And was that repaid?---Yes.

With interest or just 15,000?---He paid me some interest and plus I paid him  
the tax he, was applicable on it.

Because it went in under his name, did it?---Yes.

20 All right. Nothing further.

THE COMMISSIONER: Ms Mishra, over this period of time that you  
worked at Council what was your salary per annum?---When I started it  
was, I'm just saying approximate, maybe 60 or 65, something like that and  
with CPI increases, and we had some pay rises back in 1990s. And now,  
before I left it was 72, 73,000.

So you were receiving approximately \$900 a week - - -?---Yes.

30 - - - after tax, were you?---Yes.

And apart from the property that you purchased with Mr Goodman off the  
plan, and your home at Earlwood, and I think you said about \$1,000 worth  
of shares that you jointly had with Mr Goodman, did you have any other  
assets?---Yes.

What were they?---I have in Brisbane, a townhouse.

40 One in Brisbane. What was that?---A townhouse.

Was that an investment property?---Yes.

And was that leased out to someone, was it?---Yes.

Anything else?---Another one through super account in Melbourne.

You mean there was, what that was a, a unit in Melbourne, was it?---Yeah.  
Self-managed super fund.

That was purchased through your own super fund?---Yes.

Anything else?---I was in the process of buying off the plan in Canberra, which I had to pay the deposit, 10 per cent deposit.

When you say in the process, did you complete that purchase?---I completed the 10 per cent deposit.

10 And when did you do that?---I think in November or December last year.

And was that just one property in Canberra or more than one property?---Two.

Two?---Two units.

Two units?---Yes.

20 And were they rented out?---No, they're off the plan, they're not ready, yeah.

I see. So you still stand to complete that settlement, do you?---Yes.

Any other assets, any other shares?---I have shares.

And what would be the approximate value of your share portfolio?---40,000.

30 And that's in your own name, that's not jointly with Mr Goodman?---It's in my name.

Anything else?---That's about it.

So taking into account your various investments and your home at Earlwood, what kind of payments were you making on a weekly or monthly basis in relation to those investments?---The Brisbane is kind of paying itself because of the rent. Our house repayment is \$432 a week.

THE COMMISSIONER: So that's 1,600 a month approximately?---Mmm.

40 And the others?---Canberra is probably \$60 a month. Anything else?---That's it.

So what would be your monthly outgoings on your investments. This is before you have to pay for any utilities or anything of that nature?---I haven't got the sums.

Well, you get about \$900 a week or you did get about \$900 a week paid into your bank account for your wage. How much of that was dedicated to

payment on your investments and your mortgage?---The investment mortgage wouldn't have been much because it had rent coming in, rent income.

Yes. I'm just interested in the total figure. How much was dedicated to the payment of interest on your investments and your mortgage?---16, probably \$1,600 a month.

Probably \$1,600 a month?---Yeah.

10

It wasn't anything like 3,000 a month was it?---No.

No?---No.

Sure about that?---I have to check. I don't remember.

So apart from giving you \$200 a week and paying your phone bill were there any other bills that Mr Goodman was paying on your behalf?---No, I don't remember.

20

Did he pay for your health insurance?---It was active for a few months and then it wasn't active.

What does that mean?---The card was – he made payments and he got something done for himself and then it was an active card, membership, active membership.

What, you mean he was on your health insurance?---He included me on it.

30 What, on his health insurance?---Yes.

So you were included - - -?---It was only for a short time.

You were included on his what, private health insurance for some period of time?---Yes.

And did you otherwise have private health insurance?---I had previously, yes, and then I cancelled it.

40 I note the time. I suppose people have to some questions of Ms Mishra so I think if we take a luncheon adjournment and resume at quarter to 2.00 and then we'll take the further questions. Thank you.

**LUNCHEON ADJOURNMENT**

**[12.42pm]**