

INDEPENDENT COMMISSION AGAINST CORRUPTION

**RECORD OF INTERVIEW BETWEEN INVESTIGATOR KATE SOUTHAM,
SENIOR LAWYER ANTHONY BAINE, COUNSEL ASSISTING ZELIE HEGER
AND STEPHEN CHAN ON 7 SEPTEMBER 2022**

5

TIME: 14.45PM

10 SOUTHAM: So just for the purposes of the recording it's the 7th of September 2022 and the time is now 2.45 pm. Present in the room is Anthony Baine, Senior Lawyer with the Commission. Kate Southam, Investigator with the Independent Commission Against Corruption and a translator Stephen Chan.

CHAN: Yes.

15 SOUTHAM: And also attending remotely is Zelie Heger, Counsel Assisting for Operation Galley. Mr Chan, can I just confirm your consent to be recorded today for the purposes of this meeting?

CHAN: Yes, I give consent.

SOUTHAM: Thank you. Sorry Zelie, keep going.

20 HEGER: That's alright, thank you Kate. So do you have a copy of the text messages in front of you?

SOUTHAM: Anthony? It's probably that set.

BAINE: Yeah.

SOUTHAM: Yes.

25 HEGER: Alright so you can see there's a series of WeChat messages here. Eh, under the column content. It has the text of the messages. Can you see that column?

CHAN: Yes, I can see that column.

30 HEGER: And you see it says body and then it has some Chinese characters underneath?

CHAN: Um, yes I can see the word body and the Chinese characters below it.

HEGER: Yeah so can I start by asking you, I understand there's a difference between simple Chinese characters and traditional Chinese characters. Is that right?

CHAN: That is correct.

35 HEGER: And with what sort of characters do you see here?

CHAN: Eh, if I just look at the first line of the Chinese characters below body, um, the – the – the text here is the printed in simplified Chinese characters.

HEGER: Alright and is that the same when you come to message 5 on the next page? Is that also simple Chinese characters?

5 CHAN: Message 5, yes, the - the line of Chinese characters under body they are simplified Chinese characters.

HEGER: Okay, alright, what I'm going to do is start with message number 3 which you can see is a person called Phillip sending a message to a person called John Yuen. Do you see those names on the third and four column?

10 CHAN: So, yes.

HEGER: And what's been sent is a photograph. Now if you just flick to, I think the last page in your bundle there, it will be a blown up version of that photograph.

CHAN: Mm hm.

15 HEGER: So that's going to provide some context.

CHAN: That's the page?

HEGER: That's – that's it. So that's going to provide some context for the messages that follow.

CHAN: Mm hm.

20 HEGER: Eh, message number 4, could you translate those Chinese characters for us now? So this is a message in response to the last message. So this is now from John Yuen to Phillip. Do you see that?

CHAN: Yep. So the first glance of the Chinese characters, there are four Chinese characters that form that phrase or sentence, whatever.

25 HEGER: Yeah.

CHAN: It's ready to give to me, already to be given to me.

HEGER: Okay.

CHAN: Or ready for giving to me.

HEGER: Okay. Alright and then the next message, number 5 comes about 17 minutes later from Phillip back to John Yuen.

30 CHAN: Mm.

HEGER: Can you translate that message for us?

CHAN: This one will be a little bit complicated because there are three Chinese characters there and the – after the first Chinese character there's a full stop.

35

HEGER: Yep.

CHAN: So, um, that single Chinese characters itself, literally, we need fat, F A T
5 it means music, happy but the two words together when joined together
usually it means Chinese music or it can be – it can be a name. When the
two joined together can – can be a name or can mean Chinese music.

HEGER: Um, now –

CHAN: Put it this way for – for Chinese characters – whenever Chinese characters
10 join together if people say that they are name, then it would be hard to, um,
to argue because any – any Chinese characters when joined together can
be used as a name.

HEGER: Okay.

CHAN: But to me when I look at these two Chinese characters in here I would
15 think that it would mean maybe Chinese music. Chinese music.

HEGER: Alright. You said the first character means China – Chinese or middle, is
that right?

CHAN: No, the first character, oh sorry you mean the second?

HEGER: In this, the second sentence.

CHAN: The second, yeah, yeah, um, the first Chinese characters on the left means
20 Chinese or middle.

HEGER: Alright, so you've seen that character used in other context to mean the
word Chinese?

CHAN: By itself it's not, if you just put that Chinese characters by itself alone –

HEGER: Mm.

CHAN: - there would not be conclusion to be drawn what it really means.

HEGER: Mm.

CHAN: Because for Chinese or China it would have to have another Chinese
character to follow.

HEGER: Yeah.

CHAN: But this –

HEGER: So if you were just saying China you would need more characters to make
the word China, correct?

CHAN: Correct, yeah and for Chinese whether it's Chinese – Chinese as a person
35 or Chinese as a language it also requires another Chinese characters to
follow it.

HEGER: Mm hm. Mm hm but does it make sense to use it to describe Chinese music, to describe music as Chinese? Does that make sense to you?

5 CHAN: Um, this word here is not used to describe the music as Chinese but the two joined together is usually how people would call Chinese music. Um –

HEGER: Mm hm.

CHAN: Um –

HEGER: Alright well it's –

10 CHAN: When, um, no it's – it's a little bit also confusing here when I think a little bit more because for Chinese music it's – for the two was here to – to mean Chinese music there must be something discussed before or talk before and then we come up with this two – actually this iscreated for Chinese music. This – they stand for Chinese music.

15 HEGER: Well my next question was going to be does that answer make sense in context because the previous message seems to be asking, according to your translation, ready to be given to me which may be a reference to the money in the photograph. Do you accept that?

CHAN: Mm.

20 HEGER: Could – could – on your translation could the previous message be asking about the money in the photograph?

CHAN: Um, it looks like that the question is a continuation of the previous diagram or picture that in response to that picture, yeah.

HEGER: Yeah, so your understanding is that that message is saying, is that money ready to be given to me?

25 CHAN: Correct.

HEGER: Okay and so then if message 5 is a response to that question it doesn't make a lot of sense to be talking about Chinese music, does it?

CHAN: No it doesn't.

30 HEGER: Mm, alright, eh, and then if you look at the message number 6. Could you translate that for us?

CHAN: Um, you already have another or you have another already or you have had another already. In Chinese there is no tense. You have to judge them from the text itself to – to tell the tense whether it's present tense, past tense or perfect tense but here is you have another already or you already have another or you have had another already or you already – you had – you already had – had another.

35 HEGER: Okay and –

CHAN: And there should be a question, this – without – without punctuation there, without a question mark or a comma, here it seems to be a statement but it looks like a question or to me I'm not sure whether that's a statement or that is a question.

5 HEGER: You're talking about message number 6?

CHAN: Correct.

HEGER: Okay, so do you read number 6 as saying, and I understand that this is getting beyond the literal meaning, no this money is for somebody else. You have some other money coming or available to you?

10 CHAN: If it refers to money because it doesn't, um, um, have an object there.

HEGER: Okay.

CHAN: So if – if the object the – the – the hidden object which has not been written there, is money. Then it would be money. Um, yeah you – you – you have – yeah I agree to what you said, if that is money.

15 HEGER: Okay, um now going to show you another document which is a letter.

CHAN: Can I – can I - because I just quick – had a quick glance in message 7.

HEGER: Yeah.

CHAN: In message 7, the Chinese there say that please notify the fat guy or a person. This – this – this Chinese characters is joined together with another Chinese character meaning guy or fellow.

20 HEGER: Yeah.

CHAN: So two together would mean a fat person or fat guy.

HEGER: Yeah.

CHAN: I'm not sure whether this fat is the same as the one used in message 5.

25 HEGER: Sure.

CHAN: But there word fellow or guy was missing there.

HEGER: Yeah okay. So yeah I can see the character from message 5, the first character in message 5 is the fourth character in message 7. Is that right?

CHAN: Mm hm.

30 HEGER: And then does the character for guy follow the character?

CHAN: It's the one on the right next to the – next to that – to that word meaning fat.

HEGER: Yeah. Followed by the full stop?

CHAN: Mm hm.

HEGER: Okay, alright, so could it – could both message 5 and message 7 be referring to a person known as fat?

CHAN: Eh, possibly, it's possible.

5 HEGER: Mm. Is another translation of that character for, that you've described as fat, chubby? Is chubby an alternative translation?

CHAN: Yeah, yeah, yeah, yeah.

HEGER: Okay. I might –

CHAN: It's more or less describe the figure of the person.

10 HEGER: Yeah, I'll ask you about message number 8 as well then. Could you translate that for us.

CHAN: Okay in message 8 the first line, the first two Chinese characters, they are the same as the two characters we talk about in message 5, the Chinese music.

HEGER: Are they, are they though? The second character looks a little bit different?

15 CHAN: Oh hang on. Yeah, sorry, my mistake. My apologies, yeah, yeah.

HEGER: But they are quite similar aren't they, those two characters?

CHAN: Yes, they are quite similar but they mean two – two different things.

HEGER: Yep.

20 CHAN: That's the problem with the simplified Chinese chara – Chinese characters or Chinese words, yeah.

HEGER: Yeah. Can I ask you before you go any further, if you were – do you have experience writing simple Chinese on a mobile phone?

CHAN: Yes I do.

HEGER: And would that be an easy –

25 CHAN: Good question. Yeah, I think -

HEGER: - mistake – an easy mistake to make using that character in five – that character in five instead of the character in 8? Would that be an easy mistake to make?

CHAN: Yes.

30 HEGER: On a phone?

CHAN: And it's easy to make mistake like that. actually when we type the Chinese characters on the mobile phone or on – on computer, we can do it in two – two different way or by two different – by three different methods. Actually three. One is verbal and then you would convert the verbal language into text.

35

HEGER: Mm.

CHAN: Um, and then the second is to chose from the – from the English alphabet the – the sound that is called pinyin. P I N Y I N (spells). You chose it and then – then it would give you the Chinese character to choose. It would give you a series of Chinese characters with that sound.

5

HEGER: Mm.

CHAN: Because once one – one sound may give you sometimes maybe 10, 20 similar sounds of Chinese characters and then you just chose one and then the third method is you write it on the – on the mobile phone or on the computer. On – on a pad and then it would – it would get the Chinese characters of what you have written, put in the text.

10

HEGER: Mm.

CHAN: So if – in this case I think the verbal would not be likely used – be used here because if it is verbal it would convert to – oh hang on if it is verbal there’s still also a chance that there may be a mis – chosen or the word – because when – when you say the word it will give you a number of words and then you chose the one and because this too looks so similar therefore he may pick the wrong one. Click the wrong one.

15

HEGER: As in the wrong one in message number 5?

CHAN: Number 5 or number 7 whichever – number 8.

20

HEGER: Yeah okay.

CHAN: Okay and – and then if the person write – it would – after you write it, it also gives you a series of words to chose and then you may chose the wrong one because they look similar. Just what – what happened to me. I thought they were the same Chinese characters.

25

HEGER: Yeah, no I can tell you that other people have made the same mistakes. So it happens. Alright so could you then translate the first couple of sentences in message 8?

CHAN: Okay, message 8. Middle east, the two Chinese characters means middle east.

30

HEGER: Those are the first two Chinese characters?

CHAN: Yeah.

HEGER: Middle East?

CHAN: Yeah, yeah, suddenly and then it said two weeks ago or two weeks prior.

35

HEGER: Mm hm.

CHAN: Full stop.

HEGER: Full stop, okay.

CHAN: Request or demand.

HEGER: Alright and then two full stops?

CHAN: Two full stops.

HEGER: Okay.

5 CHAN: And then – it’s because the first two words is – is because –

HEGER: Mm hm.

CHAN: Then it can not be translated according to the order of the Chinese characters. Well it means it’s because it will be – it will – it will be all finished then – it would – it is because – it is because it will – it will – Well I’ll do the first attempt first here. It is because for the last time it will all be finished. Well the second is – it is because it will be all finished for the last time.

10 HEGER: Mm hm.

CHAN: Or it is because there will be finished at once at the end.

15 HEGER: Mm hm.

CHAN: That is – we’ll all be finished all at once at the end.

HEGER: Mm hm.

CHAN: Yeah that’s what I can think of.

HEGER: Sure. Alright keep – keep going for the rest of that message?

20 CHAN: And then the next four Chinese characters is, the first Chinese character is but or however. That female. The second and the third characters together means that and the fourth Chinese characters is female.

HEGER: Mm hm.

CHAN: Or female person or female or lady or woman or girl. Full stop. Has or has or – hang on because there’s no tense I have to make the best judgment here for – but that female had got a group of people to rebel or post.

25 HEGER: Hm?

CHAN: To hit back or anything that is the opposite.

HEGER: Yep.

30 CHAN: Because the last word of that phrase, the second phrase the second line by itself, it just mean turn over.

HEGER: Okay.

CHAN: Or oppose or object.

HEGER: Yep.

CHAN: And then the three full stop. After the three full stop the first three characters means a last week and then the two Chinese characters following that means a big battle.

5 HEGER: Mm hm.

CHAN: A big war. Big fight. It could also mean big argument. Now it depends on what's – what's been referred to.

HEGER: Yep.

10 CHAN: Anyway it's referring to something in conflict - a big conflict between something.

HEGER: Okay.

CHAN: And then full stop and the middle east.

HEGER: Mm hm.

15 CHAN: And then that fat fat. I think this fat fat will – will be the – the – the one in message five. Fat fat is a person. This will be – it's a nickname of a person. Fat Fat or Fatty.

HEGER: Okay. So I noticed in message number 5 you just have the one Chinese character?

CHAN: Yeah.

20 HEGER: For Fat but in message number 8 you have Fat Fat. Two Chinese characters for Fat.

CHAN: Yes.

HEGER: Followed by another character. Is that character one guy?

25 CHAN: That character is that he would fight to death – he would do whatever to death.

HEGER: Oh okay so there's no guy here. It just says Fat Fat?

CHAN: Oh no, no, Fat Fat is just like easy. It's for easy – easy talking like a fatty. Oh that – that Fatty.

HEGER: Okay.

30 CHAN: Like – like to call a person that – that – like what you – the word used chubby.

HEGER: Chubby?

CHAN: Yeah, person or this together when these two together is definitely referred to a nickname of a person.

HEGER: Okay but you think that could be the same person referred to in five, even though five has one fat and eight has two fats?

5 CHAN: Yes, correct. I think this – this two may be referring to the – maybe referring to the same – same – same thing, same person but in the first in message five I think because it's understood therefor the person would type the message or to tell the message to be typed, just do it simple way. Just call it one.

HEGER: Mm.

CHAN: The sound of this word is Fay Fay.

10 HEGER: Okay.

CHAN: And then four full stop.

HEGER: So – sorry it says –

CHAN: Go back to message eight.

HEGER: For what?

15 CHAN: Can we go back to message 8?

HEGER: Yes.

CHAN: Okay, after – after the four full stop I think, um, the first character after the first full stop was a mistyped word but it mean yesterday but is – is – is chosen the wrong word. The first two characters, after the first – after the four full stop means yesterday and then the next two Chinese character they're not – they are not the mistyped word. Is the fourth. This one is newspaper. I believe it's newspaper but – but the word, the second word of that two words it means son. As father son but that word I think is a mistake. It's a mistyped word.

20 CHAN: Okay, after – after the four full stop I think, um, the first character after the first full stop was a mistyped word but it mean yesterday but is – is – is chosen the wrong word. The first two characters, after the first – after the four full stop means yesterday and then the next two Chinese character they're not – they are not the mistyped word. Is the fourth. This one is newspaper. I believe it's newspaper but – but the word, the second word of that two words it means son. As father son but that word I think is a mistake. It's a mistyped word.

25 HEGER: Okay.

CHAN: So here it means yesterday in the newspaper. It has a large paragraph of – it has the last paragraph that published, that has been published or that has used a large section of the newspaper report, reporting the matter or something has been reported with a large section in the newspaper.

30 HEGER: Okay. Message 8 refers to Middle East twice.

CHAN: Mm.

HEGER: Do you think that's referring to a person?

CHAN: It can – it can be referred to a person. It can be referred to the actual geographic location of – of some countries or of – or places that is in Middle East but here it can be a nickname of a person. This person with this nickname could be a Middle East person or is a person who look like a Middle Eastern person or this person has got that features.

35 CHAN: It can – it can be referred to a person. It can be referred to the actual geographic location of – of some countries or of – or places that is in Middle East but here it can be a nickname of a person. This person with this nickname could be a Middle East person or is a person who look like a Middle Eastern person or this person has got that features.

HEGER: Yeah. Okay well I can – I can tell you the person who wrote this message, Phillip does know two people who he nicknames Middle East and Chubby.

CHAN: Alright.

5 HEGER: For context. Um, alright so I appreciate message 8 comes about a week after the other messages so you'll see that 2nd of August and the other messages were 25 July. Um, but now that you've seen message number 8 does that affect, eh, your interpretation or understanding of message number 5?

10 CHAN: Alright, so after this and with the knowledge that I just learn, probably in message five is referring to two people. Um, when I say two people is, I assume that the word for the Chinese music, the Chinese characters has been chosen by mistake.

HEGER: Okay.

15 CHAN: Actually, maybe that word because the same mistake was made by me when I first read it. So it's easy if I use my phone, I could have chosen the wrong word from – from my experience.

HEGER: Okay and so just to be clear it's the last character in message number 5 that you think could be a mistake?

CHAN: Correct.

20 HEGER: And –

CHAN: It – it – it that is – there's a chance that it's a mistake.

HEGER: Okay and so you think they may have intended to write something else being –

CHAN: Go on.

25 HEGER: What is your best guess as to what they intended to write?

CHAN: Ok sure. Yeah I think in message 5, the first Chinese characters it – it's got two – the author originally make, might meant - mean to type two Chinese characters that is the same character to refer to a person by that nickname, Fat Fat and then for the second phrase, the second Chinese characters of the second phrase with two Chinese words also may have been chose incorrectly. In – instead of choosing this word happy or music it should have chosen the word East.

30 HEGER: Okay. Alright, now we've had a suggestion that there's an alternative interpretation of message number 5 and I'm just going to ask you about that. I'll show you a letter that we've been sent that puts forward a different interpretation.

35 CHAN: 11.

SOUTHAM: After 11.

HEGER: Yeah, read that – that paragraph.

SOUTHAM: It refers to message number 5.

HEGER: So just for the transcript this is a paragraph that starts, “I attach the telephone transcript” and ends with the words, “should confirm that to be the case” and it’s a letter dated 18 August 2022 from Mr Patterson.

5 CHAN: What does it mean? I don’t understand what it means.

HEGER: Alright, well this person, well first of all for context if you have a look at the photograph, the large photograph that we’ve provided to you. This is a photograph that was sent in the – in the text message the same day.

10 CHAN: Mm hm, mm hm.

HEGER: You’ll see in the background there’s some statues.

CHAN: Yeah Buddha.

HEGER: Some Buddha statues.

CHAN: Mm hm.

15 HEGER: And so what’s being suggested is that in message number 5 the person wrote China happy and what they were intending to convey was Fat Happy Chinese Buddha by reference to the Buddha in the background.

CHAN: Mm.

HEGER: Now –

20 CHAN: So –

HEGER: - you want to comment on – on that and whether it’s a plausible interpretation? Starting first with the proposition that the Chinese symbols mean China Happy.

SOUTHAM: In message 5.

25 CHAN: Yeah I know that but –

HEGER: Do – do you – do you agree that’s a interpretation?

CHAN: Nobody would say China Chinese or China Happy like that, no. I do not agree.

HEGER: Alright, okay, and when you take the two symbols together with the – the photograph of the Buddha.

30 CHAN: Mm hm.

HEGER: Do you think it’s plausible that the author of the message was intending refer to refer to a Fat Happy Chinese Buddha?

CHAN: In my opinion no I don’t agree.

HEGER: Alright, and why do you say that?

CHAN: That's not the way how we would – we would – we would say the – that statue, the Buddha is weird. It's – it's just not the way for us to – to – because if - if the person – the author really wants to – to say something with reference to the Buddha statue then the word Buddha should have been typed all included. Not just part of Chinese or part – not – because now the – the – the Chinese character here is (UNDECIPHERABLE). Doesn't refer to Buddha because Buddha is not from China. Buddha is from India originally. My – from my knowledge so you can't just use the (FOREIGN) or through – or even China to refer to Buddha. It's – it's weird. It's not – it's not how it's refer or described.

5

HEGER: Alright, accepting that he hasn't used the word Buddha could those symbols still be trying to convey a happy Chinese something and then when you read it together with the picture in the background –

10

CHAN: The, um –

HEGER: - the Buddha.

CHAN: The two Chinese characters in the second phrase of message 5, although it will break – break the two – break down the two Chinese characters into each individual Chinese character or symbol, whatever you call it, the first one means middle and the second one means music or happy but when you join the two together the chance for it to be referred to Chinese music is more than the chance for it to be referred to as China Buddha or Chinese Buddha because our – the word Buddha is – its not indicated. It's nothing. Even if you – you have a picture there and then you ask people to just to refer this two Chinese characters and you point at the Buddha is happy and ask the person whether this two – it's talking about this Buddha. I don't think you would get a yes answer.

15

HEGER: Okay. Are you able to answer this question, could those two characters both be adjectives or does one of them have to be a noun and the reason I'm asking that question is could those two characters convey a happy Chinese with a noun not expressed or does one of them have be a noun? Does that make sense what I'm asking you?

20

CHAN: Mm, the – that two Chinese characters, it – it – if anyone says that this two Chinese characters means Chinese happy I would think – I would tend to think that this is a new invention of a description for – for children to learn if they are – they are starting to learn Chinese language. The – this two – unless previously they have a conversation, they're talking about something like this but still not – not right to – to use these words to represent China happy or Chinese happy.

25

HEGER: Yeah and I suppose makes even less sense in the context where the previous message on one view is asking is that money for me. The logical response to that question is to identify the people that it is going to be given to.

30

CHAN: Mm, the – that two Chinese characters, it – it – if anyone says that this two Chinese characters means Chinese happy I would think – I would tend to think that this is a new invention of a description for – for children to learn if they are – they are starting to learn Chinese language. The – this two – unless previously they have a conversation, they're talking about something like this but still not – not right to – to use these words to represent China happy or Chinese happy.

35

HEGER: Yeah and I suppose makes even less sense in the context where the previous message on one view is asking is that money for me. The logical response to that question is to identify the people that it is going to be given to.

40

CHAN: Yes, even without that, for this to stand alone I would not agree to, um, to the, um, to the usage of these two Chinese characters for describing Chinese happy or China happy.

5 HEGER: Okay. Alright, and when the letter says “I’m informed that the mistranslation may have been caused by the app on Mr Uy’s phone which utilises simplified Chinese script.” Do you understand that?

CHAN: First of all I do not know what apps is referring to.

HEGER: Yep.

10 CHAN: And, um, and as I said earlier, there are different ways of putting Chinese text into computer. Whether there is a laptop or a desktop or to a mobile phone. As you said, in words, that it would be converted or you type it to choose from the pinyin P-I-N-Y-I-N pinyin or you write. Do you want me to show you so that you know? Or you know it already?

HEGER: Um, no. I don’t know that.

15 CHAN: Okay um maybe I show it to you.

HEGER: Okay.

CHAN: Now this is the, uh...

BAINE: Could I ask, maybe, do you mind standing here so that um, I’m holding your phone up to the screen.

20 CHAN: Okay. Do you mind me using the conversation between us, the...

SOUTHAM: That’s fine. Just fine.

CHAN: Okay. Where?

BAINE: Ah, just here so that the camera can pick it up.

CHAN: Now this is the um...

25 BAIN: Sorry you might have to hold it up a little closer.

HEGER: That’s great thankyou.

CHAN: Too close is it?

SOUTHAM: No, no, no that was better.

HEGER: That’s fine.

30 CHAN: Okay. Now I’m going to change that to...now you notice at the bottom I have selected this text is going to be typed in Chinese traditional.

HEGER: Yep.

BAINE: Sorry Stephen you might have to stand a little bit closer.

CHAN: Okay. And I can...

SOUTHAM: The camera is where that big eye thing is, so if you could just aim it...

CHAN: Oh. I have shifted that traditional Chinese into simplified Chinese.

HEGER: Can you hold it a little bit closer, the camera is re-focused. Yep. Okay.

5 CHAN: Now I'll shift it back to traditional Chinese for you to have a look.

SOUTHAM: That's better, isn't it?

CHAN: Okay.

HEGER: Yep.

10 CHAN: But they all consist of four Chinese characters there. It's called traditional Chinese, uh, this one is simplified Chinese. This one is traditional Chinese and then in brackets it said Hong Kong.

HEGER: Okay.

CHAN: Traditional Chinese there are two major places that are still using traditional Chinese. One is Taiwan, one is Hong Kong.

15 HEGER: Okay.

CHAN: The characters themselves would be almost the same except some colloquial. If we choose to, traditional Chinese Hong Kong then we can, we can use some colloquial expressions, expression words that would not appear in the traditional Chinese Taiwan.

20 HEGER: Okay.

CHAN: Okay.

HEGER: So, when this letter says, as the Hong Kong, Mr Yu typically classically traditional Chinese script, that's right on your understanding that people use traditional?

25 CHAN: Because this one, because the words that I have seen um, simplified Chinese.

HEGER: Yes, yes.

CHAN: And it's those simplified Chinese Hong Kong.

HEGER: Yeah. But, but on your understanding it's right to say that Hong Kong is generally used traditional?

30 CHAN: Hong Kong, yes, yes, before they handover, traditional is, they use traditional. And after they handover gradually people tend to use simplified because easier, easier to write.

HEGER: Okay.

CHAN: Okay. Now, I'm now going to choose a word, for example Zhong. I'm not sure if you can see the word [spells] Z-H-O-N-G here?

HEGER: Yes.

CHAN: And then below it, it gives me a series of Chinese characters.

5 HEGER: Okay. Then we, we pick, we, we choose one of them. If the, if the, the word, the Chinese characters doesn't appear here then we may get more.

SOUTHAM: Just up a little bit.

HEGER: Okay.

10 CHAN: You see all these have the same sound as [spells] Z-H-O-N-G and then you choose one.

HEGER: All right. And so, if you choose, if you choose the symbol that appears here in message number 5 for Zhong, does it come up with suggested symbol to follow that? Is it, is there like predictive text function or?

CHAN: Yes, yes, yes, yes. This is a good question, it does.

15 HEGER: An what the options we have?

CHAN: If I had chosen, for example I type [spells] Z-H-O-N-G meaning, middle –

HEGER: Hmm.

20 CHAN: I chose Zhong here and then it will give another series of Chinese characters that maybe used to, to, to go after it, without me typing any, anything.

HEGER: Yeah.

CHAN: And from here it said China, Chinese in the middle, midday.

HEGER: Hmm.

25 CHAN: And loyal.

HEGER: Hmm.

CHAN: With China, in the middle, central. Chinese Communist, (unintelligible).

HEGER: It's Middle East then?

CHAN: And, and Middle East.

30 HEGER: Okay.

CHAN: And yeah – I'm trying to look for the middle or Chinese music, maybe it's somewhere down there.

HEGER: Hmm. Or perhaps not if it's not a common expression.

CHAN: That's correct, yep.

HEGER: Okay. All right but the, how, how would an error arise choosing between East and happy? How would that work in practice? Did you say it's the same sound or not?

5 CHAN: No. Different.

HEGER: Different.

CHAN: In Cantonese I'm not sure whether this person speak Cantonese or Mandarin.

HEGER: All right, speak in Cantonese.

10 CHAN: Whether this person's Cantonese, (unintelligible) is Lok, or Lok, Lok, [spells] L-O-K.

HEGER: Ah-hmm.

CHAN: Or [spells] L-O-K, Lok. In Mandarin it's Yue, [spells] Y-U-E. This is Lok, this is for the Chinese music. And then for Middle East the, the word 'East', in Cantonese it's Tong, [spells] T-O, argh Tong, [spells] T-O-N-G. In Mandarin it's Dong, almost the same, [spells] D-O-N-G. So, the sound are different.

15 HEGER: Hmm.

CHAN: Um.

20 HEGER: Sow how could that error arise? Can you talk, step me through that, how somebody who was intending to write 'East', could accidentally write a symbol for 'happy'?

CHAN: Um – is when the person type, sorry when the person writes in the, let me, let me try to write something here?

25 SOUTHAM: Maybe if you could show her that.

CHAN: Yeah, I'll, I'll try to see if I can get this word first. I see how it's written.

SOUTHAM: I'm just going to zoom up again.

HEGER: Thanks.

CHAN: Adjust the (unintelligible), middle of the camera.

30 SOUTHAM: (Unintelligible) looks too far. We do like (unintelligible).

CHAN: Now I have written the, in the middle bar Dong East.

HEGER: Ah-hmm.

CHAN: And then below you can see two lines of Chinese characters.

HEGER: Yeah.

CHAN: Can you see the music, the Chinese character music up here, one of them?

HEGER: Argh.

CHAN: You can't tell?

HEGER: I can't tell.

5 CHAN: No. How about I show Kate and then Kate show you?

SOUTHAM: Yeah, yeah if you could, that'll be good. Actually if you could start by when you wrote the thing and I –

CHAN: Yeah I, I do it on my (unintelligible) and then send it to you.

10 SOUTHAM: Yeah, or I can film you writing in the letter and then you can wait till – if it's, if you just, and then I'll send it to (inaudible).

CHAN: Okay, now I'll tell you what, this is East and this is music or happy.

SOUTHAM: Could you just point them out again, sorry it's just the light is a little bit.

CHAN: This is East.

SOUTHAM: Ah-hmm.

15 CHAN: And this is happy or music.

SOUTHAM: Ah-hmm.

CHAN: And I only, I only typed East, so it come up with different choices.

SOUTHAM: Okay. And before when you were drawing the symbols, does -

CHAN: Yeah I could draw this one. I'm sorry. I need to go 'cause.

20 SOUTHAM: Yeah, that's okay, we can (unintelligible).

CHAN: Depends on how he write, that's why.

SOUTHAM: (Inaudible)

CHAN: (Unintelligible). I, used, this time the only, only music or, only music, or, or, or happy come up. That stroke, if the person who wrote it, if that stroke doesn't go up above the, the first horizontal line then only happy will come up.

25 SOUTHAM: Ah-hmm.

CHAN: Then he would just choose that one.

HEGER: Can I ask, when you were drawing then were you draw, trying to draw the symbol for East or for happy?

30 CHAN: I tried to draw for um to East but very often the, I didn't scratch the line long enough –

HEGER: Hmm.

CHAN: - and happy would come up.

HEGER: Okay. So that's how the mistake could be made. If you were drawing the symbol and you didn't draw it quite properly, the phone could come up with happy instead of East?

5 CHAN: Yeah, correct. And then the poor, the person for, for (unintelligible) reason or other reason, doesn't bother to go back in again –

HEGER: Yeah.

CHAN: - that's one. Two is the person was well aware that this was a, a different word, or this, this word was wrong.

10 HEGER: They might not have known if the wrong symbol came up and those the symbol thinking it was East, is that what you're saying?

CHAN: Yeah, yeah, yeah.

HEGER: Just (inaudible) confuse the two symbols before when you were looking at them.

15 CHAN: Yeah, yeah.

HEGER: Because they're similar, okay.

CHAN: Yeah. I think my mistake was a very good demonstration.

HEGER: Yeah. Yeah, okay.

20 SOUTHAM: I've just (inaudible) the video.

HEGER: Thank you.

BAINE: Do you want to ask for screen shot? Zelig would you mind taking a screen shot of that (unintelligible), and sending it to Kate?

CHAN: Yeah, the, the –

25 SOUTHAM: I, I can get the screen shot off the video.

BAINE: All right that's (inaudible)

HEGER: All right, so I understand how the error could be made if you were drawing, but could it be made if you were typing?

CHAN: Type?

30 HEGER: Or, or I just, is there another way the error could made other than through drawing?

CHAN: That's why I said most likely the mistake was arising when the person was writing. Because that, for me I don't, I don't write.

HEGER: Okay.

CHAN: Only for my wife, when she write, when she used to, in her text, then she likes to write and she often (unintelligible) me speak.

HEGER: Okay.

5 CHAN: But people will understand if, if you, if they are, they have talking about something then even a few words have been incorrectly chosen, they would still understand, just like English text.

HEGER: Hmm. Okay.

10 CHAN: But I'm not sure whether this is the reason why this, but what I think is most likely –

HEGER: Okay.

CHAN: - that a chance for that to have happened is when the person spoke the words, oh sorry when the person type, instead of –

HEGER: You mean write?

15 CHAN: - the person write instead of speaking, speaking to the phone and let the phone get the word.

HEGER: And you say that because the sound, the sound for happy –

CHAN: Different, different.

HEGER: - the sound for East are too different sounds?

20 CHAN: Too different. Correct.

HEGER: Error can't happen that way, yeah okay.

SOUTHAM: Did you say before that there was three different ways that people write or, or can send messages? So there's the handwriting –

CHAN: Handwriting.

25 SOUTHAM: - so it's the same word and that it gives you the symbols –

CHAN: Yes.

SOUTHAM: - those characters?

CHAN: Yeah.

SOUTHAM: What's the third?

30 BAINE: Was it in dictation?

SOUTHAM: Yeah.

CHAN: Dictation done for, for the, for that to be converted by the system itself.

SOUTHAM: And that's based on speaking?

CHAN: That's based on speaking. When that, I think that, I'm not sure whether, I don't think that's available in WhatsApp yet but it's always used by Chinese speaking people when they use WeChat.

5 HEGER: Yeah so these are WeChat message.

CHAN: Yeah. But for WeChat, if they use verbal and that verbal is converted to Chinese then both would appear in the record. That, that is the, the conversation would be recorded and then the, the, the translation from the conversion would be, would also appear.

10 HEGER: I'm sorry I don't understand that. Can you explain that again?

CHAN: So if, if a person speak to WeChat, actually I don't how to, how to operate it –

HEGER: Okay.

CHAN: - I don't use it. But I, I translate it a lot for, for some of the law firms because of the litigation. They show screen shots with com, recording message, record a message and then below it is a translation by the phone. So there is both, both, both are recorded on, on the phones.

15 HEGER: Yeah.

CHAN: So if I, then if we reverse our thinking, if there are no recorded message and the converted message translation, that means the person did not speak except the person that type –

20 HEGER: Mmm.

CHAN: - or write.

HEGER: Mmm.

25 CHAN: I don't know if you follow me?

HEGER: I think I do. And it, just so I'm clear, can you also generate Chinese characters by typing out the phonetic English rather than speaking it? So by typing out in English, Zhong, could it come up with Chinese characters (inaudible).

30 CHAN: Yeah, first and second, best of second yeah, they're, yeah.

HEGER: Yeah. But that couldn't have produced the error here because again they're just different sounds and you'd be typing different sounds. If you wanted East or if you wanted happy?

CHAN: Yeah.

35 HEGER: Okay. (Inaudible)

CHAN: The choice of word would not probably include the wrong word there because it –

HEGER: Yeah.

CHAN: - it has a different sound.

5 HEGER: Yeah, okay I understand. All right, I think those are all the questions I have. Does anyone else have a question?

BAINE: Stephen, would you just mind for the record, just identifying your credentials as a interpreter.

CHAN: Okay. Level 3 in the past, now certified.

10 BAIN: Okay um –

CHAN: Interpreter, translator, Cantonese and Mandarin.

BAINE: All right, thank you.

HEGER: Thank you.

BAINE: I don't have anything else.

15 HEGER: All right. Thank you for your time.

BAINE: Great. Thanks Zelig.

CHAN: Thank you.

HEGER: Bye.

20 **INTERVIEW CEASES**